

Early Music

REVIEW

Number 21

June 1996

including

ANNUAL BYRD NEWSLETTER 2

ISSN 1355-3437

Price £1.50

Editor: Clifford Bartlett

Associate editor: Brian Clark

Administration: Elaine Bartlett

Reviewers:

Andrew Benson-Wilson

Peter Branscombe

Steven Cassidy

Margaret Cranmer

Stephen Daw

Shane Fletcher

Anthony Hicks

Ian Graham Jones

Kah-Ming Ng

Brian Robins

Lynda Sayce

Michael Thomas

2 Books and music

English Opera

4 Andor Gomme *Semele*

5 James Huw-Jeffries *Comus*

6 CD Reviews

14 Music for Church

between pages 8 & 9

Annual Byrd Newsletter

including the first edition of

Byrd: Haec est dies

Early Music Review is published on the first of each month except January and August. by

King's Music, Redcroft, Banks End,

Wyton, Huntingdon, Cambs PE17 2AA

tel +44 (0)1480 52076 fax +44 (0)1480 450821

e-mail cbkings@ibm.net

Subscription (UK) £10.00 (Europe) £13.00

Rest of world £20.00 (airmail), £13.00 (Surface)

Cheques payable to King's Music except French

francs (FFR115) & \$US (\$30.00 airmail, \$20

surface) payable to C. A. J. Bartlett

A recent issue of *Classical Music* contained a letter from the Britten Estate objecting to a recording of Britten's folk-songs in which the singer commendably went back to the first edition to give the proper text of *Little Sir William*. In the original, the boy was killed by 'the Jew's wife'. Britten seems to have worried that it was antisemitic and later editions have some unconvincing changes (visible to the keen eye by an unmatching typeface). It is understandable that, just after the Second World War, people might have been hypersensitive about such matters. But that war finished fifty years ago and it is very odd that it should now be thought more acceptable to sing about a murderous 'school-wife' than about the wife of a Jew? Has the Tory contempt for teachers reached so far? In fact, if anyone should be offended by the song it should be believers in Merrie England who don't want to admit that there were racist killings in medieval times.

I am grateful to have the original text pointed out: it shows that the folk memory of the medieval story was not as corrupt as it seemed to be. What strikes me as odd is that the guardians of Britten's reputation seem to believe that any mention of a wicked act performed by a Jew is antisemitic. The song is only about one particular 'Jew's wife', and a Jew is as likely to kill as anyone else (I write this just after the Israeli bombing of a Lebanon UN base). Would there be grounds for objecting by the locals if Britten had set a song about murders by a woman of Huntingdon? And if rewriting is necessary to avoid offending Jews, how about that other PC-protected group, women?

I had intended to write about the current fad for plainchant CDs. I acquired *The Great Composers: Gregorian Chant* at our local newsagents and sent off for the *Sunday Times* Easter chant offer. But the latter has not arrived. I would be interested to hear how those who buy such discs as background music or for meditation really react to them. Do readers have any acquaintances who know nothing about chant but play such CDs who might write about how they respond and what they mean to them?

CB

BOOKS AND MUSIC

Clifford Bartlett

NORTH GERMAN CHURCH MUSIC

Geoffrey Webber *North German Church Music in the Age of Buxtehude* Clarendon Press, Oxford. xi + 236pp, £35.00 ISBN 0 19 816212 X

Travelling through such Hanseatic towns as Stralsund and Rostock last autumn I wondered what sort of music took place in the massive, red-brick churches of the area. This, for a period of about fifty years, tells us. The major collections of sources are those of Düben (in Uppsala), covering the 1660-1680s, and the Bokemeyer (in Berlin), assembled at Gottorf in the 1690s and at Wolfenbüttel after 1702. Even Buxtehude's vocal music is rarely performed, so that of his contemporaries is almost entirely unknown, though some is included in DDT, *Das Erbe deutscher Musik* and the Hänssler anthologies of music from Danzig. The list of works cited gives modern editions. Nice though it is to have a CD in which Webber directs his college choir in S. Wesley, it would be even better if he could give us a chance to hear some of this music about which he writes so temptingly: let's hope one will follow.

One of his themes is the influence of Italian music, partly from composers going south, partly from performers coming north. A sub-theme which might have been pointed more clearly is the varying popularity of Venice and Rome as sources of stylistic models. Incidentally, the fact that he twice quotes items based on Monteverdi's *Vespers* does not mean that the 1610 edition was known as a whole, since the first two pieces were reprinted in Nuremberg in 1615. It is unlikely that the castrato Giovanni Gualberto sung the title role in *Orfeo*, written for tenor. Webber twice mentions that an Italian pronunciation of German was recommended.

The path through the controversy on the place of music in worship is deftly delineated. Some expected the words to be comprehensible to the congregation, while others were only concerned about the general effect. The ideas on church music of both traditionalist Lutherans and pietists are not always predictable. Webber gives a good sketch of the place of music in the services and the different emphases of court and town establishments. A chapter is devoted to the texts, which were often very elaborately constructed. The chapters on the music have enough quotations to back up the arguments and give a flavour of the music under discussion. For those who wish to go further, there is a chapter on performance practice. One point not made entirely clear is the extent to which solo motets or sections need a melodic bass accompaniment and whether there was a change in this respect during the period under study.

HANDBOOK to the SEASONS

Paul Everett *Vivaldi: The Four Seasons and other concertos, Op. 8* (Cambridge Music Handbooks) Cambridge UP, 1996. xiv, 104pp. hb £ 19.95 ISBN 0 521 4049, pb £6.95 ISBN 0 521 40692 7

'What's in a name?' Quite a few millions of pounds, in terms of the total income for performers, promoters and recording companies of Vivaldi's op. 8/1-4. I wonder what we would have made of these curious pieces if title and programme had been lost? Music can be precise in depicting emotion but terribly ambiguous in showing the cause of that emotion, and most illustrations need a key (or an agreed convention) to be meaningful. Everett's excellent book underplays the programmatic detail: 'In these works, the sum of their individual depictions remains a series of scantily connected ideas; it is the perceived flavour of the concerto as a whole, not the depictions by themselves, that inspires and fixes in the listener's mind a single impression of the season in question.' I wonder. But he does come up with a new idea for the source of Vivaldi's poem, drawing attention to the similarity with Milton's *L'allegro* and *Il penseroso*. Since the idea only came to the author at the latest stage of completing the book, he leaves detailed discussion for a separate article. It seems to me inherently more probable that there might be a common source. Milton's use of Italian titles is in itself suggestive of an Italian background. We must wait and see.

Everett's main concern is how the music is put together. If you want to know how to write spoof Vivaldi, virtually all the information is here – except, of course, how to make it sound like Vivaldi from the very first bar. The account of Vivaldian form as used in op. 8 is clear and even those who are not reading for professional or educational purposes can find out without too much technical language (though *comparator* on p. 88 reads oddly) how Vivaldi sustains the attention through a movement and gives it a coherent shape. All the information I expected to find is here, including a note of early arrangements, the most intriguing being a transformation into a motet *Laudate Dominum de cælis* by Corrette. Vivaldi's poem is given a more precise translation than it often gets.

Strangely for so popular a work, there is not yet a reliable edition of *The Seasons*, though a new one (taking account of the MS material at Manchester as well as the op. 8 publication) will appear from Ricordi shortly. In addition to the facsimile from Alamire which Everett mentions, there is another from Performers' Facsimiles. Both include the page of cello obbligato from the slow movement of *Winter*

that is lacking from virtually all modern editions and most recordings.

I'm not sure if CUP is on to a winner: the sort of people who buy books on their favourite pieces would probably be embarrassed if seen buying a CD of *The Seasons*. But this covers another eight fine concertos as well, and is probably the most thorough account of an aspect of Vivaldi's music likely to be available to the non-academic.

MARIANNA MARTINES

A couple of days after taking last month's *EMR* to the printer I received the latest issue of *The Journal of Musicology* (vol. XII.4, Fall 1995) which concludes with an article by Irving Godt 'Marianna in Italy: The International Reputation of Marianna Martines (1744-1812)'. Apart from displaying a political incorrectness surprising for an American academic (the patronising use throughout of just the christian name for his subject, though Franz Joseph and Wolfgang Amadé are referred to by surname), this is a useful article about a capable and, from what I could detect from a rather heavy performance, interesting composer. The explanation of the Italian *In exitu Israel* is that it is one of a group of settings of an Italian translation direct from the Hebrew, not via the Vulgate, sent to Metastasio from Naples by Saverio Mattei in the hope that he would get Hasse to set them. Hasse excused himself on the grounds that he had gout, so Metastasio entrusted them to Martines. *In exitu Israel* perhaps dates from 1772. The following year she was elected to the Accademia Filarmonica of Bologna on the strength of her *Miserere* and in 1774 she sent her *Dixit Dominus* (to the normal Latin text). Godt reckons that it 'may well be her masterpiece'. It will be published by A-R Editions; next summer is the target date.

HAYDN SONATAS

László Somfai *The Keyboard Sonatas of Joseph Haydn: Instruments and Performance Practice, Genres and Styles* translated by the author in collaboration with Charlotte Greenspan. Chicago UP, 1995. xx + 389pp, £35.95. ISBN 0-226-76814-7

We already have a recent and thorough musicological study of Haydn's keyboard music in A. Peter Brown's *Joseph Haydn's Keyboard Music* (Indiana UP, 1986), so my initial reaction was one of dismay at another substantial book, essentially somewhat older (it was originally published in Hungarian in 1979), covering similar ground. In fact, the two are remarkably different. Brown's book is a more 'conventional drawing together of available information, supplemented by his own thorough research. Somfai's is more an individual's reflection, starting from his own profound understanding and experience of the sonatas themselves. The contrast should not be pushed too far; Somfai has mastered the literature, Brown writes with intelligence. But one feels that Somfai is reaching out from the music itself towards all aspects of musicology which

might illuminate it whereas Brown's approach is more from the outside. Somfai also has a refreshing concern with how the music is played: one rarely feels that he is just analysing notes on a page. His analytic approach is refreshing, and although this is a difficult book to read, it will repay thorough study. Those working at the sonatas, whether on fortepiano or modern piano, will find that their understanding and performance benefits enormously from coming to grips with Somfai's thoughts on them.

MOZART

Konrad Küster *Mozart: a Musical Biography* translated by Mary Whittall. Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1996. xviii + 409pp, £25.00. ISBN 0 19 816339 8

Format and price suggest that this is intended for a wider market than the Clarendon Press's more musicological tomes. Its style is, however, learned rather than popular, despite the attempt at headline-style chapter titles (*On Doctor's Orders* or *Süssmayr in the Spring of 1792*). The book comprises 40 short chapters, each based round a single work or group of works. There is no systematic survey of his output, but the spotlight technique works well enough. The book is not primarily biographical, but the main events in his life are covered. What is a little disturbing is the variety of tone from one chapter to another. Sometimes we get quite detailed analysis, at others a fairly superficial account of the circumstances of a work. I was pleased to see a chapter devoted to the clarinet trio, one of the few chamber works I know well from the inside (having played both the viola and the piano parts), and was disappointed to find it chiefly about skittles and whether Mozart could compose while playing. (No information, however, on how the game was played.) But there is some method in the apparently erratic approach, and in a kaleidoscopic way the book builds up a varied picture that may be more effective than a more apparently systematic one. I wouldn't recommend this as a first book on Mozart, but it is a stimulating one. If you read a library copy and find that a label has been stuck over the multicoloured notation of K 495 on the endpapers, complain vigorously!

As an editor, I would be delighted if I really believed that the revelations of the *Neue Mozart Ausgabe* have been of any great significance in causing the ubiquity of Mozart's music (p. viii), but fear that it is wishful thinking. Just as, despite our delusions as critics, the difference between a good and competent performance is so minute that most listeners cannot detect it (a famous performer has to fail disastrously to avoid a standing ovation), so the difference between a performance from the older editions and NMA will be imperceptible to 99% of the listening public.

Rather less of me this month, to allow space for the Byrd Newsletter. Fortunately, very little material came in until the last minute. But there is plenty for next month, including the recent output from PRB (the Telemann cantatas look tempting) and, at last, the 1993 Performing Purcell Conference publication.

ENGLISH OPERA

SEMELE STAGED

Eccles's, that is, not Handel's. It is an ironic footnote to a sad story of the contemporary snuffing-out of what might have started a real tradition of English opera that Handel's now famous piece 'in the manner of an oratorio' should in this century have been made into a staple of baroque opera, despite all the awkwardness of managing lengthy static choruses, while poor Eccles, composer of the one of minute group of English through-composed operas, was denied any performance at all in his own time through the combination of the Lord Chamberlain's hamfistedness and the duplicitous machinations of the infamous Christopher Rich. *His Semele* was not given its given its first airing until 1964, and then only in a concert version.¹ Now, 289 years after it was written, it has finally reached its true place on the stage in an exuberant production by Mayfield Opera which was clearly enjoyed by the cast as much as by the sadly small audience in the Gulbenkian Theatre at the University of Kent, where I saw the last of five performances (the first three having been given in Tunbridge Wells).²

It wasn't quite such a performance as one might have expected to see at Drury Lane in 1707, though the rather bizarre assortment of costumes – some evidently aping the Roman style, but with a monkish 'chorus of priests and augurs' and Juno less herself than like Marie-Antoinette in her dairy – might have been designed to recall the 'old Cloaths' which Congreve's company took with them when they moved to the Haymarket. The set consisted of two columns and a couch, moved by members of the cast, who looked understandably nervous when standing near the smoke machine which announced the frequent marks of divine disapproval. The seven-strong band, in 18th-century dress on stage right, was a minimalist version of the orchestra – with six each of first and second violins – that Eccles specified for ritornelli; but their sound was admirably full, the balance just and the intonation, crucially exposed in one-to-a-part playing, pretty well impeccable. From somewhere – I haven't seen a score and the programme told us nothing of it – Michael Fields had found aptly pert music to supply the lost overture and something a little less good for the final chorus: as well as directing and playing in the band, he was in charge of the overall production – a double duty whose strain was occasionally visible in the unschooled gestures of the less experienced singers.

Vocally there was much to admire, and perhaps one should mention first of all the exceptionally clear diction of the whole cast: no need for surtitles here! Evelyn Tubb brought to the title role the rich and expertly modelled drama that all who know her solo singing will be familiar with – ranging from deep anguish, which made her opening

lament at being forced into an unwelcome marriage extremely moving, to something near farce in the scene in which Juno tricks her into narcissistic self-admiration in a magic mirror. Jane Haughton's Juno was suitably both authoritative and scheming; in what is perhaps the most remarkable number in the whole opera – the Act 3 duet with Iris accompanied only by two solo violins without bass – her dark tones and the ringing soprano of Ruth Gomme wrapped themselves round one another to magical effect. John Hancorn was a sturdy rather than heart-throb Jupiter – he is, of course, seen almost entirely in the 'human' form in which he appears to Semele – and could have done with some filling-out in the lower register. Ansy Boothroyd made a remarkably Puckish Cupid, capering around the stage with such dash that one really began to doubt the blindness of the god on which her (or his) own words laid such repeated stress. Also worth special mention was the remarkable *haute-contre* voice of Robert Balconi (as Athamas, Semele's betrothed), which could slip into falsetto in the alto range with barely a hint of a change of register.

And the opera? It's much too good to have had such a luckless fate, and it's time people stopped apologising for Eccles as a pallid sub-Purcellian or complaining that his *Semele* isn't as good as Handel's (which is a very different kind of music drama and incidentally sets a considerably amended libretto). It's historically fascinating – had anyone ever written a quartet like that in Act 1, in which four characters sing simultaneously from opposed points of view within the same music? – but much more than just historically. As he had already shown in *The Judgment of Paris*, Eccles has impressive powers of characterization – of the moment as well as of the person: witness the contrast between Jupiter's horrified realization of the consequence of having agreed to grant Semele's every request, when the descending bass beats out the ominous threat to her life, and the pompous *da capo* (a rare thing in *Semele*) in which he self-importantly announces himself on his first appearance.

Eccles's recitative, as Roger Fiske has shown, has what Handel never learnt, the native's instinctive feeling for the natural rhythm of English: Congreve remarks in his preface that 'what they call *Recitative* in Musick, is only a more tuneable Speaking, it is a kind of Prose in Musick; its Beauty consists in coming near Nature, and in improving the natural Accents of Words by more Pathetick or Emphatical Tones.' Despite a few banal cadences, Eccles is exceptionally sensitive to these accents; but the real revelation is of his skill in creating a form of continuous musical narrative in which recitative – *accompagnato* and more rarely *secco* – moves easily into arioso and thence into an astonishing range of aria types: the contrast with the Italian opera which shoved Eccles into a premature angling retirement is extreme.

Semele has its weak spots, which are to some extent the fault of the disjointed libretto: scenes on level ground are ill-connected to those in and around Olympus; the first act would benefit from losing some of its repetitions (the chief priest evidently believes that what he sings three times must be true); and the chirpy finale, in which Jupiter, after being largely responsible for *Semele*'s downfall and death, has the cheek to order her sulky sister to marry an only too willing Athamas, is a sad anticlimax (presumably the music was imported for this occasion). But if *Semele* hadn't been stifled at birth, the history of English opera might have been very different, and – who knows? – there might have been less call for Gluck's reforms. Enterprising theatre managers and festival organisers, please note; like the opera, this production is an entertainment too good to remain a memory merely of the few hundreds who had the forethought to make their way to Tunbridge Wells or Canterbury.

Andor Gomme

¹ Was the performance at St John's Smith Square on 22 April 1972 by Opera da Camera staged? I was in the audience, but cannot remember. Another 'first modern performance' took place a year or two ago in New York, directed by my friends Dongsok Shin and Gwendoline Toth. CB

² I must declare an interest here: my daughter was singing the part of Iris.

ARNE – COMUS

The 18th-century masque is a curious hybrid. Superficially, its elements of song, dance, music and drama are those of what we now call opera; however, here each element has its own separate identity. To be sure, they are linked by theme and association, but to weld them all into a coherent whole requires theatrical skill and vision of a high order.

Each April for the last six years, Opera Restor'd has run a course at Hitchin with the Benslow Music Trust. Attracting young professionals as well as keen amateur singers, dancers, and players, it leads to performances which have outgrown the hall at Little Benslow and now take place in Hitchin's delightfully intimate Queen Mother Theatre.

This year the choice fell on Thomas Arne's *Comus*, an adaptation of Milton's play from the previous century by John Dalton first performed in 1738. *Comus*, son of Circe and Bacchus, enslaves mortals through his magic arts, creating an alternative court of lecherous depravity. The Lady, lost in the wood searching for her two brothers, falls into his power, but is rescued through the intervention of the Attendant Spirit and of the water-nymph Sabrina. Such inter-relationship of the pastoral and supernatural appealed strongly to the more Romantic aspect of baroque sensibility, and the combination of Milton's play and Arne's bewitching music still has the power to charm us.

