

Early Music REVIEW

Number 5 November 1994

ISSN 1355-3437

Price £1.50

Editor: Clifford Bartlett
Associate editor: Brian Clark
Administration: Elaine Bartlett

Contributors:

Robert Oliver
Crispian Steele-Perkins

Reviewers:

Angela Bell
Andrew Benson-Wilson
Julia Craig-McFeely
Margaret Cranmer
Alastair Harper
Selene Mills
Kah-Ming Ng
Noel O'Regan
Simon Ravens
Brian Robins
D. James Ross
Lynda Sayce
Michael Thomas

2 Books and music
6 Monteverdi *Vespers*
8 Dart's dated drums
10 Monteverdi *Salve Regina*
12 Early Music in New Zealand
14 Bonporti
16 CD reviews
20 Letters and comments

Early Music Review is published on the first of each month except August and January. King's Music, Redcroft, Bank's End, Wyton, Huntingdon, England PE17 2AA
tel +44 (0)1480 52076 fax (0)1480 450821

Subscription details on page 9

Somewhat surprisingly, I received from Eulenburg recently a review copy of a new edition of Ravel's *Bolero* (No. 8023; £9.95), a work that, since its ice-skating debut, has crossed the divide from 'classical' to be universally known. How many of the millions who recognise the sound will look at the score is another matter, but its familiarity and the simplicity of one of its parameters makes it a good document for learning to score-read. It can hardly be defined as 'early music', yet raises problems for those interested in historic performance practice. One is the internationalisation of wind instruments: French orchestras used to sound different from German and English ones; now any difference comes more from varying educational traditions than the instruments themselves. It is characteristic that this edition uses Italian names for them, though the autograph used French.

But more important than that is the tempo. For a work which depends on the exact repetition of a mesmeric *tambour* part, that is crucial, and Ravel evidently felt strongly about it. In his introduction the editor, Arbie Orenstein, refers to an incident when Ravel snubbed Toscanini because he conducted the work too fast. The tempo of that performance is not known, but Toscanini recorded it at $\text{J} = 76$, the speed originally written on Ravel's own copy of the score. He later changed it to $\text{J} = 66$ (and recorded it at that speed), but finally settled on $\text{J} = 72$. If the speed suggested by so meticulous a composer as Ravel for a piece where the basic tempo is of the essence can vary by about 15%, what hope have we of establishing any concept of a correct tempo for composers who give us no information except the notes? CB

Our apologies to about 350 readers of *Early Music News* whose copies of *EMR* arrived late last month: the printer neglected to send them with the first batch of *EMN* and had to post them on separately. The appearance was also not as we intended: the spacing on the mock-up was ignored and all pages except the music were imposed a centimetre too high.

BOOKS AND MUSIC

Clifford Bartlett

'THE BEST CONCORDS'

This should perhaps be the title for a study of *The Alcotts*, but Nicky Losseff's book is in fact subtitled *Polyphonic Music in Thirteenth-Century Britain* and is in Garland's series *Outstanding Dissertations in Music from British Universities* (\$72.00). It certainly justifies its series title: it is, as an examiner might put it, an excellent piece of work, summarising the existing information and producing different patterns from previous writers in her analysis of it. One chapter is entitled 'fashion', and I'm not entirely convinced that her suspicion of interpreting English music in relationship to the tradition Notre-Dame centrality arises as a logical conclusion of her researches: I suspect that rather it was her starting point and that she had a fair idea of some of her conclusions before she started amassing evidence. Nevertheless, this is a useful survey of the topic, and there is a valuable catalogue of compositions, which would have been even better if the type size had been larger and the blank space less. I feel that there is still more that can be deduced about the extent and the manner of use of polyphonic music in this period. It puzzles me that, though England was not a political entity separate from parts of France and though its clerics were closely linked with the continent, there should be an insular style at all. How come? Do we really believe *Giraldus Cambrensis* and celtic influences?

LIBRERIA MUSICALE ITALIANA

A useful contact made on our visit to Urbino was with Libreria Musicale Italiana, who were fellow-exhibitors. Two interesting editions have arrived this month; I will write about a third item when I have had time to read it.

Il Codice T.III 2 is a lavish facsimile of 15 fragmentary folios of polyphonic music from a decade or two after 1400 which were acquired by the Biblioteca Nazionale Universitaria of Turin in 1991. It is No 3 in the series *Ars Nova* and costs 200,000 lire (available in the UK for £92.00 from Rosemary Dooley, Crag House, Wither Slack, Grange-over-Sands, Cumbria, CA11 6RW). In addition to the colour facsimile there is a substantial introductory study by Agostino Ziino. This includes a table of contents with concordances, a bibliography, an account of the structure of the MS and surmises as to its origin and date. He comes up with two hypotheses: either 'it was drawn up at a Franciscan house of Pisan/Bolognese obedience between 1409 and 1417' or that it preserves the repertoire of a cardinal, perhaps from the Veneto, and was drawn up during his residence in Constance for the Council there (1414-1418). A particularly prominent composer in the new source is Antonio Zacara

da Teramo. The introductory material is generously presented in both Italian and English – somewhat extravagantly so, since it duplicates the list of sources, music example, bibliography, etc. There are also slight problems in translation: I'm not entirely sure what 'drawn up' (quoted above) really means. This is probably as near as one can get to having the MS itself before you; the only regret is that the transcriptions of the complete *unica* are being published elsewhere (*Analecta Musicologica* 30, 1995), not along with the facsimiles.

Marc'Antonio Ingegneri is a name most of us know only as Monteverdi's teacher. A Collected Works is now under way and I have before me *Opera Omnia, Serie II, Volume III: Il Terzo Libro dei Madrigali a Cinque Voci* edited by Marco Mangani. This is a thorough edition, beautifully produced, though in a large-page format more convenient for study than singing. It is best to forget about Monteverdi and enjoy these fine and fluid contrapuntal pieces in their own right. The edition preserves original note-values (sadly, this editorial policy will not extend to the sacred volumes) and all accidentals (rare enough for there not to be ludicrous sequences of repeated notes each with a sharp). There is no indication of range and no transposition of madrigals in high clefs (one rather obscure article on the topic is footnoted). In view of the retention of as many original features as possible, it is odd that the original typographic convention of capitalising the first letter of each line is abandoned. There is a thorough commentary on and edition of the texts. Lazy linguists like myself will be grateful for the English translation of all the introductory material (except for Ingegneri's dedication). The price (£50,000 or £21.00) is very reasonable. (There is a previous edition of Book III, but it is neither complete nor accurate; one example from it that has been quoted by a Monteverdi scholar as a sample of free dissonance was a misprint.)

CARDINALL'S MUSICK EDITION

Cardinall's Musick have been most successful in bringing back to life the music of Ludford so it is good that they are making their editions available so that other choirs can enjoy this marvellous music. CMM issued two volumes of masses, but not the three reconstructable motets. *Ave Maria ancilla Trinitas* and *Domine Iesu Christe* are all transposed for SATTB with editorial second tenor parts by the editor, David Skinner. Two are in direct competition with Antico Edition RCM127, Nick Sandon's completion of the Peterhouse Partbooks. Skinner's edition is more conventional in that note values are halved; also, at £2.95, his version is cheaper. He gives less information about the music and source than Sandon, though Skinner has

produced more recent biographical information elsewhere. Apart from any preference for the editorial reconstructions (both convincingly imaginative), I would personally prefer to use the the Sandon versions, but the Skinner ones are easier for choirs. The Cardinall's editions could usefully show vocal ranges. Also edited by Skinner at the same price are Taverner's *Sospitati dedit egros* (SATBarB) and Sheppard's *Gaude, gaude, gaude Maria* (SATTBarB), both untransposed (the latter looking and no doubt sounding much more comfortable than in the Oxenford edition). Both have the necessary chant added. John Milsom has filled in the missing part of Weelkes' *Laboravi in gemitu meo* (SSAATB). This used to be thought a student exercise in imitation of Morley's setting: does the fact that the Morley attribution is wrong change this idea? Comparison with David Brown's completion in *Musica Britannica* XXII is interesting (£2.50). Cardinall's Musick Edition is available from P.O. Box 243, Oxford, tel & fax 0865 512478.

EDINBURGH PALESTRINA

Another new source for renaissance choral music is Edinburgh Music Imprint (Faculty of Music, Alison House, 12 Nicolson Square, Edinburgh EH8 9DF). Noel O'Regan has produced the first complete edition of three triple-choir motets by Palestrina (*Ad te levavi*, *Beati omnes* and *Salve Regina*) which were previously published by Haberl in vol. 26 of the old Breitkopf Collected Works with the then-missing choir III parts added by Michael Haller. The originals do, in fact, survive and are included here. The first two pieces (original clefs C1A3A4F4 x 3) are transposed up a tone to make them suitable for SATB, the *Salve Regina*, a high-clef piece, is down a minor third with two sharps. Original note values are retained. Since there are links between this publication and *EMR* (the editor is one of our reviewers, it was computer-set by our associate editor and the master copies were run off on my laser printer) perhaps I will appear biased if am too enthusiastic!

PRB GABRIELI

No, not a predecessor to PDQ Bach, whose works continue to appear. Peter R Ballinger (963 Peralta Avenue, Albany CA 94706-2144) has issued a batch of three motets by Giovanni Gabrieli edited by Richard Charteris. For some years I have been publishing Giovanni Gabrieli, mostly from the same editor, and have been disappointed at the poor sales. It is not just a marketing failure; even when we have our stock on show at exhibitions, the interest shown in them is disappointingly small. So I hope PRB find the venture worth-while. Richard Charteris is engaged in completing and revising the Collected Works (*Corpus mensurabilis musicae* 12) and has also been issuing performing editions independently. For the works which he published with King's Music we had worked out a series of principles that made the editions more user-friendly, rather than issuing them exactly as they would be in CMM. These have not been carried over to PRB. So we have, for instance, the odd-looking practice of a sharp before one

note and editorial accidentals above two consecutive repeats of it. But at least the user knows the status of each accidental. PRB also has long bars, while I thought that non-specialists might prefer two-minim bars.

Gabrieli's *Symphoniae Sacrae... Liber Secundus* (1615) suffers from its posthumous publication and is not as reliable a source as one would like it to be. In the case of *Sancta et immaculata virginitas* (\$2.00) the problem is a missing part, apparent from the ungrammatical sections in the upper parts. Curiously, the 1615 organ part does not remedy the deficiency (which suggests that the part has no independent authority, at least for this piece), but there is a MS part by Johann Staden included with a set of the 1615 print in Warsaw which fills the gap. The edition does not include an emended continuo part and does not list the surviving keyboard transcription, which does something to alleviate the gaps in at bar 20+ but not at 30+ or 41. It is a low-lying piece (C1C1C3C3C4C4F3F4F5) needing parts if performed at pitch, or transposing up if sung a capella (which seems to be the natural way to use the edition as printed). The problem with *O gloria virgo a 12* (score \$5.00, parts \$10.00) is that there are two suspiciously empty bars with an organ part and nothing else. This vacuum was abhorred by whoever was responsible for the MS version of the work in Kassel; but the 17th-century editor probably had no score available and was working just from the parts. Charteris, with the advantage of the work as a whole in front of him, can provide a more plausible completion. It would be odd if the text began ungrammatically, so I wonder whether *nostra defende salute* means 'protect [us] for our salvation', not 'defend our salvation'. This seems to be a work for three voices and nine trombones (Charteris implies in the introduction that the top part of each choir has a *voce* designation, but doesn't print them); the Kassel parts have only the top parts (C4C4C4) texted. PRB prints a set of 12 parts, but the continuo part is only in the score.

