

Early Music

REVIEW

Number 97 February 2004

ISSN 1355-3437

Price £2.50

Editor: Clifford Bartlett
Associate Editor: Brian Clark
Administration: Elaine Bartlett
Diary & Advertising: Helen Shabetai
Cartoonist: David Hill
Reviewers:

Andrew Benson-Wilson
Peter Branscombe
John Butt
Stephen Cassidy
Stephen Daw
David Hansell
Richard Maunder
Stewart McCoy
Selene Mills
Robert Oliver
Jim Rich
D. James Ross
Stephen Rose

- 2 Reviews of Music *CB etc.*
- 6 Sutcliffe's *Scarlatti Mark Kroll*
- 8 Reviews of books *CB*
- 13 London Music *Andrew Benson-Wilson*
- 16 Ravens View *Simon Ravens*
- 17 ♯ *Handel There in myrtle shades reclin'd*
- 18 CD Reviews
- 28 Letters, Obituaries

Published on the first of each month except Jan. and Aug.
by King's Music, Redcroft, Banks End, Wyton,
Huntingdon, Cambs., PE28 2AA
Tel +44 (0) 1480 52076 fax +44 (0) 1480 450821
e-mail clifford.bartlett@btopenworld.com
<http://www.kings-music.co.uk>
UK: £17.50 Europe: £22.50
Rest of World: £35.00 (air) £22.50 (surface)
Sterling cheques made payable to King's Music
French cheques in Euros (€36.00)
sUS (\$50.00 airmail, \$33.00 surface)
Payable to C. A. J. Bartlett

We have tried a new layout this issue, with reviews of music separated from reviews of books and placed first. Few magazines review editions of music at all extensively, while that is one of our distinguishing features. Many of our readers are performing musicians, whether amateur or professional. We try to review new books in a way that is useful to them. While not going as far as having medieval nudes on page 3, we hope that the new arrangement will be more attractive and user-friendly, even though we will still keep to a roughly chronological order. I can understand that someone glancing at the magazine may well be deterred by the prominence of a learned volume on plain-song (excellent though it be) had we followed our usual order, while all viol players and a fair number of listeners will have heard of Ortiz and know why he is important.

I was wondering whether to respond to what is probably the first serious questioning (by Roger Bowers in the current *Early Music*) of Andrew Parrott's proposal that *Lauda Jerusalem* and *Magnificat* in Monteverdi's 1610 *Vespers* should be transposed down a fourth. Andrew can speak for himself; but I have an interest too since, until the Oxford UP edition, it was through mine that the idea was practically available – not that our sales depend on the level of transposition, since we can provide the movements at a variety of notated pitches. I wasn't surprised at Roger's statistical demonstration that the high-clef movements came out below the low-clef tessitura when transposed: I've sensed that in a lot of repertoires. But he skates too readily over the instrumental evidence, which is discussed in one of the articles in the collection of articles by Stephen Bonta reviewed on p. 8. Ever since I started my monthly reviews (in *Early Music News* in 1977), I have kept my eyes on *chiavette* usage, and have yet to find anything that contradicts rather than refines it. One specific example was mentioned last November (p. 3): Rigatti printing violin parts a fourth lower than the high-clef voice parts. Another significant article in the same *Early Music* issue lays to rest the idea that Tomkins' notorious organ pipe enables us to locate Jacobethan pitch as up a minor third: Andrew Johnstone's solution of a $\frac{3}{4}$ tone brings it near the pitch postulated for Venice at the period. Coincidence? Or did those Bassanos bring their cornetti with them? CB

REVIEWS OF NEW EDITIONS

Clifford Bartlett

NEW ORTIZ

Diego Ortiz *Trattado de Glosas* New edition in four languages... edited by Annette Otterstedt... Bärenreiter (BVK 1594), 2003. 126pp + part, £28.00. ISBN 3 7618 1594 8

Max Schneider's edition, first published in 1913 and familiar in the 1936 Bärenreiter version, has had a long life, supplemented for the last 20 years by the SPES facsimile. This new edition is an attempt to provide for performers who need a transcription, and is supplemented by an introduction, critical commentary, and the texts in four languages (the Spanish and Italian originals, separately published in 1553, as well as translations into English and German). The large format enables the verbal matter of Book I to be printed in facsimile on the left pages, Spanish version above the Italian, with translations in parallel columns on the right, along with footnotes. The rest of Book I and Book II (mostly music) is in transcription only. It is odd, in view of the user-friendly aims of the rest of the publication, that the four-part vocal versions of *O felici occhi miei* and *Doulce memoire* are transcribed in the original clefs and that the F3 clef is occasionally retained elsewhere. This is a legacy of the 1936 edition: the music seems not to have been reset (despite a statement that it has in Bärenreiter's 'new publications' booklet), though bar numbers have been added and corrections made. The string part of the Recercadas of Book II is printed separately with only one, manageable mid-piece turn; the large format (with two of the 1936 small landscape pages on one of the new version) also minimises turns for the keyboard player.

The editor's introduction provides a context for Ortiz and the practice of embellishment. She almost reaches the reason to explain why the repertoire is for viol, not violin, at the top of page 13, column 2. The viol is played seated, because it is both a domestic and an aristocratic instrument; the violin is played standing up because it is a public and professional instrument. Violins probably embellished, but not in this more refined style, and the use of a low-pitched instrument is perhaps because higher viols sounded less impressive than low (or perhaps middle) ones – though large bass instruments tuned to a nominal sub-bass G probably sounded elephantine. I find that explanation more satisfactory than 'anyone keen to hold his ground in those circles had to settle down both physical and mentally'.

This isn't just a book for violists: all renaissance players (and singers) would benefit from absorbing the various ways of getting from A to B (or A to C or even A to A) set forth by Ortiz in Book I, and singers can learn much from using the settings of Arcadelt's *O felici occhi miei* and Sandrin's *Doulce memoire* as models for their own embellishments as well as improvisations in the bastarda style. Perhaps falsettists who have usable broken voices could try.

GIOVANNI BASSANO

There are two further editions from PRB Productions by Richard Charteris of music by Giovanni Bassano, both for 8 voices, performable by double SATB. *Quem vidistis pastores* (C1C2C3F3; C1C3C4F4) is a well-known Christmas text, and the music isn't quite strong enough to expel the other settings from the minds of singers or listeners. If you don't know the c.1600 Venetian double-choir clichés (both pieces were published in 1599), you'll enjoy it, but there's not quite enough originality. *Cibavit nos* (G2C2C3C4; G2C2C3C4) is a candidate for transposition, since both choirs are in chiavette. With a top note of G, it would work as it stands as an instrumental piece for 4 cornetts and 4 sackbuts, though even for a modern-style SATB choir it needs to go down a tone at least to be comfortable for all parts. It suffers from too many short phrases, with the ping-pong effect carried to excess, but is worth singing and/or playing. The text is for Corpus Christi, and it could work at any season as a communion motet moving from a sombre opening to jolly Alleluias. (PRB 31, \$3.50 & PRB 32, £3.00, from PRBPrdns@aol.com. Parts are also available.)

LUZZASCHI MADRIGALS

Luzzasco Luzzaschi *Complete Unaccompanied Madrigals. Part 1. Quinto libro...a cinque voci* (Ferrara 1595), *Sesto libro...* (Ferrara 1596), *Settimo libro...* (Venice 1604) Edited by Anthony Newcombe. (*Recent Researches in the Music of the Renaissance*, 136) A-R Editions, 2003. lviii + 184pp, \$93.00. ISBN 0 89579 535 3

I'm not sure if I feel encouraged or depressed by reading of Luzzaschi apparently legitimately claiming that he was too old to fulfil a commission while still a couple of years younger than me but the same age as A-R's editor. Anthony Newcomb's *The Madrigal at Ferrara 1579-1597* (Princeton UP, 1980) gave some prominence to Luzzaschi, who was otherwise known chiefly for the 1601 collection of music for one, two and three sopranos – not so much for its musical value but because of its written-out keyboard part. It is a bit odd to have the later books of madrigals as issued as the first volume: it suggests a desire to make sure that the important works appear first in case the next volumes are not published (perhaps I shouldn't joke about the editor's age). It doesn't contain as much music as the title suggests. Book V has a full complement of 20 pieces (or perhaps 21, since No. 5 is in two parts and Book VI has 21 pieces). Only the quinto partbook of Book VI survives, but other sources have Nos 1, 2, 12 & 13 complete and 4 with two missing parts, here somewhat clumsily reconstructed (see, for instance, bar 14). Of Book VII, only Canto and Basso survives, with nos 3 & 11 extant elsewhere. The

edition includes transcription of the surviving parts of the incomplete pieces: those of Book VII (with top and bottom parts) could be useful for student exercises. All pieces are transcribed at the original pitch notation with four-minim bars. I don't see the point of using the accurate but unhelpful time signatures of 2/1 and 4/2; users of such academic editions can cope with the original C and $\text{C}\flat$. Original note values and accidentals are preserved. No suggestion is made that chiavette pieces might be transposed: indeed, the consideration (and rejection) of the suggestion that high clef pieces are for pieces representing female texts, low clefs for male ones, suggests that he assumes a pitch difference. It's a pity that the otherwise useful table of clefs, signatures, finals, lengths and 'speaker' does not include the compass. A spot check suggests that the difference in tessitura between the two groups is, if not perhaps a fourth, somewhat more than a tone (cf my editorial). There is a substantial introduction, together with detailed comments on each madrigal, particularly on the texts. The music is contrapuntal and serious. There is no suggestion in its appearance (or from the editor) that it is intended other than for five singers, though one wonders if appearances might be deceptive. Luzzaschi was an important figure, is now being recorded, and is particularly interesting because of the court where he worked: it is time his music was available in print, and the edition serves him well.

PEERSON MOTETS

Martin Peerson Complete Works I: Latin Motets Edited by Richard Rastall. Antico Edition (AB3), 2002. x + 94pp, £15.00.

Peerson's music has fared ill among modern editors, since neither his *Private Musicke* (1620) nor *Mottects or Grave Chamber Musique* (1630) have been included in the major collections of English music. There are intriguing remarks in the second paragraph of the introduction about an attempted publication in the 1980s with some relationship to the long-lived Marilyn Wailes (1896-1990), who had published some Peerson in the 1950s – perhaps a veiled reference to a scandal I don't know about. This attempt at a complete edition begins with Peerson's least-known music: the 15 motets (or 10 if bipartite motets are counted as one) which survive in Bodleian MSS Mus. F 16-19 with no cantus part, copied by Thomas Hammond of Hawkesdon, Suffolk, around 1650. I have doubts whether these pieces are the best advert for the edition. I wasn't very convinced by them, and our Christmas guest (who has more skill in counterpoint than me – my self-taught efforts never got beyond hymn-tunes) was unimpressed by Peerson's technique as well as that of the editorial additions: my copy of the first few motets is smothered with alternative suggestions. Perhaps both composer and editor should have studied Coprario's rules/examples more carefully (see p. 8). I'm more hopeful for subsequent volumes: the Peerson I know is rather better than this, e.g. the piece we printed in *EMR*35, *Upon my lap my Soveraigne sits*, despite its poor underlay of later verses,

SAINT ALESSIO

Stefano Landi *Il S. Alessio: Dramma Musicale* Introduzione de Arnaldo Morelli. Forni, 2003. 25 + 182pp, €65.00

None of my general-purpose reference books give any information on St Alexis, a fourth-century Roman who took up the religious life in Palestine then returned to die unrecognised in poverty in the family home. This facsimile seems to be a reprint of one published in 1970. The introduction (in Italian and English) on the political background is interesting, but seems completely out of place in this context. It would be fine as a separate journal article, but doesn't demand reference to the original publication or elucidate it. Far more useful would have been information on surviving copies. The English text mentions at least 15 'versions' of the print, a mistranslation of *esemplari* (copies). It would be nice to know if they were indeed identical, where they were, and which one was used for the facsimile. A particular feature is the plates showing the original stage settings: surely this is the place for comment on them? The monumental architecture makes the singers seem very small, but the evidence is invaluable and has been used for a couple of modern productions. A translation of the composer's 'a chi legge' would have been helpful. He mentions transposition of chiavette, for instance. In part of Act II, (pp. 76-109) the notation is in high clefs; if it is transposed down a fourth, the Sinfonia ends and the first scene begins on A. It is excellent that this score, still more written about than heard, is reissued, and there are no problems of legibility. The music and the plates are clearly reproduced and the paperback volume (put together in proper sections, not just perfect bound) is sturdy.