It is a great tribute to the talents of the performers and the inspiration of the coaching team (Peter Holman, Jack Edwards, Judy Tarling and Lucy Graham) that five days' study and rehearsal produced so polished and enjoyable a performance.

The nature of baroque instruments makes intonation and blend a very real problem for less experienced players, yet here these qualities were allied to stylish nuance and verve, as well as a real sensitivity to the business of accompanying singers. A morning spent playing Couperin on the last day not only afforded the opportunity to hear some delightful music, but also did much to develop the orchestra's confidence both with the idiom and with each other.

The amateur chorus sang and danced with gusto, entering vivaciously into their role as Comus's Rout: particularly memorable was their appearance as beasts, transformed with the help of some splendid masks, whilst their off-stage bestial howls chilled the blood to agreeable effect.

The weight of the vocal music falls to two sopranos and a tenor, who are given some of Arne's most exquisite music. Sadly, the three most beautiful soprano arias (a delicious Echo Song, a charming quasi-serious lament for lost love, and a lilting water song for Sabrina) were assigned to a soprano whose promise was belied by technical insecurity: this affected the clarity of her words and weighed down vocally music that should soar. However, Kevin McLean-Mair's silvery tenor (with perfect diction) and Angela Henckel's bell-like soprano (allied to a stage presence of irresistible voluptuous glamour) gave unalloyed pleasure. As did the solo dancing – in particular, the great Chaconne at the start of Act 3, danced by Karen Morgan and Hugh Hillyard-Parker with tremendous style and cool elegance, superbly conjured up the spirit of the age.

Perhaps inevitably, the spoken parts are the hardest to bring off today. Even adapted, Milton's philosophising, moralising brothers and their Guardian Angel, whether in his heavenly or bucolic guise, can be tedious. Evil is easier to play, and we were lucky to have Jack Edwards bringing his qualities of experience, eloquence and charisma to the title-role, offering a splendid dramatic focus. He was well matched by Teresa-May Whittaker as the Lady: her personal grace, beauty, and unaffected delivery made virtue a positive force, rather than an absence of vice.

The Queen Mother Theatre may not offer the flying machines and other technical gadgets of the baroque theatre; but aided by the handsome costumes and wigs, the visual impression was as strong as the musical and dramatic. Beautifully lit, a blue-green forest shimmered with alluring menace, and, with the addition of a sumptuous banquet table and a marble chair, transformed convincingly into Comus' Palace. As the Attendant Spirit, sung by Kevin McLean-Mair with exquisitely hushed tone, exhorted the Lady to climb the Hill of Virtue, and Comus writhed like Lucifer with the realisation of lost good, music and drama entwined into something greater than either. We in the audience were also involved in this learning experience with the realisation that the seemingly archaic form of the work was not merely a diversion, but could achieve a genuinely moving artistic experience.

James Huw-Jeffries

RECORD REVIEWS

CHANT

A Gregorian Feast Pro Cantione Antiqua, Mark Brown 58' 49" (rec. 1990/2)
Carlton Classics Musick's Monument 30365 00012

This stands out from other chant anthologies in two respects: it has a coherent selection comprising the introit, gradual, offertory and communion for five feasts, together with a concluding hymn, and it is an attempt to perform the chant, not in a standard modern or hypothetical medieval way, but in a renaissance style. The Gradual published by Giunta in Venice in 1611 is used as source. I use the word 'attempt' not to imply failure but to suggest that information is scanty on how chant was performed even as recently as the 16th century. This is a plausible guess, and the singing, by six singers who have averaged nearly 10 years singing chant twice a day at Westminster Cathedral, is impressive. CB

MEDIEVAL

Laudario di Cortona: a Medieval Mystery Ensemble Organum, Marcel Pérès 79' 38"
Harmonia Mundi HMC 901582

The 'Medieval' of the English title is more specifically '13th century' in French and German: why? The Lauda repertoire is remote to most Anglo-Saxon listeners; do we have a simplistic expectation that vernacular texts should be secular? The texts are of prime importance. The music is mostly stanzaic, with lots of stanzas that are often short like hymns rather than in the longer patterns of troubadour songs; so a little music goes a long way. Pérès here calls on his Corsican singers, whose sound may represent how people once sang in the more sophisticated centres. They are joined by Patrizia Bovi, who has taken part in the traditional *Calendimaggio* poetry and singing competitions in Assisi. The sound she makes is impressive, as is her ability to recreate the melody afresh for each verse. But if one were to plot *musica v. parole* on a graph, this comes almost at one corner, even if the sound is what initially attracts. A few polyphonic items are added (the Cortona MS is entirely monophonic and unmeasured) in a style which will astonish those who have not heard Pérès's Notre Dame CD. It reminded me of the Genoese dockers that A. L. Lloyd used to play in his lecture on folk polyphony. A fascinating disc. CB

RENAISSANCE

Dowland Complete Lute Works, vol. 2 Paul O'Dette 66' 38"
Harmonia Mundi HMU 907161

In spite of having performed much of Dowland's surviving music, and heard many recordings of it, I am still regularly

surprised by the sheer variety of his lute solos. No-one captures this better than O'Dette, and this recording is a delight throughout. The expected virtuosity is well to the fore, but now O'Dette no longer feels the need to prove his status as 'the fastest lute in the West', the more reflective pieces are more successful than on some of his earlier Dowland recordings. A must for lute enthusiasts, and an excellent introduction to England's most important lutenist-composer for anyone unfamiliar with his work.

Lynda Sayce

Narváez El Delfín de Música: Obras de Luys de Narváez Marta Almajano *sop*, Juan Carlos Rivera *vihuela* 63' 05"
Almaviva DS-0116

Anyone approaching the vihuela song repertory quickly becomes aware of the fundamental performance problem common to all surviving sources. The vocal lines are simple and need to be taken quite briskly if the texts are to be intelligible. The vihuela parts are spectacularly virtuosic, and verge on unplayable if the singer is allowed to dictate the tempo. I have long thought that the solution lies in the peculiarly Spanish *dedillo* technique whereby the vihuelist's finger is used back and forth like a plectrum, resulting in dazzling speed but a rather rougher sound than is considered acceptable today. To the best of my knowledge no-one has tried it on these songs. The performances here are undeniably attractive; Almanjo's intimate singing, embellished with mercurial folk-like ornaments in the Montserrat Figueras style, is very beguiling, and Rivera deserves a round of applause for his excellent solos and the aplomb with which he handles these fiendish accompaniments; they could hardly have been played faster using conventional lute technique. But most of the songs still sound pedestrian – the central problem of speed remains unsolved. This is an excellent state-of-the-art performance of this repertory, but the art is not 100% convincing yet.

Lynda Sayce

Alabanza de Tañedores: Organistas en Andalucía (1530-1626) Andrés Cea on organ at Evora Cathedral 71' 50"
Almaviva DS-0117
Music by Bermudo, Correa de Arauxo, Lacerna, Palero, Peraza

What wonderful music! And played magnificently on the fine sixteenth century (1562?) organ of Evora Cathedral. This is music to luxuriate in. It will not excite or thrill, in the way that Buxtehude might. It is vocal, melismatic, gentle and spiritual, in the way of the Iberian polyphonic masters of the Renaissance. The sub-text to the music is one of the many 'battles of the style' that music is littered with – in this case, between the *excellent* and the *barbarian* players, as described by Bermudo in 1555, and the development of the *glosas* style of

interpretation, probably brought about by a new tablature-style of writing music down (*cifra*). It is the music of Palero (found in Venegas de Henestosa's *cifra* publication of 1557) that would probably have incurred most of Bermudo's wrath – but then the style went on to produce the two masterpieces of Francisco Correa de Arauxo (1626) which concludes the CD. Andrés Cea uses the distinctive *flautados* registers of the Evora organ – the equivalent to the Principal chorus or pleno – to bring out the rich sonority of the pieces, registered and played in accordance with Bermudo's descriptions of the character of the various modes. As with Italian organs of the period, pitches are based on 24' or 12' stops, which sound wonderful on their own or in limited combinations with other stops of the chorus. Never more than five stops are used, and on an organ of this musicality and style, that is quite sufficient. The playing is highly musical and sensitive – Andrés Cea clearly loves his music and the organs which suit it best. This is attractively produced, with an intelligent and informative booklet insert. Buy!

Andrew Benson-Wilson

Gentil Madonna London Pro Musica, Bernard Thomas (60' 19")
Carlton Classics Musick's Monument 30365 00082

Chi passa per la strada, Chi chi li chi, Girometta: marvellously attractive, direct songs, that can be enjoyed without any prior knowledge (and without worrying about what they mean). I find it difficult to listen without feeling nostalgic for the years around 1970 when enthusiasts who had picked such pieces up by ear could sing divisions on them while sitting in a pub. We are more sophisticated now; *Girometta* is sung here with due regard to the verbal phrasing, and we can all buy the music thanks to Bernard Thomas's publications. Throughout the last 25 years he has been involved in teaching performance, though has less often emerged onto disc. Here he has assembled some of the best singers and players of renaissance music and put together a programme which should delight any listener – though I'd love to hear what Pérès's Corsicans could do with it. CB

O cieco mondo: the Italian Lauda c. 1400-1700 Hulegas Ensemble, Paul van Nevel
deutsche harmonia mundi Baroque Esprit 05472 77439 2 60' 53" (rec. 1988)

One of the first batch of a new mid-price series of reissues under a title which all our reviewers have found inappropriate; I thought that calling 15th century music baroque went out in the 1960s. The other common fault is the absence of texts and translations: this really is a false economy, especially for such word-based repertoire. That apart, this is a welcome reissue, appositely enabling us to follow the history of the lauda on from the earlier examples of

the *Laudario di Cortona* (see previous page). Most of the music here is from the 16th century, though there is a contrafactum of Landini's *Io ti lascio* and the title song is by Jacopo da Bologna. The approach is more cultured than on the Cortona disc and is sometimes rather too sombre, but this is worth getting despite the packaging. CB

17th CENTURY

Biber *Harmonia artificiosa-ariosa* The Rare Fruits Council 78' 53"
Auvidis Astrée E 8572

Brilliant playing of marvellous music. The strangely-named group (have I missed an allusion?) plays with the music, treating it with a flexibility that the older generation may find a little overdone, but is sparkingly stimulating. The notes by the violinist Manfredo Kraemer are a bit too sweeping in damning the ubiquitous baby organs of most modern performances, but it is nice to hear a more solid instrument, complete with *Zimbalstern*; and we don't often hear guitars in Biber. The vitality and imagination makes this an outstanding recording, my favourite of the month. CB

D'India *Il terzo libro de madrigali* The Consort of Musique, Anthony Rooley 54' 03"
deutsche harmonia mundi Baroque Esprit 05472 77437 2 (rec 1987)

I would recommend this reissue anyway, but at mid-price there is no excuse for not buying it. D'India may lack Monteverdi's emotional variety, but the intensity and the power of musical expression are there to the full. But no texts! Four pages of adverts, a page of blurb on the series and another about the galleries supplying the cover pictures are no substitute for the words. If four languages are too expensive, at least print the Italian poems. CB

De Visée *Pièces de Théorbe* José Miguel Moreno *theorbo in D* 68' 50"
Glossa GCD 920104

Recordings of de Visée's theorbo solos are not rare, but this one stands out because it is recorded entirely on a French solo theorbo, tuned a fourth higher than the standard continuo tuning. 'So what?' I hear you ask. The result is actually of considerable musicological importance. The theorbo in France is a much neglected topic, and the popular bits of its repertoire are almost invariably played on an Italian A-tuned theorbo. The D-tuned instrument plays in the same tessitura as the baroque lute, and has a much clearer, lighter sound than the murky depths of its larger brother. Having researched and commissioned a reconstruction of such an instrument myself a few years ago, I was heartened to see that my conclusions and Moreno's are virtually identical. The recording is supported by the most substantial notes I have ever seen in a CD case, and congratulations are due to the writer, Carlos Gonzalez, for picking his way accurately through the minefield of theorbo scholarship. As one comes to expect from

Moreno, the performances are crisp and beautifully phrased. I wonder about the rather manic improvised additions to the G major Chaconne, but otherwise the dances have poise and grace. Highly recommended, an essential purchase for anyone interested in the French baroque. Lynda Sayce

Grand Tour: Music from 16th- and 17th-century Italy, Spain and Germany His Majestys Sagbutts and Cornetts 69' 22"
Hyperion CDA66847
Music by Arauxo, Bassano, Buonamente, Castello, de Macque, Marini, Merula, Peñalosa, Scheidt, Schein, Vierdanck, Weckmann, Ximénez

There is a pleasing increase in the number of sackbut and cornett recordings of music from the instruments' heyday. Each group seeks to differentiate itself with a markedly different house style. The emphasis with HMSC (and a growing one over the last years) is on strong, forthright playing. The extra presence and brightness in the middle sackbut is distinctive and engaging. I would have welcomed the occasional move away from the constant, slightly anxious 'front of the beat' playing, particularly in the Italian section; repertoire which rewards the coolness of *sprezzatura* so valued at the time. The group comes into its own in the German repertoire with witty but unfussy playing, particularly in Scheidt's *Est-ce Mars*. Listening through in one sitting would have been easier if the slower paced music were between the Italian and following the Spanish sections, despite the less familiar repertoire and change of instrumentation in the Spanish music. There is some exciting playing here. Stephen Cassidy

Russian Easter Liturgy: the Easter Canon of St. John Damascene The Russian Patriarchata Choir, Anatoly Grindenko 57' 08"
Opus 111 OPS 30-145

This is a splendid example of Russian liturgical music at a fascinating stage in its history. Though the music on the disc all comes from one manuscript, there are three distinct styles: monophony, the extraordinary polyphonic style with its intriguing dissonances and the more syllabic three-part 'kant' with its supporting bass, possibly influenced by Western music in Poland. This can be heard in the *troparion* 'Christ is risen' that occurs many times in the office. This refrain is sung both to a jolly three-part chorus and in a strange polyphonic version; those not familiar with the style may know something similar in the *Gloria* of Stravinsky's Mass. The music is for what the Western church would call the office; between the first item and the second there is the loud ringing of bells as the moment of Easter occurs and the procession re-enters the church. The singing of the dozen men's voices is extraordinarily energetic and interest is maintained by the varying pace and dynamics as well as style, most movingly towards the end of the office when a four-part chorus solemnly sums up the meaning of Easter. This is not just for chant specialists; the notes are excellent and the full English version of the text can be followed. Shane Fletcher

LATE BAROQUE

Bach *Complete Cantatas* vol. 2 Amsterdam Barbara Schlick, Kai Wessel, Christoph Prégardien, Klaus Mertens SATB, Baroque Orchestra & Choir, Ton Koopman
Erato 0630-12598-2 182' 29" 3 CDs
BWV 12, 18, 61, 132, 152, 172, 182, 199, 203, 524

Apologies for the continued absence of a review: we hope to remedy it next month.

Bach *Cantatas* BWV 41, 6, 68 Barbara Schlick, Andreas Scholl, Christoph Prégardien, Gotthold Schwarz SATB, Chœur de Chambre Accentus, Ensemble Baroque de Limoges, Christophe Coin 62' 20"
Auvidis Astrée E 8555

If the notion of a complete series of discs featuring Bach's cantatas whose scoring includes the *violoncello piccolo* might seem quirky at first, it is completely justified by the qualities of this first such disc, a product of the fertile imagination of Christophe Coin. The movements featuring that instrument are outstandingly well done, not simply by the obligato soloist, but by the singers and continuo players also involved. The remainder of the three cantatas are also well performed on early instruments, including an organ by Gottfried Silbermann, placed high in the west-gallery of a small Thuringian church. Readers may recall my querying the absence of such a setting for any Bach cantata recording of which I knew hitherto; it seems that the microphone was also in the gallery, rather than beneath in the church, which obviously misses some of the point. The orchestra and choir share German and French names, and the vocal soloists are of the highest international rank. Especially outstanding, though, are the movements so expressively played by one of France's most gifted early music specialists. Stephen Daw

Bach *Der Streit zwischen Phoebus & Pan*, BWV 201 Efrat Ben-Nun, Maria Cristina Kiehr, Katharina Kammerloher, Andreas Scholl, Christoph Prégardien, James Taylor, Kurt Azesberger, Roman Trekel, Peter Lika, Klaus Häger SS A cT TTT BarBB RIAS-Kammerchor, Akademie für alte Musik Berlin, René Jacobs 134' 30" 2 CDs
Harmonia Mundi HMC 910544.45
In addition to BWV 201, contains: BWV 205 *Zerreißet, zersprenget* (Der zufriedengestellte Äolus), BWV 213 *Laßt uns sorgen* (Hercules auf dem Scheidewege)

Three of Bach's secular cantatas with strong dramatic ingredients are here performed as though they were actually baroque opera, or scenes. The results are easily the most persuasive readings of the works I have ever heard live or through recordings – a triumph for the new-to-CD ensemble that has revolutionised eastern Germany's previously rather uncertain way of dealing with early music. The soloists are slightly operatic in a modern sense, but director René Jacobs (who does not sing himself, incidentally, being admirably replaced as a counter-tenor by Andreas Scholl) has kept all tasteful and concentrated our attention on Bach's truly

operatic skills. There are outstanding notes by Hans Joachim Schulze – eastern Germany's outstanding Bach scholar for over 35 years, but until recently over-shadowed through political restrictions. The translations of the texts are accurate and helpful. Altogether authoritative and delightful. *Stephen Daw*

Bach Motets BWV 225-230 Kammerchor der Augsburger Domschulen, Reinhard Kammler deutsche harmonia mundi *Baroque Esprit* 05472 77436 2 60' 18" (rec 1987)

I'm afraid that this previously-issued recording, blazoned as one of a rather odd series claiming to convey the Baroque's 'esprit', does little to impress me. It is an adequate attempt by an all-male choir to convey Bach's magnificent motets, but far from competitive in a market including accounts conducted by Koopman, Herreweghe, Gardiner and others. None of their choirs is all-male, but is an all-male choir that has not been taught to sing with an appropriate tone and projection preferable? There are unacceptable faults also in ensemble and even tuning. There are no text translations, either. I am very surprised that under the new system and its excellent present director, the Leipzig Thomanerchor has not recorded the motets. That would indeed be something worth having.

Stephen Daw

Bach Organ Works vol. 3 Ton Koopman Teldec *Das Alte Werk* 4509-94460-2 75' 06" Contents: Sonatas 1-6, BWV 525-530

The third in Ton Koopman's new Bach series includes all six Trio Sonatas, which have been the delight of organ students from WFB onwards. There can be few of Bach's organ works that more closely approach the transfer of the style of other instruments to the keyboard – and there can be few performers as familiar with such styles as Koopman. His playing is sparkling, spirited and always musical. His characteristic approach to ornamentation is entirely appropriate to these wonderful pieces. His registration ranges from a gentle three-flute texture to movements on powerful *pleno* registrations. My only query would be with the occasional use of a rather too powerful Rückpositif registration for the upper voice, leaving the other voice distant and quiet. The organ is the huge four manual Arp Schnitger organ of 1693, with some pipe-work going back to 1512, recently restored by Ahrend. Splendid music, performance and organ.