I'm not sure why we need another *In ecclesiis* (score \$15.00, vocal score \$3.00, parts \$10.00). There are several other editions, and the King's Music one was proof-read by Charteris himself. I will just comment on a curious editorial practice he reverts to here: the bracketing of the dot required for a modern transcription of a perfect breve. See, for example, bar 56, where not only do we have pointless brackets, but also the confusing use of an undotted breve rest to stand for three breves, which is unhelpful in modern notation. Charteris prints Denis Arnold's realisation from CMM12/5 in respect to him; sadly, idiomatic though it is in most respects, it is set far to high to be acceptable now. (No disrespect to Denis, whose widow is a subscriber to *EMR*, as indeed are Peter Ballinger and Richard Charteris).

Also from Charteris and PRB comes an edition of Gabrieli's Venetian contemporary Giovanni Bassano: a setting a 12 of *Ave Regina caelorum* for G2C1C2C3; G2C2C3C4; C2C3C3F3 + Bc - a strangely high ensemble for San Marco (where Bassano was cornettist): should it be transposed down? Although it was probably not intended for 12 voices, it is

performable thus (though probably best down a tone). Is there any Italian sacred evidence for the editor's suggestion that uniformity of instruments in each choir is desirable (so wind for one, strings for another)? The music is a bit predictable compared with Gabrieli's, but effective enough (score \$4.00, parts \$6.00).

The editions are nicely produced, in a smaller format than the King's Music Gabrieli editions. Both KM and PRB editions give underlay in the parts – so the players have no excuse for bad phrasing! The prices are extremely reasonable.

MUSICHE VARIE

Another contact made during our aestival peregrinations (to adopt the language of a music hall chairman) was at Utrecht with *Musiche Varie*. This is a series of 17th-century instrumental music issued by Verlag Martin Lubenow (Findorffstraße 4, 27711 Osterholz-Scharmbeck, Germany). Lubenow is a cornettist, a performer of music of the period he is publishing, and has produced exactly the sort of edition I would have done, which I hope will be read as a compliment. Each issue in a stiff blue cover has a clearly-printed score with parts that are sensibly laid-out without page turns. There are so-far about 20 titles, of which I have been sent three. There is some competition among editors of Marini's op. 8 (1626 or 1629 depending on whether you follow the original or corrected title-page date: the preface is dated 1626). The solo and duo sonatas were published by Thomas D. Dunn in *Collegium Musicum Yale University Second Series Vol. X*, now available from A-R Editions (score \$31.95, parts \$22.00). Lubenow has done Sonatas 1-3, for 2 violins or cornetts and continuo (25 DM) and 10-12 for treble, bass and continuo (25 DM) with scores which follow the source more precisely and parts that are far more legible (the Yale parts are not up to A-R's usual standards). Lubenow also gives the user a separate figured part. (I would probably have added a little more editorial figuring to help players, especially since there is, commendably, no realisation.) Their catalogue also lists Canzoni 7-10 a 6 (40 DM) which will save me the bother of issuing my own versions. Another issue contains the three sonatas a 6 (nos. 21-23) from Buonamente's *Libro Sesto*, 1636. These are all small-scale double-choir pieces; no. 1 is for violino & tiorba + cornetto & 3 trombones, no. 2 for 2 violins/cornetti + ATTB viole da brazzo/tromboni and no. 3 for 2 violins + 4 trombones, all with continuo. The three pieces are quite varied and well worth playing. Those interested in the meaning of the word *tremolo* in this period will find it used for regular quavers on the trombones in the last piece.

PURCELL SONGS

I expected to find it difficult to say anything polite about the reissue of the Tippett/Bergmann versions of 20 songs in three volumes (Schott; £7.95 each) but was agreeably surprised: my mind must have been mixing them with the Britten versions, and they are in fact more acceptable than

I remembered them. They are definitely versions for piano, so are not likely to be favoured by our readers. But they will be used by the majority of non-specialist performers, and are rather more idiomatic and interesting than the Novello volumes derived from the Collected Works, though less so than the anthologies from Stainer and Bell. (I think something worthwhile is imminent from Oxford UP.) The Schott series starts badly: why make the poor accompanist suffer in B flat minor? The end is also regrettable: commendable to include a duet, the fine elegy on Queen Mary *O Dive custos*, but the singer needs to know what it means. But there are marvellous songs here and it is excellent that these versions are reissued so conveniently. The volumes are all described as for high voices; there is no mention of a low voice version. Vol. 3 has one non-Purcellian item buried in it, Humfrey's deservedly-popular setting of Donne's *Wilt thou forgive*; the mordents in thirds of the accompaniment are irritating. Singers of the preceding piece, the *Evening Hymn*, should note the introductory remarks qualifying the meaning of *Slow*.

FRENCH BAROQUE

I hope to be able to write more about interesting French editions I saw at the Paris exhibition recently. Meanwhile, here are a couple of items from Leduc (UMP in the UK) which had reached me earlier. I'm sure that something is lost by playing Marais on recorder rather than viol; but on the other hand, the music is worth playing on anything and the title page encourages performance on a wide range of instruments. A Suite, originally in C, from Book III looks piercingly high for treble recorder in F so will need to be played with considerable restraint on the top notes. I have received a playing score (£12.95): just the treble and bass, without realisation, set out with sensible page-turns (apart from the last page). There is also a realised version available. Another lay-out is adopted for a pair of flute sonatas, Leclair's op. 9/2 and Blavet's op. 2/2; a modern flute part is given along with facsimiles of the original for the continuo (£11.25); there are also separate editions in the conventional manner with realisation. Quite why the flautist is considered to be less capable of reading a facsimile than the accompanist isn't clear, and the reduced-size reproduction is hard on the eyes, especially the cellist's (whose eyes are further from the page than those of a keyboard player). But it is encouraging that a publisher one tends to think of as conservative feels the need to experiment in this way.

GREENE'S END

Lord, let me know my end is a marvellously expressive anthem by Maurice Greene for SATB and organ with a central section for SS soli. A new edition by Christopher Brown is available from him at 6 Station Rd, Catworth, Huntingdon PE18 0PE (£1.10). The plentiful editorial dynamics may seem excessive to readers of *EMR*, but the organ part is realised far more stylishly than in many editions by more recognised 'experts'.

BAROQUE INSTRUMENTAL

A large pile of Schott imports from Kunzelmann (GP numbers) and Amadeus (BP) must, as usual, be covered more briefly than they deserve. Another batch of Telemann trio sonatas from Amadeus have been held over until next month.

Albinoni's *Concerti a Cinque* op. 10 are less well known than his four earlier sets, perhaps because they are a comparatively recent discovery; there is, for instance, no facsimile of them as there is of his other instrumental works. Kolneder's editions of No. 3 in C (GM 369p; £11.65) and No. 5 in A (with a two-sharp signature. GM 371 p; £13.80) includes a *violino principale* part that doubles *violino primo* throughout so need not have cluttered the scores (GM 371p; £11.65); as usual, there are unmarked editorial additions. The Sonata 4 from op. 2 (the 7th work in the set: numbering can be confusing) is a genuine 5-part piece in C minor, more enterprising than the later concertos (GM 309p; £9.55). Instrumental parts will presumably be available later. [I failed to mention in the January *Early Music News* op. 10/2 & 7, which appeared at the end of last year. The former in g (GM 368p; £11.65) has an independent solo violin part, the latter in F (GM 373p; £10.60) reverts to the pattern of 3 & 5.]

Turning to France, we have Dornel's *Concerts de Simphonies* Book III containing *Six Concerts en Trio* for two trebles and bass. Kolneder's edition (GM 1365; £38.15) lists the ranges of each movement to enable the players to choose suitable instruments. The remark on the title page 'arrangement and edited by Walter Kolneder' is worrying, but an alternative edition of Suite II confirms his notes and some of his dynamics. He omits the two duos and the trio without bass from the 1723 publication; these were published 20 years ago by U. C. P. Publications, Paris, but the firm seems not to exist now.

Considering that Boismortier produced half a dozen sets of pieces for two bass instruments (viols, cellos or bassoons – each available in facsimile from King's Music at £5.00), it is careless not to put an opus number on the cover of *16 Sonaten für 2 Violoncelle* (GM 165a; £11.50). The introduction reveals them to be opus 40. They have been edited for modern cello by A Pejsik; *EMR* readers will probably prefer the facsimile.

Corrette's op. 8 *Concertos comiques* for three trebles and bass are also available complete in KM facsimiles (£12.00). Amadeus has issued a separate edition of No. 6, *Le Plaisir des Dames*, a strangely-scored piece with the third part almost invariably doubling one of the others (BP 721; £9.00). A Sonata in d by an unspecified Loeillet in an adaptation for four recorders and bass is more democratic for the players and seems musically more interesting (BP 2310; £9.55); the original is in b for two flutes and two 'flutes de voix'.

Editing W. F. Bach's trio sonatas for two flutes and bass is more complex than the editorial tasks required by the other chamber music mentioned here; there are no authoritative sources and some have been lost. Two of the three works which survive (F47 & F48) have been edited by Elisabeth Weinzerl and Edmund Wächter, with good realisations by Winfried Michel (BP 761 & 762; £9.55 each). No. 3 has already appeared in Michel's imaginative reconstruction. These are more complex than the French sonatas, and I find them more interesting. Heinichen's Sonata in G for 2 flutes & bc (the same editors add violins as alternatives) flows more smoothly and is less instrumentally idiomatic, though easier to play (BP 759; £9.00).

A versions of C. P. E. Bach's *Trio* in G, which survives in various forms as Wq 85, 152 & 157 (=H.508, 581 & 583) has been arranged for three treble recorders in B flat. It works quite well, though you have to read the introduction quite carefully to see that Isa Rühling's role has been that of arranger, not editor (BP 2323; £8.50).

Bärenreiter have let both their editions of Fasch's *Sonata* in B flat for recorder, oboe, violin and continuo (FWV N: B1) go out of print (Hortus Musicus 26 & Nagels Musikarchiv 148), so there is room for a new version from Amadeus (BP795; £11.50). The editors suggest alternative instrumentation, but this is well written for its original scoring and is useful as a worthwhile piece written for specific instruments, with the additional excitement of a third contrapuntal strand added to the normal trio-sonata duet above a bass.

KOZELUCH

We still hear the string quartets of Haydn, Mozart and Beethoven in splendid isolation. The recent CD of Boccherini op. 58 was an eye-opener to me (see *EMR* 2, p. 15). So it is commendable that A-R has issued opus 32 and 33 by Leopold Kozeluch (*Recent Researches in the Music of the Classical Era*, 42; \$82.95. Parts \$40.00 for op. 32 and \$40.00 for op. 33). The editor, Roger Hickman, has had no great problem in establishing an accurate text: there is an authoritative edition published by the composer which is extremely accurate. He has added a fine introduction, mostly on musical rather than editorial matters. He outlines the strands in quartet creation and consumption of the period with a clarity I had not met before. It is interesting that Hickman finds that Beethoven's op. 18 is somewhat conservative and retrogressive compared with the Viennese quartet style of the 1790s. These six quartets were Kozeluch's only composition in the form. They circulated widely, and are worth publishing (and playing) in their own right as well as filling a gap in our knowledge. Just one technical comment (repeating one which I have made before): the score would be easier to read if the gap between the staves were smaller and the gap between the systems were larger.

STEVENS' ENLARGED VESPERS

Clifford Bartlett

I mentioned in July that a revised and unabridged version of Denis Stevens' edition was imminent from Novello. Had I known it was coming this month, I wouldn't have anticipated my review with a reply to Professor Stevens' letter last month. But here it is, and (at the risk of boring readers who have had enough on the work from me, and also of offending the editor, our latest subscriber) I feel that I should comment at length. It is an important edition. At the price of £7.95, none of the existing editions can compete (though Oxford UP may well try when their version comes out), so it will inevitably be the one most often used. It does, however, present problems. It is not a panacea, and is based on ideas that are, I believe, outmoded even among circles that do not claim to be early-music specialists.