VOICES & TROMBONES

Seventeenth-Century Lutheran Church Music with Trombones Edited by Charlotte A. Leonard. (*Recent Researches in the Music of the Baroque Era*, 131). A-R Editions, 2003. xxv + 114pp, \$64.00. ISBN 0 89579 542 6

The scorings are so intriguing that it is worth listing the contents in full: I've numbered the pieces, though the edition unhelpfully doesn't.

1. Tobias Michael *Ihr Geiligen lobsinget* a7
vln, A trmbn, fagott/trmbn gross. STB, bc
2. Werner Fabricius *O Liebes Kind* a7 [sic]
vln, A viole/trmbn, T viole/trmbn, B trmbn; SATB; Bc
3. Johann Rudolf Ahle *Höre Gott* ar2, 17 & 22
7 trmbn + ad lib AATB; SSATB; bc
4. Andreas Hammerschmidt *Herr höre und sey mir gnädig*
2 cnt, ATB trmbn, TB, bc
5. Wolfgang Carl Briegel *Du Tochter Zion*
vln, T trmbn, SATB, bc
6. Christian Andreas Schulze *Heut triumphiret Gottes Sohn*
cornettino 1 & 2, A & T trmbn, violone;
vln 1 & 2, viole 1 & 2, fagotto; B solo; bc.

The volume begins with an excellent introduction on the theology, liturgy, instruments and performance. It isn't

stated whether the capella is likely to have been one or more voice to a part. I'm surprised that the allocation of trombone to instrument (alto/tenor/bass) was not done by clef: the simplest way to hand out parts to players is by that method – it works now, and probably worked then. A consequence is that it is not clear whether the clefs in the transcription represent those of the sources, since (surprisingly in so careful an edition) original clefs are not stated. The reader may get the impression that these various types of trombone scorings are recognised types of motets, whereas it is rather odd to single out items explicitly for trombones, ubiquitous instruments that may well have played in rather more pieces than those for which it is named. The music is impressive, especially the large-scale *Höre Gott*, with seven trombones set against five voices, with five of the trombone parts texted for a vocal *complementum*. Schulze's *Heut triumphiret* has a virtuosic bass solo part with a two-octave range (if the singer takes an unnotated but tempting bottom D at the end); the cornettino parts are not particularly high (cornetti play higher in the untransposed Monteverdi *Magnificat* 47), but hover around A and B rather too much for comfort on the standard instrument. I'm longing to try out some of the pieces; unlike some A-R volumes, there is no mention of parts. If they materialise and I can organise a chance to play them, I'll report back.

VIVALDI LAUDATE

Vivaldi *Laudate pueri Dominum, Salmo 112...* RV 601
Edizione critica a cura di Michael Talbot Ricordi (PR 1368), 2002. viii + 96pp, £18.30

Ricordi has progressed most of the way in its production of Vivaldi's sacred music; the editions are available in the UK from United Music Publishers. RV 601 is a nine-movement work for solo soprano, flute, two oboes (ad lib) and strings; it is the last of Vivaldi's three settings of the text. The soprano part is notorious for having an unexceptional range apart from two top Ds. Talbot argues that the work must have been written for Dresden: a MS there in the hand of a copyist assumed to have been Vivaldi's father is a very close copy of the autograph, perhaps sent among other pieces to persuade the Saxon court that he was worthy of employment, as successor to Heinichen or at least as an associated composer (or perhaps an honorary one like Bach). It's a brilliant work, 'perhaps the greatest showpiece for solo Soprano that Vivaldi ever wrote' (to quote the editor). The MSS do not make clear when the oboes play. It is a pity that the crucial information of how the instrument is mentioned in them is buried on p. 91 rather than on the first page of the score or in the critical commentary under movement 1, bar 1. In both MSS, there is a heading *Violini e Hautbois*. The editor only includes them in movements 1, 8 & 9. This is an odd compromise, since Talbot suggests that they may have been omitted from Italian performances but would probably have played more or less throughout the psalm at Dresden, though perhaps with adapted parts. So why not add some adapted parts to satisfy both scenarios? A traverso is

included only in movement 7, where it duets with the voice; if the piece was performed in Dresden, it may have been played by Quantz or Buffardin. This is obviously the edition for scholarly use, but there is a cheaper edition (without introduction or editorial commentary) typeset by BC direct from a photocopy of the autograph and available from King's Music (score £6.00, parts each £2.00).

TRANSPOSITION GOOD – EXCISION BAD

J.S. Bach *Overtüre (Suite) für Streicher und Basso continuo a-moll nach BWV 1067*, reconstructed by Werner Breig. Breitkopf & Härtel (PB5398), 2003. Score: 19pp, €11.00

A new masterpiece has been added to the baroque violin repertoire, the supposedly original version of Bach's Overture in B minor (BWV 1067), transposed down to A minor and with a violin replacing the flute part. This original form of the work was first suggested by Joshua Rifkin in an unpublished paper in 1996 and was later discussed by Siegbert Rampe and Dominik Sackmann in *Bachs Orchestermusik* (Kassel 2000). The theory is supported by transcription errors in the original set of parts which suggest a transposition of a major second upwards. Furthermore, in several places the voice leading of the viola part in the b minor version goes out of its way to avoid the dreaded top f sharps, a problem solved when the work is performed in A minor. The solo part in A minor, however, is too low for a flute, but suits the range of the violin perfectly.

The good news for performers of the A minor version is that many of the passages we like to complain about now appear in more comfortable keys and befit the range and idiom of all instruments involved far better – a factor that certainly supports this reconstruction, but in reverse, made me suspicious about Wilfried Fischer's reconstruction of the violin concerto in D major from BWV 1052 (NBA VII/7).

Werner Breig's edition is prepared with much care and equipped with an informative introduction and detailed finger-printing of the process of reconstruction (the latter only in German). Unfortunately, editorial suggestions are not marked in any way. The only, but major flaw of this edition is the fact that Breig decided to reduce the five parts of the later version down to only four in his reconstruction. He achieves this by transferring solo passages to the first violin part and at the same time leaving out what he calls 'superfluous' parts such as the first violin parts of the *Badinerie* or *Bourée II*. This reduction naturally leads to an extensive rewriting of the various parts in several passages. Alas, Breig's criteria for superfluity seem somewhat arbitrary and he fails to justify his reduction, so that by his logic practically the entire baroque concerto repertoire could be boiled down in a similar way without losing much essential harmonic or melodic material. However, the strongest argument for maintaining a five-part setting is certainly the fact that Johann Bernhard Bach's Overture in g minor, which obviously provided the paradigm for BWV 1067, is also scored for solo violin and a four-part string ensemble. J.S. Bach evidently knew and

performed this piece (most of the original parts are in his hand). Furthermore, one can detect clear thematic similarities between the two works (e.g. the fugue subjects of the respective overtures). These arguments taken together refute the theory of an original four-part setting and render Breig's edition rather an ingenious arrangement than a reconstruction. *Tassilo Erhardt*

There is also a new Breitkopf edition of the normal version for flute by the same editor (PB 5397; €11.00). It seems to have some slight improvements over the NBA (Bärenreiter) edition. The latter normalises some slurs between violins and flute, whereas the Breitkopf editor makes them visible as editorial additions (eg the four quavers after the double bar of the second movement). I noticed further minor discrepancies in slurring which I had attempted to worry out. But Tassilo is getting a copy of the source, so it would be better to wait till we can look at it. These are little points, but in a composer like Bach every detail is important. There is also an edition for flute and piano (EB 8717; €11.00)

Waiting for review next month are further publications from Editions HH (whose Manicord edition we praised last October), a varied batch from Carus-Verlag (including the complete Johann Ludwig Bach motets), and even some Chopin.

CPE BACH 'NEW' FLUTE CONCERTO

C. P. E. Bach *Concerto for Flute, Strings and Baso Continuo in D major Wq 13* edited by Ulrich Leisinger. Breitkopf & Härtel/Musica Rara (MR 2281B), 2003. Score & parts €32.00; fl & pf (MR 2281A) €13.00

CPE Bach, like his father, was happy to transfer the solo part of his concertos from one instrument to another. This is the original flute version from which the keyboard concerto Wq13/H416 derives, and it was unknown until the Singakademie collection emerged from the Ukraine a few years ago; the edition was first performed at the ceremony celebrating the return of the collection to Berlin on 15 May 2002. There are two 18th-century sets of parts, neither of which are directly connected with the composer, with minor differences. Since the keyboard version is dated 1744, the flute version probably dates from Bach's first years in Berlin, with Quantz as the likely soloist. The very first reading in the commentary raises doubts: in bar 2, a slur in the preferred source is omitted on the evidence of the other source. Since the commentary is not full of references to differences in slurs, it is very odd that one so prominent should have been added by a scribe, especially since there is a slur in that bar and in the similar phrase in the first bar in the keyboard version (if the incipit in Helm's catalogue is accurate). Most of the differences seem minor, so that is no reason to neglect and attractive new flute concerto.

SUTCLIFFE'S SCARLATTI

Mark Kroll

W. Dean Sutcliffe *The Keyboard Sonatas of Domenico Scarlatti and Eighteenth-Century Musical Style*. Cambridge UP, 2003. xi + 400pp, £55.00 ISBN 0 521 48140 6

Domenico Scarlatti is the greatest Spanish composer Italy has ever produced. Scarlatti often inspires such curious contradictions, and many aspects of his life and works remain controversial and elusive. Performers and scholars will therefore always welcome any new information and insights about this unique figure.

W. Dean Sutcliffe's book represents a substantial contribution to the field. The author offers a comprehensive survey of the literature, an excellent account of the problems posed by the lack of sources (especially autographs), and an unflinching confrontation with the question of placing the sonatas in pairs (he is clearly not an advocate). He addresses issues of performance practice, explores the influence of Spanish folk music (wisely praising what he curiously refers to as the 'ethnomusicological investigations' of Jane Clark and others) and examines many other factors that, taken together, determine how we hear and play Scarlatti's music. He justly questions the existence of four separate numbering systems for the sonatas, and he

accurately describes the extent to which the Austro-German focus of musicology has distorted the analysis and reception of Scarlatti. This problem, I might add, has also been true for other 'latinate' composers, such as François Couperin and the French *clavecinistes*. The author, therefore, covers considerable ground with the skill of an experienced scholar,

But a number of aspects of this book diminish the impact of this otherwise valuable study. Most troubling, the reader gets the impression that its author has deep suspicions, if not downright antipathy about many characteristics of Scarlatti's essential compositional style. This includes the hallmark use of repeated chords, his unconventional voice leading, the rapid tempos of the majority of the sonatas, and his predilection for phrase repetition and unusual formal structures. Sutcliffe's tendency to express his reservations in what I consider to be overly harsh terms exacerbates the problem.

For example, he writes that: 'Scarlatti Sonatas are too fast' the voice leading of K. 277 is 'crude', the consecutive fourths [in K. 254] '[have] an obviously ugly effect', and 'the gigantic sequences can be... infuriating and upsetting'.

Repeated chords and passages are described as 'idiot repetitions' that 'test our tolerance levels'. My tolerance level was certainly tested when he hinted at some dark psychological disturbance lurking beneath these musical gestures. Writing that 'many forms of irrational conduct or mental illness involve repetitive behavior', Sutcliffe suggests that 'were we to speculate on Scarlatti's character from the evidence of the music, we might imagine it to have been unstable or even schizophrenic'. Although I am sure this was not the author's intention, the conclusion one draws from such inflammatory statements is that he considers Scarlatti's music to be crude, ugly, compulsive and perhaps even mentally unbalanced.

Mr. Sutcliffe's harsh tone often extends to his criticism of a number of eminent scholars and performers, especially Ralph Kirkpatrick. If one can identify the leader by the number of arrows in his back, Sutcliffe has certainly emptied his quiver for Kirkpatrick. However, is it really appropriate to describe the work of this distinguished Scarlattian as 'incredible, if not absurd' or to accuse him of being guilty of 'a fabrication'? In an amusing twist, the author unwittingly echoes Mr. Kirkpatrick on several occasions, such as the comparison of Scarlatti's harmonic practices to those of Igor Stravinsky. Kirkpatrick once shared a conversation with me that he had had with Stravinsky during rehearsals for the premiere of *The Rake's Progress*, in which the great Russian composer personally acknowledged the similarities between his compositional style and that of Scarlatti.

It is disappointing that these instances of invective and unhelpful terminology have such an adverse effect on the reader, so much so that one is compelled to search for the reasons why the author has allowed them to appear in this potentially satisfying book.