Andrew Benson-Wilson

Bach Wachet auf: the Schübler Chorales, The Leipzig Chorales (The '18'), The Kirnberger Chorales Christopher Herrick (Metzler Organ of the Jesuitkirche, Lucerne). 147' 02" 2 discs Hyperion CDA67071/2 BWV 645-650, 651-668, 690, 691, 694-713

The six Schübler chorales are amongst the best known of all Bach works in this genre, while the Kirnberger chorales are relatively little known. As the notes remind us, there is a wealth of symbolism in the Schübler chorales: the musical letters BACH appear

exactly halfway through the collection, there is a range of numerical references adding up to the name Bach and the key relationship and *cantus firmus* are also arguably based on symbolic arrangements. These are strong performances by Herrick. His registrations are sparkling and bright and his playing is distinctly articulated – perhaps a bit too articulate for the close microphone position in this reverberant building and for music that needs to project a strong sense of musical line.

Andrew Benson-Wilson

The Young Bach: organ music and influences of the early years Douglas Hollick on the Halbach organ in Olomouc 74' 16"

Supraphon SU 3015-2 131

Bach BWV 542, 701, 709, 710, 726, 733, 737; Böhm *Christum wir sollen*, *Carpissio in D*, *Prélude & Fugue in C*, *Vater unser*; Buxtehude *BuxWV* 161, 204, 211-2; Pachelbel: *Allein zu dir*, *Fantasia in G*, *Toccatas in e & F*, *Vom Himmel hoch*

This is a fascinating tour around some of the influences on the young J.S. Bach, with examples of the type of music that he produced under the influence of such composers as Böhm, Pachelbel and Buxtehude. The fact that pieces by these very different composers all, to an extent, work on this organ is both an advantage (an interesting programme) and a problem (the organ itself). It was built in 1728, went through a romantic phase and was then reconstructed in 1977 in the 1728 style. The programme notes are sparse about details, but I do wonder if a restoration done today would have produced a very different tonal result. There are many organs in the Saxon and Thuringian areas (Bach's homelands) dating from the early 18th century (including many Gottfried Silbermann organs) which were restored in the 1960/70s to sound like the then fashionable North German organs of Schnitger. In most cases this fundamentally changed what was a distinctive organ style: and one that is very suitable for playing Bach of all periods. Although I don't know the Olomouc organ, or indeed other Moravian organs of this period, I am tempted to put it in this same category. The mixtures are shrill and are not helped by what sounds like an equal temperament. (On such organs, they were intended to amplify the fundamental 8' tone, rather than sit on top of the chorus and shout.) Hollick's choice of registrations does rather reinforce this style. The simple chorus to mixtures (typical of North Germany registration practice, but not of Bach) is used frequently, as are other rather spiky sounds. The sounds are not always pleasant. It would have been lovely to hear rather more of the wonderful 8' stops that, drawn together or added to the *pleno*, can produce such a characteristic full and rich sound on organs of this type. Otherwise Hollick's playing is generally musical and sensitive, with a good sense of musical direction.

Andrew Benson-Wilson

Bach Goldberg Variations Christophe Rousset L'Oiseau-Lyre 444 866-2 76' 44"

Christophe Rousset's Bach is very nimble, at times very sensitive, but it somehow fails to sound right to me as genuine Bach playing

on the harpsichord. There is too little variety in colour as he plays (does he not realise how essential this is to the playing of Bach on any adequate instrument or does he actually chose not to employ audible subtleties of touch?) Certainly, the outward aspects of the performance display a very dependable fingerwork and a clear sense of structural and technical designs within the most wonderful music. But there should be far more to it than that. If you enjoy his *Quodlibet* last variation you'll probably enjoy the whole disc!

Stephen Daw

Bach Brandenburg Concertos Amsterdam Baroque Orchestra, Ton Koopman 133' 05" Erato 0630-13733-2 2 discs (rec.1983)

If you want a mid-price set, this is a strong contender. Dating from a time when the orchestra seemed more English than Dutch (only the soloists are listed here, but the violins and violas of No. 3 are Huggett, Bury, Cracknell, Schlapp, Jones & Cleminson, and Goodman plays violin in No. 5), the playing is exciting and stylish. I feel that at times the phrasing is exaggerated to compensate for the aggression of the motor impulse: Koopman is a little more relaxed now – indeed, he had become so by the time the two extra items were recorded. These are the triple concerto (with Hazelzet & Manze, recorded in 1990) and a reconstruction of BWV 1059, 9 bars of which survive in autograph, as an organ concerto. (No, this isn't the height of presumption: the music is all from Cantata 35).

CB

Bach Ouvertüren BWV 1066-9 Akademie für alte Musik Berlin 98' 02"

Harmonia Mundi HMC 901578.79 2 CDs

This is a far from a run-of-the-mill account of the Suites I thought I knew so well, since in all respects it has quite clearly been very carefully prepared and recorded. The balances work well, despite rather shrill trumpets, with what sound like really effective early or reconstructed timpani, excellent and generally gentle woodwinds (some fine oboe and bassoon work from people I've never knowingly heard before) and really stylish, positive string-playing. Everything therefore hangs together and goes well. If one prefers a rather more prominent flautist for the B minor suite, one may prefer the Hyperion first record with Rachel Brown, but for me the player here (Ernst-Burghardt Hilse) is right not to try to sound too soloistic. A good buy – especially so if you already thought you knew this music well.

Stephen Daw

Fasch Three Suites for Orchestra Pro Musica Kiev, dir. Richard Kapp 53' 09" ESS.A.Y CD1041

This is the first of several recordings on modern instruments which are included by virtue of the fact that they cover unusual repertoire. The three suites reveal a confident composer with a sense of humour (like his idol, Telemann), here witnessed by the somewhat bizarre goings-on in the Overture, March and Pastoral movements

of the first D major suite. Richard Kapp justifies the re-ordering of the pieces to avoid an anti-climactic Minuet as being more in keeping with 20th century taste. In the early music world, surely our approach is to challenge such preconceptions? Still, these are bold and valuable recordings of a much neglected composer's output. *BC*

Handel *Messiah* Ruth Holton, Vanessa Williamson, James Griffet, Laurence Albert SATB, Gioia Della Musica Praha, Brnensky Akademicky Sbor, Mark Brown 147' 27" 2 CDs (rec 1992)
Carlton Classics *Musick's Monument* 30365 00117

This curious Anglo-Czech collaboration dates from 1992. It presents the complete standard text with the quirky exception of 'Their sound is gone out' as a tenor solo, an alternative that ought to be used only with the duet-and-chorus version of 'How beautiful'. The chorus is well-trained and has good English, but lacks fervour; the orchestra, with just 12 strings, lacks power. A closely-mixed harpsichord is the only chord-playing continuo instrument (which does at least ensure that no organ intrudes in the recitatives or 'He was despised'). The soprano soloist is particularly disappointing, and for me the main pleasure of the performance was Vanessa Williamson's pure tone in the alto numbers. The set might well have a place in a 'super-bargain' range, but at mid-price is uncompetitive. *Anthony Hicks*

Handel *Ariodante* Lorraine Hunt Ariodante, Juliana Gondek Ginevra, Lisa Saffer Dalinda, Jennifer Lane Polinesso, Nicolas Cavallier Il Rè, Rufus Müller Lurciano, Jörn Lindemann Odoardo, Wilhelmshavener Vokalensemble, Freiburger Barockorchester, Nicholas McGegan 202' 59" 3 discs
Harmonia Mundi *HMU* 907146.48

The high standard set by McGegan in his previous Handel opera sets is well maintained in this first period-instrument recording of one of the acknowledged pinnacles of Handel's output, based on the 1995 Göttingen Handel Festival production. The uncut text restores certain passages Handel removed before his first performance, notably in the role of the King of Scotland, which in its first state was apparently too taxing for the original singer (Gustavus Waltz, perhaps more skilled as Handel's cook, if Burney is to be believed). Thus the full autograph version of the King's Act 1 aria (with horns) is reinstated, and (as always in modern performance) his F minor aria in Act 2 is preferred to its trite major-key substitute. (The latter choice means that we hear two arias based on the same music, since Handel reworked the material of the discarded aria for Dalinda's aria in the same act; but there is enough difference to make the repetition acceptable.) McGegan follows modern practice in ending Act 2 with the original ballet of conflicting dreams and Ginevra's concluding accompanied recitative, rather than the short *Entrée de' Mori* which replaced both. (Handel transferred the ballet to *Alcina*.) The King's replacement aria and the *Entrée*

are however included in an appendix to CD2, together with an unpublished aria for a mezzo-soprano Dalinda, cancelled when Handel revised the part for soprano. I was thus able to hear for the first time the ending of Act 2 as Handel performed it, and pretty bleak it is. The context of the extra items is indicated in the booklet, but their provenance is not explained in Mark Stahura's woolly and verbally infelicitous note, even though he is credited with the edition. (He does not mention the King's Act 1 aria.)

The two sopranos, Gondek and Saffer, and the bass Cavallier are outstanding in a not-quite-ideal cast (Müller's colourless Lurciano is the weak spot). Gondek is vivacious in Act 1 and touches tragic depths in her final aria in Act 2, sometimes too slight for its context. Hunt is expressive in her slower music – the anger and grief in 'Scherza infida' are both palpable – but the voice thins a little in the virtuoso set pieces, especially the taxing 'Con l'ali di costanza'. Lane is correctly cast as Polinesso, written for a female alto, but is not entirely convincing: the evil nature of the character is insufficiently defined by the music itself and needs a more sinister edge than her warm contralto allows. McGegan sets apt tempos and draws confident playing from the Freiburgers. Clearly this set is to be preferred over the CD reissue of Leppard's 1979 recording, now sounding very ponderous in comparison, though the interpretations of Janet Baker (Ariodante) and James Bowman (Polinesso) have alternative nuances that should not be forgotten. *Anthony Hicks*

Handel Opera Arias Various singers with Nicholas McGegan and René Jacobs 69'58" Harmonia Mundi/BBC Music Magazine

This is not available through the normal channels, but is circulated with the June 1996 issue of the *BBC Music Magazine*. There are 12 tracks from Harmonia Mundi complete recordings, excellent samplings of seven operas and an oratorio (*Theodora*), and good value in that the issue also contains another CD of concertos by Mozart (K271), Bellini (for oboe), Weber (Clarinet no. 2) & F. Strauss (horn) played by recent BBC Young Musicians' finalists. *CB*

Handel Opera Arias and Overtures (1704-1726) Emma Kirkby, Brandenburg Consort, Roy Goodman 75' 39"

A very successful juxtaposition of some of Handel's best arias and overtures from the first half of his operatic career; a godsend to those who can't bear to sit around and wait for the best tunes in complete opera recordings. Particular credit should be given to the instrumental soloists, including the harpsichordist. Ignore questions as to whether the inimitable qualities of Emma Kirkby's art are apposite for castrato arias, and enjoy this technical tour-de-force. *Kah-Ming Ng*

Heinichen *Lamentationes, Passionsmusik* Mechthild Georg, Axel Köhler, Jörg Dürfmüller, Scot Weir, Raimund Nolte SATTB, Musica Antiqua Köln, Reinhard Goebel Archiv 447 092-2 129' 12" 2 discs

Alma mater redemptoris, Beatus vir, De profundis clamavi, Lamentationes Jeremiae prophetae, Nisi Dominus, Nicht das Band, das dich bestricket (*Oratorio tedesco al sepolcro santo*), Pastorale in A, Warum toben die Heiden

This two-CD set comprises lamentations, three psalms, an early German cantata and the Marian antiphon *Alma Redemptoris mater* for various solo voices and instruments, an instrumental pastoral (previously released on MAK's *Concerti per l'orchestra di Dresda*) and the *sepolcro* oratorio, *Nicht das Band, das dich bestricket*. Heinichen's music treads the middle path between the baroque and the early classical – little contrapuntal complexity, an increasing emphasis on melody and bass, combined with ever greater awareness of instrumental colour, not only in his choice of instrumentation but in the different colours each can produce. Goebel's notes are full of important information and his passionate advocacy of the Dresden repertoire in such carefully-considered performances is compelling. I look forward to hearing some of Heinichen's secular output, or perhaps even music by some of the many composers whose work he re-worked for the Catholic Chapel. *BC*

Locatelli *L'arte del violino, Op. 3 nos 1-6* Mela Tenenbaum, Pro Musica Kiev & Philharmonia Virtuosi (Nos 1 & 3 only), dir. Richard Kapp 116' 25" 2 CDs
ESS.A.Y *CD1043/44*

An American recording team went to the Ukraine for a week and recorded these two discs, the *Fasch* one reviewed above, and a couple more, while the orchestra and Mela Tenenbaum also gave several concerts – an astonishing schedule and an equally impressive level of performance. If the sound is about as far from Elizabeth Wallfisch's landmark recording of last year as it is possible to get, that is not to criticise: quite simply, the soloists and the accompanying groups are worlds apart stylistically. Tenenbaum's violin shows no signs of strain in the very high positions on all four strings, even if her cadenzas, though undeniably virtuosic, are sadly anachronistic. *BC*

Perti *Lamentations, Liturgy for Good Friday* Soloists, Cappella Musicale di S. Petronio di Bologna, dir. Servio Vartolo 77' 59"
Naxos 8.553321

Another innovative release from Naxos here. Perti's settings for the liturgy of Good Friday vary from lamentations for solo voice and continuo, with melismatic Hebrew initials and some florid writing, to his rather staid settings of the responsories, with occasional duets to vary the texture. The singing is full-blooded and rich, such as a large acoustic requires. (There are considerable time delays between some phrases which reveal just how resonant the basilica is!) The continuo playing is the most dubious aspect and it's frankly a bit worrying if this man is passing on his talents to his pupils: fussing about with arpeggio patterns above the singers is hardly stylish. I don't believe this merely is an indication that Perti's music is not, of itself, interesting; rather,

that these interpretations are not ideal. Maybe the performers will think again before the next volume? BC

Scarlatti High and Low: 16 late harpsichord sonatas Colin Tilney 66' 24"

Music & Arts CD-907

K. 380-1, 386-7, 426-9, 451, 476-480, 514-5

This recording of 16 of the last of Scarlatti's sonatas makes the music clearly understandable. It is played on a big Italian harpsichord of five octaves going up to g. It has a powerful bass and a strong treble to balance it. When I first met Colin Tilney he had been playing Bach's Brandenburg 5th under the baton of Boris Ord. I said that I hoped it wasn't too fast and he replied that it had been at a speed at which it was impossible to be expressive although it was for him technically possible. After all these years this comment is relevant to this recording as many of the slower sonatas are very expressive with the phrasing well thought and formed throughout. However some of the faster sonatas are perhaps a little mechanical. Colin Tilney (as does Andreas Staier) chooses as his final sonata K427, marked by Scarlatti to be played as fast as possible, but takes it at a tempo where the phrasing remains clear and controlled although the sonata loses none of its excitement. Michael Thomas

D. Scarlatti Sonatas Andreas Staier *hpscd*
Teldec *Das Alte Werk* 0630-12601-2 73' 52"
Contents: K. 69, 113-6, 208-9, 215-6, 246-7, 394-5, 414-5, 426-7, 513

This is a collection of 18 Scarlatti sonatas finishing with K427 *Presto, quanto sia possibile* which shows off Andreas Staier's dazzling technique and reminds us of Roseingrave's account of Scarlatti's playing: 'he thought ten hundred devils had been at the keyboard'. However, like Couperin, I prefer to be moved than amazed and some of the playing on this disc lacks shape. Every group of notes should have a focus point and one should be able to feel the natural ebb and flow of the phrasing. All too often it seems to gain speed and then suddenly slow down to the last note which comes late and separated from the others. There is some very nice playing, particularly K113, but on the whole Colin Tilney's Scarlatti (see above) communicates better. Michael Thomas

Telemann Concertos Frans Brüggen *rec*, Otto Fleischmann *bsn*, Concentus Musicus Wien, Nicolaus Harnoncourt 53' 50"
Teldec *Das Alte Werk* 0630-12320-2 (rec.1966)
Includes Concertos in F for rec, bsn & str, in G for 4 vlns TWV 40:201, in Bb for 3 ob, 3 vlns, bc; Overture in F for 2 hns, vns & bc TWV 44:7

These performances may have taken place 30 years ago, but there is still much to commend them. The variety of instrumental line-ups is typical of Telemann, particularly when he is exploiting a particular group of players (here the court orchestra of Hessen-Darmstadt). Possibly his most self-limiting choice is the concerto for four violins in G major (i.e. the one Goebel didn't record on his *Concerti da*

camera LP years ago), a brilliant piece of writing for strings. The concerto for three oboes & violins had a far superior recording last year from Collegium Musicum 90. Still, this disc is good value. BC

Telemann Music for Oboe Marcel Ponsele
Accent ACC 95110 D 64' 34"

Partita 4 in g *Die kleine Cammer-musik*, Sonata in a *Der getreue Music-Meister*, Sonata in c (2 ob, bc), Trio Sonata in Eb (ob, hpscd & bc) *Essercizii Musici*, Concert in D (tpt, 2 ob, bc)

Marcel Ponsele is widely considered to be among the best baroque oboists around. Judging by this disc, it's a reputation he well deserves. He spins an elegant melodic line, with some of his ornamentation so subtle that it blends seamlessly into the composer's original, and his fingerwork in virtuosic passages is flawless. The only problem with the CD is the music; even if Telemann was reckoned the greatest composer of the age, and with the considerable combined talents of this ensemble, only the exuberant concerto for trumpet, two oboes and continuo captured my imagination. BC

Telemann Der Tod Jesu Greetje Anthoni, Yves Saelens, Stefen Geyer STB, Ex Tempore, Le Mercure Galant, Florian Heyerick 69' 46"

Vox Temporis/René Gailly VTP CD92 025

Der Tod Jesu is a hybrid work, somewhere between a passion, oratorio and cantata. Composed in 1755 to a text by Ramler, it is a somewhat less dramatic work than the secular cantatas by Ramler, such as *Ino*, that Telemann set at about the same time. The chorales, as in Telemann's passion settings, are simply harmonised, yet effective. Choruses are more substantial than the *turbae* in the gospel Passions, all the recitatives are *stromentato* and on occasions richly dramatic, whilst the arias (many with obligato solo wind) are more genial, almost galant. The work is divided into 25 separate movements, so the feeling of continuity is not so apparent as in the true Passion settings. There are nevertheless some superb moments in the work, with no apparently weak movements, though the chorales will seem somewhat plain if compared with Bach's harmonisations. The work receives an excellent performance in the hands of Heyerick, backed by a team of three outstanding soloists. An interesting comparison could be made with C.H. Graun's setting of the same work (written in the same year), as the Graun composition received many performances during the 18th century. There is no English translation of the text. Ian Graham-Jones