This is, in fact, not a revised edition but a completed one. I have not made a thorough check, but I have not noticed any significant difference in the music carried over from the 1961 version. Most of the changes concern instrumentation. The chant antiphons assembled for the 1961 edition survive with no *raison d'être*. The original introduction explained at some length why they were important and the principles for their selection; all this is cut, so non-specialist users will be mystified why they are there. If performers want to use chant (and I am not entirely convinced that antiphons are necessary even in a performance that attempts liturgical correctness), they should take the antiphons for a particular Marian feast. (King's Music has a booklet of chants for five Marian feasts edited from sources of Monteverdi's time available for £3.00.)

A major problem in editing the 1610 *Vespers* is that it must inevitably often be performed by forces utterly unlike any which Monteverdi could have envisaged. Some will try to perform the work (if, of course, it is a work) in a way as near as they can surmise to how it may have been performed at the time. But there are choirs whose members want to sing what has become one of the most popular items in the choral society repertoire, and why not? This involves compromise. The problem with this edition is that it is a compromise for the 1960s, not for the 1990s. And whether the compromise is right or not, the conscientious performer does now, I think, want to know much more about the nature of that compromise than is given here.

The postulated origin of some of the music in Monteverdi's Hungarian visit is here mentioned too vaguely, concealing the point that the music was not then performed by a choir but by six singers. This edition, however, is based on the assumption that it is a choral work. Fine for Novello's sales and the editor's royalties, but a sounder approach is to think of it as a work for ten voices with sections that can be

doubled by a choir. More worrying is the use of the word 'orchestra'. In normal modern usage, it implies a doubling of strings. I would have thought that the chance of that being Monteverdi's intention was minimal (see, for instance, the article by Peter Holman in *Early Music* Nov. 1993 which Stevens quotes in his introduction). The layout diagram (a good idea in principle) names each string instrument in the plural, even 1st and 2nd violas, and there isn't even a solo marking for the violin duet in the *Sonata*. From my experience, even with a big choir single strings are adequate (or, put another way, doubling the strings doesn't solve any balance problems). Moreover, even amateur performances now often have a pair of cornettists (easier, of course, if *Magnificat* is transposed down a fourth, but Stevens passes on that point). So why substitute oboes rather than just suggesting them as alternatives *faute de mieux*. He seems to have missed out on all the discussion over the difference between an organ part and an independent string bass part, let alone the doubts about 16' pitch instruments, and provides an 18th-century continuo part, cueing in bassoons and double basses. Plucked continuo is ignored completely, despite the power of a good *chitarone* to clarify the bass in a way no other instrument can and to spread chords far more flexibly than keyboard instruments.

I append a few detailed remarks on the 'new' movements.

Nigra sum

This is an accompanied monody. The voice is paramount and should lead, and there is no function for a conductor. It is usually started by a nod from the singer. The opening words *Nigra sum* are only perceived to be in a specific tempo in retrospect, when we have heard the next phrase *sed formosa filia* – not, incidentally, *filiae*; that may be the text of the Vulgate and the liturgy, but the 1610 edition prints *filia* three times and Monteverdi's setting treats *formosa filia* together as an adjective-noun pair ('pretty girl'). For the accompanist(s), the crucial rhythm-giving point is his off-beat entry on *sed*. It is not the job of the accompanist to lead here. But Stevens has provided a continuous movement for the organ throughout the opening three bars, drawing attention from the singer and making explicit a rhythm that should not yet have been clarified. Moreover, the strange arpeggio figure he gives the organ is unidiomatic. (A *chitarone* might, of course, play an arpeggio on the opening chord, but that would be unmeasured.) Then, when in bar 3 the organist can clarify the rhythm with regular movement, he is given just a bass note on the fourth crotchet, not a chord. I won't carry on in this detail. But I can see little in this part that accords with what a stylish continuo player might produce.

There are three more general points about the movement.

1. Stevens turns it into a dialogue for a Shulamite Maiden and King Solomon. Apart from the clear heading *Voce sola*, notation in the tenor clef and inclusion in only one partbook (I think the Venetian printer worked from partbooks, not a score, so would have reproduced that feature had it existed), this suggests an over-literal approach to the text which, later on, should lead to *Duo Seraphim* needing six tenors: two (then three) to state the narrative, with a different two (then three) to sing what the Seraphim were shouting to each other. He also misleads the user into suggesting that it is only tradition that allocates *Pulchra es* to women, without stating that they are in the soprano clef. (Nowhere, incidentally, does the edition give original clefs: vital information for vocal and instrumental scoring.)

2. Cello is marked as accompaniment: whatever for? It is possible for a stylish player to make a tactful but positive effect on a string bass instrument here, but Stevens is envisaging modern instruments. If the organ does not have a clear enough bass, it needs plucked supplementation, not bowed.

3. Stevens rebars *surge et veni*. This is asking for trouble. A common fault in unspecialist singers of Monteverdi is to foreshorten notes tied across the middle of a bar. Stevens actually creates instances where this happens when regular barring would have avoided it, and makes matter worse on the 7 $\#$ 6 chord by giving the organ octave f $\#$ s rather than a chord the singer can feel himself holding a suspension over.

Pulchra es

Stevens does not inform the user that the organ part in bars 3 & 4 comes from the *Partitura*, so is the organist's cue for what the voice is singing, i.e. an alternative reading of the voice part, not an elaboration of it to be played against a simple, sung version. The organ part at the opening here again draws attention from the voice but lacks weight on the 9 chord at bar 6. His quaver run in 9 leads him into the trap of getting above the voice in 10, and the quaver scale at the end of the bar forces the singer to place the quaver on *Jerusalem* precisely, which she might well not want to do. Two good things: no change of the Sop I D to E at bar 56 but an emendation of the bass C to E at bar 70 (bars 64 & 79 in my edition: the latter an idea missed there).

Duo Seraphim

Another messy organ opening: bar 3 is particularly pointless, as is the *forte* on the last beat of 19. The magical moment of the entry of the third voice is spoilt by another arpeggio. (Stevens is afraid of simplicity.) Curiously, the part of the third voice is given to the first tenor. It is generally better for the organ to leave it to the three tenors to sort out their fifths on *unum sunt* without clouding the issue on a possibly imperfectly-tuned or equal-tempered instrument.

Audi coelum

There are very few bass figures in the work: one is a flat on the G oddly placed by Stevens in the middle of bar 9 (another pointless change of time). Surely an indication of a

G minor chord, but no: we have a 98 suspension. A natural is omitted before the last B in bar 12 (which therefore implies a sharp C on the following note: see my review of Jerome Roche's edition in *EMR* 2 p. 8). A typical organ silliness is at bar 33 on *luna* where, instead of allowing the player to breathe with the singer and start a new chord on *electa* after a break, he obtrusively (especially since he is too high) slides down a position on the triad on -na and then ties across the barline instead of letting in some air and phrasing intelligently. Rebarring is particularly bizarre at the end of the movement. *Benedicta es* moves in a series of four two-minim bars, the third of each being a 43 dominant chord with a tonic on the fourth: there is just one place where the pattern is telescoped. Stevens bars the whole section in a mixture of three- and two-minim bars, with complete disregard for the harmonic movement.

Sonata sopra Santa Maria

Normally a stickler for Italian usage, Stevens prints the Latin *Sancta*, and do we really need the tempo mark *Andante processionale*? Taking a cue from Peter Holman, Stevens decides that the original parts are an inadequate guide to the instrumentation, he adds a couple of violas. The exact balance of 5 strings and 5 wind looks suspiciously tidy, and I'm not sure that the problem (the occasional mix-up of string and wind involving the original *Viola da brazzo* and *Trombone ovvero Viola da brazzo* parts) is, at least with early instruments, anything to worry about. What does concern me is the continual doubling of instruments, which (even if spaced) is uncharacteristic of notated music of the time. I am unhappy by the heading for the voice part 'Sopranos and altos'. Why should it not be sung by a solo? Congratulations on using short bars. I won't comment on the thorny matter of mensural relationships here (cue for a letter from Roger Bowers!)

What is so sad about the edition is that it does not put before the general user any of the experience gained by those who have been thinking and experimenting with the work, both academically and in practice, over that last 33 years. I know that Stevens is sceptical about whether much of this has been an improvement. There are some areas where he may perceive a decline: an interest in surface rather than substance and an inadequate feel for the words, though the best performers are aware of these problems. (I will be reflecting on changes of performance style next month in a review of reissues of Alfred Deller recordings on CD.) But there seems little point in producing in the 1990s an edition for the 1960s. Novello's have in general shown themselves very willing to keep in touch with musical developments, e.g. their newer Handel editions and Duncan Druce's version of Mozart's *Requiem* (I hoped to write on that, but requests for review copies have been ignored). It is a pity that here they have chosen to prop up an aging edifice rather than build a new one.

I know that our proof-reading has not been impeccable, but we have definitely spelt Professor Stevens' name correctly: the Novello advert with 'Stephens' is wrong.

DART'S DATED DRUMS DROPPED

Crispian Steele-Perkins

The first occasion upon which kettle-drums appear to have been permitted in Westminster Abbey was at the Coronation of George II in 1727 in Handel's *Coronation Anthems*. This seems surprisingly late in view of the vast amount of ceremony enacted in that great building. Hindsight is sometimes of dangerous and dubious benefit to musical historians. Theories propounded by a single commentator, however well-intentioned, may be taken up by others and repeated so often, both on paper and in performance, that they are accepted as fact. I suspect that their ability to improvise at the keyboard has also encouraged some distinguished musicologists to improvise with history. No more striking an example can be found than the obtrusive timpani parts inserted by Thurston Dart into Purcell's *March and Canzona* for the funeral of Queen Mary II.

Dart's imaginative concepts need to be reassessed, particularly since we now have accurate reconstructions of brass instruments of Purcell's time, and these produce a surprisingly gentler sound than we had previously imagined. Furthermore, the fact that two of Purcell's scores -- *Hail! bright Cecilia* and *The Fairy Queen* (Act IV), both from 1692 -- contain parts for kettle-drums (and wonderfully written they are too) does not entitle us to assume that musically-illiterate drummers were habitually let loose at the rear of the orchestra to improvise their own parts in other works. On the contrary: drum improvisation was not the province of art music but of equestrian ballet and the country dance. Drum parts added posthumously (whether in the years immediately after Purcell's death or in modern times) invariably sound unconvincing, even in the most skilled hands, and by imposing Handelian concepts upon this elegant music, undermine Purcell's unusual treatment of the trumpet as a melodic instrument.

Misunderstanding stems from a misplaced assumption of the integration between the various departments of musicians of the royal household. Purcell's eminent trumpeter, John Shore (1662-1753), came from a family of military trumpet-players. His name appears in the Lord Chamberlain's accounts from 1688 as a ceremonial (household) trumpeter-in-ordinary¹ and later as Sergeant (Administrator) of the Trumpeters (1707-53)². Simultaneously he had been appointed musical instrument maker (7 Feb. 1688) and lutenist (28 January 1696), to which role he devoted most of his career. He was clearly a man of diverse talents, and it was his trumpeting skills that Purcell so brilliantly exploited during his last five years.

Detailed study of the sequence of Purcell's compositions using trumpets and kettle drums reveals that *Hail! Bright Cecilia* (the *Song for St Cecilia's Day*, Nov. 22 1692) was not

only the second and last occasion for which he wrote for kettle drums but, with two fleeting exceptions³, it ends his use of a pair of trumpets in thematic dialogue, a notable characteristic of his previous writing for the instrument. The sudden disappearance of the second trumpet and kettle-drum from his scores but the retention of a prominent solo trumpeter must be significant⁴. The reason for this is not clear. There were plenty of other talented trumpeters around -- two other Shores, for a start, or the Dutchman Henrick de Vant (Henry Davent). Perhaps the aging Matthias Shore was no longer up to scratch, but it was not tactful to book anyone else in place of the sargent-trumpeter, a powerful figure who controlled the distribution of performance licences.