One possible explanation is that Sutcliffe has perhaps relied too heavily on the work of Joel Shevaloff, whom he has dubbed, most surprisingly, 'the doyen of Scarlatti sonata scholars'. Sutcliffe's apparent discomfort with the Scarlatti style, for example, might be traced to Shevaloff's judgment that 'Scarlatti's licenses remain unbelievable and almost inexplicable'. This could also help explain the strong opinions about Ralph Kirkpatrick, who launched a withering and relentless response to Shevaloff's 1970 dissertation on Scarlatti. This impression is reinforced by the fact that Sutcliffe cites Shevaloff more frequently than any other writer and, more importantly, adopts many of his concepts and terms. The most unfortunate is the 'vamp', which Sutcliffe tells us was 'coined by Shevaloff to describe those apparently nonthematic, obsessively repetitive passages that occur frequently in the sonatas'. Sutcliffe considers the vamp to be 'the most upsetting... feature of Scarlatti's style', and it figures prominently in his discussions.

The reference to the jazz and pop music technique of 'vamping until ready' is clever but potentially misleading, since this vamp bears little if any relation to the Scarlatti

style. On the contrary, the repeated chords of Scarlatti's sonatas serve an active and integral harmonic, rhythmic and melodic function, and they should not be compared to what Sutcliffe calls 'an improvised accompaniment waiting for the entry of an important musical event'. These figures might evoke a particular dance rhythm, the sounds of other instruments (like the guitar), or religious events. They are also decidedly not 'non-thematic'. Melodic strains are embedded throughout these chords, sometimes stated and sometimes merely implied, and skilled harpsichordists can highlight them with a subtle command of articulation, sustaining some notes and releasing others—in other words, voicing them as a pianist does with touch and dynamics.

Nevertheless, the book's pages are filled with perceptive and detailed analyses of many sonatas that indicate the author's admiration of Scarlatti's brilliance and originality. Taken in the context of the number of negative comments, this can be source of some confusion. The note-by-note approach is also so thorough that it sometimes leads to the point of diminishing returns.

It is also abundantly clear that Sutcliffe enjoys listening to Scarlatti sonatas, especially when recorded by his favourite artists. The book overflows with CD reviews that seem, frankly, better suited to the pages of a record magazine than to a scholarly work. Notably, most harpsichordists fail to live up to Mr. Sutcliffe's expectations, since 'they take too many rhythmic liberties', remain 'chronically underaware [sic] of the implied cross-rhythms... unless they are clearly indicated by the notation', and play 'fast and loose with the rhythmic and phrase-structured features'. If by this he means rubato and individual interpretation, we should all plead guilty to enjoying Scarlatti's 'ingenious Jesting with Art'.

The strengths of the book, however, are considerable, and the discussion of the social, political and cultural environment in which the Scarlatti lived and worked is particularly noteworthy, since this is crucial to our understanding and performance of any composer and his music. Here I would have appreciated a more complete fulfillment of the expectations raised by the subtitle 'Scarlatti and Eighteenth-Century Musical Style'. The music of Scarlatti's Spanish and Italian contemporaries receives excellent coverage, but a wider net would have included more 18th-century masters from north of the Pyrenees, such as Telemann (who merits but a single footnote), Couperin, Rameau and his successors (e.g., Duphly and Balbastre), and even J. C. Bach.

Another gentle suggestion would entail a deeper exploration into the relationship of Scarlatti's idiosyncratic style with that of his literary contemporaries, such as the poet Luis de Góngora, Father Benito Jerónimo Feijoo and his *Teatro critico universal*, and especially Lope de Vega and Pedro Calderón de la Barca. The historian James Iffland, in an unpublished paper presented at my Domenico Scarlatti Festival of 1998, draws fascinating parallels

between Scarlatti and the intentional 'rule-breaking approach', 'anarchistically Baroque theater' and mixture of 'high culture' with popular folk idioms of these authors.

The author and Cambridge University Press separately remind us that this book is 'the first in English on the sonatas for fifty years'. This is astonishing, but essentially true, although Malcolm Boyd's excellent 1986 study of the composer should not be discounted. I applaud Sutcliffe for the work he has done, and I hope we will not have to wait fifty more years for another study of this great harpsichord composer.

Mark Kroll has performed throughout the world as a harpsichordist and fortepianist for more than three decades, and he has also written on a wide variety of subjects. His most recent

publications are two editions of transcriptions by Johann Nepomuk Hummel (A-R Editions), and he is currently completing a book on expressive harpsichord playing and a biography of Hummel for Scarecrow Press.

Performer's Facsimiles has recently issued Roseingrave's edition of Scarlatti's *XLII Suites de Pieces pour le clavecin* published in London by Benjamin Cooke in 1739. The print is very clear and there are no notational problems to impede playing from it. It is good to have the music available in the form in which it circulated among Scarlatti's English followers. The copy reproduced includes the list of subscribers, which surprisingly does not include Handel. (PF 236-7; each £16.00)

NEW BOOKS

Clifford Bartlett

MEMORY & NOTATION

Leo Treitler *With Voice and Pen: Coming to Know Medieval Song and How it was Made*. Oxford UP, 2003. xxx + 506pp, £95.00. ISBN 0 19 816644 3 + music CD

One way of collecting together the output of a distinguished scholar is that of the Variorum series (such as the Bonta volume reviewed below). This takes a different course. The author has taken charge of the re-presentation, adding often-substantial introductions and correcting the original texts. Chapter 5 has a 16-page introduction to a 12-page article – but with the excuse that it is one of the oldest items included, from the *Festschrift* to Treitler's teacher Oliver Strunk in 1968. Treitler's particular concern is the relationship between notation, improvisation and memory, especially exactly what the middle term means and how it operates. The book needs to be reviewed by someone who has followed the discussion on the creation of the *Iliad* and the *Odyssey* since the publications of Milman Parry and Albert Lord and other investigations in complex oral culture. Unless one postulates lost notated sources (Treitler is, I'm sure, right to be suspicious of these), the problem with the history of early chant is the gap between the creation of a coherent repertoire (whether as imagined so persuasively by James McKinnon or in some other way) and its notation. How was it remembered? Treitler's breaking down of chants into discrete elements in conjunction with the backing supplied by psychological theories of how memory works makes a powerful argument for how, not just this stage in chant creation, but much other medieval music might have been created and performed. I now see the logic of the barlines that separate the notes for each word in early printed sources. I don't understand how what seems perfectly plausible as recon-

structed memory for a soloist can apply to chants which begin with a section sung by the choir (such as the Offertory discussed first in chapter 1): this problem is only briefly dealt with on p. 185. There is some fine chanting on the accompanying CD, worth hearing even without reference to the discussions in the book – though I wouldn't want to discourage reading it, even if you know most of the articles included. (See also p. 18)

The title is misleading. In normal parlance, song (despite plainsong as an alternative to plainchant) has strong secular, certainly non-liturgical connotations. The Sound of Medieval Song, advertised on the back cover, isn't about plainsong, and the major modern introduction to the topic, also from Oxford UP, is David Hiley's *Western Plainchant* (not *Western Song*). I don't know if it still exists, but there used to be a committee that vetted new scientific names. Perhaps a joint body of the RAM and AMS plus (most important) non professionals could monitor changes in musicological terminology.

THE PLAY OF DANIEL

Ludus Danielis A cura du Marcello Schembri... (*Historiae Musicae Cultores*, xcvi) Firenze: Olschki, 2003. xv + 103pp, €13.00. ISBN 88 222 5195 2

The Play of Daniel achieved modern fame when it was revived in 1958 by Noah Greenberg and his New York Pro Musica. The performance survives in an edition and recording, and is described at length in the recent biography of Greenberg (see *EMR* 86). It was an early test case in the controversy between sobriety and kaleidoscopic variety in the revival of medieval music, which is still running. I've a feeling that the other main area of difference, adding regular rhythms to unmeasured monophony, is declining – though I wonder what the third PMMS edition of the work (David Wulstan's revision of his rhythmically-modal

second edition) will offer. What I appreciate about Schembri's version is that he leaves the rhythm unspecified, confining his suggestions to the commentary, where he offers alternatives based both on the stress and quantity of the verse forms. Generally, the verse fits either equally well, though to modern ears the latter feels more natural, perhaps justified by the limited success at basing music on verse quantitative patterns elsewhere in the history of Western music. Had I been typesetting the music, I would have tried to make the layout relate to the verse form (as in the edition of then Rouen Christmas play that we included in *EMR*₁₃): not even changes of stanza are visible in the notation, whereas if the pattern shown in the facsimile on the cover continues throughout the play, the first letter of a new stanza in the MS marked by being in red. The text is edited separately, set out as verse, with an Italian translation on the opposite page. The volume concludes with a survey of nine recordings, ranging from NYPM to The Harp Consort, features of the latter reminding the author of Laurel and Hardy. This is a useful and inexpensive little book.

HOW TO COMPOSE JACOBAN MUSIC?

The New Way of Making Fowre Parts in Counterpoint By Thomas Campion and Rules how to Compose By Giovanni Coprario. Edited and with an Introduction by Christopher S. Wilson. Ashgate, 2003. x + 122p, £39.95. ISBN 0 7546 0515 9

Campion's work is one of the most accessible of English theoretical works since it is included in two editions of the author's literary complete editions. The one I have is the earlier by Percival Vivian, an elegant volume of 1909; there is a later one by Walter R. Davis, whose treatment of *The New Way* is different in the hardback (1967) and paperback (1970) versions. The new edition is a bit of a hybrid: the words are transcribed with minimal modernisation but the music is 'translated' into treble and bass clefs, thus discouraging the reader from thinking of the music in the way the original users would have done. The Vivian edition has the music examples in facsimile, so remains useful. There is a substantial introduction, tracing Campion's sources and explaining the ideas behind them. But it is written from the standpoint of music theory being an independent field of study. I want to know how the treatise relates to the music of the time. Does it match Campion's own practice? Should (for example) Richard Rastall have studied it closely and followed it when trying to reconstruct the missing part of Peerson's motets? (cf p. 3). How far would a student have got in composing had he worked through it? Is it important as a good treatise or only because there wasn't much in English at the time that was more concise than Morley?

Coprario gets much less attention from the editor: two pages of introduction instead of 40. But his treatise is only available in Bukofzer's 1952 facsimile, which is not readily accessible, so its publication here is more valuable than the Campion: working through the examples will give students a good basis in the harmonic and contrapuntal basis of music in the second decade of the 17th century.

Coprario offers examples of how to handle common harmonic patterns with good part-writing. It's a bit like continuo playing: recognise a situation, and patterns fall into place almost automatically. I hope the striking red title and design on the black cover doesn't wear off: complete justification for the absence of a dust jacket.

ITALIAN 17th CENTURY INSTRUMENTS

Stephen Bonta Studies in Italian Sacred and Instrumental Music in the 17th Century Ashgate Variorum 2003. xii + 338pp, £52.50. ISBN 0 86078 878 4

Stephen Bonta's work has affected most performances of Monteverdi's Vespers since his crucial article on how it made liturgical sense in *JAMS* 1967 (which opens this collection) revealed the liturgical naïvety of Denis Stevens' abbreviated Novello edition. (The current expanded version still includes an irrational selection of chant.) Bonta's extensive survey of the Italian sources of 17th-century church and instrumental music (at one point he mentions 999 of them) enables him to argue from a very wide database. Other themes are the terminology and use of string bass instruments, Legrenzi, and notation. I hadn't seen the two overlapping articles on the notation of accidentals, a matter of some interest to me both as editor and as organ continuo player. I'll keep my eyes open in future and check his idea that accidentals retain their validity within a beat against the sources. If so, perhaps we should emend our normal editorial policy of keeping accidentals except on consecutive notes. I have no doubt that he is right that an accidental carries for repeated notes across barlines. That it also carries across a rest may be right for his sample, but differs from more conservative usage. I am less happy about the logic of bass figures; Monteverdi (or his printers) seem fond of unhelpful sharps when more subtle harmonies that are not obvious from the movement of the bass remain unmarked.

There is also an article ('The Use of Instruments in the Ensemble Canzona and Sonata in Italy, 1580-1650' from *Recercare* IV, 1992) that bears on clef configurations. He makes slightly heavy going over pieces that use G₂ and F₄ clefs – I've always assumed that it was a sign that transposition was not required; one wouldn't expect it in polychoral pieces with high and low choirs, for instance. My deduction from the evidence is that violins normally used treble clef even if they had to transpose (as is explicit in the Rigatti 1639 Mass: see *EMR*₉₅, p. 3). There is a higher proportion of articles new to me than I expected, so I was very pleased to have my attention drawn to them, and recommend it to all who perform 17th-century music.