Vivaldi Le quattro stagioni etc. Andrew Manze *vln*, Marcel Ponsele *ob*, Amsterdam Baroque Orchestra, Ton Koopman 56' 27"
Erato 4509-94811-2

Also Oboe Concertos in a RV 461 and d (op. 8/9) RV 454

Eccentrics of the world unite! This is very much a personal view of the most popular set of concertos in the repertoire. I was astounded to hear Andrew Manze not totally secure (it's comforting to discover

that he can have off moments!) As with all his recordings there are some unusual things, such as trills of a third in the opening solo of *Spring* and slightly later the drawing out of the chromatic scales by soloist and tutti alike, the ultra-chromatic series of trills in *Autumn*. More than anything, though, this is the Ton Koopman Show. There is no denying that he is a wonderful continuo player and a director with tremendous insight. Throughout the six concertos on the disc (the two for oboe feature the first-rate playing of Marcel Ponsele) I felt the obtrusive harpsichord distracted me from music I thought I knew intimately. Whether you like bold triplets against duplet time melodies or little keyboard figures inserted to rests or not will determine whether or not you buy the CD. In all honesty, I cannot say I would buy it. It's far too quirky for my tastes. BC

Vivaldi Concerti »con molti istromenti« The English Concert, Trevor Pinnock 71' 34"
Archiv Masters 447 301-2 (rec 1985, 1987 1993)
RV 151 (*Alla rustica*), 439 (*op. 10/2 La notte*), 484, 532, 548, 549 (*op. 3/1*), 558 *con molti istromenti*, 575

Apart from the piece for two violins and two cellos with which this issue opens most dramatically (RV 575), the performances of the eight well-chosen concertos date from 1985-87. The playing is crisp and focussed: Vivaldi from his most innovative in *La notte* to his most exuberant in the eponymous Concerto in C major. An attractive selection, well performed. BC

Zavateri Concerti da chiesa e da camera (op. 1, 1735) Freiburger Barockorchester, Gottfried von der Goltz *dir & solo vln* 103' 18" 2 CDs
deutsche harmonia mundi 05472 77352 2

CB sent me this set with a covering note: 'If he'd been English, I'm sure we'd have heard all about him ages ago'. Having listened several times to these highly varied pieces (there are concertos for solo violin rather like Locatelli, for a pair of violins – this one very much in the Corellian mode – and for string orchestra, again like Locatelli or perhaps Vivaldi), I am equally persuaded that Zavateri is a name we should all know. He seems to have spent most of his life in Bologna, a violin pupil of Torelli and a touring virtuoso. Perhaps not as extrovert as *L'arte del violino*, the solo concertos demand a fine player, which Gottfried von der Goltz most certainly is. But it is the diversity of style, the range of ideas that is most impressive. I was frequently reminded of that still too little known Englishman, William Corbett and his *Bizzarie Universali*, particularly Roy Goodman's fine recording with the ECBO. Highly recommended. BC

Vivaldi, Marcello, Quantz, J. C. Bach, Fasch Florilegium Musicale Camerata Köln
deutsche harmonia mundi *Baroque Esprit* 05472 77438 2 68' 01" (rec 1989)

J. C. Bach *Quintet in D op. 22/1*; Fasch *Quartet in d* 2 ob, bsn, bc; A. Marcello *Oboe concerto in d*; Quantz *Trio in C rec*, fl, bc; Vivaldi *La notte* (RV 104), *Concerto for s'no rec in C* (RV 444)

This is an attractive combination of the familiar and not so well known. Alongside

Vivaldi's *La notte*, in a slightly more characterful performance than the English Concert reviewed above (the manuscript version has a bassoon which 'breaks forth from the shadows like some gruff monster', as the notes put it), and his ubiquitous sopranino recorder concerto, we have a delightful trio sonata by Quantz contrasting the two types of flute and a lovely fortepiano/cello continuo section, and one of J.C. Bach's Op. 22 quintets. Alessandro Marcello's Oboe concerto and a lively quartet by Fasch (both in D minor) make up the disc. Players are not listed anywhere which is rather a shame as there are some particularly fine performances. BC

Hornkonzerte am sächsischen Hof Peter Damm, Dieter Pansa horns, Capella Sagittariana, dir. Eduard Melkus 51' 40"
Berlin Classics 001772 BC (rec. 1990)
Concertos by Fasch, Heinichen (2 hrs, 2 obs, 2 vlns, 2 vlns & continuo), Quantz (fln, ob & str), Telemann, Zelenka (2 hrs, 2 obs & str)

Horn playing at the Saxon court must truly have been astonishing. These concertos exploit the players to the limits of the modern instrument's range, so it is all the more astounding that natural horns were able to cope with such difficult parts: if Zelenka's parts are notoriously demanding, the D-major Fasch concerto requires some remarkable triplet playing and extraordinarily high coloratura from the first horn player. The accompanying orchestra is never anything less than stylistic. Hats off to Berlin Classics for promoting this music – perhaps not quite of the same standard as Goebel's Dresden series, but worthwhile none the less. BC

CLASSICAL

C. P. E. Bach The Complete Keyboard Concertos, vol. 2. Miklós Spányi hpscd, Concerto Armonico, Péter Szűts 67' 25"
BIS-CD-708
Concertos in F (H.415), G (H.406), A (H.410)

This is the most enthralling disc I've heard in a long while. The excitement is compounded by the fact that it is labelled as Volume 2 of a series of the complete keyboard concertos that will eventually run to some seventeen discs covering 64 works. The performance material is based on the new C.P.E. Bach edition currently in progress. The three unpublished works on this disc date from Bach's early years in Berlin (c1738-70) and unbelievably they are première recordings. H.410 and 415 are magnificent works, releasing wave upon wave of restless, dynamic creative intensity that surges in an unabated ebb and flow. H.406 is a less challenging, *galant* work that admirably demonstrates that Bach could turn on the charm when he had a mind to. These Hungarian period-instrument performances are fully worthy of the music, capturing the white-heat energy of H.410 and H.415 in a manner rarely encountered in the recording studio. If this standard is maintained BIS's C.P.E. Bach cycle bids fair to become one of the major recording achievements of the '90s
Brian Robins

BIS is a recent addition to the companies sending us discs for review, so we missed vol. 1 – evidently a pity.

C. P. E. Bach Instrumental Chamber Music, Cantata 'Phyllis and Thirsis' Les Adieux, Schola Cantorum Basiliensis 60' 21"
deutsche harmonia mundi Baroque Esprit 05472 77435 2 (rec. 1981)
12 Short Pieces for 2 vl & bc (H 600), Sonata for fl & bc in G (H 564), Duo for fl & vln in e (H 598), Trios fl vln & bc in b & C (H 567, 571), *Phyllis und Thirsis* (H 697)

A reissue of a Hans Martin Linde enterprise with various cameo appearances: Wilbert Hazelzet in a two-movement 'Hamburg Sonata'; Nigel Rogers and Rosmarie Hofmann in an avian cantata with one soprano aria and one recit and aria for tenor – a pity Bach didn't see fit to combine both voices in a concluding number. The playing is fresh and inspired, and the recorded sound well transferred. Kah-Ming Ng

Haydn: Arrangements for Harmonie Consortium Classicum 66' 38"
Claves CD50-9515
Octet in C & contemporary arrangements from *Der Ritter Roland* & *Der Jahreszeiten*

The Harmonie, a wind band (normally paired oboes, clarinets, bassoons and horns), was immensely popular in the late 18th century. These pieces by Haydn are typical of the genre: Generally, oboes and clarinets share the tune, the bassoons supply the bass and the horns fill out the harmony and supply punctuating chords and pedals. Consortium Classicum play modern instruments but, being the principal players of most Swiss orchestras, they are excellent ensemble players. The disc passed so quickly the first time I had to listen to it again. Recommended. BC

Haydn Piano Trios H.XV: 12, 26, 28, 30 András Schiff, Yuuko Shiokawa, Boris Pergamenschikow 68' 56"
Decca 444 861-2

We normally only review early-instrument performances of music as late as this: not that we want to be doctrinaire, but we must draw a line somewhere. It is not always clear from the lists of forthcoming releases whether a disc will be relevant, and we asked for this on the strength of the Mozart clarinet trio CD (see below), which has two of these players on old instruments. The balance problems of using a modern piano are easily overcome here, and it is an extremely satisfying disc of chamber-music making. It derives from the Mondsee Festival, and can be recommended to all except those for whom early instruments are a *sine qua non*. CB

Jadin & Vachon String Quartets from the Court of Versailles Rasumovsky Quartet ASV Gaudeamus CD GAU 151 69' 05
Jadin: op. 1/3, 2/1, op. 4/1 Vachon: op. 5/2, op. 7/2

The Rasumovsky Quartet play modern instruments with what one might term 'stylistic awareness' – they take the music

for what it is, without trying to force it into being something bigger. The five late 18th-century quartets range from two movements to four and are all fairly melody dominated. Jadin, in particular, indulges in the odd harmonic experiment and both composers are capable of perfectly competent part writing (dominated by melody rather than necessarily by the first violin). This is yet another incitement to period quartets to explore this Aladdin's cave. BC

Mozart Clarinet Trio K.498; Piano Trios in Bb & E, K. 502 & 542 Elmar Schmid cl, Yuuko Shiokawa vln, Erich Höbarth vla, Miklós Perényi vlc, András Schiff fp 63' 14"
Teldec Das Alte Werk 4509-99205-2

'Played on Mozart's own instruments', i.e. the Anton Walter fortepiano, Mozart's concert violin, a viola that might have been his and a cello made in Mittenwald, where Mozart's violin came from.

The two trios for piano and strings have the brilliance of some of Mozart's piano concertos – András Schiff makes every note of the decorative runs and arpeggios eloquent on Mozart's Walter fortepiano. The first movement of K542 is a genuine dialogue between all three instruments, with superb tone and melodic lines in the strings, but in general the cello strengthens the bass or plays in harmony with the violin. The clarinet trio is a masterpiece, performed here with the warm tone colours of the clarinet (after Grenser) and Testore viola (that may have belonged to Mozart) playing parts of equal interest to that of the piano. However in the first movement I thought the forte chords in the piano sounded forced rather than broad, and the interpretation of the first movement of K502 was almost brusque rather than playful. Margaret Cranmer

Soler Sonatas completas I Patrick Cohen fortepiano 63' 15"
Glossa GCD 920502
Sonatas 1-12 of the Rubio edition.

One often hears these sonatas performed on the harpsichord but this recording is proof that they are much more interesting on the fortepiano. Patrick Cohen plays on a copy of a 1795 Walther which has a beautiful tone (similar to my own) and a large range of dynamics. It really is a joy to listen to a performance where the player matches the dynamics to the harmonic progressions as well as the shape of the melodic line. For example, I notice he often releases on the tonic. There is a well-researched booklet which tells us that Soler's biographer described him as of good character and of a profoundly sensitive and religious spirit. This recording of his sonatas communicates these qualities. Michael Thomas

J. C. Bach: Salve Reginain Eb; Mozart Ergo interest K. 143, Exsultate jubilate K.165; Pergolesi Salve Regina in c Ruth Ziesak, La Stagione, Michael Schneider 57' 27"
deutsche harmonia mundi 05472 77335 2

Over the past few years Ruth Ziesak has built an enviable reputation, particularly as a Mozart singer (she was a highly praised

Pamina in the second Solti *Die Zauberflöte*). Her voice is not that of a natural 'early music' singer, but it is exceedingly beautiful and her intelligent use of it has resulted in a recital that even *EMR*'s most radical readers are unlikely to resist. Vibrato is minimal and Ziesak's technique is impressive – listen, for example, to the way the runs are articulated in the Alleluia of K.165 or the confident handling of the florid coloratura in the Bach *Salve Regina*. This is one of three settings composed during his Milan years, an extended motet not otherwise obtainable on disc. Schneider's support is efficient rather than inspired, the recording good rather than outstanding. Full texts and translations are included with an issue that is eminently worth investigating, but why should we want a picture of the conductor rather than or the singer. **Brian Robins**

La Musique au temps de Beaumarchais Various performers 63' 50"
Auvidis Valois V 4767
Music by Beethoven, Boccherini, Gluck, Haydn, Jadin, Mozart, Soler, Sor, Vachon.

This compilation of mostly quite recent recordings is strung loosely together under the name of Beaumarchais – a connection that the three brief paragraphs of notes hardly justifies. (Curiously the translator is credited but not the author.) As a themed disc, it falls a bit flat. But treated as an Auvidis sampler (though as such it should be at bottom, not mid-price) this is an attractive anthology. Most of the performances are from period ensembles, not necessarily an assurance of excellence, as Savall's disappointing *Rex untremendae* from Mozart's Requiem shows. The movement from a Jadin quartet should entice anyone to get the Quatuor Mosaïques CD. **CB**

19th CENTURY

Mendelssohn Paulus Melanie Diener, Annette Markert, James Taylor, Matthias Görne *SmSTB*, La Chapelle Royale & Collegium Vocale, Orch. des Champs Élysées, Philippe Herreweghe 128' 55" 2 discs
Harmonia Mundi France HMC 901584.85

This was recorded live at performances given only eight months or so ago in Montreux, following hard on the heels of the same forces' account of the Beethoven *Missa Solemnis*, recorded in the same way. As in the Beethoven, there are times when one could wish for a more forward choral sound, but this may be a price worth paying so that the wonderful playing of the Orchestre des Champs Élysées can be more easily appreciated. Mendelssohn's *St Paul* has been woefully neglected, either because people still blame Mendelssohn for not being Bach or because they expect the work to be full of grand Baroque dramatic gesture when it is essentially contemplative. Thus in the first half of the work the conversion of Paul (by a choral God, as in Schütz) is not nearly so moving as the account of his being healed. This reading shows the gentleness of the work perfectly, even though one might wish for a slightly more intense

account of Paul's words from Matthias Görne and more variety of pace in the recitatives. The essence of the score that Herreweghe brings out so well is Mendelssohn's flawless counterpoint, not just the fugal choruses but between orchestra and choir or woodwind and strings. The harmonic richness leaps out from the opening of the overture, with its lush orchestration of the chorale *Wachet auf*. It makes so much sense on a period orchestra. Rather than looking back from Brahms, this recording makes us see how Mendelssohn is carrying forward the orchestration of *The Magic Flute* and Weber. Thoroughly enjoyable. **Shane Fletcher**

Mendelssohn String Symphonies 1,4,6,6,12 Concerto Köln 67' 46"
Teldec *Das Alte Werk* 4509-98435-2

There's something uncanny about doing Mendelssohn's pubescent pieces on period strings; the results are invariably gratifying. Concerto Köln impart all the nervous energy and audacity that one comes to expect with such a combination. Praise must be given where praise is due: we have to read the booklet to find that the disc was planned and rehearsed by Werner Ehrhardt (the leader). **Kah-Ming Ng**

Schubert Lieder nach Gedichte von Johann Wolfgang von Goethe Christoph Prégardien, Andreas Staier 70' 29"
deutsche harmonia mundi 05742 77342 2

The partnership of Prégardien and Staier has already given us fine recitals of Schubert's Schiller settings, and a splendid *Schöne Müllerin*. This generous programme of 25 lieder to poems by Goethe includes the groups originally published as opp. 4, 5, 12, 19, and 92 (not 3, as the booklet claims), with nice balance between the familiar and the rarely heard. Andreas Staier plays a fortepiano by Christopher Clarke after Johann Fritz (Vienna, 1815); I wish we had been given details of this instrument with its atmospheric effects. Prégardien is not quite at his best, with touches of stridency and dry tone, but both he and Staier show their artistry and assured sense of style in this impressive and finely recorded issue. **Peter Branscombe**

Schubert Sonata in a D.845; Klavierstücke D.946 Andreas Staier (*fp* by Johann Fritz, Vienna c.1825) 61' 45"
Teldec *Das Alte Werk* 0630 11084-2

Andreas Staier brings explosive energy into these performances, especially in the scherzo of the sonata; but just when he seems to be making the fine Viennese fortepiano by Johann Fritz stand to attention, he reveals an ability to make phrase turn corners nicely. There are moments of poetry, especially in the way that he uses *una corda* and moderator pedals. The sonata is a powerful and original work, but as Andreas Staier explains with great honesty in the notes, the *Klavierstücke* are less cohesive and can make interpretation difficult for the performer. The quality of the recording is good. **Margaret Cranmer**

S. Wesley Sacred Choral Music Choir of Gonville & Caius College, Cambridge, Geoffrey Webber 65' 14"
ASV *Gaudeamus* CD GAU 157

This is perhaps a little modern to be called 'early music', but *In exitu Israel*, which begins this disc, is the finest English Latin motet since *Jehova quam multi*, and it is interesting to hear more of this under-performed composer, whose music is firmly rooted in the 18th century and is utterly unlike that of his son Samuel Sebastian. Despite being the son of Charles Wesley, the Methodist hymn-writer, he flirted with catholicism (perhaps chiefly for musical reasons), which accounts for the Latin pieces on this disc; the *Dixit Dominus* (not a setting of the complete psalm) makes a balancing coda to this varied selection. Cambridge has several mixed choirs with a quality to match the two famous all-male ones; that of Caius presents this music convincingly. Wesley's best-known organ piece is also included, stylishly played by the choir's director. (See also page 2). **CB**

MISCELLANEOUS

Miserere Westminster Abbey Choir, Abbey Consort, Martin Neary see page 14
Goostly Psalmes: Anglo-American Psalmody 1550-1800 His Majesty's Clerkes see page 14

The James Bowman Collection James Bowman, The King's Consort, Robert King Hyperion King 3 78' 20"
Music by Bach, Couperin, Ford, G. Gabrieli, Handel, Purcell & anon.