In the *Funeral Music*, the misleading name 'flat trumpet' caused Dart to envisage the brazen tone of the modern orchestral trumpet or rasping fanfare instruments, whereas excellent and accurate reconstructions of the trombone-like hybrids give a soft, mournful quality manifestly inappropriate to be accompanied by thunderous timpani or massed drums. Using a rather cumbersome rear slide, the 'flat-trumpets' can play almost chromatically in the trumpet register, but not with the agility either of the trumpet or trombone. Purcell's other use of these symbolically funereal instruments occurs in *The Libertine*, in which their simple sequence of chords is doubled by the strings (with no mention of kettle-drums). However, when enhancing the solemnity of Queen Mary's funeral a few weeks earlier, they played the same sombre March unaccompanied. The instruments played are vividly described by James Talbot, and the music was subsequently transcribed by Charles Tudway, who had been a chorister at the ceremony: neither mentions percussive accompaniment, either to the March played as the coffin arrived in Westminster Abbey, or to the Canzona sounded later in the service. It has not been possible to establish the precise number of drummers

who accompanied the funeral bier along Whitehall: the Lord Chamberlain's records account for at least one pair of kettle-drums, 25 drums and 5 drum cases to be covered with mourning (black) baize cloth. If Queen Anne's funeral twenty years later was comparable, 120 regimental footguard drummers were in attendance as well. So it is not surprising that even if, as some would have us believe, the flat-trumpets sounded the March while processing along Whitehall, no eyewitnesses record hearing or seeing them, however, muted or muffled the drums were.

Practical experience in recording and performance endorses the view that flat-trumpets symbolise death and mourning, especially if played without embellishment like the trombones in Beethoven's *Equali*. Kettle-drums enhance the sound of ceremony and triumph with fanfare trumpets; side-drums punctuate the marching fife and soldiery. Attempts to mix these elements transforms the character of their music and overlooks the symbolism of the sight and sound of each of them.

Finally it must be born in mind that, although much of Purcell's theatre music was rescored after his death, often for very practical reasons, and additional music was composed by others, he perceived the trumpet as a symbolic but melodic instrument, not as the adjunct to the (non-existent) drum section. Unfortunately, the limitations of the trumpet's harmonic series enable not-necessarily-skilful hands to add simplistic kettle-drum parts where they were not envisaged and where they are not appropriate. This practice cannot be justified if one is seeking honest reconstructions of Purcellian performances. To perpetuate this misconception by adding parts not written by Purcell is like daubing a pair of spectacles upon a portrait of his much-loved Queen, excusing the outrage because 'they had spectacles in those days'. Such desecration is made all the worse by being perpetrated, not by pranksters, but by those trusted as authoritative.

¹ Appointed March 30 1688; later attended King William III in Holland Jan 1 – April 13 1691 at 5s per day (total £25 - 15 - 0).

² A lucrative, non-playing appointment.

³ (a) *Te Deum & Jubilate* (Nov. 22 1694), an inexacting part. (b) *Come ye Sons of Art* in the first chorus. This comes before and after the alto duet 'Sound the trumpet' with the famous pun

'till the listening Shores re-Sound

(the two trumpeters being members of the Shore family, John and either his father Matthias or uncle William). NB The second trumpet and kettle-drum part in the last movement in Robert Pindar's 1765 copy (RCM MS 993) are unlikely to be by Purcell.

⁴ They reappear shortly after Purcell's death in music by his brother Daniel (1663-1717), John Eccles (1668-1735) and others. Some editions allocate Purcell's second oboe part to a second trumpet, but give themselves away by allotting to the instrument notes which the natural trumpet of Purcell's time could not play.

⁵ Talbot gives detailed measurements of the flat trumpets; he makes no mention of them playing with kettle-drums or drums though, being memorable and noteworthy, he probably would have done so had it taken place.

Purcell's Music with Trumpets and Drums

1687	Oct. 14	Welcome Song (James II's Birthday)	[2 pts in D <i>later additions</i>]
1690	March 27	Yorkshire Feast Song	2 pts in D
	April 30	Arise my Muse	2 pts in D
	----	Dioclesian	2 pts in C & D
1691	April 30	Welcome, glorious Morn	2 pts in C
	----	King Arthur	Act I 2 pts in D & C Act IV 1 pt in C
1692	----	The Fairy Queen	2 pts in C & D
	Nov. 22	(in Act IV only)	Kettle-drums
		Hail! bright Cecilia	2 pts in D, Kettle-drums
1693	April 30	Celebrate this festival	1 pt in C
1694?	Jan 1?	Trumpet Sonata*	1 pt in D
1694	April 30	Come ye Sons of Art	Ov. 1 pt in D
		Chorus	2 pt in D
	----	Don Quixote	1 pt in C
	----	Timon of Athens	1 pt in D
1695	March 5	Te Deum & Jubilate	2 pts in D
	July 24	Funeral music	4 flat-pts
		Who can from Joy refrain	1 pt in C
	----	The Libertine	4 flat-pts 1 pt in C
	----	Bonduca	1 pt in C
	----	The Indian Queen	1 pt in C & D

* Possibly the Overture to the lost New-Year ode *Light of the World*.

Early Music Review

Subscriptions

UK: £10.00

Europe (airmail): £13.00

Rest of the world

(airmail): £20.00 (surface): £13.00

UK cheques payable to King's Music.

SUS checks (\$30.00) and French cheques (FFR115,00) payable to C. A. J. Bartlett,

Other foreign subscribers may use:-

Eurocheque

Sterling cheque drawn on a UK bank payable to King's Music (Branch code: 20 4363; Account No. 20551015)

National Girobank (Postcheque) payable to C. A. J. Bartlett (account no. 42 129 3705).

Please make sure that the amount we receive, after any bank charges, is the total named above.

Subscriptions run for ten issues from date of receipt. Back issues may be ordered by subscribers for £1.00 each.

Those receiving *Early Music Review* as part of their *Early Music News* subscription should note that this arrangement ceases with the December 1994 issue. If you have not already notified us that you wish to be invoiced for a 1995 subscription, please do so.

Monteverdi – Salve Regina

Tenore (C4 clef)

Basso Continuo

Original figures encircled

9

17

26

32

34

Although written in the tenor clef, this has a small range and can be sung by soprano, alto or baritone.

40

in hac la-cri-ma - rum val - le. E - ia er - go, o____ ad-vo-ca - ta, ad-vo-ca - ta

4 3 # b

47

no - - - stra, ad-vo-ca - ta, il-los tu - os mi-se-ri-cor - des o - cu-los ad

4 3 6 4 # 5 6 5 6

53

nos con - ver - te. Et Je - sum be - ne - dic - tum fru-ctum ven - tris tu - i, no -

4 # # 5 # 6 6

60

-bis post hoc ex-si - li-um o - sten - de, o - sten - de, o cle - - mens, o - sten -

4 # # 4 3

66

-- de, o pi - a, o-sten-de, o - sten - de, o dul - - cis, o dul-cis Vir-go, dul -

(b) 4 # 4 # b 6

73

-cis, o dul - cis Vir - go Ma - ri - - a.

6 b 5 4 #

Those who prefer the notes in bar 32 to add up correctly may halve the values of notes 15 & 16.

EARLY MUSIC IN NEW ZEALAND

Robert Oliver

This article is not about Maori music, a large and fascinating topic in its own right. In fact, the first communication between Europeans and Maori was musical: the Dutchman Abel Tasman called for his trumpeter to hail the approaching Maori and they responded with their shell trumpet (see John M. Thomson's *Oxford History of New Zealand Music*).

European music of Tasman's time (1642), and that of older and more recent times, is performed throughout New Zealand, quite often on appropriate instruments, at a level which ranges from amateur to professional. There is a lively musical scene throughout the country, involving a remarkably high proportion of the 3.5 million inhabitants, spread unevenly over an area the size of the British Isles. While there are plenty of New Zealand musicians who make their careers in other parts of the world, there are also plenty who choose to work at home. Some, like myself, come and go as often as practicable, showing a restlessness that seems characteristic of both New Zealanders and musicians.

Life as a professional early musician in New Zealand is certainly possible, and also interesting, stimulating and character-building. There were enough players of baroque instruments to assemble an original-instrument orchestra for Arne's *Comus* (though we lacked a bassoon), which was my last concert in Wellington before we left for England last month. Visiting fortepianists (there were one each from the USA, England and Holland this year) have two excellent instruments on which to display their art in Wellington and Dunedin. Modern technology means that information travels immediately, microfilms and facsimiles make available an enormous repertoire, travel is now relatively cheap and commonplace, so that there is no longer the sense of isolation which we felt when I first visited this side of the world nearly 30 years ago.

For this reason we experience many of the same ups and downs as here. Early Music societies which were thriving ten years ago are much less influential now, promote fewer concerts or workshops, and are more inward looking. Whereas ten years ago we were able to organise a national tour for London Pro Musica, nowadays such tours simply don't happen. We lament the failure to set up an early music network. An attempt was rejected by our Arts Council some years ago, a symptom of the indifference of most mainstream institutions to early music. Another is the attitude of Radio New Zealand's *Concert FM* (the equivalent to BBC Radio 3). Very little of the enormous recorded early repertoire is broadcast, and when it is, it's late at night.

Despite this, early music performances have a high profile, particularly in the main centres. Two of the universities, Victoria in Wellington and Otago in Dunedin, are very active. At Victoria University, Peter Walls, as Senior Lecturer for some years and now as Professor, has been building up a collection of baroque and classical instruments (strings, wind, brass and keyboard). The most recent is a magnificent Dutch-built organ on a baroque model – a superb, characteristic and exciting instrument. The University of Otago, where for many years the distinguished scholar John Steele taught, is now building up a collection of renaissance instruments – viols, flutes, recorders, lutes, etc – under the direction of Dr Suzanne Court. In Auckland, our largest city, Extempore, a baroque group, and the chamber choir Cantus Firmus, are very active. Wellington, the capital, has several groups: Restoration, The Baroque Players, Concordance, Baroque Voices and an excellent chamber choir, The Tudor Consort. All attract good audiences, and a recent concert by the Tudor Consort of music for the early Stuart court included, amongst other items, Lawes' music for *The Triumph of Peace*. In fact, August was a good month for the 17th century, as Concordance performed music by Jenkins, Lanier, John Wilson and others, and a trio-sonata group performed music by Lawes, Locke and Purcell. So Abel Tasman's contemporaries got a fair hearing.

This is all within a lively musical scene, so the competition for audiences is intense: there is a lot of choice for those who tear themselves away from their TV or CD-player for a night on the town. Apart from good theatres, pubs, cafés with live music, most cities have several visits a year from professional chamber groups organised by Chamber Music New Zealand, which tours local groups as well as bringing ensembles from overseas. The NZSO, which many readers will know to be an excellent orchestra, tours nationally, with soloists and conductors from all over the world. The four main centres also have part-time professional orchestras which give concerts, play for ballet and opera seasons and accompany the local amateur choirs in their *Messiah*, *B Minor Mass*, *Verdi Requiem* or whatever.

However, the only major institution which has been bringing in early music groups in recent years has been the International Festival of the Arts, held every second year in Wellington. It has a good mix of popular appeal and adventurous programming, bringing Musica Antiqua Köln, the Orchestra of the 18th Century and, most recently, Fretwork, who gave two superb concerts. The next Festival is in 1996: we hope that the organisers will not interpret the small audiences for Fretwork as anything but the result of their own poor promotion of this marvellous group. The

truth is that any concert of relatively unknown repertoire needs energetic promotion to gain the size of audience that Fretwork's concerts deserved.