IN HONOREM GUSTAV LEONHARDT

The Keyboard in Baroque Europe edited by Christopher Hogwood. Cambridge UP, 2003. xviii + 244pp, £50.00 ISBN 0 521 81055 8

We have three collections of papers/essays from Cambridge UP this month, of which this is distinctly the best.

That may be the result of the editorial hand, but perhaps the occasion was also an inspiration. I suppose that the publishers believed that admitting that this is a Festschrift would diminish sales; but I am sure that more players would buy it if the cover had proclaimed that the volume is in honour of the 75th birthday (30-5-03) of Gustav Leonhardt. The blurb is, however, happy to mention that the contributors are scholar-performers, a point lightly taken up in the editor's floral introduction, with the dedicatee described as head gardener of the *hortus musicus*.

I'm not sure how to review these dozen articles without filling several pages. Of the four on 17th-century topics, Silbiger contrasts *Zefiro torna* and *Cento partite sopra passacagli*, and more. Rasch tries to fill the gap of Froberger's biography between 1649 and 1655. Dirksen examines three sections of Lynar Ar, including the English music (nos. 50-61). Hogwood reflects on the revised Purcell Society volume of keyboard music, which he is editing: I fully support his intention to be as inclusive as possible – it is extremely frustrating when dubious works get excluded from thematic catalogues and over-critical editions so that the choices cannot be evaluated, and later changes of mind inconveniently require new editions.

The rest of the book is divided into three sections, but apart from Robert Levin on Mozart's non-metrical preludes, the Bach family predominates. John Butt speculates on why Bach and Handel may have coincidentally found the keyboard concerto, Davitt Moroney compares French and German Arts of playing the keyboard. Christoph Wolff relates Bach's teaching to the idea of imitating and improving nature. Peter Williams' title 'Is there an anxiety of influence discernible in J. S. Bach's *Clavierübung I*?' is somewhat of a hindrance to his fascinating, if inconclusive, remarks on the connections with Rameau's contemporary keyboard music. David Schulenberg shows how and why JS and CPE demand different styles of keyboard accompaniment – essential reading for continuo players. Peter Wollny provides a comprehensive study of WF's polonaises. Menno van Delft draws attention to *schnellen*, a finger technique first mentioned by Quantz, who is probably referring to JS Bach. Levin writes on Mozart's non-metrical keyboard preludes, samples of how to link pieces in different keys: we have revived early instruments and playing styles, and for church music present liturgical reconstructions, but the practice of linking pieces by improvisations (genuine in the case of Mozart, precomposed in the case of his sister) survived till the 20th century, but is almost completely ignored – especially by players whose repertoire is essentially from that period! The book ends with music: Lars Ulrik Mortensen offers a keyboard version in A minor of Bach's violin Partita in D minor.

I hope Leonhardt enjoyed this offering: there is plenty here for all early keyboard players to savour and consider.

BACH'S ORGAN MUSIC

Peter Williams *The Organ Music of J. S. Bach. Second edition.* Cambridge UP, 2003. x + 624 pp. hb 0 521 81416 2 £80.00; pb 0 621 89115 9 £25.95

The original editions are the first port of call for anyone wanting information or help in performing or listening to any of Bach's organ music. This is an unusual second edition in that there are so many changes: it is not just an corrected version with the newly-discovered pieces added. It is shorter: 722 pages have shrunk to 624 in rather more spacious type. One wonders whether the impetus for that was from the publisher keen to have a manageable one-volume work. Be that as it may, owners of the original edition will need to buy the new one but will benefit from consulting both. Obviously, the new edition represents the author's later thoughts, but the former discussions are still worth consulting. As always, Williams is stimulating, not doing all the reader's work for him, not afraid to leave questions unanswered. And when the editions differ, the reader is challenged to ask: why? The prospect of a new edition of Vol. III is tantalisingly mentioned.

GALANT HEARTZ

Daniel Hartz *Music in European Capitals: The Galant Style 1720-1780.* Norton, 2003. xxiv + 1078pp, £65.00

I have been working through this marvellous book a few pages every day at breakfast – and a very civilised start to the day it gives. But it will, alas, be several months before I reach the end, and it is unfair on the publisher and author to make them wait so long for a review. I must confess that I have no great enthusiasm for music between Bach/Handel and Haydn/Mozart: the harmonic simplification that ended the baroque feels to me like a loss, unlike what happened around 1600. But Hartz is marvellous advocate for it. For each composer, he takes a few pieces and gives well-chosen music examples that are long enough to illustrate the points he is making. The geographical approach works brilliantly, and by starting in Naples he has a basis for a degree of cohesion in his argument: this isn't just a series of unrelated chapters. His model and guide is Burney, who is quoted frequently. Following the taste of the period (but not that of many later historians), opera is at the heart of his story: it's a change to read an account of Vivaldi that starts with his operas. It is curious that two of America's most cultured musicologists, Howard Mayer Brown and Daniel Hartz, began their career with major bibliographical works; Hartz's study of Attaignant is in itself an elegant example of book production as well as a magnificent work of scholarship. The new book shows how a major work, of value to musicologist and non-specialist alike, can be written with fluency and grace, acknowledging essential source information in foot- (not end-)notes without complexity, bringing an amorphous period of musical history into focus in an apparently effortless manner. My only criticism: the weight. If a book this long can only be read at a desk, who will actually read it? To reach its potential market, the paperback (which must surely come) needs to be split in two, however much that undermines the concept of a Europe at least partially integrated by the Neapolitan operatic style with which Hartz begins his musical tour.

COMPANION TO MOZART

The Cambridge Companion to Mozart Edited by Simon P. Keefe. Cambridge UP, 2003. xvii+ 292pp. hb £47.50 ISBN 0 571 80734 4; pb £17.95 ISBN 0 521 00192 7

In my earlier years, my most-consulted book on Mozart was *The Mozart Companion*, edited by H. C. Robbins Landon & Donald Mitchell (Rockliff, 1956). How would this compare? The most obvious difference is that the present generation of scholars is uninterested in sonata form. Is it now thought irrelevant, or is it old hat, something that listeners will have picked up elsewhere? Instead, the preoccupation is with texture. A useful technique when writing programme notes on music that one doesn't know is to look through the score and comment on the density of texture, which instruments are associated with which, whether the cello is independent from the keyboard left-hand, etc. I'm not sure if I am pleased or shocked to be in accord with current academic practice. I'm not obsessed by form myself, but one feature of Mozart's pieces that struck me long before I knew what to call it is the poignancy of many of his codettas – I can't remember any mention of this in the book.

Mozart's output is covered, but I'm not entirely convinced by the blurb's claim that this 'brings the most recent scholarship into the public arena' and 'bridges the gap between scholarly and popular images of the composer'. Most of the biographical image-updating is in relationship to *Amadeus*, which is listed ten times in the index. There isn't anything positive put in its place, and is anyone reading a book like this going to take the image of a play or film seriously anyway? I'm not sure that I want to replace the image of Mozart, like Mendelssohn and Britten, as a composer who had some sort of natural musical instinct from a very early age – which is not to deny that they all benefitted from an intensive musical education. There is nothing that a book like this can do to budge such ideas that 'right from Symphony No. 1, everything Mozart wrote is immediately recognisable' (to quote someone I worked with 40 years ago) – at least now one can play a few symphonies by composers of the period and challenge Mozart's to be identified: but is there a grain of truth in it? There has been research to show that Mozart's music (rather than that of other classical composers) is positively beneficial when used as background music for children. If there is something specific, it should surely be identifiable by comparative analysis and might explain his individuality more than studies of sonata form or texture. It might also justify (or disprove) the popular belief of an essence that is fundamentally Mozartean.

The idea that he composed everything in his head and wrote it out while playing billiards must have been squashed by countless notes on the 'Haydn' quartets, but surely there is still an element of fluency in his music, whether natural or successfully contrived. We are told that the scatological language is normal for the period: I'd feel happier with the explanation if it came from writers who had read widely in the correspondence of the period and produced some statistical information.

The first chapter is one of the best: Cliff Eisen on Mozart and Salzburg. An incidental bit of information intrigued me: through the 18th century the Salzburg court had 10 trumpets and two timpanists: exactly the numbers required for Biber's *Missa Salisburgensis*. There's a fine example of the tendency of giving articles on something specific a general title: 'Mozart's compositional methods: writing for his singers' is certainly worth reading, but the title and subtitle conceal that it is entirely about *Così fan tutte*. Most of the chapters on particular work-groups are of interest – though I wonder how many readers will follow up all the editor's references to bar numbers in his chapter on the concertos. There are interesting chapters on Mozart in the 19th and in the 20th centuries. We should not be too superior about 19th-century versions which radically changed the operas: the same happens now with fashionable productions which, while keeping all the words and notes (and sometimes even having them performed in period style), make nonsense of their meaning by wilful staging. The two final chapters are probably the most valuable for *EMR* readers: Katalin Komlós on Mozart the performer and especially Robert Levin on performance practice: note in particular the section 'idiosyncrasies of notation and execution' on pp. 231-2. I doubt whether I'll use this volume as much as the 1956 equivalent – that may be because there are rather more good books on the composer around now, but it may also be that it does not get quite so close to the music.

ORCHESTRAL COMPANION

The Cambridge Companion to the Orchestra Edited by Colin Lawson. Cambridge UP, 2003. xiv + 297pp. hb £45.00 ISBN 0 521 80658 5; pb £15.95 ISBN 0 521 00132 3

I was initially worried by this and smothered my bookmark with comments of dissatisfaction about the emphasis when baroque music was mentioned, and some discussion of use of single and multi-string playing throughout the period would have been useful. The first chapter points out that, at least in the earlier stages, opera and church were more important arenas than the concert hall. But more stress could be put on the survival of the influence of opera, most typically with Wagner (who has fewer index entries than Brahms). The chapter on the repertoire is particularly restrictive: only two pages before we reach Haydn, Mozart and Beethoven, and subsequently concentrating on the symphony, ignoring the concerto and overture until the 20th century, when the importance of the symphony wanes and stage music (Stravinsky's ballets) is accepted. Another problem not explicitly faced is the relationship of development to progress, whether in the changes in forms or instruments. I'm not complaining at the absence of a philosophical discussion, but would welcome the occasional reminder that such processes do not necessarily make music or performances any better. There is a chapter on the revival of historical instruments by the editor, whom readers will know as a distinguished performer on the early clarinet, which makes a good introduction for the non-specialist.

It was the later chapters that interested me most and which make the book of interest to the general concert-goer: chapters on score-reading, conducting, composing, training, recording etc. I would recommend the book far more strongly to such a public than to Cambridge UP's normal academic clientele. It should sell well to Prommers: CUP should appoint someone to walk up and down the queue at the Albert Hall this summer

NOVELLO

Victoria L. Cooper *The House of Novello: Practice and Policy of a Victorian Music Publisher 1829-1866*. Ashgate, 2003. viii + 210pp, £45.00. ISBN 0 7546 0088 2

Novello dominated British choral music for over a century from about 1850, and was still powerful in my youth. I haven't counted, but I probably have well over a hundred (maybe several hundred) Novello vocal scores, mostly outmoded, but still sometimes useful. The out-of-print editions of Handel oratorios from c.1850 (rather than the later revisions) are, in some cases, still the only complete vocal scores that are accessible and, despite inaccuracies, are used for modern 'authentic' performances. One disappointment of this survey is that the link between Novello and the place of Handel in the Victorian pantheon is somewhat peripheral to its thrust. An important feature of Novello's success was, at least according to the self-published histories of the firm, the establishment of the cheap octavo vocal score as the standard format. Victoria Cooper's statistics show the decline of the large-format editions and of separate voice parts (which survived much longer on the continent); a page-size for the book that could have been used to illustrate this would have been helpful, and also to have given full-size music examples. It is difficult to see from the small reproduction that the detailed instrumental cues of the operatic vocal scores do actually work in the right format (until reading this I hadn't registered how unusual they were) and the other examples would have given a feel for the original style had they been in facsimile. The comment quoted from Littleton (p. 84) about the knock-on effect of what was probably only a slight increase of type size needs explanation: if you only get two rather than three systems (the word in the quotation is 'scores') to a page, the length of the volume can be increased not by 50% but by up to 100% because to fill the pages vertically the size has to be increased horizontally as well.

The business information is particularly interesting, both the contractual arrangements between J. Alfred Novello and Henry Littleton and the evidence of sales of popular works like *Messiah* and *Elijah*. There is less domination by church music than I expected: did that increase later, or is the author less interested in it? The relationship of the firm to the catholic world and the pre-liturgical anglican movement would have repaid investigations, since the Mozart masses are featured in the book.