This is a wide-ranging anthology of recordings Bowman and King have made for Hyperion over the last few years, opening with the single new item, a mellifluous *Erbarne dich*. The Bowman sound is so distinctive that those who love his voice will merely need to balance their wealth against the number of tracks they have already. As an anthology, the 21 items are nicely varied and well worth recycling. **CB**

The Songs of Angels Female voices of the Choir of Trinity College, Cambridge, Richard Marlow 67' 10"
Conifer 75605 51261 2

Commercial pressures this Christmas tried to inflict on us what we were told is a widespread American belief in angels, and here it is linked to the plainsong fad. According to the cover, this is 'a Collection of serene beauty featuring chant by Hildegard von Bingen, Fauré, Holst, Byrd and other great composers', no doubt a deliberate perversion of what the word 'chant' usually means; I hope Richard Marlow would reject such usage by his students. John Kehoe's notes, however, manage to be intelligent, concentrating on the angelic vision as metaphor, though I don't know what a 'sequence hymn' is and *Edi be thu* sounds to me merely odd at the very high pitch given it here. The issue raises the question of why we need make such a fuss of boys' choirs: even the Britten *Missa brevis*, written for the

Westminster Cathedral boys in honour of George Malcolm's departure, sounds idiomatic from Trinity's clear young women. CB

Historiches Spinett & Cembalo Andreas Beurmann 70' 49"
BMG 74321 29052-2

This recording of 24 musical works on 21 different historical keyboard instruments, is a veritable treasure trove. Dr Andreas Beurmann, the owner of this wonderful collection, plays well throughout and has done an excellent job in matching pieces with appropriate instruments. So we have 16th-century Venetian music on 16th-century Venetian virginals, 17th-century Spanish music on a Spanish harpsichord of 1629, Purcell on a Hitchcock, Rameau and Forqueray on 18th-century French instruments, giving a vast range of styles and different tones. The tone of the 1766 Kirkman on which he plays the first movement of The Italian Concerto is a bit over brilliant and percussive and one wonders if the quills are too short. But the surprise of the record is the Bach French Overture on a 1936 harpsichord by Maendlar-Schramm; Dr Beurmann gives a dramatic and splendid performance on this powerful machine which tends to steal the show. It is very encouraging to hear that this collection is in good playing order and available to other musicians. Michael Thomas

Robert Burns The Complete Songs vol. 2 Ian F. Benzie, Ian Bruce, Tony Cuffe, Arthur Johnstone, Christine Kydd, Gordeanna McCulloch, Rod Patterson, Alan Reid, Billy Ross, Janet Russell 78' 38"
Linn CKD 051

This is the second of a series of 12 CDs to contain all of the songs of Burns – 368 of them. (Radio 3 have missed a trick: they could have had one sung every day of this bicentennial year, with two on the anniversaries of his birth and death.) I suspect that our readers would have welcomed a recording that recreated singing styles of the late 18th century, with some performed as unaccompanied folksongs, others with arrangements of the period or in their style. In fact, the series has taken the opposite approach and used modern folk-singers, one that may spread the songs to a different sort of audience but which is not relevant to ours. It is curious that folk experts used to scorn the early settings as distorting the rhythmic and harmonic flexibility of unaccompanied melody, yet the current folk world seems happy to foist even more obtrusive accompaniments on the songs. Although normally I would object strongly to the omission of texts from a CD booklet, it does seem rather a waste to print them for this series when separate editions are so readily and cheaply available. This is the first Linn recording to disappoint me. CB

The Harp Key Alison Kinnaird *Scottish Harp*
Temple Records COMD 1001 50' 37 (rec. 1978)

While not quite so remote from our interests as the Burns disc, I have worries

about this too. We don't know how Scottish harp music sounded: all that survives are tunes, nothing to suggest how they were accompanied. So the modern player must work from the implications of the melody, from what is possible on the instrument, and a feel for what is historically appropriate at any given period. Folk musicians often seem to assume that folk music is more different from art music than it really is, and I am suspicious of some of the versions that do not recall any historical period at all. I would guess that there was little imaginative interaction between musicologists and players back in the 1970s, when this was recorded: I hope the situation has changed since. CB

REISSUES

Baroque Esprit

A new series from deutsche harmonia mundi, *Baroque Esprit* (following their capitalisation) has re-issues of mostly 1980s performances of music from a rather wider historical range than most of us would call baroque. Individual CDs are reviewed separately.

Virgin Veritas

The following list includes many items whose original issue I remember so clearly that it is a shock that the time has come to recycle them more cheaply. There is also an important batch of earlier material: some pioneering recordings by David Munrow, who died 20 years ago. I hope to write about these next month, and some of the other items might also then receive separate reviews. All are mid-price; the VED prefix indicates a 2 CD set.

Early Music Consort of London, David Munrow

VER 5 61283 2 Dufay *Missa Se la face ay pale*
VED 5 61284 2 *The Art of Courtly Love*
VER 5 61288 2 Monteverdi's *Contemporaries*
VER 5 61289 2 Praetorius *Dances & Motets*

VER 5 61290 2 Handel, Abel, Boyce *In Vauxhall Gardens* Kirkby, London Baroque
VER 5 61291 2 Bach *Gamba Sonatas* Savall, Koopman

VED 5 61292 2 Bach *Partitas* Leonhardt
VED 5 61295 2 W F Bach *Sonata 5 in Eb 12 Polonaises* Rousset

VER 5 61296 2 Beethoven *Piano Concertos 1 & 2* Tan, LCP, Norrington

VER 5 61293 2 Byrd *Mass a5, etc* The 16
VED 5 61298 2 Couperin *Organ Masses* with chant. Louis-Marie Vigne

VER 5 61301 2 Haydn *Sinfonia concertante Hob I:105, Vln concertos VIIa:1 & 4* Wallfisch, OAE
VER 5 61302 2 Josquin *Motets & Chansons* Hilliard

VER 5 61303 2 Mozart *Masses in C K.66 & 167* Neumann

VER 5 61305 2 Schubert *Symphonies 5, 8 (compl. Newbould)*, Rosamunde OAE, Mackerras

VED 5 61306 2 Schütz *Opus ultimum* Hilliard
VER 5 61304 2 *A Baroque Pageant* (Bach, Handel, Pachelbel, Purcell) Parrott

VER 5 61309 2 *Music of the Sistine Chapel* (Allegri, Josquin, Morales, Palestrina) Parrott
VER 5 61310 2 *Songs of the Trobairitz* Figueras, Savall

VER 5 61311 2 *Sprezzatura* Tragicomedia

Apologies.

I made the mistake of believing the information in the booklet when commenting on the soprano in the Consort of Musicke's *Tirsi e Clori* last month. Listening again, I don't understand how I didn't identify Emma Kirkby rather than Evelyn Tubbs, but an Emma sounding distinctly odd, with an uncharacteristic vibrato and generally off form (the only time I have been disappointed by her). I also replayed *Tempo la cetra*, interested in hearing it after playing for a performance a couple of days ago. I won't dare name the singer in case the booklet is wrong, but it really sounded most impressive – though I don't believe the F natural in the first bar of verse 3.

Corrected Dragon

While squashing the first of the two songs from *The Dragon of Wantley* from the three staves of our complete edition to two for last month's issue the words of the last line slipped. 'True Blue will never stain' should begin on the last note of 31, not the first. In the previous line, the ending of the extender line at bar 27 is a quirk of the computer: the whole line is sung. In the second song, the bass must be the wrong octave for the last note of 7 or the first note of 8: I don't have the information at hand to say which.

Margot Remembered

A concert of Biber sonatas by Romanesca (Andrew Manze, Nigel North and John Toll) at the Lufthansa Festival, St James's Piccadilly, on Sunday June 16 at 7.30 is dedicated to the memory of Margot Leigh Milner, that astonishing lady who had such an involvement in the early music world for so long. Tickets from 0171 437 5053 between 11am & 7pm.

Performing Bach

Andrew Parrott has written an article for *Early Music* on some of the topics on Bach performance that we have aired recently, and is also organising a conference on the subject in Oxford in the autumn; participants will include Joshua Rifkin. Details to follow.

Playing the Viol

We have been suprised that our correspondents have taken up the church music theme rather than that of taking practising seriously. We did have one letter from a lady who took up the viol in the mid-fifties who felt somewhat hurt: I sympathise. I am all in favour of learning to play the viol just well enough to enjoy the marvels of the English consort repertoire. We can leave scales and playing above the frets to the more ambitious; but we need enough skill and confidence to be able to react to the playing of our companions – the essence of chamber music of all sorts.

We enjoyed the gentle fun at our expense in *Classical Music*; we are not so familiar with the language of the drug culture as the staff of that magazine. I'm afraid I couldn't find a performance this month to commend for its cracking speed. CB

MUSIC FOR CHURCH

Clifford Bartlett

Miserere Westminster Abbey Choir, Abbey Consort, Martin Neary 77' 00"

Sony Arc of Light SK 66615

Chant *Christus factus est, Improperaria, Vexilla regis*; Allegri *Miserere*; Bai *Miserere*; Gabrieli *O Domine Jesu Christe*; Gesualdo *Caligaverunt oculi mei Tenebrae facti sunt*; John IV *Crux fidelis*; Lotti *Crucifixus* a6, 8 & 10; Monteverdi *Adoremus te Christe*

Goostly Psalmes: Anglo-American Psalmody 1550-1800 His Majestie's Clerkes, Paul Hillier

Harmonia Mundi HMU 907128 61' 23"

Music by Billings, Dowland, Farmer, Hall, Holden, Jenks, Knapp, Morgan, Read, Shunway, Swan, Tan'sur, B & E West, Wood

Our pages of late have included various views on liturgical reconstructions. But that there are other paths to an imaginative presentation of music for the church is shown by the Westminster Abbey record. The programme plan is credited to Martin Neary and Hugh Keyte. Hugh was one of the innovators in presenting liturgical reconstructions while he was working as a Radio 3 producer. He has a wide knowledge of how and why the liturgy was as it was, and he has here put that to good use in devising a programme that draws on liturgical practice but recreates it in such a way as to make a satisfying concert and CD, and also, for those whose interest is not primarily musical, a programme of meditation for Good Friday. I suspect that, mixed with those enticed by the wide media interest, fanciers of top Cs and devotees of Abbey events in general, there was a considerable number for whom the concert performance of the music on this CD will have been a religious as well as a musical experience (even though one may not expect to pay an admission charge for the former).

Times change. A few years ago it was normal to put on concerts to prepare for a recording; in this case, the concert coincided with the release of the record. And a very good concert it was; in fact, I enjoyed it more than the CD. Listening more clinically, the trebles sound more insubstantial (or, from another viewpoint, more ethereal), the men a bit woolier than in the Abbey. But Simon Birchall, soloist in three of the *improperaria*, sounds happier on disc, lacking the wobble (or reverent vibrance) he adopted to reach the back of a crowded nave. The Abbey choir and solo ensemble escape from the cathedral style to catch the passion of the Gesualdo and Lotti, even if some may prefer a sound just a little more tightly focussed.

The advance publicity on the event concentrated so much on Hugh's researches on the two settings of *Miserere* that it was disappointing to find that the Allegri was given in its 'traditional' version. The Abbey fortunately has a boy who can negotiate the top Cs with some panache, indeed, with enough confidence to play with the phrasing and length a bit. But I must confess that I find it difficult to react to the work as music rather than an obstacle race. The revelation was the setting by Bai, sung in accordance with the detailed notation prepared by the last *maestro* of the Sistine Choir. It is startling in its elaboration, and is given an utterly different style of

performance. Let's hope that the choir will soon record the Allegri with similar imaginative panache.

The sound of the chant reminded me very much of Hugh's impersonation of a Parish Clerk when at a local concert we sung through 25 verses of a metrical psalm to illustrate the changes of performance styles from 1550 to 1850. Whether Sistine singers around 1850 really sang like that I don't know. But what is missing from Paul Hillier's anthology of Anglo-American psalms and set pieces is that sense of earthy vigour which is such an attraction to those who regularly sing this sort of music (and that includes several of our subscribers). I have had the last item on this disc (*Evening Hymn*) running round in my head since the CD arrived – but not the sound of this version, which prettifies it. I would guess that the idea that a verse about death should be sung softly is a Victorian one; surely in such strophic, congregational hymns the words and music move in parallel (like a medieval song) and do not reflect each other with that sort of detail. Another curiosity is that, here as in a few other pieces, the doubling of tenor tune by sopranos is introduced just to give variety for one verse. It is my understanding that this (along with the doubling of the treble part by tenors) was a fundamental part of the performance practice of the repertoire, not just superficial decoration. I have found this a most moving hymn when sung straight, vigorously and with doublings; I hope that still gets across to listeners of this version.

This is nevertheless a useful anthology, and will, I hope, help to persuade people to take the less learned style of church music seriously. At the West Gallery Conference last summer, we failed to come up with a suitable word to describe the repertoire, 'west gallery' being too specifically English while 'primitive' was thought demeaning. There is much memorable music here, especially for those who like tunes and can pick them out from the tenor line, and some affecting choral writing. These performances may well convince those without a commitment to a rougher style.

Over the years I have received many phone calls from people seeking an 'authentic' version of the Allegri *Miserere*, mostly sparked off by the EMI Taverner recording, which used an earlier edition by Hugh Keyte. Sony has printed in the notes to their CD a thorough account by Hugh of the history of the work, and there have been several articles by him recently on the subject. It is hoped that his new edition will be published by Oxford University Press. Meanwhile, in my capacity as Associate Editor to John Rutter's *Oxford Choral Classics*, vol. 2 of which will include the traditional version and, if there is room, an unadorned transcription from the early sources and a note on its history, I was trying to track down the first appearance of the top C (partly for academic interest, partly because it might still be in copyright – like the cadence for the gold rings in *The Twelve Days of Christmas*) when my eye fell upon the 3rd edition of *Grove* hiding behind a photocopier. I looked up 'Allegri', and there was the familiar version in an edition by Rockstro (1823-95), carried over from previous editions. This was too late to correct the information in the CD booklet that it only goes back to Robert Haas in the 1930s. Curiously, this was information that Hugh, John and I had all been seeking for a long time, and it emerged close at hand. Moral: don't throw away old reference books.

Forthcoming issues

July will be published as usual at the beginning of the month.

Normally we have no August issue and the September issue would appear slightly early. However, in view of our summer trip to the Pacific, which will take us away from base for the last week of July and all of August, we will instead prepare the issue before we go, so subscribers may well receive it before the end of July. We will, however, still call it the September issue to avoid confusion.

During our absence, King's Music will be in Brian Clark's hands: this year he will actually be in Huntingdon, not just answering our phone from Dundee. He would be grateful if any complicated or lengthy orders were received before our departure on July 27 (or preferably earlier, since Clifford will be teaching at Beauchamp all the previous week).

Alistair Dixon and the *Chapelle du Roi* are performing the complete works of Thomas Tallis. Notice of the first concert arrived too late for the May issue, but rest of series are 13th July *The Marian Revival* at Hammersmith, 28th September *Music for the Church Seasons* at Kensington, 23rd November *The Anglican Service* at Waltham Abbey & 22nd February *Music for Queen Elizabeth* in central London. Further details from 10 Kensington Hall Gardens, Beaumont Avenue, London, W14 9LS Tel: 0171 385 6489. (This repeats a project that was one of the earliest manifestations of the Tallis Scholars; perhaps the younger group is also heading for fame and fortune.)

Dragon at Large: 13th May Theatre Royal Brighton, 13th June St James Piccadilly, 27th July Deal, 10th August Cambridge, 24th August Suffolk Villages Festival, 6 & 7th September Utrecht Festival, 14th November Maidenhead. Details from Caroline Anderson, Opera Restored, 0181 870 7649

La Serenissima Concert performance of Vivaldi's opera *Giustino* (UK Premiere), 12 July, 6.30 pm at the Royal College of Music Concert Hall. Preceded by a talk at 5.30 by Michael Talbot. Details from Adrian Chandler, 51 Newlands Park, London, SE26 5PN Tel: 0181 778 5754 Fax: 0171 326 0712

St James' Festival A feast of talent for Europe's food town! July 6th -14th The Parley seem to be the only early music group featured. Details from Andrew Cantrill, Grimsby Parish Church, DN31 1EP Tel: 01472 358610

STIMU & Utrecht Early Music Festival & Utrecht University have a Heinrich Schütz Study Day on Thursday 5th September 1996. The moderator will be Peter Holman. Joshua Rifkin, Eva Linfield, Albert Clement and Pieter Dirksen will give lectures; Ton Koopman will conclude the day by conducting a workshop on Schütz's *Musikalische Exequien*. Further information from STIMU, PO Box 565, 3500 Utrecht, The Netherlands Tel: +31 30 2362250, Fax: +31 30 2322798

VANTAA BAROQUE WEEK 1996 3 - 9 August. 19 events include Gabrieli Consort & Drottningholms Baroque Ensemble. Master classes with Monika Frimmer & Peter Kooij. Readers who may find themselves near Helsinki, Vantaa or Tikkurila then, can get further details from VANTAA BAROQUE WEEK, PO Box 10, 01301 Vantaa, Finland Tel: +358 8306261 Fax: +358 8361099



A HOME PAGE FOR THE EARLY MUSIC PROFESSION

<http://www.brainlink.com/~starmus/Unison/unison.html>

- World Wide Web home page design
- Server space for home pages
- Links from Unison to other WWW locations
- Maintenance of WWW documents (restrictions apply)
- Handling of e-mail and other correspondence (restrictions apply)

To express yourself in Unison contact

E-mail: starmus@brainlink.com

WWW: <http://www.brainlink.com/~starmus/index.html>

Fax: +1 (812) 336-7236

Phone: +1 (812) 335-1121 or +1 (812) 336-1810

or by snail mail to:

Star Community Services Inc.
Attn: Paul or Wendy Elliott
3702 Tamarron Drive,
Bloomington, IN 47408-2819
USA

BENEFITS

- Affordable, 24-hour world-wide publicity
- Shared W3 "store-front" for the early music community
- No investment in hardware or software necessary
- Reliable access and service through US-based provider
- Tame nerd not required
- Inclusive prices - no VAT or sales taxes

Lindum Records

suppliers of Early Music Records

You have read the reviews in Early Music Review?

You wish to buy a record?

We will:

supply records favourably reviewed in recent issues of Early Music Review.
gradually increase the stock list to include other quality records.
supply any other record you may wish subject to availability.

Send SAE for current stock list

One call, fax or email to

**Aldhundegate House
Beaumont Fee
Lincoln LN1 1HB
U.K.**

Tel/Fax 01522 527530

Email: peter@aldhund.demon.co.uk

BYRD

Haec est dies

Introduction to the edition on pages 6-7 of the Annual Byrd Newsletter. Separate copies of the work are available from King's Music at £1.00 either at the pitch as published here (down a fourth) or for SATB down a tone.

This hitherto unpublished and virtually undocumented motet is the first such work with a contemporary attribution to Byrd to emerge for many years. Its source is a biographical dictionary of Roman Catholic martyrs GB-Ob MS Eng.Th. b. 2, page 116 (c.1605-8) in the hand of 'Thomas Jollet', known from his inscription on page 949 to be a pseudonym. The first reference to the MS in a musical context is J. G. O'Leary 'A recusant manuscript of great importance' *Essex Recusant* 10 (1968) 17-21. Mary Clapinson and T. D. Rogers provide more detail in their *Summary catalogue of post-medieval western manuscripts in the Bodleian Library, Oxford: acquisitions 1916-1975* (Oxford UP, 1991) pp. 721-2, entry 46533. The attribution at the end of the motet reads 'Mr. Byrd. 4. vocum'. References in the surrounding narrative to the martyrdoms of Fathers Campian and Garnett, both of whom are associated with William Byrd, indicate him as the composer (pp. 123 & 132ff). Jollet reports that the words *Haec est dies Domini: gaudeamus et laetemur in ea* were sung repeatedly by Fathers Barkworth and Filcock on their way to execution in 1601 (pp. 114-5). Perhaps 'Mr. Byrd' composed this setting in their memory, or perhaps Jollet found an appropriate existing one.