There is also a very lively dance scene in New Zealand. The Royal New Zealand Ballet, fully professional now for many years, covers the classics, and we have superb modern dance ensembles and choreographers. Early dance attracts an enthusiastic following from both professionals and amateurs. Helga Hill often comes to New Zealand and Wendy Hilton has been twice to take courses. These visits have mostly been organised by Jennifer Shennan, herself a baroque dancer and tireless organiser of historic dance events. She, with harpsichordist Robert Petre, recognised the significance of the family heirloom 18th-century manuscript, which turned out to be a hitherto-unknown work book of Kellom Tomlinson. Robert wrote about it in *Early Music* four years ago, Jennifer edited its recent facsimile publication by Pendragon Press, and both were involved in the performance of the dances for the first time in nearly 300 years.

So my sojourn in England for the next 15 months is not an escape from an unsympathetic environment – far from it. It is to broaden my musical experience, play to a different audience, meet new ideas and renew old friendships. Perhaps it is mainly that restless gene inherited from my great-great-great-grandfather. He left England in 1841, arrived in New Zealand six months later, landing his goods – including a piano – above the high-water mark on a beach near Wanganui in the North Island. He never returned to England, as we are now able to do after a 26-hour flight, landing with our New-Zealand-made copy of an Italian virginals in our baggage well away from the sea at Heathrow.

Robert is a viol player, singer and conductor. With his wife Andrea, oboist and keyboard player, he is now touring schools with a choice of early-music programmes. I first met them in the early 1970s, when Robert and I were both playing in Peter Holman's Ars Nova.

CB

CITY WAITES JIG PROJECT

The City Waites will, later this month, begin a project in collaboration with the Royal Shakespeare Company to reconstruct for the first time in the modern professional theatre the jigs which were part of the Elizabethan theatrical tradition. These knockabout ballad dramas, effective crowd-pullers at the time and exported also to Germany, were published back in 1929 in Charles Read Baskerville's *The Elizabethan Jig*. Douglas Wootton (another colleague from Ars Nova in the early 1970s) will, we hope, write about how his ideas develop in practice in a later issue of *Early Music*.

Historical Music & Historical Instruments

Public Concerts and
Concert Workshops in Schools

Programmes

TUDORS & STUARTS

MUSIC FOR SHAKESPEARE

A MUSICAL JOURNEY

Robert and Andrea Oliver playing flutes, shawms, oboes, recorders, viols, rebec, psaltery, virginals and voice.

Music from the Medieval, Renaissance and Baroque eras.

School visits include performance & participation, with special emphasis on singing.

Public concerts of domestic settings of Renaissance and Baroque music.

Programmes and details from:

Selene Mills,
42 Owlstone Road,
Cambridge CB3 9JH

tel/fax 0223 354096

Eighteenth-century church music

In both England and America there were rich traditions of church music utterly unlike any practised in the cathedrals and collegiate chapels. Various strands will be investigated in a day's workshop held by the Eastern Early Music Forum at Michael Taylor's house (formerly a Baptist chapel) in Elsworth near Cambridge on Saturday 3 December. Larry Gordon and Northern Harmony will guide singers through the unaccompanied American repertoire while Blaise Compton will direct the first modern performances of a variety of English country anthems for voices and instruments. (One of them will be printed in the December *Early Music Review*.) Singers and players welcome: further information from Stephen Cassidy tel 0473 718811 or from Clifford Bartlett.

BONPORTI

Concerti A 4, op. 11

King's Music is in the process of publishing the complete set of ten concerti, op. 11, by Francesco Antonio Bonporti (1672-1749) in an edition by Maxwell Sobel.

Bonporti had a wide general education, studying physics and metaphysics at Innsbruck and theology and music at the German College in Rome. He was ordained a priest in 1694 and held a minor post at the cathedral of his native Trento until 1740, when he retired to Padua. He published 12 *opera*, all chamber music except for 6 motets for voice and violin op. 3. His best-known publication was his *Invenzione da camera* op. 10 (Bologna, 1712) for violin and continuo. Veracini played them in Germany and in one manuscript nos. 2, 5, 6 & 7 were ascribed to Bach and were included in the Bach-Gesellschaft vol. XLV. (They are Bonporti's most accessible works, and can be found in Kalmus Study Score 903, pp. 172-189.)

His 10 *Concerti a quattro* were published in Trento sometime after 1727. The title is confusing since, as well as parts for two violins, viola and bass, there is an additional one for *violino di rinforzo*. This sometimes has independent material, otherwise shares the Violin I part or has a skeleton version of it.

I met Maxwell Sobel at the Boston Festival in 1993 and he asked me whether we were interested in publishing his Bonporti. I agreed, and we have now almost completed opus 11. I knew nothing about his background, so asked him to sketch a brief biography, for my benefit as much as for our readers.

CB

I was brought up in a musically appreciative family and learned piano and violin at an early age. I became interested in early music through recordings and concerts, and began to learn the recorder and cornetto on my own during high school. In college I was a member of the Pro Arte at Indiana University, the early music program that preceded the founding of the Early Music Institute at this university by Thomas Binkley. I detoured into medical school, and after eight years of training emerged as a psychiatrist, and have been employed as an assistant professor at Indiana University in Indianapolis since 1985. In those years I have continued to play various instruments, and after building several harpsichords and a clavichord, I decided to apply myself to musical editing and in 1992 began assembling the computer equipment that I would need to produce modern but scrupulously accurate editions of early music.

I first heard of Bonporti through an enthusiastic, if uneven, recording of the concerto op. 11 no. 8 by the Societa Corelli made in 1955. I was quite taken with the piece at the time and looked for more of his works, but found very little. During the mid-1960s a recording of four of the concerti by I Musici confirmed my interest in this composer, who curiously seemed to be rather neglected. Research into him revealed an enigmatic individual who produced a fair amount of first class, well-crafted music. Since almost no one was involved in bringing his music to light, and I had the inclination and time (and money) to do so, I decided to collect all of his surviving works, set them on computer, and have them published so others might avail themselves of them. I am determined to print all of his works in a well-edited complete edition which no early music enthusiast need fear has been arranged, edited or altered in any way from the original.

Following completion of this project, should I still be alive then, I would begin with another composer (Manfredini is on my mind at present) who is relatively unknown, yet produced some very lively music. Once I retire from medicine, I intend to go into the music publishing/editing business full-time.

Maxwell Sobel

The following concertos are immediately available:--

Concerto No 1 in F major
 Concerto No 2 in B-flat major
 Concerto No 3 in B-flat major
 Concerto No 4 in B-flat major
 Concerto No 5 in F major
 Concerto No 6 in F major
 Concerto No 7 in F major
 Concerto No 8 in D major

Price per set (score, 3 violins, viola, cello)

£16.00 or \$25.00

extra parts each £2.00 or \$3.00

score only £10.00 or \$15.00

Discount of 20% to subscribers of Early Music Review

The remaining two concertos will be available soon.

Special offer for complete set of 10 concertos if ordered before 31 December 1994.

Complete sets: £140.00 (\$200.00)

Scores only: £70.00 (\$100.00)

Prices exclude postage. Do not send payment in advance.



KING'S MUSIC

Clifford & Elaine Bartlett

Redcroft, Bank's End, Wyton, HUNTINGDON, PE17 2AA

tel +44 (0)480 52076 fax +44 (0)480 450821

CAVALIERI

Rappresentazione di Anima et di Corpo 1600

We have had a MS transcription by Philip Thorby in our catalogue since 1988. It has now been put on the computer, and in the process checked back against the original, in preparation for a BBC recording under Philip Pickett next month. It comes in two separate sections. One contains the score, the other has facsimiles and translation of the introductory material in the 1600 edition, a translation of the libretto by Anne Graf and a facsimile of the 1600 libretto (which Cavalieri set out as verse at the end of his score). Score: £15.00

Cavalli: Magnificat a 6

This was included in the posthumous 1650 edition of church music by Monteverdi: a set of Vesper Psalms needed a Magnificat, and it seems, surprisingly, that there wasn't an unpublished one by Monteverdi. It is a fine piece for SSATTB, 2 violins and continuo. Parts for trombones to double the lower voices are ad lib.

Score £5.00, String parts £6.00, trombone parts £6.00

Lully: Alceste – Ouverture

Not a critical edition: we tried comparing the Collected Works with a late-17th century source on film and decided that the editorial complexities were too great. But it's a fine work, and there is little orchestral music by Lully available. (We also have the overture to *Le bourgeois gentilhomme*.) Originally for violins, 3 violas & bass violin, + oboe(s) & bassoon(s) ad lib. Our parts print the 1st and 2nd viola parts in treble and alto clef.

Score £3.00, parts £1.00 each

Two new facsimile sets of parts

J.C.Bach: 4 Quartettos op. 19 (1784) £10.00
Nos 1-2: 2 fl, vla, vlc
No 3: 2 fl, vln, vlc
No 4: fl/ob, fl, vla, vlc

J.C.Bach/Abel/Giardini: 6 Quartettos (1776) £10.00
fl/vln, vln, vla, vlc

RESTORATION VERSE ANTHEMS

We are trying to find time to tidy up some of the items that have been prepared for recordings over the past few years but have not been finished. There are several magnificent anthems by Pelham Humfrey prepared for Nicholas McGegan and the choir at Clare College Cambridge (HMU 907053). It is a fine record, but has sadly sold rather poorly – if you want the sequel, persuade all your friends to buy it! We have recently run off copies of the following: others will follow.

Humfrey: Hear my crying O God

SATTB soli, SATB chorus, 4-part strings and continuo
Score: £3.00 Set of parts £10

Purcell: O sing unto the Lord

SATB soli and chorus, 4-parts strings and continuo
Score: £5.00 Set of parts £6.00

Purcell: They that go down to the sea in ships

A/T & B solo, SATB chorus, 2 vlns, vlc & continuo
Score: £3.00, Chorus score £0.50, parts £3.00

A note on our Restoration Anthem material

Most orchestral anthems are predominantly for soloists, with symphonies and ritornelli for strings and short sections (often just at the end) for chorus. We always provide a full score (for conductor, soloists and organ) and instrumental parts. In some cases, we issue a separate chorus score. If we do not, we will negotiate a discount for multiple copies of the full score. When cheap vocal scores exist from other publishers, we have not issued chorus material.

The performing circumstances in the Chapel Royal at Whitehall were unusual. Reconstruction of the layout is difficult, since the building was destroyed soon after Purcell's death and there are virtually no pictures of its interior. But it seems that the organ and soloists (perhaps with a bass viol and theorbo) were in one gallery on the liturgically-north side of the chapel, with a string quartet in an adjacent gallery or room; the choir (presumably grouped as *cantores* and *decani*) was below. There was a bass viol to accompany the soloists as well as a bass violin with the other strings.