I was puzzled at her surprise that the 'The Glee Hive' was still in the 1863 Novello catalogue: the series title survived on back-cover adverts to puzzle me nearly a

century later. Some of the comments on editorial techniques seem too trivial: the addition of slurs on melismas, for instance, is a house style matter that doesn't necessarily have an significance in performance (ex 2.3a & 2.3b should have been placed on the same opening).

This isn't a book on 'early music' as such; but Novello had a considerable influence on British choral taste, and although performances styles have changed (often despite the editions available from the firm), some of the credit of the continuous awareness of Handel and Mozart and the early revival of Bach is to the credit of the house of Novello.

PERFORMING BRAHMS

Performing Brahms: Early Evidence of Performance Style Edited by Michael Musgrave and Bernard D. Sherman. Cambridge UP, 2003. xx + 391pp, £60.00. ISBN 0 521 65273 1 + CD

The first of the 13 contributions made me wonder whether the book was going to be relevant: Brahms didn't seem to be concerned about developments of instruments and style during his life time, so why should we? The answer is that the changes in the century since he died have been greater and that eventually we reach a time when continuity is stultifying while a fresh start brings freedom (or at least excitement). Other chapters are more encouraging, though not offering any simple answers. There are many accounts of Brahms's playing and studies of later recordings that are argued to be in the Brahms tradition. The details assembled here are valuable, but the main message I draw is that modern performances are far too literal in their interpretation, especially in rhythm. If you listen to one example in the fascinating CD, make it the last one, with Charles Draper and a Hungarian quartet playing the gipsy section of the slow movement of the clarinet quintet: Brahms as vulnerable as Elgar. Robert Philip's concluding chapter 'balancing the evidence' is well worth reading even if you think the rest of the book looks a bit heavy.

20th CENTURY RECORDER MUSIC

Andrew Mayes *Carl Dolmetsch and the Recorder Repertoire of the 20th Century*. Ashgate, 2003. xxv + 338pp, £55.00. ISBN 0 7546 0968 5

Carl Dolmetsch gave his first recorder concert at the Wigmore Hall in 1939 and after the war he gave one a year from 1946 until 1989. Most of them included a commissioned work, and it is a study of these that forms the core of the book. Most of the documentation surviving in the Dolmetsch home in Haslemere is printed here; the music, is described, often with detailed textual comments, and reviews from the press. This not just a compilation of letters and reviews: the author's comments are apt and he has the knack of knowing what is worth saying. I'm not sure that Carl was really successful in his attempt to establish the recorder as a 'modern' instrument. But he did his best, and his efforts deserve this documentation. Perhaps Andrew should next survey John Turner's commissions.

MUSIC IN LONDON

Andrew Benson-Wilson

THE THISTLE AND THE ROSE

Cappella Nova, the 12-strong Scottish early-music vocal ensemble, ventured way south of the border to St John's, Smith Square (14 November) for a concert of Scottish renaissance vocal music under the title 'The Thistle and the Rose'. They featured music attributed to Robert Carver, and from the Carver Choirbook, probably dating from the Chapel Royal of James IV in 1501 but, according to James Reid-Baxter's programme note, taking on Carver's name after he apparently rescued it from destruction when his Augustinian Monastery of Scone was sacked in 1559. Their concert also commemorated the 500th anniversary of the marriage of James IV to the English Margaret Tudor – a marriage that, on the later demise of the Tudors, gave the English crown to Scottish house of Stewart. An anonymous mass for three voices attributed to Carver was sung by the three female voices of Canty, a sub-group of Cappella Nova. The wide-ranging vocal range is a challenge for all three voices. The close-knit texture exposed something of an inconsistency of vocal timbre and style between the three singers, who also occasionally had trouble in coordinating entries, although the bell-like conclusion to the *Agnus Dei* was very well done. The full choir had a generally good blend of voices, although there were some tiny insecurities and loss of confidence in some of the more exposed duo passages, notably in the Mass *Deus creator omnium*. The concluding Magnificat, however, was given a most impressive performance. One fascinating item was Kenneth Elliott's reconstruction of *Now fayre, fairest off every fayre* – a welcome song for Margaret Tudor with each verse ending with 'welcom of Scotland to be quene'. [See also the review of the CD, p. 18.]

THE WORLD IN THE MOON

London has had Handel operas by the bucket full over the past few years, so it was nice to explore one of the lesser-known works of Haydn at the Royal Academy of Music (25 November). The comic opera *Il mondo della luna* has all the makings of a lightweight romp but is, in fact, rather deeper than it first appears, with some impressive music for one who has never been seen as much of an opera composer. The plot is essentially daft (a man is hoodwinked into thinking he is on the moon as part of a plot to ensure that three pairs of lovers manage to get together), but the librettist, Goldini, has weaved around this basic plot a razor-sharp satire of human relationships, vanity, vulnerability and ignorance. Robert Chevara's direction (in full 18th century dress and staging) allowed Goldini's insights to evolve unhindered by mannerisms, even letting several distinctly non-politically correct incidents to pass

by without additional comment. He managed to overcome some tricky directional problems, including a long sequence of arias in the first act, and a structurally weak and lengthy finale. The singers of Royal Academy Opera were divided into two casts over the four performances. On the night I was there, they were generally impressive, albeit with rather too much 19th-century operatic style for my taste. I generally avoid naming individual performers in student productions, but will make an exception for Rebecca Bottone's delightfully bright and perky showcase aria as Lisetta. Ian Ledingham's direction of the Royal Academy Sinfonia gave a good sense of momentum, although his harpsichord continuo was too busy for the generally accepted late-18th-century style.

IN ILLO TEMPORE

The Orlando Chamber Choir is one of the most impressive of London's many amateur choirs. Their commitment to the early repertoire was reinforced a couple of years ago by the appointment of Edward Wickham as director. Their concert at St John's Smith Square (26 November) opened with Stravinsky, a composer whose music still has the ability to disturb, and his use of baroque ornaments in his Mass set a trend that is still prevalent amongst present day composers. The second half was Monteverdi's *Missa In illo tempore*, interspersed with two of his two motets, and prefaced by the Gombert motet that is the source of Monteverdi's melodic material. Published with the Vespers in 1610, it is in the *prima prattica* style that the Vespers so dramatically broke away from. It is technically demanding, with densely concentrated polyphonic lines and little apparent concession to things like breathing. In a work like this, a choir with nearly 40 singers runs the risk of magnifying a number of performance issues. There were occasions when exposed entries were not tight enough and one moment at the end of the Credo when some singers were tempted to speed up as the tension increased. Occasionally the task of keeping the pulse going produced some slightly over-emphatic articulation (towards the end of the Gombert motet) or a rather relentless pulse (in the early parts of the Credo). Vocally, the male voices were a bit light, and this was not helped by a slight tendency towards wooliness, particularly noticeable in the motet *Christe adoramus te*. But these are tiny points. This is a large amateur choir whose performance was impressive by any standards. The diction, notably the control of consonants, was spot on, and they sang with a coherence that many professional choirs lack. The sopranos were particularly effective, with a clear, precise and consistent tone – they successfully avoided any stridency in the high lines in the Credo and Sanctus. The Sanctus was superbly sung –

despite the text, Monteverdi's music sets a subdued mood which the choir caught beautifully. The gentle motet, *Adoramus te Christe* was another highlight. Even the crescendo at the end was retained within the overall mood – no easy task with a choir of this size. Edward Wickham is an inspiring director, and he seems to have won the hearts and minds of the choir. My only directional quibble was the use of a different voice for each intonation in the Mass, something that makes little musical or liturgical sense to me, but is fairly frequently done. Hilary Norris provided an effective organ continuo to the Mass, using the Mander chamber organ that is usually hidden away at the side of the stage. This is much larger than the usual box organs, but is not often heard, although I find it far more effective for accompaniment and continuo purposes.

NONSUCH CHRISTMAS

Another impressive London-based amateur chamber choir are the Nonsuch Singers, who gave a seasonal concert of Lalande's *Cantate Domino*, Charpentier's *In nativitate...* (H. 314) and his *Messe de Minuit* at St James' Piccadilly (18 December). They were supported by the instrumental forces of Canzona, who also gave a lovely performance of Corelli's Christmas Concerto, with notable contributions from violinists Theresa Caudle and Jean Paterson and with Richard Campbell on the bass violin. This was a sophisticated reading, avoiding the occasionally heard excessive speed in the early movements and the lushness in the pastorate, with clarity of phrasing and some beautifully timed pauses. The central *adagio-allegro-adagio* section was particularly effective, with some nice dynamic shading. The concerto was performed along with Lalande's *Cantate* at the first of the Parisian *Concert Spirituel* in 1725 and remained in the repertoire of the Court Chapel until the Revolution. The Lalande produced some of the highlights of this concert. Andrew Kennedy has a fine tenor voice and has been deservedly making his mark in the past couple of years. Good as his singing was on this occasion, he does not have the *haute-contre* voice that these works demanded. Although the lack of the expected vocal timbre was a shame, it makes it the more impressive that Kennedy managed to hit the notes so well. His opening to *Cantate Domino*, with its rhythmic complexities, was outstanding. Soprano Helen Groves, with James Eastaway, oboe, produced what for me was the most moving moment of the whole evening – the incredible 'et pasallite' of the 'Viderunt imes' section, written for solo voice and oboe alone. Natalie Clifton-Griffith's clean and focussed tone was also impressive throughout, although there was a bit of a (nervous?) tremble to her voice, particularly in the opening of *In nativitate*. Bass Jacques Imbrailo produced some impressively refined drama to the *Jubilate*, with its watery word painting. The choir continued the mood nicely with 'Flumina plaudent manu', giving a spaciousness to the last section, although I felt that the silences could have been more telling. The choir were particularly effective in the layered sequence of ornaments in the Gloria – an extraordinary movement. The concluding *Messe de Minuit*

was given a broad performance, with some nice inserted organ solos from Alistair Ross, no doubt doing his best to imagine that the little chamber organ was really the grand west-end French Classical organ that this work really needs. These organ solos are an essential part of the work, but are often omitted, as is the general pause at the Crucifixus, so credit is due for observing the performing instructions. The countertenor ornaments were nearly always confused by the persistent vibrato. The French repertoire is new to the Nonsuch Singers and to conductor Graham Caldbeck. Both he, and the choir, have worked hard to understand the style. I particularly liked his indication of the typical French cadential trill by wagging two fingers at the choir – something that conductors must often be tempted to do. It says something for the choir that they managed to avoid his attempt to bring them in too early in the Sanctus. This was a nice way to close the Corelli anniversary year and start the Charpentier one.

JOGLERESAN LAUDE

Another Christmas concert was from Jogleresa (St John's, Smith Square, 21 December), with works from around 1400 from the *Cortona Laudario*, the *Llibre Vermell de Montserrat* and the *Florence Laudario*. Whatever their repertoire, Jogleresa seem to bring a contemporary Arabic, jazz and more general 'world music' feel to their interpretations, and this concert was no exception. This is particularly noticeable in the exotic vocal style of Belinda Sykes and the accompanimental style. Notable in this concert was the frequently over-dominant percussion, with several wild improvisations which rapidly lost any sense of the pulse that had been set by the preceding piece, and only really served to disturb the mood. The frequent exchanges of glances and gestures between the performers give the impression of things being worked out on the spot. This later is usually more visually than aurally disturbing, but it leaves me with a feeling that this sort of concert is perhaps better suited to the world music or club environment than the concert hall stage. The voices, to varying degrees, appear to be untrained, in the normally accepted sense of the word. Although that can bring a nice touch of innocence and naivety to a work (in *Altissima luce col grande speldore* and *Da ciel venne messo novello*, for example, where the singer really only retained tonal stability in the middle register of her voice, getting thin and nervously edgy in the higher register and somewhat husky down below, and also had trouble retaining breath until the end of some of the longer held notes), it also sometimes adds to the feeling that Jogleresa are falling into a gap between two different performing genres. That said, there were some lovely moments, particularly from the two special guests from Italy on voice and tamborello – Catia Gianessi, with her beautifully sensuous voice and an ability to weave some delightful ornaments into often anarchic melodic lines, and Pierino Rabanser. Belinda Sykes's plaintively mournful interpretation of *Nova stella apparita* produced some fascinating sounds, with some effective playing on the vielle by Ben Davis, but it was a curious mood to set considering the text. She was also one of a duo of bagpipe players,

playing on an instrument (if that is the right word) that must have been very distressing for any lovers of small furry animals in the audience.