On p. 137 of the same volume there is a setting of the text *Adoramus te Christe* attributed by Jollet to himself. This is the only other music in the MS, and is markedly inferior to *Haec est dies*. The words were sung on the scaffold by Garnett at his execution in 1581 (see p. 135). Byrd published his own setting in the first book of *Gradualia* (1605). As a work that does not fit into the liturgical scheme of *Gradualia*, perhaps it was included as a covert memorial.

John Harley & Richard Turbet, April 1996

The four parts have *chiavette* clefs (G2, C2, C3 & C4), implying transposition down a fourth or fifth. Down a fourth fits the normal male-voice tessitura of alto, tenor, baritone and bass, but the edition is also available transposed down a tone for SATB. The note values of the MS have been retained, except that the conventional final breve has been changed to a semibreve with pause to fit the modern barring – the original is unbarred. Expansions of ::/ (repeat-text marks) have not been indicated. Inconsistent spellings of *haec/hec* and *laetemur/laetetur* have been standardised. Tenor bar 28 note 3: # in the MS.

Clifford Bartlett & Brian Clark, May 1996

LETTER

Dear Clifford,

I wonder why musicians, of all people, seem to be worried that those who enjoy the aesthetic experience of church music and art are apparently so indifferent to its meaning? Surely this is something to celebrate: the success of music (and pictorial art) where the salaried representatives of the church have so completely failed – the final, ironic, triumph of the artist over those employers who have so rarely appreciated or rewarded his talents!

And why has the church failed? Because the actions of the 'religious' rarely match their words – when they occasionally do what they tell others to do, they are called 'saints'. Music, on the other hand, makes no pretence and has a meaning, is a communication which Mendelssohn (I think) said was too precise for words. If people's higher aspirations are being encouraged by music and not religion, then 'tant mieux' I say. I think it was really ever thus, and Ruskin was probably wrong when he said that one could not be blown into a change of religion by the whine of an organ pipe; this century has certainly shown that we have not been much improved either by two thousand years of organised ecclesiasticism or by libraries of sermons.

I say this as someone who does believe that Jesus the Nazerene had something extremely important to say. Like Mr Suzuki, I don't doubt that Bach possessed a deep knowledge of the bible, and was profoundly Christian (whether or not he was deeply wedded to the church of his time – that is quite another thing) and that these characteristics shine through and inform all his 'church' music; any interpretation of it that does not understand them or take them into account will be more shallow, less communicative, than one that does. In fact, I wonder if we should not avoid the rather coy term 'church music' when we really mean music that engages us much more profoundly than church theology ever did? Liturgy is, or should be, like music – it should communicate more than appears on the surface – but liturgy, which was designed to be seen, participated in, touched and smelt (so is more complex than opera), is not something that can be captured aurally; the current use of the term in compilation recordings is mistaken.

Sadly, the fact is probably that most people are more swayed by fashion than either music or church-religion as such. But if the present fashion is for music that normally attracts negligible congregations, then why not feed the appetite until it sickens; one could do worse! We are becoming a listening culture; hence the parallel popularity of books on cassette. But one should not confuse a partial experience with the whole one. Or is the musical part the only part of the total liturgical experience that we still find communicates with us?

Martin Renshaw



ANNUAL BYRD NEWSLETTER

No. 2 June 1996

Editor: Richard Turbet,
Music Librarian,
Aberdeen University Library,
Queen Mother Library,
Meston Walk,
Aberdeen, Scotland,
AB24 3UE
tel +44 (0)1224 272592
fax +44 (0)1224 487048
e-mail r.turbet@abdn.ac.uk

- 1 Editorial
- 1 New articles
- 3 Forthcoming research
- 4 Significant recent recordings
- 5 Future recordings
- 5 Miscellany
- 6 ♪ *Haec est dies* attrib. Byrd
- 9 The Carnegie Trust & Byrd's music in the 1920s
- 9 Byrd's Music at Lincoln
- 9 The William Byrd Singers of Manchester
Stephen Wilkinson
- 10 The Ensemble William Byrd
Graham O'Reilly
- 10 William Byrd & the late 17th century
Robert Thompson

The *Annual Byrd Newsletter* is published in the June issue of *Early Music Review* and is available by subscription to that magazine.

Editorial

In a recent issue of *The Gramophone* I was interested to read about the research centre dedicated to Schütz established in his birthplace. Although we do not know in which building Byrd was born, John Harley's forthcoming book is going to give us two specific locations to weigh up (as well as an interesting date of birth). In any case, many sites associated with Byrd are known; three are in Essex, one is in Middlesex and the one in Lincoln boasts a suitable plaque. With the increase in the number of universities in England, it is time to consider a William Byrd Centre for the study of all early English music. This would need financial investment and staffing. My own University of Aberdeen has just accomplished this successfully with its newly-created Elphinstone Institute, a centre for studying the culture of north-east Scotland, headed by Professor James Porter, likely to be known to readers for *The traditional music of Britain and Ireland: a research and information guide*, New York: Garland, 1989 (Music research and information guides, 11). Universities in the vicinities of Essex, London and Lincolnshire should be encouraged to think along these lines, especially in view of the possibility of publications that could result. Even if they cannot obtain the accommodation associated with Byrd, a presence in the area

would be appropriate. One thinks of the new University of Lincolnshire, Anglia Polytechnic University with a nearby campus in Chelmsford plus one at Colchester where church music is a speciality, and the top-rated Music Department at Nottingham University, not far from Lincoln and with a formidable Byrdian presence in John Morehen. The stock would consist of scores, recordings, books, periodicals and videos. One full-time director would be sufficient to get it off the ground. A successful model would be the Institute of Popular Music at Liverpool University, which offers courses, attracts visiting scholars, acts as a national resource and produces publications. This could be attractive to a new university wishing to establish scholarly credentials, or to an older one wishing to confirm them.

I would like to reiterate my plea in last year's editorial for more specific identification of Byrd's generic pieces. Things seem slightly to have improved, but please would broadcasters, record companies and concert organizers identify works such as pavans or fantasies by using a title where one exists (more than one might imagine), or by referring to the piece's number in *The Byrd Edition* (e.g. BE 17/2), in *Musica Britannica* 27-8 (BK) or in my catalogue in *William Byrd: a guide to research* (e.g. T 500). It is done routinely for Bach, Mozart and Haydn; Byrd requires and deserves the same dispensation, as practised now in *The Gramophone*.

Returning to early English music, I propose to give a portion of next year's *Newsletter* over to updating my monograph *Tudor music: a research and information guide*, New York: Garland, 1994, which has a *terminus ad quem* of 1991.

Richard Turbet

New articles

This continues the sequence explained on page 1 of Newsletter 1.

226. Ward, Jennifer C. and Marshall, Kenneth. *Old Thorndon Hall*. Chelmsford: Essex County Council, 1972. (Essex Record Office publications, 61). Description of Petre family residence, no longer standing in its original form, where Byrd is known to have stayed.

227. Darton, Ruth. "A father of musick": an exhibition to mark the 450th anniversary of the birth of William Byrd 1543-1623. London: University of London Library, 1993. Exhibition catalogue. (1993 Df)

228. Elders, Willem. "Symbolic scoring in Tudor England". In *Symbolic scores: studies in the music of the Renaissance*. Leiden: Brill, 1994, pp. 97-117. (Symbolica et emblemata, 5). "Byrd" pp. 113-17. Takes Byrd's four compositions in over six parts and offers explanations for their scoring. (1994 Eb)
229. Gelder, Gaert Jan van. "From Horwood to the greenwood: a round and its origin in rondellus". *Leading notes* 9 (1995): 5-6. Traces the round *Hey ho to the greenwood*, spuriously attributed to Byrd, back to William Horwood's *Magnificat* in which phrases from the round are used as the contrapuntal technique of phrase-exchange *rondellus*.
230. Harley, John. "Letters about John Bull". *Music & Letters* 76 (1995): 482. Letter detailing source of statement that Byrd was the teacher of Peter Philips.
231. Holdsworth, Donald. "Broadcast Choral Evensong: survey of Byrd's music performed". *Annual Byrd Newsletter* 1 (1995): 6. Table showing frequency with which works by Byrd have been included in "Choral Evensong", a programme broadcast on the radio by the British Broadcasting Corporation since 1926, generally once a week from a cathedral or collegiate chapel. The survey runs to 1989. (1995 HOb)
232. Hunter, Desmond. "Some preliminary thoughts on tempo in virginalist music by Byrd". *Annual Byrd Newsletter* 1 (1995): 5-6. Suggests flexible tempi in the performance of Byrd's fantasias. (1995 Hs)
233. Nasu, Teruhiko. "The publication of Byrd's Gradualia reconsidered". *Brio* 32 (1995): 109-20. Produces evidence suggesting that Richard Bancroft, archbishop of Canterbury, should be numbered among Byrd's patrons, and explains how Richard Redmer came to reissue both volumes of *Gradualia*. (1995 Np)
234. Shay, Robert. "Purcell as collector of 'ancient' music: Fitzwilliam MS 88", in *Purcell Studies*, ed. Curtis Price. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1995, pp. 35-50. Mentions Purcell's method of copying Byrd's *O Lord make Thy servant and Prevent us O Lord*.
235. Smith, David. "Some stylistic correspondences between the keyboard music of Byrd and Philips: an introductory note". *Annual Byrd Newsletter* 1 (1995): 7-8. (1995 Ss)
236. Spink, Ian. *Restoration cathedral music, 1660-1714*. Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1995 (Oxford studies in British church music.) Contains some interesting observations concerning Blow's debt to earlier composers such as Byrd and Gibbons. Of particular value is the inclusion of the prefaces to all six volumes of Tudway's MS "Services and anthems" (1715-1720) which provide an indication of albeit conservative attitudes to the music of Byrd and his contemporaries.
237. Turbet, Richard. "An affair of honour: 'Tudor church music', the ousting of Richard Terry, and a trust vindicated". *Music & Letters* 7b (1995): 593-600. Brings to the attention of researchers the Tudor Church Music archive of the Carnegie United Kingdom Trust at the Scottish Record Office, Edinburgh, and reveals the conception progress and disintegration of the Tudor Church Music series, including the remarkable events surrounding the removal of Terry as editor-in-chief. Three of the series' ten volumes were devoted to Byrd.
238. Turbet, Richard. "Byrd and Tomkins: the Great Service revisited". *Leading Notes* 9 (1995): 10-11. Response to 180, emphasizing the need to perceive early music as its contemporaries did, and not impose specious categories such as "Great Service" on it. Reiterates that Byrd's was the only work so titled and that scribal errors explain such headings in the Services by Tomkins and Hooper. (As I reported on page 101 of 221, Peter Meadows stated that the heading "Greate" in Peterhouse Music MS. 38 (under the first two lines which read "Basso" and "Mr Hoopers Full Magnificat Dec") "would seem to be a later addition or amendment". Since only the Cantoris bass partbook consistently calls Hooper's Service "Great", this suggests that a scribe went later to the companion partbook and mislabelled it for consistency among the basses, perpetuating a confusion with Byrd's piece in the same source. (1995 Tbyr)
239. Turbet, Richard. "Byrd, Weelkes and verse Services". *Annual Byrd Newsletter* 1 (1995): 5. Appendix to 158. Suggests Weelkes' *First Service* is another homage to Byrd's *Second*. (1995 Tbyr)
240. Turbet, Richard. "Francis Neilson, F. W. Dwelly and the first complete edition of Byrd". *Bulletin of the John Rylands University Library of Manchester* 77 (Summer 1995): 53-8. Using Neilson's papers deposited in Manchester University Library, traces for the first time his involvement and that of Dwelly in the publishing history of Fellowes' complete edition. The correspondence establishes the edition's official title, the corrected dates of publication of the post-war volumes 10-17, and the size of the print run. (I am indebted to Oliver Neighbour for the observation that vols. 10-12 were deposited in the British Museum on 7 December 1948. Fellowes states explicitly in a letter of 15 August 1949 that these three volumes had been published earlier during the year in which he was writing, i.e. 1949. Presumably the depositing of the copyright volumes preceded by a few weeks their actual publication in what was by then the following calendar year.)
- Is 'date of publication' a very precise term for music? Unlike books, music is rarely advertised as 'published on 1 June 1996'. The date of copyright often refers to a different format from the one to hand and is not necessarily corrected if the printing process takes longer than is originally anticipated. CB
241. Bray, Roger, ed. *Music in Britain: the sixteenth century*. Oxford: Blackwell, 1995. (The Blackwell history of music in Britain, 3). Contains numerous references to Byrd throughout. Indispensable. (In John Morehen's discussion of the

Great Service on page 344, the reference to Morley's Best (or First) Service being in "some York Minster manuscripts" should, according to a telephoned communication from the author, refer to Durham Cathedral MS E 11a.)

242. Milsom, John. "Sacred songs in the chamber". In *English choral practice, 1400-1650*, ed. John Morehen, Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1996, pp. 161-79. Byrd is mentioned on all but two of this essay's pages. Surveys all Elizabethan and Jacobean sources containing Latin music. Concludes that with a few exceptions they were intended for domestic consumption. Renews his plea in 198 for more authentic performances of this repertory. On pages 176-7 notes those known to have owned sets of the joint 1575 *Cantiones* of Tallis and Byrd. (1996 Ms)

243. Wulstan, David. "Byrd, Tallis and Ferrabosco". In *English choral practice* (see 242), pp. 109-42. Continuation of 187. Exploits computer analysis to compare the extents to which Tallis and Alfonso Ferrabosco I influenced Byrd. Includes the statistics, compiled by John Duffill, mentioned as forthcoming in footnote 28 at the end of 187. (As coeditor of *Byrd Studies* (168), in which David's original paper appeared, I have to respond to his complaints that it "had to be truncated". His first draft came in at three times the length laid down by the publisher. I know I speak for my fellow editor Alan Brown in expressing my delight that this important material which we had to jettison has found so worthy a home.) Although these are supposed to be brief annotations, I take friendly issue with David on four points. First, I believe that *Similes illis fiant* is indeed by William, and not the otherwise silent Thomas, Byrd: I argue the case in my short monograph on Byrd (210), pages 13-15. Subsequent support has come from one of many biographical discoveries by John Harley. Readers may have noticed in this year's catalogue from Scolar Press an interestingly early date of birth in the details of his forthcoming book on Byrd, rendering the composer more of an age to participate in a tripartite setting of the sort in which *Similes* appears, jointly written with two older colleagues. Secondly, Timothy Symons puts a good case for Sheppard's *Second Service* being one of the composer's latest works, and not from the Edwardine period: see his edition, Guildford: Cantus Firmus Music, 1995. Thirdly, it is unbelievable that it can still be stated that Byrd joined the Chapel Royal in 1570 when it has been known for years that the correct date is 1572. Finally, he is rather hard on *Out of the deep*, and on page four of last year's Newsletter I provide conclusive support for the attribution to Byrd. The patently erroneous indexing to Gibbons can now be consigned to footnotes and otherwise forgotten. But he is right to query *Save me O God*: see for instance my diatribe in *William Byrd: a guide to research*, pp. 335-6. (1996 Wb)

244. Dawson, Giles E. "A gentleman's purse". *Yale review* 39 (1950): 631-46. Anecdotal review of the account book of William Petre, dedicatee of Byrd's *Tenth pavan*. The composer is mentioned only twice in the article.

Further amendments to *William Byrd: a guide to research*

- p. 9: add "KM Byrd, W. Fantasia à 4 no 3., ed. by Warwick Edwards. Wyton: King's Music, 1995."
- p. 16, T 38, l. 2: for "Iesu" read "Iesum".
- p. 43, T 231: add "MB lvi 127 no. 82 (keyboard arrangement)."
- p. 60, T 377: add "KM".
- p. 62, T 392: Replace penultimate sentence with "MB lvi 39 no. 16 (keyboard arrangement)."
- p. 107: for "DESCANTABANT" read "DECANTABANT".

Forthcoming Research

Five items noted in Newsletter 1 as forthcoming are still in that purgatorial state. David Crankshaw's essay on the religious dispositions of peers and how they exercised their powers of patronage, with reference to Byrd, is awaiting submission to *Past and present*.

Craig Monson's "Byrd, the Catholics and the motet" is in *Hearing the motet*, ed. Dolores Pearce, due this year from Oxford University Press. Likewise my article on "William Byrd and the Motett Society" is scheduled for *Aberdeen University Review* this Autumn. Publication of John Harley's book *William Byrd, Gentleman of the Chapel Royal* has been brought forward to December 1996 by Scolar Press. David Mateer kindly allowed an intermediary to send me a typescript of "William Byrd, John Petre, and Oxford, Bodleian MS Mus. Sch. E.423", to appear in the 1996 *Research Chronicle*. It is an important article, with much new information and some reinterpretation of familiar material. By the same means I received his paper on "William Byrd's Middlesex recusancy", due to appear later this year in *Music & Letters*. Again there is a substantial amount of new information and some provocative conclusions.

Richard Rastall kindly sent me a typescript of his contribution to *Liber amicorum John Steele: a musicological tribute*, ed. Warren Drake, due this summer from Pendragon Press of Stuyvesant, NY. Its provisional title is "William Byrd's string fantasia 6/g1". Richard is collaborating with Julie Rayner on a monograph provisionally entitled *William Byrd: six-part fantasias in G minor*. This has been accepted for publication by Scolar Press.

My article "A model from Byrd?", which considers the impetus for Tomkins' solitary motet, is scheduled for publication this July in *Choir & Organ*.

At the 13th Seminar on the History of the Provincial Book Trade, Bristol, 11-13 July 1995, I gave a paper entitled "Byrd's music in provincial imprints from 1770 to the present, with special reference to H. B. Collins", which will form part of the published proceedings, edited by Michael Richardson (University of Bristol Press).

Michael Greenhalgh's "A Byrd discography supplement", updating "A Byrd discography" (170) from 1989 to 1994, and filling lacunae 1922-88, will appear in *Brio* 33.1 (1996).

Significant recent recordings

In last year's recordings I stated that on *The spirit of Byrd* (Helikon HCD 1016) Oliver Hirsch "like everyone else who has recorded the *Preludium and Fantasia* ... has adopted the repeat at bars 58-61". This is the classic error in transmission (my error, my transmission) as the word "not" was omitted before "adopted" thereby reversing the intended meaning. This clears the way for Laurent Stewart's recording of the piece on *Harpsichord works by Byrd and Gibbons* (Pierre Verany PV 795051) to be acclaimed as the first to adopt the repeat in question. (A reminder that the Helikon disc is not distributed outside Denmark but can be obtained by sending a British cheque for £12, or a cheque of other nationality for a comparable sum in local currency, to Helikon Edition, P.O. Box 8, DK 4672 Klippinge, Denmark.)

If 1994 was a good year for British recordings of Byrd, 1995 was a dud, apart from *The early Byrd* reviewed last year. With one exception, the only discs worth mentioning are all from overseas, and it is excellent that this state of affairs gives prominence to the fact of a major British composer being appreciated abroad in France, Germany and America (not to mention Denmark).