20% discount to all *EMR* subscribers on any item listed on this page: valid until 30 November

MEDIEVAL

Love's Illusion: music from the Montpellier Codex Anonymous 4 (64' 04")
Harmonia Mundi France HMU 907109

Anonymous 4's third CD is surpassing the enormous success of its predecessors. In some respects, it is well-deserved. The four women make a marvellous sound and present the music intelligently and appealingly. Am I being hypercritical to miss any sense of occasion? We need something to sustain 29 minimally-contrasted two-minute pieces. Here there is neither the logic that a reconstruction of an event can give (difficult, of course, for secular music) nor the variety that one normally gets in a well-planned concert (the recent Anon 4 London performance was pretentiously aimed at recreating a CD, including the silence between the tracks). Like the Hyperion Purcell songs, the CD is marvellous to own, but should be taken in small doses. Congratulations on the 86-page booklet with translations of all texts, except the tenors: even if *CUMQUE* is arbitrary and untranslatable, surely *FLOS* is the starting point for *Plus bele que flor* and *Quant revient et fuelle et flor?* CB

The Spirit of England and France - 1: Music for Court and Church from the later Middle Ages Gothic Voices, dir Christopher Page, with Pavlo Beznosiuk fiddle (62' 40") Hyperion CSA66739

In contrast with the CD by Anon 4, this is unashamedly an anthology, 'a succession of fine pieces chosen with complete freedom from the restrictions that are usually imposed by the financial constraints of touring and concert work' (to quote the booklet). There are 9 pieces from the 14th and 15th centuries (including a monophonic Machaut virelai and Cooke's Old-Hall *Gloria*) and 11 from the 12th-13th centuries, all anonymous except for the question-mark-Perotin *Presul nostri temporis*. Those who have enjoyed previous Gothic Voices CDs will find the same elements here: careful selection of repertoire (no music included for reasons other than its intrinsic excellence) in fine performance, with particular care for appropriate intonation. The male singers produce a wider variety of sound than the anonymous ladies, and there is further contrast with three of the *estampie reals*, played with musicality as well as virtuosity. CB

The Unicorn: medieval French Songs Anne Azema with Cheryl Ann Fulton (harps), Shira Kammen (vielle, rebec etc), Jesse Lepkoff (flute). (56' 55") Erato 4509-04830-2

For once, Anne Azema without Joel Cohen. The general style is, however, the same. This is a fine anthology, imaginatively grouped round common textual themes: the Bestiary of Love, one of Gauthier de Cuny's Miracles of the Virgin and The Abbey of Love. One can enjoy the CD just as sensuous sound (though the spoken sections might then irritate), or follow the texts and enter more fully into the ambience of the world of 13th-century France. CB

RENAISSANCE

Bull Music for harpsichord Bob van Asperen (Ruckers 1624) (55' 36") Teldec Das Alte Werk 4509-95532-2

Anyone who has heard Bob van Asperen in concert knows his ability to transmit his enthusiasm and enjoyment of the music. Interest is kept here by a careful choice of contrasted pieces, placing the plainsong settings such as the *In nomines* against the bright gigues and virtuoso pieces like *The King's Hunt*, *Doctor Bull's Myself* and various galliards, although the balance could do with a few more gigues. Ruckers instruments originally had many limiting qualities: two pitches, extra strings for mean-tone tuning, short octaves, crossing-over key arms, and a limited compass and specification (1 8' x 1 4'). These obsolete factors make them much prized by organologists. But they were rebuilt for musicians to become like French harpsichords. This 1624 instrument, presumably the one from the Sade family, sounds sonorous and enjoyable, and adds to the success of the record. Michael Thomas

Byrd Consort and Keyboard Music, Songs and Anthems Rose Consort of Viols, Tessa Bonner, Timothy Roberts, Red Byrd Naxos 8.550604 (63' 29")

Christ rising again, Fair Britain isle, Have mercy upon me O God, In angel's weed, Rejoice unto the Lord, Susanna fair, Triumph with pleasant melody; Pavan & Galliard, Fantasia 2 & 3 a6, In nomine a5, Fantasia, In nomine 2 a4 viols; John come kiss me now, Qui passe kbd.

This is a fine anthology, covering four areas in which Byrd excelled: viol consort, consort songs, verse anthems, and solo keyboard – if you have no Byrd, put your next £5 on this, and that is not much to spend even if you have other versions of much of the music. For a well-balanced disc, I would have preferred another anthem and another keyboard piece and less viol music (though if you generally hate Fantasies, try No. 2), but I'm not grumbling. Tessa Bonner has an uncomfortable start by being given *Susanna fair* untransposed (it's a high clef piece): it is in her range, but doesn't sound so well with the viols as the lower pieces. Red Byrd are at times a bit rustic in style and in accent – they should record some 18th-century country anthems – but it's a pleasant change from over-refined ecclesiastical. CB

The Spirit of Byrd The Duke His Viols, Oliver Hirsh org, Anders Engberg-Pedersen treble (73' 56") Helikon HCD 1016

In *EMR* 1 there was a review of Martin Souter playing the c.1605 chamber organ at Knole House in Kent. This recording uses a copy of that by Martin Renshaw and Karl Friedrich Wieneke. In fact, the copy sounds older than the original, thanks to a combination of the more suitable meantone temperament, the close mike position, and the uninhibited voicing of the copy. It appears in a solo role on 6 tracks (including the Prelude & Fantasy in a, *The Carman's*

Whistle and *Ut re mi fa sol la*), the remainder being equally divided between music for viols and consort songs with the principal soloist of Roskilde Cathedral. The organ playing is fluid and expressive with a viol-player's feel for the direction of the pulse and the ebb and flow of a piece. The instrument is hand-pumped which, combined with the temperament, produces wonderfully smooth and gentle chords. The sound of the bellows being raised by ropes at the side of the organ adds to the atmosphere; the *Kalkant* (organ blower) is, very properly, credited on the sleeve. The viol pieces are played with an aural integrity that owes much to a consort from a single maker (Jörn Erichson). The songs include *The Lord is my only support*, *O God but God* and *O that we woe*ful wretches. The singing is clear with a valiant attempt at English pronunciation, although the occasional upper note is rather pinched and the intonation is not always spot on. Andrew Benson-Wilson

Clemens non Papa & Gherardus Mes Souterliedekens Camerata Trajectina Globe GLO 6020 (68' 29")

I have often been intrigued by the title of one of the CMM volumes of Clemens, but do not remember ever hearing any of his vernacular psalm settings. Here they are put in context with inter-related secular music, including folk ballads and instrumental pieces (these last sounding a bit twee). Clemens' settings a 3 with the tune in the tenor were rapidly outmoded, and are complemented by treble settings a 4 by Gherardus Mes. This is pleasing domestic music skillfully but appropriately sung without excess. CB

Marenzio Madrigali a quattro voci, Libro I Concerto Italiano (Rossana Bertini, Claudio Cavina, Giuseppe Maletto, Sergio Foresti SATB), Mara Galassi harps, Andrea Damiani lute, dir Rinaldo Alessandrini Opus 111 OPS 30-117

It is rare to find four singers so uniformly in love with a composer. The members of Concerto Italiano sing the four-part madrigals of their compatriot Marenzio as though every word sprang from their own hearts. The surprising thing is that the group has a director: many quartets would feel that this was unnecessary. But Rinaldo Alessandrini's inspiration flows freely, and this recording brings a constant stream of surprises and delights and could even – if enough people heard it – reform the art of madrigals. Who could fail to be excited by that use of rhythm – tight and accurate where needed, but as free and disparate as four people could make it when languid phrasing can enhance the beauty of the music and the meaning of the text – and dynamics, and silence? Some pieces are accompanied, to great effect, on lute and harp. Pitch is A=465, and that may account for a certain amount of flatness, especially from the soprano. But let that not deter anyone from buying this exceptional disc: it only adds yet more voluptuousness to this ravishing music. Selene Mills

Morales Missa Mille regretz & Motets*
Chanticleer (55' 20") Chanticleer CR-8809
*Emendemus in melius, Lamentabatur Jacob, O
sacrum convivium, Vidi aquam; Josquin Mille regretz

In many ways Morales seems the ideal composer for the American ensemble Chanticleer, and his flowing melodic lines and rich harmonies are sung here with obvious relish. Anyone not acquainted with Morales' mass *Mille regretz* is in for a real treat, and there is a further banquet of motets, as well as the source chanson for the mass, all sensitively performed. The CD has one of the most striking covers I have seen. This is Chanticleer's last record on their own label, but after their collection of music of the Mexican Baroque (see *EMR*, 4, p. 19) we can expect great things from their collaboration with Das Alte Werk. *D James Ross*

Ockeghem Missa Mi-mi The Clerks' Group, Edward Wickham (63' 26") ASV CD GAU 139

Also Busnois *Victimae paschali laudes*; Isaac Angeli, Archangeli; Obrecht *Quod chorus vatum...Haec deum caeli*; Ockeghem *Alma redemptoris mater, Salve regina*

Ockeghem Missa Sine nomine, Missa quinti toni Schola Discantus, dir Kevin Moll. Lyrichord Early Music Series LEMS 8010

The Clerks' Group's anthology is centered on one of Ockeghem's most famous and most accessible compositions (at least in terms of getting hold of an edition: *Das Chorwerk* 4, reprinted in *Kalmus Study Score* 701), though accessible in the other sense of being easy to understand is another matter. Rob Wegman's impressive note, more philosophical than one expects from that particular form, discusses why the music is so difficult to grasp. I wondered at first whether it was my limited understanding of the logic of how Ockeghem's mass was held together that made this CD somewhat unappealing, though the motets also seemed a bit cold. But then I listened to the American disc. The music is far less complex, but the performance was much more 'user-friendly'. The sound of Schola Discantus is enticing and enjoyable in a way that is missing from The Clerk's Group. These three-voice masses may be less important historically, but they are more likely to make the unconvinced listener feel that Ockeghem has something to offer. *CB*

A Medieval Banquet hosted by St. George's Canzona (74' 46") ASV CD QS 6131

I knew the 1976-8 recordings from which this CD is compiled in their vinyl incarnation and was glad to hear them again. This medieval banquet recalls a bygone era when artists performed more for audiences and less for critics, and critics seemed less aware of the academics looking over their shoulders - back in that unselfconscious time when early music was not quite so assimilated into the formal structures of the mainstream. The percussion rhythms were more square than is now the fashion, the interest in Eastern European vocal techniques

younger, and harmonisations of monodic pieces sometimes took odd turnings. But this pot-pourri of the 13th and 15th centuries is well-played and spirited, and the arrangements sensitive. Where do we now hear the ethereal sound of duetting bowed psaltries? The shawm playing is as biting and exciting as any commonly heard today. John Sothcott's performance of *Ghaetta* on his own reconstructed vielle, incorporating harmony and simultaneous bowed and plucked crooked drones, is indeed, as the notes invite us to observe, a unique achievement. *Stephen Cassidy*

Musica mediterranea: music of the Italian and Spanish renaissance Kithara, dir. Shirley Rumsey & Chris Wilson (61' 58") Chandos Chaconne CHAN 0562

It makes a change to hear a voice so well balanced with an instrumental group appropriate to the music performed. Professional singers often produce the sort of volume or tone that will reach the back of a concert hall, with anything quieter sounding suppressed. Shirley Rumsey's performance of the songs on this recording, however, are refreshing both for an unusually well-blended balance with her accompaniment and for the attractive colour and tessitura of her voice which combine here to produce one of the most convincing 'period' sounds I have heard. The delicately balanced and thoughtfully blended ensemble-playing are entirely appropriate to the period and repertory. The dynamic range of viols, lutes and recorders is extremely subtle, and Kithara's elegantly understated performance demonstrates an enviable intimate understanding of both the individual instruments and overall style. At a time when there are so many early music groups recording, this stunning record will ensure that Kithara are strong contenders for a leading place. *Julia Craig-McFeely*

Sicut lilium inter spinas: in annunciatione Beate Marie Virginis. Cappella pratensis Emergo Classics EC 3975-2 (65' 07") Brumel *Mater Patris et Filia*; Clemens non Papa *Ego flos campi*; Hellinck *Missa Mater Patris et Filia*

This collection of Flemish polyphony and plainchant derives its name from the motto of the Confraternity of Our Lady in s'Hertogenbosch and is from a series comprising speculatively reconstructed services. Familiar music by Brumel and Clemens rubs shoulders with the work of the little-known but accomplished Lupus Hellinck in a reconstruction which not only considers liturgical validity but which takes authenticity to a new level. The performers apparently gain from the physical contact achieved by reading from unbarred parts written in a single large choirbook such as that shown in the posthumously-imagined illustration of Ockeghem directing his 36-part motet. The results are pleasingly fluid and expressive; the Dutch singers produce a full, confident sound with a generally-successful blend and intonation. *D James Ross*