RATTLE'S BRAHMS & SCHUMANN

Although many period instrument groups have explored parts of the 19th-century repertoire in the past, there seems to be another revival of interest in that period. The Orchestra of the Age of Enlightenment, conducted by their Principal Guest Conductor Sir Simon Rattle, gave two concerts of music by Brahms and Schumann at The South Bank on 14 and 15 December, and will be following up with further concerts of music by Beethoven, Rossini, Weber and Mendelssohn. The first concert, in the Queen Elizabeth Hall, featured Schumann's Violin Concerto and Fourth Symphony, alongside Brahms's Tragic Overture and St Anthony Variations. Schumann's Violin Concerto is a curious and disturbing, work, far from immediately appealing. It is his last major work before his attempted suicide and mental collapse, and was suppressed by the intended soloist, Joachim, together with Clara Schumann and the young Brahms, on the grounds that it all too clearly exposed Schumann's exhaustion. The spirit world seems to have been involved both in its early life (after his breakdown, Schumann is said to have received a variant of one of the themes from the spirits of Mendelssohn and Schubert) and its rediscovery, by a spiritualist great-niece of Joachim's, in the 1930s who claimed that she had received telepathic messages from Joachim as to its whereabouts (in the Prussian State Library in Berlin, deposited with the stipulation that it was not to be published until 1956, 100 years after Schumann's death). Despite attempts by Brahms and Joachim to have the work performed in the 1870s, its first public performance ever was given in 1937, under the cloud of Nazi politics, in a version largely re-written by Hindemith. Musically the highlight is the slow movement – a languid, almost vocal melody above a restlessly syncopated rocking bass that builds into a slightly ungainly dance. Both outer movements are marked with warnings against being too fast, warnings that Rattle sensibly heeded. Thomas Zehetmair

gave a performing of amazing virtuosity and emotional depth. If he did not convince many in the audience of the greatness of this work, I fear that was not his fault. Various crises of confidence also clouded what became known as Schumann's Fourth Symphony, and he revised the score ten years after its first performance. Rattle directed the earlier, 1841 version, with its less-obvious pointed entries and more transparent texture and the omission of the transition passage between the Scherzo and the Finale. This was a masterly performance by Rattle and the OAE. The expressive tone colour that period instruments bring to music like this will not need explaining to *EMR* readers, but the breathy clarinets and buzzy (and well tuned) horns were particularly revealing in this performance. Rattle's ability to mould and shape the music is inspired – his controlled use of rubato is outstanding and this exploration of the depths of mood within a work have earned him a deserved place of the world stage.

The following day, in the Royal Festival Hall, Rattle and the Orchestra of the Age of Enlightenment gave us Schumann at his very best, with the Overture to *Genoveva* and the *Nachtlied* – the latter a particular impressive performance, and piece, with some sensuous and sumptuous orchestral colour, notably in the final section with prominent roles for combinations of clarinet and oboe, and flute and oboe. The repetitions of the word 'Schlaf' (sleep) at the beginning of this section are a moment of pure musical magic. I heard Simon Rattle conduct the same work again more recently, with the Vienna Philharmonic in Vienna's Musikverein – a hall with acoustics and a intimacy that bring a much greater focus to works like this than the Royal Festival Hall, at least in its current incarnation. The singers of European Voices were on splendid form in this work, integrating superbly with the orchestral texture, as they did in Brahms's German Requiem that completed the concert. In this work, soloists Susan Gritton and Dietrich Henschel were excellent, again working within the orchestral colour. It is nice to able to commend a percussionist – Alan Emslie, whose prominent timpani role in the Requiem was one of the highlights. These two concerts showed Rattle at his best, exploring lesser-known parts of the repertoire and bring his vast breadth of vision to large scale works like the Brahms. His control of the emotional tension throughout the final movement, for example, was superb – it is so easy to lose all sense of power as the piece works towards its *solo voce* conclusion. He also ensured that the opening of the massive fugue at 'Der Gerechten Seelen' was heard – this passage is often clouded in performance. One let-down was the poor translation of the German text in the programme, which used the standard English Bible translations rather than following the German sequence of words.

POLYPHONIC MESSIAH

No Christmas is complete with the annual pilgrimage to St John's, Smith Square, for the Polyphony *Messiah*, this year accompanied by the SJSS resident period orchestra, The Academy of Ancient Music, and directed, as usual, by

If you play, teach, make or just listen
to recorders, then

The Recorder Magazine

is for you

News, reviews, interviews
and offers on CDs
delivered directly to your door
four times a year for just £16
(£24 airmail)

Peacock Press,
Scout Bottom Farm, Mytholmroyd,
Hebden Bridge, West Yorks, HX7 5JS
Tel: (01422) 882751

Stephen Layton. Layton is one of the finest choral directors around, and his performances are always rich and rewarding. He is not a follower of the semi-skinned, lean and mean school of period performance – his interpretations of Bach and Handel are full-fat roast beef and Yorkshire pudding affairs (or should I say, turkey with all the trimmings), with a broad, architectural view of the works. One feature of this is his ability to allow the music to flow between movements, making pauses the more telling, for example, just after the chorus 'And He shall purify'. His build up of tension in the sequence between 'Their sound in gone out' and the Hallelujah chorus was immensely powerful. He also pays due attention to the simple matter of controlling the standing and sitting of the choir – often poorly done. And I do approve of his habit of directing the audience to stand for the Hallelujah chorus. He works within a broad tempo, carefully controlling the phrasing of the music, and bringing out the frequent changes on in mood that give *Messiah* so much emotional depth. He is particularly good at cadences. His choir, Polyphony, have moved well beyond their early music roots, and are as well known now for performances of contemporary music. They sing with a solid and controlled tone, with a remarkable degree of coherence. The youthful sopranos form one of the best line-ups I have heard – never shrill or overpowering in their upper registers, and with that clarity of tone and vocal timbre that is so important for early music performance. The soloists were impressive, notably James Gilchrist and James

Rutherford. Emma Kirkby was not quite articulating her runs the way she used to, and is allowing herself rather more slithers up to notes than in days of old – and her cadenza in her final air was perhaps a little ambitious. She was unfortunately let down in two key arias by some shaky violin solos, with a surfeit of vibrato and questionable intonation. Countertenor William Towers left me with very mixed feelings. He has a powerful and focussed tone, and a commendably sure grasp of notes (as in some tricky passages in 'Thou art gone up on high'), but I never quite came to terms with his fast and persistent vibrato, even though it didn't really effect the stability of his intonation in the way that happens with some singers. 'He was despised' was beautifully sung, full of passion and emotion. The OAE were on form, with particularly good contributions from the continuo group of Joseph Crouch, cello, Judith Evans, double bass and Alistair Ross, harpsichord and organ, who might have blushed slightly at having to creep off the stage and walk the length of the gallery to bring off Stephen Layton's party trick of bringing in the large west end organ, bit by bit, during the final chorus. This produced a neat bit of transposition from Mr Ross, and some very puzzled looks in the audience as the tonal focus shifted from the stage to the back of the hall. Mr Layton is a very naughty boy, but after a performance like this, I would forgive him anything. Finally, commendations to Katie Hawks for some refreshingly relaxed and informative programme notes – she even managed a cricketing reference.



Handel – There in myrtle shades reclin'd *from Hercules* (HWV 60/6a)

Largo

5 Dejanira

There, there in myrtle shades re-clin'd, By streams, that thro' E-ly-sium wind, that thro' E-ly-sium wind,

9 In sweet-est un-ion, we shall prove E-ter-ni-ty of bliss and love, e-ter-ni-ty of bliss and love,

13 of bliss and love, e-ter-ni-ty of bliss and love. There, there in myrtle shades re-

17 -clin'd, By streams that thro' E-ly-sium wind, In sweet-est un-ion we shall prove E-ter - - -

20 - - - ni-ty of bliss and love, e-ter - - - - - ni-ty of bliss and love,

23 there we shall prove e-ter-ni-ty of bliss and

26 Violin 1
Violin 2
Viola
love.

This represents the version of the autograph, omitting the bars crossed out but ignoring the cue for transposition into G major.
Bar 3, note 6: first written 2 octaves lower. Bar 20, voice, penultimate note: a sixth lower in autograph.

© King's Music 2004
Complete edition of *Hercules* in preparation.

RAVENS VIEW

Simon Ravens

My name is Simon, and I am an Alphaholic. For me, it all started... well, see *EMR* April 2003 if you're interested in this tedious bit of personal history.

To mark its fifth birthday, the Parisian label Alpha has issued a predictably novel and irresistible catalogue disc. Irresistible, simply because all the stars in the Alpha galaxy are offered a chance to shine; novel, because nothing on the disc has yet been presented on an Alpha recording. This disc, *Pastime with Good Company*, is also novel because, for a good reason I won't go into here, most of the performers are pictured in a wine shop. (It is this, I'd like to think, rather than any sub-conscious need for an awkward personal confession, which inspired the opening of this column.) Actually, the term 'Alphaholic' isn't so much of a joke. I really *am* one. I know I have managed to hide it over the last year, but a birthday party (even if it's not mine) is a chance for an embarrassing lapse. Here goes!

First, the headiest brew of the last year. *Nova metamorfosi* (Alpha 039). This is Vincent Dumestre's incomparable vocal and instrumental ensemble *Le Poème Harmonique*, performing Monteverdi madrigals in the Milanese sacred garb of Ruffo and Coppini. Put like that, it sounds as interesting as communion wine: put on the CD, and it sounds like vintage stuff. (I think I'll stop the wine analogy here: it's 9.30 on a Saturday evening as I write this, and I'm making myself thirsty). The opening of the Coppini's *O gloriosae martyr*, for instance, is simply the most magnificent sound I have ever heard in this kind of music. There's more to these performers, though, than an ability to wallow in the moment. There is an intense musical drive that sweeps us through what are often quite fragmented musical structures. And if ever there was a demonstration of the difference between improvisation and ornamentation, this is it. *Poème Harmonique's* flights of genius literally improve (validate, even) the music in a way that still-born ornamentation never can.

In the run-up to Christmas, whatever quantities I bought in of this disc, Grove Music had sold out within a day or so. To whom? Well, other Alphaholics, for a start. Alpha is one of only two labels, the other being Naxos, the release dates of which bring expectant, impatient customers into Grove Music. Naxos customers often – not always – strike me as buying for negative reasons – the chief one being that they're *not* wasting money (even if that line leads them to to such rusted, buffered dead-ends as Jenö Jando playing Schubert). Alpha customers, on the other hand, really do tend to smile: even when they pick up a relative dud such as Olivier Schneebeli's overblown Lejeune disc, the stunning art-work and essay make it anything but

money thrown away. Let's face it, any performer, let alone any label, will score hits as well as misses, and when they do, we are most consoled by the impression that, despite all, they cared. The attention Alpha lavish on the non-musical aspects of each release shows that they care.

A vital ingredient in Alpha's success is the varnished acoustic they record in (the Chapelle de l'Hôpital Notre-Dame de Bon Secours in Paris). In principle, I'm wary of the idea of using a single acoustic to record anything from 1 to (in the case of the Lejeune) 49 performers. In practice, the acoustic is so ravishing it almost invariably places Alpha's aural jewels on a velvet cushion. Even the sound of Elisabeth Joye's solo harpsichord playing Bach Inventions (Alpha 034) is captured so beautifully I can almost smell the polish on the instrument's soundboard. Mind you, it helps that this is playing of the most sublime finesse.

Likewise the inspired recording of Mattheson's 1717 Sonatas for Transverse Flute, Violin & Keyboard, *Der Brauchbare Virtuoso* (Alpha 035) by Diana Baroni, Dirk Börner, Petr Skalka and Pablo Valetti. Remembering that this was the man who fought a duel with Handel, there always had to be more to Mattheson than we find in his lumpen-treatise *Der Vollkommene Cappelmeister*, and here is the evidence. A genuine revelation.

The only bad news about Alpha in the last year is that, their initial UK distributor having gone to the wall, the price of the discs here has gone up. I now sell the individual discs at £14.99 (*Pastime with Good Company* I do for £7.50). I sometimes have difficulty squaring the price of 'premium' discs with my conscience, but not in this case.

There is also one bit of mixed news. In terms of its overall sales, the UK market is so incidental to Alpha that actual release dates here bear little resemblance to those advertised. Still, sometime in the next few months a box will arrive here containing Helene Schmitt playing Carbonelli, and Café Zimmerman playing Bach. I'm already salivating.

I have asked Harmonia Mundi, who import Alpha, for a review copy of the Carbonelli. The facsimile has been in our catalogue for at least 15 years (originally requested by Monica Huggett), and I've yet to hear any of it. It has a marvellous title page, with crest and dedication to the Duke of Rutland, who multi-timed in other noble offices as much as fat-cats of industry have multiple directorships. One of them is familiar as a pub name: the Marquis of Granby. 'Carbonelli' is appended at the end in the smallest print.