Laurent Stewart's disc mentioned above contains nine items by Byrd in a programme of 23. It is maddening that he plays only the first and third of the *French corantos*, even if he does play the sole example of Gibbons. Byrd's have only once appeared on disc as a trio, and none of Stewart's other selections are unfamiliar to the medium. Nevertheless it is a selection well chosen both in terms of Byrd and in relation to the fine music by Gibbons with which it is interspersed.

William Byrd: songs and ensemble music (Musicaphon M 56808) is performed by the soprano Lynne Dawson and the English Consort of Viols. Ironically the only hitherto unrecorded item on it is the briefest, *I thought that love*. Nearly all of Byrd's corpus of music for viols in five parts is presented, and although all but one of the songs have also been recorded previously, most remain unfamiliar.

Both of these European discs are distributed in Britain, as are the following two American discs devoted to Byrd's music. *The passage mesures* is played by James Nicolson (virginals and organ) on Titanic Ti-225. All the pieces have been recorded before. The plucked instrument Nicolson uses is a double virginal. I have at once to confess to a dislike of the squeaky tone of the "kind" in this "moeder en kind" pairing. The sound of the "moeder" is agreeable, especially when used with the "kind". Entire, mercifully short pieces played on the "kind" – the Gigg and Alman (T 431/BK 11) both unfamiliar to disc – are under-standable, but its sudden appearance in the middle of pieces such as *Qui passe*, *The bells*, *My Lady Nevell's ground* and the *Passamezzo pavan* and galliard disrupts their rhetorical flow and sounds undignified for such profound utterances. Also

it is the case that Nicolson's musicology is slightly old-fashioned. It has long been known that what he calls "Miserere (4 parts)" is the third setting of *Clarifica me pater*. Although he identifies each piece by its Nevell or Fitzwilliam number, reference to the complete edition would have been more helpful; as it was, I resorted to my own catalogue in *William Byrd: a guide to research* to discover the BK number (which illustrates one practical purpose of my listing...). At 79 minutes such plenitude may explain the regrettable omission of the Galliard to the Pavan T 497 (BK 4). Otherwise, unless one has reservations about varied tempi, anyway confined to the variations on *The woods so wild* and *Walsingham*, the music comes over very well. There are excellent performances of the *Pavana Lachrymae*, *Clarifica me pater* (see above), the isolated Galliard (misnumbered FWVB CLLXIV on the back, recte CLXIV) and the Pavan and Galliard T 504 (BK 52). Slightly heavy weather is made of the Fancie T 447 (BK 46) while the first setting of *Mounsieur's Alman* T 426 (BK 87) is a bit untidy but exudes a sense of fun. Nicolson's varied repeats in the Gigg are rather obviously his own, but his *Walsingham* is a commanding performance showing a perceptive grasp of its massive structure.

The other disc is *Music of William Byrd* by the New York Consort of Viols with guest soloists Tamara Crout (soprano) and Louis Bagger (harpsichord), on Lyrichord LEMS 8015. It gets off to a slow start with the *Voluntary for My Lady Nevell* arranged unconvincingly for four viols but the remaining 14 items are fine. Attention must be drawn to two premiere recordings: the duet *Delight is dead* (the tenor violist doubles as no mean countertenor...) and the dubious but delightful *Fantasia à 4* T A19 (BE 17/7). Otherwise the consort plays the *Fantasias à 3* T 373-4 (BE 17/2-3), the "1611" *Fantasia à 4* and *Browning*. Louis Bagger gives fine performances of *Ut re mi*, *The maiden's song* and the *Tregian pavan* and galliard with adopted prelude T 508 (BK 115). Violist Lawrence Lipkin also duets with Miss Crout on a gimmicky but ultimately satisfying version of *Who made thee Hob* (always remembering before the authenticist in me becomes too militant that it survives in an unreconstructable fragment for broken consort) and sings a good solo on *Farewell false love*. Miss Crout seems slightly disengaged from the text in *Rejoice unto the Lord*, but her performance of *My mistress had a little dog* is so far the best of a growing number on disc, with good projection of the necessary "mezzo" range, and in *Ye sacred muses* she is the equal of any other female interpreter. (The foregoing review of LEMS 8015 is adapted from one in *Viola da Gamba Society newsletter*, April 1996, by kind permission of the editor, Michael Fleming.)

The same label is reissuing on CD the classic recording *Music for voice and viols* (LEMS 8014) performed by the countertenor Russell Oberlin and the In Nomine Players. For details consult Michael Greenhalgh's indispensable "Byrd discography" in *Byrd studies* (pp. 202-64). Suffice to say of its 12 tracks, three still remain unique recordings, and despite many subsequent recordings of the fifth In

nomine à 5, the eponymous players' version remains the best, 36 years on.

On Lammas LAMM 086D The Mixed Choir of Jesus College Cambridge sings *Sacred songs of William Byrd*, conducted by Duncan Aspden. I was sent a review copy by another journal (*Choir and Organ*) so must take care not to plagiarize myself. The ensemble is authentic in including ladies. (While there is no reason to exclude boys, such performances of Byrd's Latin music would be more authentic not given the echoing vastness of cathedrals and like buildings.) However, Jesus' Mixed Choir is quite a large ensemble. Seven of the eight *Cantiones sacrae* 1589-91 performed here have been recorded before, but of particular importance is the first ever recording of the earlier of Byrd's settings of *Salve Regina*. Otherwise a varied and challenging programme includes items such as *Miserere mei*, *Haec dies*, *Laudibus in sanctis* and *Ne irascaris* which have established recording histories, beside *Vigilate*, *Haec dicit Dominus* and *Infelix ego* which have begun to flourish on record more recently. Performances of the two well-known fantasias in C major (for my Lady Nevell) and A minor (from the *Preludium and fantasia*) played on the organ by Charles Harrison (the latter with the elusive repeat mentioned above) complete the contents of the disc.

Announced for 1995 but released early in 1996 is another European recording: *Jhon come kisse me nowe, and other harpsichord works* played by John Whitelaw on the Belgian label Talent (DOM 2910 22). This is a recycling of a 1981 LP on the American Spectrum label which contained eight items, with the addition of three extra tracks. The contents of the LP are listed in Michael Greenhalgh's discography (170) and I discuss the disc briefly on pages 284-5 of 153 (my guide to Byrd research). It is my policy to offer information only concerning discs not submitted for review to *The Byrd Newsletter*, reserving opinion and recommendation for review copies. This disc was not sent for review, but I am happy to endorse the comments I made in 153. Furthermore I now understand Whitelaw's changes of tempo in *The bells* and, even if I have reservations about them, can feel comfortable listening to his interpretation. Whitelaw's remains the only recorded version of the dubious *Medley* T A22 (BK 112). Furthermore, as in the case of the previous disc, the present one is important for presenting a first ever recording (amongst the three additional items), in this case the *Hornpipe*. The other two additions are the *Passamezzo* pavan and galliard and *My Lady Nevell's ground*. The disc is distributed in the United Kingdom by Seaford Music, 24 Pevensey Road, Eastbourne, Sussex BN21 3HP.

The Clerks of New College, Oxford, have recorded the *Lamentations* (first appearance on CD) and the *Mass a4* at low pitch on Collins Classics 1487-2 and *Out of the deep* has just appeared on a disc of music by Gibbons sung by Oxford Camerata (Naxos 8.553130). Still awaited is New College Oxford's recording of the 1575 *Cantiones* (CRD 3492).

Future recordings

Priory Records' catalogue for 1996-7 bears news of a first ever complete recording of the evening canticles of the *Short Service*. (Details of a fine recording of the *Magnificat* can be found in Michael Greenhalgh's discography in *Byrd studies*.) The new recording is by Truro Cathedral Choir (PRCD 553 for release 1996/7 as volume ten in the series *Magnificat and Nunc dimittis*. The synthetic *Faux-bourbons* (or *Fifth*) *Service* is to appear on volume 11 in the series sung by St Edmundsbury Cathedral Choir (PRCD 554) also 1996/7 and again a premiere: see page 37 of *William Byrd: a guide to research* for details of this piece.

Sales of volume 1 of I Fagiolini's *The Early Byrd*, reviewed in last year's *Newsletter*, were sufficiently encouraging for Chandos Records to envisage two further discs in the series. Works under consideration for recording include *Vigilate*, *Why do I use*, *Deus venerunt gentes*, *Crowned with flowers*, *Domine salva nos*, *Domine tu iurasti*, *Quomodo cantabimus* and *O dear life*. It is anticipated that Fretwork and Sophie Yates will again also be involved in recording sessions planned for later this year.

Unrecorded Byrd

Several keyboard pieces by Byrd remain unrecorded:-

Monsieur's alman T 428 (BK 44)
Ut mi re T 514 (BK 65)
Lady Monteagle's pavan T 493 (BK 75)
Pavan and galliard in G T 498 (BK 73)
Pavan and galliard in a T 501 (BK 16)
Alman T 432 (BK 117, EK 30)
Piper's galliard T A24 (BK 118, EK 26)

Carlton Classics have invited Alan Cuckston to make a CD of keyboard music by Byrd, and Alan hopes to include the pieces hitherto unrecorded.

The following pieces only appear on obscure recordings:-

Pavan and galliard in B flat T 502 (BK 23)
Coranto T 444 (BK 45)
French corantos T 441-3 (BK 21) as a set.

Miscellany

Colin Bayliss has composed *Differencies from the Harlington of Mr Byrde, for string orchestra* (Bolton: Da Capo Music, 1994). It was premiered during the summer of 1994 at Macduff by Aberdeen Sinfonietta, who gave subsequent performances at Perth and Aberdeen: a fine piece.

From a music publishing perspective, the Byrd event of 1995 was the publication by King's Music of Warwick Edwards' reconstruction of the third *Fantasia* in four parts, never before playable: see R. Turbet, "Cruel to be kind", *Musical Times* 134 (1993): 104. [cont. on page 8

Haec est dies (attrib. William Byrd)

Triplex (G2) Haec est di - es, haec est di - es, haec est

Medius (C2) Haec est di - es, haec est di - es, haec est di - es Do - mi - ni, Do -

Tenor (C3) Haec est di - es, haec est di - es, haec est di - es

Bassus (C4) Haec est di - es, haec est di - es Do - mi -

5 di - es Do - mi - ni: gau-di - a - mus, gau-di -

- - - - - mi - ni: gau-di - a - mus, gau-di - a - mus

Do - - - - - mi - ni: gau-di - a - mus, gau-di - a - mus et lae - te-mur, et -

-ni, Do - mi - ni: gau-di - a - mus, gau-di - a - - -

9 -a - mus et lae - te - mur in e - a,

et lae - te - mur in e - - - - - a, et lae - te - mur in e - - -

- lae - te - mur in e - - - - - a,

-mus et lae - te - mur in e - a, et lae - te - - - - -

12 et lae - te - mur in e - a, et lae - te - mur in e - a,

-a, et lae - te - mur in e - a, et lae - te - mur in e - - - - a.

et lae - te - mur in e - - a, et lae - te - mur in e - - - - - a.

-mur in e - - - - - a, et lae - te - mur in e - - - - - a.

16

Haec est di - es, haec est di - es, haec est di - es Do - mi - ni

Haec est di - es, haec est di - es, haec est di - es Do - - - mi - ni gau - di -

Haec est di - es, haec est di - es, haec est di - es Do - - - mi - ni gau - di -

Haec est di - es, haec est di - es, haec est di - es Do - mi - ni

20

gau - di - a - mus, gau - di - a - mus, gau - di - a - mus

- a - - - mus, gau - di - a - - - mus, gau - di - a - - - - - mus

- a - - - - - mus, gau - di - a - - - - mus, gau - di - a - - - mus et lae - te -

gau - di - a - - - mus, gau - di - a - - - mus, gau - di - a - - - mus

24

et lae - te - mur in e - - - - a,

et lae - te - mur in e - - - - a, et lae - te - mur in e -

- - mur in e - - - - a, et lae - te - mur in e - - - - a,

et lae - te - mur in e - a, et lae - te -

27

et lae - te - mur in e - - - a, et lae - te - mur in e - a.

- - a, et lae - te - mur in e - - - - - - - - - a.

et lae - te - mur in e - - - a, et lae - te - mur in e - - - - - - - - a.

- mur in e - - - a, et lae - te - - - - mur in e - - - - - - - a.

King's Music, publishers of *Early Music Review* and therefore of this *Newsletter*, also publish the *Short Service* of William Inglott which is misattributed to Byrd in one source. This is another reconstruction.

In 1994 Northwood Music published George Hunter's new edition of Byrd's consort music in five parts. This is the only edition that includes the Pavan's authentic tenor part, which only came to light after BE 17 was published.

When I was reconstructing the 1588 arrangement for broken consort of *The fifth pavan* (Lincoln: Lindum Desktop Music, 1993) I became convinced it was based on a lost original for consort that predated the surviving version for keyboard. Richard Rastall has reconstructed a version of *The fifth pavan* for viols, plus other pieces that may derive from consort originals, with a view to publishing them, beginning this year, perhaps in a joint venture between the University of Leeds Music Department and North East Early Music Forum.

Further to item 225 in *Newsletter* 1, the vocal ensemble Pange Lingua performed a series of concerts in Holy Trinity Church, Sloane Street, London during October 1993 to celebrate the 450th anniversary of the birth of Byrd.

On page 81 of *A catalogue of Durham Cathedral music manuscripts* by Brian Crosby (Oxford UP, 1986) there is what may be the earliest reference to "short services" as a genre or category. This is from Misc. Ch. 7116, a parchment of c.1665. It is questionable as to whether a Tudor composer was conscious of composing in a "short service idiom" when writing what contemporary scribes would have described as, amongst other things, his "Short Service". After the Restoration, when the Tudor repertory had been plundered for canticles, the perspective of history would reveal the existence of many services of modest dimensions, designed for routine unaccompanied performance, and often entitled "Short". It is a short step from noticing such a perspective to an awareness of an apparent category of such services: an awareness that perhaps was not felt in the Tudor age when they were being composed.

In 1994 Ensemble Five/One, conducted by Drew Minter, performed three concerts entitled "Prayer and lamentation: music for Lent by William Byrd" as part of their series "Music in historic churches". Scheduled for March 18-20 at St Anne's, Annapolis, Maryland; St Paul's, Rock Creek, Washington, DC; and Trinity, Upper Marlboro, Maryland respectively, each event included a pre-concert lecture.

The Byrd Memorial Concert for 1995 by the Stondon Singers in Stondon Parish Church on July 4 included *Tu es pastor* and *Hodie Simon Petrus*.

Writing in *British Music Society Newsletter* 19 (1993 Ti) I lamented that the two Byrdian works that Tippet turned to Byrd's pavans as a formal model for two crucial passages in his first symphony and first string quartet. Now that we know how to listen to the works in question, the debt to Byrd is as clear as are the links with Gibbons in other works by Tippet. It is tempting to wonder whether, when Tippet breaks into triplets in these Byrdian passages, he is emulating Byrd in Strain B' of the *First pavan*.

Simon Patterson's postmodern icon *The great bear*, first exhibited in 1992, takes the map of London's underground railway, renames the lines after groups of people (the Metropolitan is Musicians) and renames the stations accordingly. Byrd is Pinner, between Palestrina (North Harrow) and Thomas Tallis (Northwood Hills). Further north, Chalfont and Latimer becomes Orlando Gibbons. It is a fact that in the sixteenth century many people surnamed Byrd lived in Pinner.

One wonders what Byrd thinks, perhaps having just composed another Sanctus for the benefit of cherubim and seraphim, as he looks down on the shenanigans at his old cathedral. Recruitment of trebles to Lincoln's choir certainly tailed off for a while. But it has now picked up and the Lincoln Cathedral Music Appeal is making a convulsive effort to secure the cathedral's musical tradition "for the next 900 years", nine centuries having recently been clocked up. £1.75m. is being raised, part of it to endow several choristerships at £35,000 each. And William will be mollified by the announcement in the *Lincoln Cathedral Music Appeal newsletter* 6 (February 1996): [2] that "The Cathedral Group has raised the £35,000 needed to endow a chorister, to be named after William Byrd." Donations can be sent to the Appeal at 4 Priorygate, Lincoln LN2 1PL, England.

Tracing the fortune of Byrd's music in church, certainly in the present century, is relatively straightforward (see for instance 182). Less forthcoming is the secular arena. One source of information is the *Catalogue of choral works performed by societies affiliated to the National Federation of Music Societies between its inauguration in 1936 and the year 1960*, 3rd ed. London: NFMS, 1960. Renaissance music constitutes no more than a trickle. Byrd is represented by the three masses and the *Great Service*: the latter a mild surprise in a list predictably but depressingly limited. But to place it in context, the only other Tudors in the catalogue are Taverner (*Western Wind* mass) and Tallis (*Lamentations* and, gratifyingly, *Spem in alium*). Contemporary Europeans fare no better: only Palestrina (6), Victoria (2), Sweelinck, Giovanni Gabrieli and Lassus (1 each) appear.

On 3 May 1996 in the Wren Library of Lincoln Cathedral, John Harley gave a lecture "Our beloved in Christ, William Byrd".

The *BBC Music Magazine* includes a handsome postcard of Byrd in a set of five with Puccini, Shostakovich, Elgar and Chopin; £1.99 from Nicki Reid, BBC Worldwide Publishing, Woodlands, 80 Wood Lane, London W12 0TT; telephone 0181 576 2000, fax 0181 576 3292.

This year's C. B. Oldman Prize, awarded annually by the United Kingdom Branch of the International Association of Music Libraries for the best British book of music bibliography, librarianship or reference, has been won by Richard Turbet for *Tudor music: a research and information guide, with an appendix updating William Byrd: a guide to research* (New York: Garland, 1994).

The Carnegie Trust and Byrd's music in the 1920s

Researching the TCM archive in Edinburgh for 237 (q.v.) I came across two files devoted to Byrd. I mention file 242 in the article. It contains details of the performance on Sunday 20 February 1927 in the Great Hall of Birmingham University of the *Great Service* by the Birmingham Festival Choral Society conducted by Adrian Boult. The Carnegie Trustees provided a special grant of £30 to enable Boult to purchase 280 copies. The work was described by C. Grant Robertson, the University's Principal, in a letter to Sir Donald MacAlister, vice-chairman of the Trustees, as "the greatest achievement of the greatest of British musicians". Admission to the performance was free, and to vindicate Robertson's opinion no fewer than 2,000 attended, with many turned away.