EARLY BAROQUE

Biber Requiem a 15; Vesperae a 32 Amsterdam Baroque Orchestra & Choir, Ton Koopman (63' 20") Erato 4509-91725-2

Prompted by the 350th anniversary of Biber's birth, this is a disc that is justified on its own merits, with the first recording of the 'other' Requiem and the *Vesperae a 32*. The extraordinary and forward-looking Requiem in the sunny key of A major was possibly composed for the funeral of Biber's employer, the Archbishop of Salzburg, in 1687; a distinctive feature is the virtuosic trumpet writing. The earlier Vespers (1674) presumably written for Salzburg Cathedral, where there was a tradition of polychoral performance with four organ galleries on the central pillars, involve separation beyond the capabilities of standard stereo sound. This is a fascinating and welcome issue, well rendered by Amsterdam forces under Koopman's direction. Despite minor blemishes in ensemble, it deserves a firm recommendation. *Stephen Patrick*

Frescobaldi Fiori musicali Messa della Domenica, Il Secondo Libro di Toccatte extracts*. Organ of the Basilica di San Barnardino, L'Aquila (1726) (64' 57") Erato 4509-96544-2

*Toccatas 3-5, 7; Canzona 1, 3, 4, 6, Aria balletto

The organ was built by Feliciano da Camerino in 1725/6 and was restored back to its 'original' state in 1989-91. It is a large and powerful instrument and, despite its late date and a quarter-comma meantone temperament that does not always suit Frescobaldi, copes well with the music and the spirited, robust playing. Ton Koopman's distinctive approach to ornamentation always adds excitement and the occasionally frenetic additions to what is notated rarely impose. His ebullient style is ideal for these free and inventive Toccatas and his customary forthright touch is suitably moderated for the beautifully-expressed Toccata quarta alla levatione and the delightful little Kyrie movements. Two slight quibbles are that the lovely chromatic elevation toccata from the mass is omitted in favour of one from the book of Toccatas and the *Bergamasca* that concludes *Fiori musicali* is presented as the *Deo gratias* to the unrelated first Mass. An excellent recording, brilliant playing, and an informative booklet.

Andrew Benson-Wilson

Purcell Harpsichord Suites Kenneth Gilbert Harmonia Mundi HMC 901496 (66' 52") 8 Suites Z.660-3, 666-9; Ground in g Z.D221; A New Ground in e Z.T682; Hornpipe in e Z.T685; Sefauchi's Farewell. Couchet-Taskin hpscd, 1671

There are several good recordings of the Purcell Suites, including the former set by Kenneth Gilbert on the Vaudry harpsichord, Zuzane Ruzicková on a Hitchcock copy and Martin Souster on the Tisseran now at Oxford, an English instrument from a few years after Purcell's death. The Couchet played here sounds remarkably like the Tisseran and is ideal for the

repertoire. Gilbert has done a prodigious amount of work editing D. Scarlatti, F. Couperin and D'Anglebert, teaching and performing. He played these Suites at a concert in memory of Richard Clayson, which shows the affection in which he holds them. This comes out on the recording, much of which has a youthful, bouncing ease; the slow Sarabands and Grounds are also very effective, the melodic pieces moving, *Sesauchi's Farewell* very expressive (some additional pieces are included in the Suites). Gilbert adds to the limited ornaments many appropriate flourishes of his own. One looks forward to more like this.

Michael Thomas

Purcell *The secular solo songs vol. 3*. The King's Consort: Barbara Bonney, Susan Gritton, James Bowman, Rogers Covey-Crump, Charles Daniels, Michael George (SSATTB), Mark Caudle, Susanna Pell *vdg*, David Miller *lutes*, Robert King *kbd* (76' 28") Hyperion CDA66730

This third volume completes the series, though there is a disc of duets to come. I am warming to it, and enjoyed this rather more than vols. 1 and 2. I still find the male singing more acceptable than the female; it is, for instance, much more difficult to hear the words of the ladies. This is exacerbated by occasionally giving them songs notated in the treble clef but probably intended for tenor (for whom Purcell tends to use a tessitura slightly higher than an octave below the soprano): the fine lament on Thomas Farmer is a case in point. The series is particularly valuable in drawing attention to the shorter songs, rarely sung in recitals, which in their quirky unpredictability show Purcell's link with the tradition going back to Henry Lawes. It is a pity that, since we know so little how songs of the period were accompanied, the bass viol is not rested more. But criticism is minor in relationship to the value of the set as a whole. CB

The Essential Purcell The King's Consort, Robert King (79' 22") Hyperion KING 2

A generous and cheap anthology, mostly from the three Robert King Purcell series - Odes, Anthems and Songs - including complete such popular items as *Hear my prayer*, *Rejoice in the Lord alway* as well as excerpts, familiar and unfamiliar, from longer works. It is not quite a representative sampler of Purcell's music as a whole (instrumental and theatrical music are under-represented), but nevertheless something to whet the appetite for the barrage of Purcell we will be hearing next year and to entice us to buy the Hyperion series more extensively. CB

150 Anni di Musica Italiana (1550-1700) da Valente a Scarlatti Vol. 1 Cembalo. Rinaldo Alessandrini (76' 46")

Opus 111 OPS 30-118

Music by A. Valante, M. Facoli, G. de Maque, A. Mayone, G. M. Trabaci, G. Picchi, G. P. del Buono, Frescobaldi, F. Lambert, T. Merula, M. Rossi, G. Salvatore, B. Storace, G. Strozzi, A. Stradella & A. Scarlatti. Harpsichord by Francis-Cus Debonis, Rome 1678 (owned by WDR)

This gives a very good overview of the golden era of Italian keyboard music, including both well known and the more obscure composers. Gregorio Strozzi's *Corrente terza* is one of the highlights and there are very successful dances with open fifths and strong rhythms by Picchi and Salvatore. It is the more free expressive Toccatas, of which the CD has seven, which reveal the Italian temperament and sense of the miraculous. Alessandrini in his interesting notes says that each epoch has its own music and instruments: both are perfect, so one cannot talk of evolution, only transformation. I wonder if this is only true of certain great periods. The music of Frescobaldi was influential throughout Europe. This excellent recording must surely provoke more interest in other composers working in the same tradition.

Michael Thomas

Kammermusik mit Blockflöte Trio basiliensis Freiburger Musik Forum *Ars Musici* AM 1105-2 (67' 35")

(Marianne Mezger *rec*, Ekkehard Weber *vdg*, Paul Simmonds *hpscd*)
anon *Parthenia inviolata* 5, 7, 16; Dieupart Suite 6; Leclair Sonata op. 2/8; Locke Consort for several friends 4; Morel Chaconne en trio; Paisible Sonata 7; Schenk Sonata op. 2/8; Telemann Trio in d.

Kammermusik mit Blockflöte announces the title on the box. Well, not quite. We are also offered two items for viol to provide a welcome contrast. Although the virtuosic demands of Schenk's Sonata in e stretch Ekkehard Weber to the limit and the use of a harpsichord is surely superfluous here. Elsewhere the performances are efficient and dutiful rather than inspired, at their least beguiling in the French works and their best in an enchanting Trio in d by Telemann. Documentation is poor (we have provided more precise identifications above). The recording is natural and well-balanced.

Brian Robins

Voces Angelica: Portuguese Renaissance Church Music. Pro Cantione Antiqua, Mark Brown (51' 33" + 52' 19" + 50' 36") Teldec 4509-93690-2

Estêvão Lopes Morago *Jesu Redemptor, Laudate pueri, Comissa mea, Magnificat* VIII toni, *Oculi mei*; Duarto Lôbo *Magnificat* VIII toni; Estêvão de Brito *Lamentations, Ego dilecto meo, Vidi Dominum, Agnus & Communio*; Filipe Magalhães *Asperges me; Missa de Beata Virgine*; Frei Manuel Cardoso *Massa pro defunctis*; John IV *Crux fidelis*.

These three discs of Portuguese church music (Renaissance in style rather than chronology) provide us with an interesting anthology of the sort which is once again, thankfully, coming back into fashion with record companies. Pro Cantione Antiqua have a number of similarly important collections to their name. It was recorded in 1981, and although the sound quality is very fresh, it occasionally shows its age by the style of performance. The music is of consistently high quality, impassioned and suave by turns.

D. James Ross

LATE BAROQUE

Bach 18 *Chorale Preludes* Vol. 1: BWV 651-661. Vol. 2: BWV 662-668. Martin Souter (73' 25" & 75' 31")

Isis CD007 & CD008 (Priory)
Vol. 2 also includes *Six Schübler Chorales* (BWV 645- 650), *Liebster Jesu wir sind hier* (BWV 731), *Prelude & Fugue* in G (BWV 541)

The notes to these two CDs (in a language just on the safe side of the precious) refer to the truly magical experience of player, music and instrument coming together into an inspiring whole. It doesn't take much listening to realise that this is indeed the case. This is a remarkably musical recording. The organ is the little-known and unrestored 1696 Schnitger (with later work by Hinsz in 1768 and Freytag in 1809) now in the Hervormde Kerk in Noordbroek in the north east corner of Holland. Although retaining its *Chorton* (a semitone higher than modern pitch) the temperament seems to have been equalised, reducing the dramatic effect of, for example, *Jesus Christus Unser Heiland*. I don't know if it is the influence of the later changes, but the organ, unlike some northern Germanic instruments, sounds ideal for this repertoire, with a cohesive *pleno* more akin to the Silbermanns of Bach's home territory. Martin Souter clearly built up a close relationship with it: his sensitive and gentle touch caresses the sounds from the pipes in a musical way that organists so rarely attempt. The choice of registrations is masterly, with frequent use of single stops and simple sounds. He writes that he soon gave up searching for different sounds, letting the organ choose the registrations and guide his tempo, style and articulation - the organ certainly made some very good choices. However many Bach recordings you have, you must get one or both of these.

Andrew Benson-Wilson

Bach *Trio Sonatas* BWV 525, 527, 529, 530, 1031 Marion Verbruggen *recorder*, Mitzi Meyerson *hpscd* (63' 05")
Harmonia Mundi HMU 907119

The arrangements (from organ trios and a Bach-circle flute sonata) work well, although I should like to know more than one word about Verbruggen's recorders and pitches; does she use a voice flute? The general effect is extremely agreeable, and only after closer attention did I discover why I couldn't keep my attention on the music. Their enviable ease of communication covers too many tiny faults. One is inexact intonation, which tends to be on the flat side in the recorder and even worries me within the harpsichord occasionally (mistuned or mistempered?) Another is some lack of consistency over articulating and phrasing of imitative lines exchanged between the players. All might have worked better had there been a string (preferably gamba) bassline - something this writer still prefers in continuo solo sonatas, and which, with the recorder, is now so seldom included.