CB

CD REVIEWS

PLAINSONG

Leo Treitler's *With Voice and Pen*, reviewed on p. 8, includes a 73-minute disc of music to illustrate the book. There are some fascinating attempts to imagine early styles of singing. Treitler writes: 'The emphases of this book... ask for singing that celebrates the oneness of verbal and musical expression as it celebrates voice... It is largely from such performances that I have learnt the need to make historical interpretations responsible to the moment of singing out, something that has been too much neglected in the scholarly study.' £95 may be a lot for a CD, but it is worth trying to hear it. It is a pity that the list of contents does not refer to the page of the book where the music is discussed, and there isn't an index of incipits to help. CB

MEDIEVAL

Fikon, fiddler och fimlir; Figs, fiddles, and fine play – a musical taste of the 14th century Falsobordone 49' 18"
ACACD 0043 from www.falsobordone.com

Had I opened the package when this disc arrived, I would immediately have sent it off to our culinary correspondent – though it might have looked a bit odd having her name appearing as reviewer followed by it as performer in the heading to the next disc. While having rather short measure in terms of duration, this includes five medieval recipes (in Finnish and English): presumably one puts the disc in the player, then uses it as background for French figs in white wine, mushroom pie, golden peas, green sauce and/or magnificent imperial fritters. The music ranges from the Alfonsine Cantigas to Machaut and Landini; the approach is too folky for the 14th-century art music and has an earthy vigour which feels a bit northern for the former. But it's brilliantly done and would make a fine present for a historically-minded cook. CB

Temple of Chastity: Codex Las Huelgas. Music from 13th century Spain Mille fleurs (Jennie Cassidy, Helen Garrison, Belinda Sykes voices, Jan Walters harp) 59' 38"
Signum SIGCD043

Despite the heavy drumming on track 1, I've really enjoyed this. The varied styles included in this unusual MS (an international repertoire copied at a rich Spanish convent) are characterised by the carefully calculated approach to each piece. The music is religious, but it is presented

as it might have been performed for the entertainment of the nuns. The stylish presence of the harp is a bonus, worth having for its own sake, not just to avoid the possibility of the boredom that some small female groups induce. There is no chance of that here anyway; the trio does not fall into the trap of letting sheer beauty of sound get in the way of the individuality of the music. (Yes, that really is a compliment!) The performances have a freedom which is refreshing as well as plausible. Highly recommended. CB

15th CENTURY

Le Champion des Dames: Chansons de Gilles Binchois & Guillaume Dufay Continens Paradisi 69' 41"
Ricercar RIC 228

This beautiful disc intermeshes verses from Martin le Franc's satirical poem *Le Champion des Dames*, dedicated to Philip the Good of Burgundy, with chansons by two stars of the Burgundian Court, Guillaume Dufay and Gilles Binchois. An extremely astute selection of chansons allows the texts to interact with the sections from the satire, impressively performed in Renaissance French by Olivier Bettens – now we can finally and confidently pronounce Binchois as 'Beengshway'. Most impressive of all, however, are the exquisite performances of the chansons by the two voices and instruments of Continens Paradisi. Choosing generally brisk tempi, the musicians, spurred on by the subtle but insistent influence of percussion, find persuasive melodic lines through these sometimes wayward works, and overcome with ease the potential difficulty of the sudden bursts of decoration which are a feature of the Burgundian chanson of this period. This disc is highly successful in evoking the remote but rich world of the Burgundian Court with its idiosyncratic fashions – this was the time and place of the tall pointed hat and veil – and the stamping ground of Dufay and Binchois, praised by name in the final section of *Le Champion des Dames* and captured in delightful informality in the famous illustration in the same work. For those who like to skip and sample, the track numbers are not quite as stated.

D. James Ross

Riemenschneider: Music of his Time II Curioso, Bernhard Böhm; Hedos Ensemble; Oxford Camerata, Jeremy Summerly 74' 54"
Naxos 8.558145 £

Music by Finck, Hofhaimer, Isaac, Lapidida, Mouton, Obrecht, Ockeghem, Stolzer, Walter

The impressive composer list led me to expect voices. Occasionally a single voice joins an ensemble, but this is really an instrumental recording: recorders, flutes and reeds for the most part. Riemenschneider himself was a sculptor, in the fine German tradition of late gothic wood carving. He now has the posthumous challenge of bringing shape to a recording of 33 short pieces. The flute ensemble is sonorous, though the instruments sound later in design than the music, if one takes a purist view. The recorder and flute playing seems more sure-footed than the reed playing, which is a little anxious though competent enough. In one or two of the few sung pieces the singer is perhaps being careful not to drown the instruments; an ill-founded worry as the result is a little under-inflated. There are some jolly pieces and spirited renditions too.

Stephen Cassidy

'The Thistle and the Rose': Music from the Carver Choirbook Cappella Nova, Alan Tavener 65' 13"

Gaudeamus CD GAU 342

Missa Deus creator omnium (c.1470), Mass a3 (c.1520), *Magnificat* a4 (c.1490)

The Carver Choirbook, compiled by the 16th-century Scottish church composer Robert Carver and preserving most of his extant works, is the most important Scottish musical manuscript of the medieval/renaissance period, and to mark the 500th anniversary of the marriage of Margaret Tudor (sister of Henry VIII) and James IV, King of Scots, Cappella Nova have recorded three major works from it. They open with a spectacular large-scale anonymous setting of the Mass, brilliantly reconstructed by Kenneth Elliott specially for the recording. Dr Elliott draws attention to parallels in the *Missa Deus creator omnium* with the work of Walter Frye, but there are equally resonances of early Franco-Flemish masters, and we should of course not rule out the possibility that the work is by an unknown Scottish composer of the generation prior to Robert Carver. Cappella Nova sing with enormous expertise and powerful expression, revealing this much-discussed but hitherto unperformed work as a considerable masterpiece. The anonymous three-part Mass which follows is probably the work of Carver himself and is scored for the luminous combination of two trebles and alto. The ladies'

voices of Cappella Nova have long delighted Scottish and international audiences as Canty, and with a sound sense of ensemble they tackle this intricate music with total understanding and assurance. I am writing this review in the context of listening to recordings of continental music from the same period, and am struck anew by the utter uniqueness of the early 16th-century Scottish repertoire, in which lavish ornamentation of the sort encountered in the Eton Choirbook is tightly woven into textures of breath-taking complexity, in a manner reminiscent of Celtic design. This revelatory CD concludes with an anonymous four-part Magnificat, which may well have come north with Margaret Tudor in 1503, or indeed have been written in Scotland to mark her arrival. This important and impressive recording supplies the first satisfactory performances of three internationally significant masterworks, and although it is presented as a celebration of the dynastic marriage of 1503, it also serves as an eloquent celebration of the current healthy state of Scottish musicology and choral performance.

D James Ross

For a review of a live performance, see p. 12.

16th CENTURY

Anchieta *Missa sine nomine* Capilla Peñaflorida, Loreto Fernández Imaz org, Ministras de Marsias, Josep Cabré 67' 23" Naxos 8.555772 £ chant & organ intabulations

Juan de Anchieta spent much of his active service at the Court of Joanna, daughter of Ferdinand and Isabella of Spain and wife of Philip the Fair of Burgundy, a woman whose madness was simply one aspect of the tragic twilight of the once all-powerful Dukedom of Burgundy. Even after her abdication, Joanna enjoyed considerable wealth and ran a court of great splendour. This performance tries to recreate this in the form of a liturgical reconstruction using Anchieta's *Missa Sine nomine* (in fact a *Missa L'homme armé* in all but name) with lavish scoring for voices and instruments. There is something touching about the tentative way in which Anchieta insinuates the once proud *L'homme armé* tune into his Mass, but nothing remotely so about the performance of the tune which opens the CD or indeed the whole reconstruction, which is bold and flamboyant. The rich sounds of the massed voices and instruments are evocative indeed, and the mass and motets by Anchieta show him to have been truly a gifted and subtle musician.

D. James Ross

G. Gabrieli *In Festo Sanctissimae Trinitatis* Chœur de chambre de Namur, La Fenice, Jean Tubéry 64' 00" Assai 222512 (rec 1998)

Issued in 2000, this is a wonderful introduction to Gabrieli's large-scale music and how it might be performed. It begins with his best-known piece, *In ecclesiis* – often ponderously done, but not here – and includes that great favourite of sackbutists and cornettists, *Dulcis Jesu*. There are some witty canzonas, one played on two organs. The climax is the four-choir *Omnes gentes*. Tubéry's booklet note is excellent, apart from not making clear that the Feast of the Trinity in question isn't Trinity Sunday but the special celebration in the Redentore for the deliverance from the plague. This is an essential purchase for Gabrieli-lovers, and also gives a more approachable image than many single-composer discs of his music. CB

Originally issued as Ricercar 207512, this was reviewed with enthusiasm in *EMR* 62 by Stephen Cassidy, who commented (perhaps more favourably than I would have done) on the use of voices on high and low parts. So the disc gets the thumbs up from a cornettist who knows his Gabrieli from the top and an organist who reads the bottom line.

Milan Fantasia José Miguel Moreno vihuela, Eligio Quintero vihuela, gtr Glossa GCD P30110 63' 53"

This CD of music by the evergreen Luis Milan is one of the most pleasant musical shocks I have had the joy to experience. I expected to hear the same old war horses, as ridden (so well) by Segovia, Bream, and a host of other fine players in their wake, on modern guitar, lute, or vihuela. Yet instead of playing the pieces as the solos printed in *El Maestro* (1536), José Miguel Moreno is joined by Eligio Quintero, who adds a second part on another vihuela or on a renaissance guitar. Their ensemble is so good, that, had I not known the pieces so well, I might have thought Moreno was playing alone. Even in the fantasies, so full of rubato (as suggested by Milan) they play as one. The arrangements are tastefully made, with extra polyphonic lines added to enhance Milan's original, but which do not obscure it. Quintero's larger vihuela adds warmth and fills out the texture, yet never clutters; the rhythm of strummed chords and the noodling of counter-melodies on his guitar give the music lightness and oomph. They achieve something akin to the duets which Joanne Matelart created by adding *contreparties* to solos by Francesco da Milano. Their playing is crisp, well balanced, expressively phrased, exciting, graceful, serious, and fun. In his *Declaración de Instrumentos*

Musicales (Ossuna, 1555) Juan Bermudo describes how the combination of different sizes of vihuela and guitar would be 'music to enjoy'. By listening to this CD we can start to understand the sort of delightful sounds he probably had in mind.

Stewart McCoy

In natali Domini: Christmas in Spain and the Americas in the 16th century La Columbina (María Cristina Kiehr, Claudio Cavina, Josep Benet, Josep Cabré SATB) 70' 16" Accent ACC 96114 D

Music by Brito, Carcares, de Cristo, Fernandez, Guerrero, Morales, Padilla, Victoria

This programme of festive music from Spain and Latin America is presented as a partial reconstruction of a Christmas Matins service, although it seems unlikely that material from across the Spanish Empire would ever have been assembled in this manner. The decision to perform the music using four solo voices is also implausible, except possibly in the sacred *ensalada* which concludes the programme. Here and elsewhere the singing is very well focused, sweet-toned and compelling. The group are self-confessedly keen madrigalists, and the rapport necessary for this genre seems to pervade their performances of all of the music here. If occasionally I felt I wanted more gravitas and weight in the liturgical music, La Columbina's expressive singing and effortlessly intelligent readings won me round.

D. James Ross

The Marriage of England and Spain: Music for the wedding of Philip II and Mary Tudor, Winchester Cathedral 1554 Orchestra of the Renaissance, Richard Cheetham (rec 1998) 78' 23" Glossa GCD P31401 Contains Taverner *Missa Gloria tibi Trinitas* + music by Morales etc.

This is a re-issue of Richard Cheetham's recreation of the marriage, in England, of Philip II of Spain and Mary Tudor in 1554. The characteristic interworking of voices with shawms (as well as the more conventional brass) provides an interesting sound palette, based on the fact that musicians of both nations joined forces for the event. Despite being predisposed towards mixing instruments in this way, I am not entirely convinced historically nor musically that they would have joined forces in each other's repertoire. The sound of a shawm doubling the soprano part in Taverner's glorious *Missa Gloria tibi Trinitas*, though discrete, becomes a wee bit wearing, and seems to work against the lofty clerestory of sound, so characteristic of Taverner's aesthetic. Two of the three Spanish motets

are played instrumentally as processions. It would have been nicer to hear a vocal/instrumental mix in these. The third is a *Pater noster* by Morales with one voice, and this is a highlight, having real strength and passion. The overall sound is very well poised, and conveys the feeling of importance which must have imbued this occasion.