File 238 concerns the Byrd Tercentenary Festival, and the £200 guaranteed by the Carnegie Trust as long as £300 was raised from elsewhere. In the event the festival made a small surplus so the guarantee was written off. The file contains a reference to the activities of the elusive but impressively peopled Byrd Tercentenary Committee (see 152). This notes an otherwise-unrecorded meeting on 17 March 1922 at the Royal College of Music. RT

Byrd's Music at Lincoln : a supplementary note

In my *William Byrd, 1543-1623, Lincoln's greatest composer* I traced the fortunes of Byrd's music at the cathedral where he was Organist and Master of the Choristers 1563-1572 by listing manuscripts that included pieces of his, from 1711 to the advent of printed music bills in 1893 (pp. 32-4). In 1774 both *O Lord turn Thy wrath* and *Bow thine ear* (contrafacta of the two parts of *Ne irascaris* but invariably separate anthems when sung in the Church of England) were copied. However, only the latter is listed in *A collection of old and modern anthems. As they are now performed in the Cathedral Church of the Blessed Virgin Mary in Lincoln...* By the Rev, the Succentor [i.e. Childers Twentyman] (Lincoln: Wood, 1775). Worse was to follow in the next such publication, *A collection of anthems used in the Cathedral Church of Lincoln* (Lincoln: Drury, 1827), from which Byrd is entirely absent. None of his music was copied in manuscripts between 1812 (*O Lord turn* - its last appearance in the MSS - and *Bow Thine ear*) and 1851 (all but the *Venite* of the *Short Service*, *Bow Thine ear* and, for the first time since 1711, *Sing joyfully*, its inclusion probably inspired by the recent appearance in Hullah's *Vocal Scores* published in London in 1847). The evidence of 1774-5 proves that the published collections of texts did not include all repertory anthems of the time, but

the evidence of 1812-51 and 1827 in particular is not encouraging. Indeed the first printed music bill in 1893 may be an optimistic reflection of the organistship of John Young, 1850-93: *Sing joyfully* and *Bow Thine ear* sung once each, and no *Short Service*. R. T.

The William Byrd Singers of Manchester

I think I can justly claim to be no Byrd scholar - such folk might well find me a bull in a china shop or at least one of the gibbons - but my record as a Byrd fancier is well documented over the past 25 years. As a choirboy at Christ Church, Oxford, in the 20s under W. H. Harris I must have encountered some Byrd but can't recall any, though I do recall some excitement there about a rediscovered piece of Taverner (*O bone Jesu?*) which I didn't share. At a pre-university consultation with Cyril Rootham in 1936, when asked the principal difference between Renaissance and later music, I knew: the absence of emotion in the former(!)

I was to suffer a conversion of course, and others have suffered from my conversion ever since. Around 1970 I found myself avidly reading through the entire published works of Byrd - pure chance, perhaps, that it wasn't those of Palestrina or Lassus, but a happy one, for now I know more of these and other great contemporaries of Byrd I can see that what differentiates him from them is what particularly commends him to me. Hard to name it, perhaps misleading even to try: humanity? raciness? Whatever it is, I don't find it equally in all his music; gourmet, or gourmand, I can't swallow the whole corpus. Maybe looking in "a glass where all may see themselves" I find myself reflected in a tiny corner and love Byrd for all the wrong reasons, but love him I do.

I find this quintessential Byrdness gloriously apparent in *Vigilate* in *Turn our captivity*, in *Christ rising* and *Christ is risen*; less so in the masses, which others may prize more highly. I'm at least as likely to find it in early works as in later: *Memento homo*, for instance (though scholars might rate it immature), *Attollite portas* (particularly the "King of Glory" dialogue) and *O lux beata*, whose closing pages still send shivers down my back. I find it in the secular music too, in *Constant Penelope*, for example, in *What pleasure have great princes?* and in *O dear life, when may it be?*

It has been my treasured privilege to conduct Byrd in Lincoln Cathedral and awaken echoes of original performances four centuries back. It was in fact a comment by Hans Keller on a performance there of the 9-part *Domine quis habitabit?* by the BBC Northern Singers that first got them into the Proms (a tabernacle they inhabited for some years, thanks to Byrd, in spite of their "provincial" status in a heavily metropolitan organisation.)

Not unnaturally when I was asked to direct a Manchester chamber choir in 1970 Byrd was elected patron *in absentia*. The William Byrd Singers of Manchester are omnivores, not early music specialists and their repertoire has ranged

from Josquin to contemporary commissions, but there is more Byrd in their library than any other composer and they have sung it far and wide both in this country and abroad - first in Poland soon after formation, most recently in Finland last year and various lands between.

In 1973 they celebrated Byrd's 350th anniversary with "Mr Birde - homo memorabilis" at the QEH with Gillian Weir playing organ and harpsichord, the Jaye Consort of Viols and Gabriel Woolf reading from Byrd's marvellous prefaces. They made a pilgrimage to Stondon Massey, Byrd's supposed burial place, and sang there on the way. Variations of this programme have recurred several times since, most recently with the Rose Consort and Gabriel Woolf for the 450th anniversary in 1993. At one time or another they have sung *The Great Service* and all the propers for the Feast of S.S. Peter and Paul. They have also enjoyed various "Byrd-and" programmes: Byrd & Gibbons, Byrd & Bach, even Byrd & Bax. Several motets figure on their CD "The Flower of Peace" along with Parry's "Songs of Farewell" and the two motets first mentioned above appeared in their English programme at the RNCM in March. The love affair continues. *Omnis spiritus laudet Dominum...* not least for William Byrd. Stephen Wilkinson

Ensemble William Byrd

The Ensemble William Byrd started life as the inelegantly-named Quatuor Vocal William Byrd, which I formed soon after moving to Paris in 1982. Members were taken from the Groupe Vocal de France (a professional contemporary ensemble meant to be the vocal equivalent to Boulez's Ensemble Intercontemporain - but for which they never found a capable enough director). As I am a confirmed "low-pitch" man, the format was ATTB, in which formation we performed in concert between 1984 and 1989 the four-part mass (down a fourth in my own edition) and much of the four-part *Gradualia*, as well as lots of Spanish Renaissance music, French chansons and some close-harmony.

Why Byrd? Well, my previous ensemble, *Psallite*, which was at that time still active but which, being based in England, gradually died over the ensuing years, had done a lot of Byrd. There's even a recording (*Music of Religious Upheaval in Tudor England*, on Libra Realsound Cassette LR127) which includes *Tribue Domine*, *Laudibus in sanctis*, *Tristitia et anxietas* (not many recordings of that about, I suspect) and *Laetentur caeli*, plus some Tallis and Gibbons. It was while working with *Psallite* that I became convinced that for all the Latin music, and most of the English (1) low pitch, and *chiavette* transposition where appropriate, provided the only coherent musical solutions to problems of vocal tessitura and balance; and (2) one to a part was essential for all but the Service music.

After a while, we found ourselves doing more and more concerts with five singers and various instruments, so in 1989 renamed ourselves Ensemble William Byrd, won a competition, found an administrator and a record com-

pany, and launched ourselves into the Big Time. The unfortunate corollary is that the amount of Byrd we do has gone down in inverse proportion to our general success and fame! Apart from the fact that in France Renaissance music is harder to sell than Baroque, doing English music tends to label us English, which is politically a bad move. However, I'm sticking to the name, and hoping to convert more and more French singers to the joys of WB.

What the ensemble has done instead is three records (Gibbons, Purcell and Palestrina) and lots of concerts, mostly in France, of a pretty wide repertoire ranging from Machaut to Handel. The aspect in common is chamber performance - our Monteverdi Vespers uses the minimum of ten singers, the Chandos Anthems also 10 (three girls, five tenors, two basses, at 392 and with soloists taken from the ensemble). Our numbers vary from 5 to 75 (for the Biber *Missa Salisburgensis*, which we did in 1992). In the pipeline for the summer is a return to the Festival de la Chaise-Dieu to redo *Spem in alium* (we did it in 1991). We will again do it twice, once in Latin and once in English. This neatly divides the concert into a "Catholic" half and a "Protestant" half, and this time, thinking that it's about time we did more Byrd, I've put down *Ad Dominum cum tribulatione* and the Magnificat from *The Great Service*. It will be interesting to assess the contrast we sense in religious approach between these two wonderful pieces, as well as, and apart from, the obvious stylistic and musical differences.

Among our Byrd party-pieces in the last few years have been *Christ rising* and *O you that hear this voice*, which we do in a conflated "consort" and "voices" version, transposed down, of course, from the high clefs. Also in the repertoire are *Diliges Dominum*, *Ne irascaris Civitas*, *Save me O God*, *Tho' Amaryllis*, *Susanna fair* (à3) and *Hob*. What have not changed since the days of *Psallite* are my convictions about low pitch and *chiavette*, and of the necessity of "chamber" performance. I have an instinctive horror of most Byrd being sung by cathedral choirs. Graham O'Reilly

William Byrd and the late 17th century

English musicians of the later 17th century were well aware of the achievements of their predecessors. Formal musical education seems to have relied heavily on treatises of an earlier time,¹ and in cathedrals and other choral foundations, where many musicians received their initial training, John Barnard's *The First Book of Selected Church Musick* often provided the foundation of the post-Reformation repertory. The continued use of Barnard's services and anthems, old-fashioned even at the collection's nominal publication date of 1641,² is demonstrated by newly-copied performing material and by repeated alterations to the text of Byrd's *O Lord make thy servant* to accommodate the names of successive monarchs, while late 17th-century manuscript scores, particularly composers' copies, such as Purcell's autograph GB-Cfm MUS MS 88, offer further insight into the way earlier music was regarded by musicians of Purcell's generation.

The initial sequence of 17 anthems at the reverse of CFM 88, probably copied in late 1677 and 1678 and certainly finished before 1680, contains eight Barnard anthems and two others in a broadly similar style by Tomkins and Batten.³ The same series also includes works by Locke and Blow, but only the last, *Save me O God*, is by Purcell himself. Up to this point, the text features a secretary-hand 'e' characteristic of Purcell's earlier manuscripts; thereafter, Purcell's handwriting adopts the style familiar from GB-Lbl Add.MS 30930, dated 1680, and his own music appears more frequently. It is likely that CFM 88 was originally a Chapel Royal scorebook and that the first stage of Purcell's copying in it was a matter of professional duty rather than private study: his main concern seems to have been to clarify and complete the underlay, although in Byrd's *O Lord make thy servant*, he also identified, and to an extent replaced, a missing part.⁴ In addition, he radically altered the notation of the music, generally substituting a regular pattern of 4/2 bars for the unbarred freedom of his exemplars. This modern approach to barring is by no means universal in late 17th-century scores: in a related source of Barnard anthems, William Isaack's scorebook GB-Cfm MU MS 117, only the works copied from Purcell's CFM 88 have a comparable barring pattern, the others having a barline every third breve as an apparently deliberately arrhythmic visual guide. Neatly but closely written, Isaack's manuscript is essentially a file copy, a means of preserving the basic text of the repertory for reference, whereas Purcell's, laid out with admirable clarity, may have served not only as a carefully edited master copy for the standardised and corrected set of parts for the Chapel Royal but also as a rehearsal and organ score.

Purcell's regular barring in CFM 88 is applied to more recent music as well as to Barnard works and differs from his own practice of only a year or so earlier: there is a marked contrast between his pre-1677 organ part to Blow's *God is our hope and strength* in GB-Och Mus 554, for example, and his slightly later score copy of the same work in CFM 88.⁵ Though CFM 88 undoubtedly had practical and editorial purposes which the regular barring scheme could only assist, Purcell's notation draws attention to vertical rather than horizontal relationships and emphasises the organization of contrapuntal material into a rhythmically-purposeful harmonic structure: in this way, perhaps, Purcell the composer turned a somewhat tedious professional task into a revealing study of music he must have known intimately from his boyhood.

His approach can be illustrated by his treatment of Byrd's *Bow thine ear, O Lord*, one of the Barnard anthems. Purcell's underlay is complete and unambiguous, and he divides the entire anthems into bars a breve long, regardless of the relative complexity of different sections or of any rhythmic subtleties there may be. In many cases, the modern expectation of an emphasis on the first beat of a bar is, in fact, fulfilled by the rhythms inherent in Byrd's patterns of dissonance and resolution, so Purcell's notation accurately reflects the music's character (ex. 1), probably because of

Purcell's working method in copying the score rather than any theoretical considerations: in ex. 2, and even more clearly in the repetition of ex. 2 in a lower register that immediately follows, he seems to have barred the uppermost one or two parts as he wrote them to establish a basic pattern of alignment and underlay, thereby committing himself to the barlines between tied minims (originally semibreves imposed on the barlines themselves) before he had seen on paper the harmonic context created by the lower voices.

Purcell was not the only late 17th-century musician to see the qualities of special interest in Byrd's music. At Christ Church, Oxford, cathedral music underwent a significant revival under Henry Aldrich (dean from 1689 to 1710), reflected in Aldrich's own score GB-Och Mus 16 and in an organ book, *Och Mus* 1230, copied around the turn of the century by Richard Goodson, who, as organist of the cathedral from 1692, must have been responsible for putting many of Aldrich's ideas into practice. The latter manuscript, stained by repeated handling, evidently saw heavy use and there can be no doubt that its contents were frequently performed: pre-Restoration English composers whose anthems are well represented include Byrd (4 works), Tallis (4) and Orlando Gibbons (2). But whereas Purcell usually confined his modifications to the music of earlier anthems to matters of notation, Aldrich made a number of more substantial changes: amongst the longer and more complex early works in *Och* 1230, only Gibbons' *Hosanna to the Son of David* is entirely unaltered, and others, such as the anthem adapted from Byrd entitled *Be not wroth*, are extensively revised.

Be not wroth, a version of *Civitas sancti tui* from the *Cantiones Sacrae* of 1589, is in original the same work as *Bow thine ear O Lord*, transcribed by Purcell in CFM 88. The Christ Church disbursement book for 1690 records that Francis Withey received 6s for copying it, no doubt a reference to the parts in his hand in the cathedral singing books GB-Och Mus 1220-24. Two further scores at Christ Church suggest that Aldrich thought long and hard about the work before making his alterations. *Och Mus* 10 contains his own copy of *Civitas sancti tui* together with *Ne irascaris*, its 'first part', and *Och Mus* 554 is a copy of both anthems with English words: amongst papers that had belonged to Edward Lowe, and possibly written by him, the latter score probably came to Christ Church while Lowe was organist or on his death in 1682.

The English text Aldrich fitted to the adapted music, a conflated translation of *Ne irascaris* and *Civitas sancti tui*, results in many variants of rhythmic detail between his version and others, including Purcell's. Otherwise, Byrd's imitative points are preserved as the essential thematic material – virtually every phrase in every part of the Aldrich adaptation comes from somewhere in Byrd's original – but are sometimes treated less expansively or are combined contrapuntally in a way different from Byrd's: the first point, because of Aldrich's deletion of the opening bars,

makes eight entries instead of ten; the second, which Byrd extends over 11 of Purcell's 4/2 bars, is compressed into five bars instead, and the final point of Byrd's opening section becomes little more than an extended cadence. The whole opening imitative section is reduced by Aldrich to 19 breves instead of 31 bars of 4/2 time in Purcell's transcription, and the rest of the anthem is also shortened, though not to the same extent. In places, the effect of Aldrich's reworking is entirely different from Byrd's original: in the opening section, only the first ten breves could be said to be truly imitative, using the working-out of imitative points as an essential element of form, and for much of the rest of this section imitation becomes incidental to a structure conceived in primarily harmonic terms. Some of the meditative, mystical quality of Byrd's music has gone, although paradoxically Aldrich adopts a self-consciously archaic notation in *Och 16*, with unobtrusive barlines lightly sketched across the score as though he is simply aligning unbarred parts.

Aldrich's attention seems at times to be directed towards picturesque superficial effects. At the end of his compressed treatment of Byrd's second point, he introduces an augmented triad, a striking chromatic chord not present in Byrd's original (ex. 3). An augmented sixth chord, however, does appear at an approximately corresponding place in the 1589 and Barnard publications of *Civitas sancti tui*, probably because the copyist of the typesetter's exemplar mistook a step from supertonic to mediant in the medius part for one from leading note to tonic (ex. 4). Aldrich's manuscript score in *Och 10*, unlike Purcell's score or *Och 554*, includes this mistake, which perhaps inspired him to reconstruct a section of the anthem around a chromatic chord undoubtedly more convincing than the original printing error.

Aldrich's changes to *Civitas sancti tui* must be seen in the light of his personal vision of cathedral music, in which a dedicated and disciplined body of men and boys performed a sacred repertory set apart from the secular style of the day and clearly in the ancient tradition to which the Church of England was heir. His interference with Byrd's masterpiece now seems misguided and impertinent, but Aldrich's championing of the polyphonic repertory, even in modified form, and his insistence on a distinctive style for church music, may have helped to pave the way for a widespread and more historically educated interest in early polyphony later in the 18th century. His direction of the Christ Church choir and its repertory met with considerable contemporary approval: William Hayes, the anonymous author of *Remarks on Mr Avison's Essay on Musical Expression* (1753), holds up the Christ Church of Aldrich's time as a model to be emulated by other cathedrals (p. 100), and Thomas Ford, a chaplain of Christ Church from 1706 to 1712, states unequivocally that "Church music owes the preservation of its dignity" to Aldrich and describes several polyphonic works he altered as having been "rectify'd."⁶

Purcell, of course, was primarily interested in writing his own music, and it is highly probable that his copying of

early anthems in *Cfm 88* opened his eyes to the possibilities of counterpoint. Between 1678 and the early 1680s, already a successful composer with a prestigious court appointment and anthems such as *My beloved spake* to his credit, he worked intensively on contrapuntal music of various kinds, including the fantazias and sonatas as well as the anthems he added to *Cfm 88* itself. The probable chronology of Purcell's different autographs suggests that his editorial work in *Cfm 88* lay at the beginning of this process, inspiring him to explore the Baroque *stile antico* in his own church music, to examine the achievements of his predecessors at court, and to make counterpoint an essential element of his composition in many genres. But, important as they are in Purcell's own development, the *Cfm 88* copies of earlier anthems are also evidence of an unexpectedly serious attitude towards older music in the Chapel Royal: even at the earliest date possible for his work in the manuscript, December 1677, Purcell was no longer an apprentice composer and, whether the editorial task was voluntary or assigned by his superiors, his was an unusually expert hand to be sorting out the underlay in Barnard. His involvement in this work and Aldrich's policy at Christ Church are indications of the high regard in which late 17th-century musicians held some of the older repertory.

NOTES

1. See Peter Holman, *Henry Purcell*, (Oxford, 1994), 7.
2. No copies seem to have circulated before the Restoration: see John Barnard, *The First Book of Selected Church Musick* (facsimile ed. John Morehen, Farnborough, 1972) iii-ix.
3. See Robert Thompson, "Purcell's great autographs" in Curtis Price (ed.), *Purcell Studies* (Cambridge, 1995), 6-34.
4. See Robert Shay, "Purcell as collector of 'ancient' music: Fitzwilliam MS 88", in Price, *Purcell Studies*, 35-50.
5. Illustrated in R. Thompson, *The Glory of the Temple and the Stage: Henry Purcell 1659-95* (London, 1995), 11; I Holst (ed.), *Henry Purcell, 1659-1695: Essays on his Music* (London, 1959), plate III.
6. In his manuscript history of music, GB-Ob MS Mus.e.17, f.v^r

Robert Thompson

Barring from *Cfm 88*

1

2

3

4