Stephen Daw

Mancini Seven Recorder Sonatas (nos. 1, 4, 6, 7, 12, 14, 19) Ricardo Kanji *rec*, Marc Destrubé *vln*, Irmgard Schaller *vln*, Emilio Moreno *vla*, Jacques Ogg *hpscd*, Hidemi Suzuki *vln* (63' 31")
Globe GLO 5120

Kanji is accompanied by harpsichordist Jacques Ogg and cellist Hidemi Suzuki in four solo sonatas; they are joined by violinists Marc Destrubé and Irmgard Schaller for two ensemble sonatas; violist Emilio Moreno completes the ensemble for a sonata in G minor. The last three are essentially chamber concertos: there are concerto passages for both the recorder and the strings. Kanji is a clean player with strong tone and a direct approach. His ornaments are subtle and unobtrusive (in contrast with the recently reviewed Giardino armonico performance of the D minor sonata). Although the continuo section is limited to cello and harpsichord, the dynamic shaping of lines by both soloist and Suzuki and their obvious enjoyment of the music sustained my interest for the duration. *Kah-Ming Ng*

P. Philidor Flute Suites (1-3, 5, 6, 12) Wilbert Hazelzet *fl*, Jacques Ogg *hpscd*, Titia de Zwart *vdg* + Kate Clark *fl*, Mike Fentross *lute*
Globe GLO 5107 (65' 40")

Like the Bachs, the Philidors were one of those musical dynasties whose members are noted not only for their fecundity (in matters compositional) but also for the profusion of like-sounding names. This disc is devoted to the lesser-known Pierre Danican, whose *œuvre* is represented by three flute suites, two flute trios and a suite for two flutes. Unless you are a particular fan of Hazelzet and of his ample nervous vibrato, you won't be imbibing all its contents in one go. Philidor's music doesn't particularly lend itself to imaginative interpretation, not that the ensemble ever tries. Hazelzet's graceful and stylish playing is not supported by the generous though unhomogenous-sounding continuo team of theorbo, harpsichord and viol. There is no variety in continuo texture: the omnipresent harpsichord could have been relieved by the lutenist who, when used, is remarkably inventive and idiomatic. *Kah-Ming Ng*

Telemann Ouverture a 11; **Concerti** a 3, 4, 6, 9 Les Éléments Amsterdam (78' 11")
Globe GLO 5104

TWV 55 e3; concertos in D 2 *fl*, *vln*, *vlc*; F *rec*, *bsn*; E *fl*, *ob d'am*, *vla d'am*; G *picc*, *fl*, *ob*, *chalumeau*, 2 *db*

I am partial to anything by Telemann, so this has been an enjoyable disc for me. It is a programme of typical Telemann, an unpredictably varied selection of concerti grossi of motley instrumentation, the most outragous being the *Concerto a 9* for objects spanning the gamut from piccolo to two double basses. The playing is wholesome, in the best sense of the word. Less polite reviewers might refer to Les Éléments as a severely under-the-weather *Musica Antiqua Köln*, but I masochistically relish the *frisson* of imperfect intonation and ensemble playing. The generous playing time, the *joie*

de vivre of the performance and the subterranean grunts of the two double-basses are further plus points. *Kah-Ming Ng*

Konzerte für Flöte, Streichorchester und Basso continuo Patrick Gallois, Kammerorchester Carl Philipp Emanuel Bach, Peter Schreier (77' 23")
Deutsche Grammophon 439 895-2
CPE Bach *Concerto in G* Wq169 (H445); F. Benda *Concerto in e*; Frederick the Great *Concerto 3 in C*; Quantz *Concerto in G*.

I was a little surprised to receive this CD with a gleaming modern flute on the cover, but was found it most entertaining, thanks to the chirpy rhythmic playing and singing lines. The generous programme comprises four concertos from the court of Frederick the Great. Gallois's *forte* (no pun intended, for there is some beautiful quiet playing) is that his point of departure, tonally, is a crystal-clear sound, from which he radiates a vast spectrum of colours. However, one often detects the conventional *perpetuum mobile* virtuosity, with little sense of rhythmic or harmonic hierarchy. The balance is lopsided in favour of the flute, with the continuo (a tinny harpsichord and stodgy bass) hardly phrased. Although the string band is not noticeably 'modern' in the sprightlier movements, it betrays lugubrious torpidity in the more *empfindsam* movements. *Kah-Ming Ng*

Airs for the Seasons The Leda Trio (42' 00")
Springthyme SPRCD 1036
Foulis Sonatas 2, 3 & 5; Oswald *The Lilac*, *The Nightshade*, *The Lily*, *The Sneezewort*, *The Narcissus*

This delightful collection of chamber music from 18th-century Scotland is elegantly performed on modern instruments by a trio of accomplished young Scottish musicians. The violin sonatas by David Foulis (1710-1769) are the work of an endlessly inventive mind, while Oswald's *Airs for the Seasons* (1747) are charmingly galante and at times movingly expressive in an idiom that is more profound than the expected 'Euro-baroque with a Scottish accent'. The recording is rather immediate, making the violin sound brittle at times, but it presents with admirable clarity the scrupulous accuracy of the playing. A perfect introduction to the riches of this period of Scottish composition. *D. James Ross*

CLASSICAL

Beethoven Sonata for Cello, Op 17, Variations WoO 45, 46 & op. 66 Pieter Wispelwey, Lois Shapiro (45' 00")
Channel Classics CCS 6494

The three sets of variations are on Handel's *See the conqu'ring hero* and Mozart's *Bei Männern welche Liebe fühlen* and *Ein Mädchen oder Weibchen* (both from *Die Zauberflöte*). Wispelwey has been criticised in some quarters for bringing too much of his modern Romantic playing to his period performances: I totally disagree and, while there is more scope here than, say, in his Vivaldi release with *Florilegium*, this disc says it all. The

sense of drama in the pieces; the pursuit of seamless melody; the often dazzling virtuosity. These are all part of his style. He is admirably partnered by Lois Shapiro. She plays the variations on an anon Viennese fortepiano of c.1780 and changes to a Walter copy by Paul McNulty for the fourth work on the disc, the F major sonata. Here again, each of the movements is carefully characterised and the dramatic tension, such as there is, strengthens the impact of their playing. *BC*

MISCELLANEOUS

Festive Fair: Five Centuries of Popular Song and Dance Musica Antiqua, dir. Michael Uridge. 74'30"

Symposium 1157

I get worried when someone sends us a subscription along with a CD and a modest request for a review. This is probably not a record that readers are likely to buy for continuous listening, comprising 55 tracks ranging from dances from Alfonso's *Cantigas* by way of Arbeau's *Orchésographie* to a wassail song. But it is useful as a guide to a wide variety of clearly identified early instruments, and its quotation of an accessible (even if not always the most reliable) edition for each item is a feature other recordings could follow. The playing is not exactly *Musica Reservata* or *The New London Consort*, but it is fine for its purpose. Those trying to use early music for teaching will find this extremely useful.

Chanticleer Records, 650 Fifth Street, Suite 311, San Francisco, CA 94407 (+1 415 896 5866, fax 896 1660)

Emergo: The Complete Record Company, Unit 3-4, Northgate Business Centre, Crown Road, Enfield, Mddlx, EN1 1TG

Freiburger Musik Forum (*Ars Musici*), Nordstrasse 2, 79104 Freiburg, Germany (+69 761 570 31, fax 761 50 00 86); subscribers can get copies from fellow-subscriber Paul Simmonds, 36 De Montford Road, Brighton, BN2 3AU.

Globe: The Complete Record Company Ltd,

Lyrichord Discs, 141 Perry Street, New York NY 10014

Opus 111: Harmonia Mundi

Springthyme Records, Balmalcolm House, Kingskettle, Fife, KY7 7TJ (0337 830773)

Symposium Records, 110 Derwent Avenue, East Barnet, Herts EN4 8LZ (*Festive Fair* is also available direct from Michael Uridge, 21 Lancaster Rd, Worthing, W. Sussex BN12 4BP, tel 0903 241420)

MISSING REVIEWS

A batch of reviews by BC is trapped on his computer in Dundee while he is several hundred miles away in Carshalton Beeches assisting in the production of *Lassus*, *Palestrina* etc for Joed Music. These will appear in the next issue: we apologise for their delay.

LETTERS AND COMMENTS

Dear Mr Bartlett,

I read with interest the list of unanswered questions on the back page of the July issue. One of these asks when the bass violin was replaced by the cello, another on whether the great bass viol survived and whether it affected the scoring of the Fantazias by Purcell.

I have been in correspondence recently with Peter Holman, with whom I worked in the London Handel Orchestra and now and again with the Parley of Instruments, over a very interesting double-bass of mine made in 1695 by Edward Lewis, a noted 17th-century viol maker. A few years ago he suggested that this could be the first English bass, as he had previously not found one earlier than 1701. In a recent letter (18 August) he enquired whether the Lewis bass was intended to play 16' pitch, not remembering how large it was, and wondered if it might have been used to play low-pitched bass lines at pitch, for instance coping with the bottom AAs in Croft's *Te Deum* and *Jubilate*.

With a string length of 105cm (41½") from nut to bridge, this is the tallest of my contrabass instruments and I am sure that it must have been built to play bass lines at 16' pitch. But if so, why? Had Lewis been commissioned, or had he the foresight to see that such instruments would be used in England as they had in Italy and elsewhere? After all, makers like Gasparo da Salo had been making double-basses a hundred years earlier. Saggione is the first known double-bass player in England and Haym the first cellist. Both played in the Haymarket opera orchestra from 1705/6. Haym had arrived in England in 1701.

As the Lewis bass was built in 1695, had experiments in doubling the bass line already taken place with larger forces in larger halls? For this the larger violone tuned DD-d would have been used, and perhaps a heavier sound still was required. Holman has pointed out that the range of orchestral bass parts moves up after the arrival of Haym and Saggione and they no longer look as if they were written for bass violins playing at 8' pitch. One can be fairly sure that the cello replaced the bass violin soon after Haym's arrival, and that implies the use of a 16' pitch bass.

The 'great dooble base' used in the Fantasies of Orlando Gibbons was most likely a great bass viol tuned GG-g; I have found a copy of the 1563 Hans Vogel violone most suitable when playing them with my group Harmonie Universelle. It would be interesting to know if this was still used with or instead of the bass violin in Purcell's day and whether it would affect the scoring of Purcell's Fantazias. I hope to celebrate the double tercentenary of the death of Purcell and the birth of my instrument with performances of the music of one upon the other.

Anthony van Kampen

Dear Clifford,

While I entirely sympathise with the sentiments in your editorial in Early Music Review No. 4, I think it's a little hard to accuse OUP of 'swallowing up' Dent's Master Musicians if the implication is either that the series is going to disappear or be made more academic. You have no evidence for either of these implications, and most other people who have expressed a view on this have tended to take the position that OUP's acquisition of the series is good news in view of the uncertainties that have attended the Dent music list over the previous few years.

Bruce Phillips, Oxford University Press

My comment was not intended to be in any way critical of OUP, and indeed I am very glad that this excellent series is now in good hands. My concern was that yet another general publisher had given up issuing good-quality books on classical music. Thank goodness that Thames and Hudson and Faber have survived (to mention two publishers who, along with OUP, are preparing us for Purcell year with what I confidently expect will be fine and readable books.)

CB

I was pleased to receive from Barra Boydell, one of our subscribers, a copy of an article he had written for *Records of Early English Drama* Vol. 18, no. 2 (1993) about the musicians whom Richard Boyle kept on the payroll of his establishment at Lismore. At times in the 1620s there were as many as six players, and instruments included viols, harp and organ (the earliest known organ in an Irish house). There was also an organ and five vicars choral at Lismore Cathedral at this time. There seems quite a lot of material for the basis of a future Lismore Festival.

We regret that there was a misunderstanding with Harold Copeman over his article on Singing 15th-Century Music in Cyprus. What was printed was a shortened paraphrase of what he submitted, omitting much non-musical Cypriot history. I had prepared it somewhat freely as a draft for discussion. But his covering letter had become separated from his texts and I did not realise that he was going to be away until after our press date. By the time I became aware that he was not going to be able to see it, our layout committed us to the shortened version. I made the decision to print it, and the author is unhappy with what has appeared. He is particularly offended by my reference to 'Saint Aphrodite'. I was recalling something I remembered from school days about the incorporation of pagan deities into the local Christian hierarchy of saints, and I wonder whether that was a piece of mis-information based on a flippant remark or whether it is in fact true. Have any readers come across a Cypriot shrine to her? Apologies too for the misprints, especially of the Willises.

CB