Steven Cassidy

I reviewed the first release of this (under a different number) in *EMR* 51 p. 21 with some qualifications, so thought it worth getting another opinion. CB

17th CENTURY

Il Giardino di Giulio Caccini Marco Horvat voice, theorbo, gts, lirone, dir, Olga Pitarch voice, Eric Bellocq theorbo, gtr, Bruno Caillat perc, Angélique Mauillon hp, Imke David lirone 71' 32"

Alpha 043

Caccini + F. Caccini, Foggia, Frescobaldi, Kapsberger, Minischalchi, Negri, Strozzi, Trabaci

I would normally be suspicious of a bass recording virtually a whole disc of monody; as Marco Horvat admits, songs explicitly for bass use a specific texture, with the solo part expanding from the continuo rather than maintaining a line above it; the alternative *bastarda* style requires a wider compass than he can manage. But he has a lightish voice, so the non-bass songs transposed to a suitable pitch do actually sound right. Olga Pitarch supplies a pleasing contrast – a pity she wasn't allocated a couple more tracks. Horvat favours self-accompaniment because of the rhythmic flexibility it permits. One might argue that most singers are only too prone to flexibility and that they need the discipline of a more metrically-inclined accompanist; but such criticism only applies here to the occasional foreshortening of cadential whole-note dominants, which should surely be held to full length, sustained by a 3443 accompaniment. The excellent booklet notes (despite some gullibility for Caccini's own propaganda) also include an account of a mural in Caccini's house, reproduced on the cover. The whole package is highly recommended.

CB

See also Simon Ravens' on Alpha on p. 17.

Cesare Melodie per voci et instrumenti (1621) Les Sacqueboutiers de Toulouse Accord 476 064-2 76' 22"

A re-issue which includes all the vocal and instrumental pieces of Cesare's *Melodi per voci et instrumenti*, 1621. The virtuoso ensemble give of their usual best here in fine and witty performances. They are joined by a number of voices which appear in different combinations for the

motets. These are also fine performances, but it is noticeable that in putting together on-spec combinations of voices for a recording, there is no development of a 'house style', in contrast with the instrumental ensemble, which plays together a great deal. With the singing, one is listening to several voices each making individual musical performances, but together falling short of a coherent interpretation. All performances are technically excellent though, and a very good library recording to have.

Stephen Cassidy

Charpentier *Messe de Minuit* (H9), *Te Deum* (H146), *Dixit Dominus* (H204) Aradia Ensemble, Kevin Mallon 59' 50" Naxos 8.557229 £

I suppose it was inevitable that my first Charpentier review of his tercentenary year should feature his two most well-known works. Though it is not labelled as such, the inclusion of this mass makes this release the third volume of Naxos's M-AC Christmas music series and like the others it both pleases and baffles this listener, though there is far more of the former than the latter. Questionable is the treatment of the *Kyrie* in the mass, where performances of modern arrangements of the carol melodies used by Charpentier are woven into the *Kyrie-Christe-Kyrie* sequence and the organ interludes specified by the composer are omitted. I'm all in favour of these noëls being included on the disc (and, indeed, all the others that appear in the mass – there is space for them) but surely the integrity and rubrics of the original score should be respected. The treatment of the *Agnus Dei* is also questionable. Other production eccentricities include presenting the *Te Deum* and *Dixit*, at 22 and 9 minutes respectively, as single tracks. On the other hand, I did enjoy the improvised timpani introduction to the *Te Deum* (if this disc started life as a concert the audience must have been brought rapidly to full attention) and the whole general approach to and sound of the music. The performances of *Te Deum* and *Dixit* (a first recording, I think) are less contentious than that of the mass and make the disc well worth a recommendation, especially at budget price.

David Hansell

Corelli *Violin Sonatas op. 5* Elizabeth Wallfisch vln, Richard Tunnicliffe vlc, Paul Nicholson kbd 126' 46" (2 CDs) Hyperion CDD22047 (rec 1989)

Most of the sources that early performers study are full of references to 'good taste'; but descriptions of what the term comprises are far too general to give any clue what sort of performance might break the

acceptable bounds. We bring our own preconceptions, through which we strain our assessment of whether a performance shows good taste. These performances from fifteen years back are a little more cautious than Libby might play the music now: most players have loosened over the years. They make a fine basic recording, especially at mid-price – maybe less exciting than the recent Manze set, but probably better-wearing. The cello is more prominent than the keyboard. Gemini-ani's version of no. 9 is included as an appendix. The picture lurking behind the CDs wouldn't make a good advert for the chin-off book reviewed on p. 2 of our last issue. Certainly a worth-while reissue. CB

Ferrabosco the Younger *Consort Music to the Viols in 4, 5 & 6 parts* Hespèrion XXI, Jordi Savall 66' 00" Alia Vox AV 9832

The Latin birthright of the composer is an intriguing gift to English music, here given a Latin performance quite different in many ways from those of, for example, the Rose Consort, and Fretwork. The disc opens with the same pairing as The Rose's disc of Ferrabosco Father and Son – the wonderful *Dovehouse Pavan* and D major *Almain*. Savall adds theorbo and concludes the *Almain* with a repeat of its beautiful opening strain. The disc goes on to include 12 of the 4-part fancies, the four-note pavan (a5), two In Nomines (a5 & a6) and four fantasies a6. Apart from the 'da capo' in the *Almain*, Savall's approach is free of the kind of additions one might expect. His tempi are often slow, articulation comparatively legato, and there is little of the kind of showy contrast that Fretwork are so good at. At times I wanted more variety, particularly listening first time to the whole. But there is a beguiling ebb and flow, an organic lift to the rhythm, which suits each piece very well. Very accomplished playing, great beauty of sound, and the music is superb. Ferrabosco is a wonderful melodist, and his music, immediately attractive yet mysterious, rewards the listener who is feels drawn to return to it. Hespèrion enjoy the sheer voluptuous sound of 5 and 6 viols (the instruments are a mix of 16th and 18th century, including a couple of Barak Normans and a Bertrand) and make much of the ingenious music of the 4-part fancies. I shall enjoy returning to this recording very much.

Robert Oliver

Japix *Lieten/Liederen* Camerata Trajectina, Louis Peter Grijp 79' 35" Globe GLO 6055

A little known Fresian composer sees the light with this disc. The singing style

initially seems a little naïve, but finds its feet as the disc progresses. Some of the songs have been set to tunes which appear in van Eyck's *Der Fluyten Lust-Hof* in decorated form. As these often seem to have folk roots, the approach to style is defensible but nevertheless sometimes seems a little weak. Some of the later pieces seem to carry an Italian influence in the form (presumably at second hand) which suggests that Japix had higher brow aspirations for his work. The charm of these pieces is indeed in the feeling of Japix finding his feet in bringing parochial late renaissance song to terms with new imported ideas. Some of the performances work very well. There is good recorder playing, too, from Saskia Coolen, who treads very well the line between sophistication and the simplicity required to make divisions hang together. *Stephen Cassidy*

Legrenzi *Vesperae Opus 1: In laudem Sanctissimi Sacramenti* Cori Spezzati, Olivier Opdebeek
Pierre Verany PV703111

This is one of two Vespers recreations I have reviewed this month. Here, the plainsong is performed as I would expect, but the antiphons are only performed before the psalms (when technically they ought to be repeated after them as well), and a sonata just seems to be thrown in for good measure, although it might have better served as an antiphon substitute. The hymn is also slightly curious: it begins with four soloists, but the choir takes over at the first Tutti marking. Recordings of similar repertoire have shown that such pieces can work with small choir throughout, and – even if the soli/tutti approach is taken – the soloists should surely have joined the choir for the second half of the motet. These reservations aside, I enjoyed the disc enormously. Legrenzi's music deserves to be far better known and this recording can only advance his cause all the more. The sonata in question, La Pezzoli, is one of Legrenzi's best trios, and is given a very fine performance here. I hope Olivier Opdebeek will continue his exploration of Legrenzi's output (this being his second CD with Pierre Verany). *BC*

Monteverdi *Vesperae in Nativitate Domini* Currende, Erik van Nevel 77' 56"
Eufoda 1352
Dixit II, Confitebor III, Beatus vir I, Laudate pueri (1650), *Gloria a7, Laudate Dominum I, Christe redemptor, Magnificat a8; Cozzolani Gloria in altissime Deo; G. Gabrieli Hodie Christus natus est, Canzona III*

In many ways this is an impressive recording. Music for Vespers, with a few additions, is performed musically, at suit-

able speeds and pitch (no top A for the sopranos in *Laudate pueri*) and with appropriate instruments – but not always in the right places. For example, a sackbut suddenly deserts his own part and doubles the organ in the bass duet in the Magnificat, and (even when he is on the right part), is allowed to become a bit overenthusiastic – I'm not blaming Wim Becu: any trombonist will make the most of a good line if the conductor encourages him. The shaping of the vocal lines is good, but doesn't always sound very Italianate. I'm not sure of the point of plainsong antiphons except in a thorough liturgical reconstruction: wouldn't organ improvisations relate better to the settings and be equally liturgical? If you want a recording with small choir rather than solo ensemble, this is worth having; the Robert King complete church music has bigger forces for a few pieces but others sung just by a consort. *CB*

Purcell *The complete secular solo songs* Barbara Bonney, Susan Gritton, James Bowman, Rogers Covey-Crump, Charles Daniels, Michael George *SSATB*, The King's Consort (Mark Caudle, Susanna Pell bass viols, David Miller *theorbo*, arch-lute, Robert King *organ*, *hpscd*) 222' 48"
Hyperion CDS44161/3 ££ (rec 1993-4)

A welcome to this cheap reissue of the three discs (still available separately) in a box with a single, unabbreviated booklet. There is so much positive that could be said about these performances that looking up my review of vol. 3 (*EMR*5), I find it seems a bit churlish; but I'll repeat the final sentence: 'criticism is minor in relationship to the value of the set as a whole'. If you haven't bought it, get it now. There really is some excellent singing, and it is unlikely that you will know all the 87 songs included here. Just one warning: it doesn't include those 'songs from the shows' (some of his best) that have, right from the 1690s, circulated as independent songs. So no rosy bowers or Celia with her 1000 charms. But there's so much else! *CB*

Sweelinck *Keyboard Music* Christopher Herrick (17th-cent. organ at Norrfjärden Church, Sweden) 152' 00" (2 CDs in box)
Hyperion CDA67421/2

Christopher Herrick has been knocking at the door of historically-inspired performance for some time, and this offering finds him gaining entry, at least to the foyer. At last, he has chosen an historic instrument, and this seems to have revealed (as predicted in a number of my previous reviews of his recordings) an understanding of many of the techniques than bring music like this to life.

Although there is the occasional non-HIP hiccup (for example: slightly too emphatic articulation in some of the opening solo thematic entries, and some naughtiness involving the 16' pedal reed and Vogelgesang), this is really inspiring playing with some compelling musical insights into the structure of Sweelinck's often monumental pieces. The organ is a recent reconstruction of a 1684 instrument, now in the farthest reaches of Sweden but originally in the German Church in Stockholm. It is not clear how much original pipework remains, but it does have the type of action that allows Herrick to reveal his understanding of the effective use of touch – and it produces some lovely sounds, particular in the quieter combinations. The pleno is a bit brittle at times, but that is what tone controls are for. The programme (on two well-filled CDs) is well chosen to represent the wide range of Sweelinck's compositional style – not for nothing was this composer known as the Orpheus of Amsterdam and was to prove so influential in the development of 17th century organ music, particularly in North Germany. *Andrew Benson-Wilson*

Apologies for delayed review: the disc disappeared before I could send it out some months ago and emerged just before Christmas. *CB*

***L'eredità frescobaldiana*, vol. II** Andrea Marcon (18th cent. organ in Sant' Andrea in Riva, Treviso) 74' 04"
Divox Antiqua CDX 79805
Music by Blow, Froberger, Kerll, Muffat, Poglietti, Purcell, Roberday, Scherer, & anon

Although apparently released in 1999 this CD has only now been received for review. But it was worth waiting for. A fascinating programme traces the influence of Frescobaldi's heritage on later composers in Germany, Austria, France, Spain, Italy and England (Purcell and Blow – the latter passing off whole sections of Frescobaldi pieces as his own). It was Froberger, a pupil of Frescobaldi, who did most to spread his master's works throughout Europe, and he is given pride of place on this recording, with five pieces, including the melting Toccata VI *da sonarsi alla Levatione*, played on the characteristic and beautifully singing combination of the Principale and Vox humana stops. The acoustic adds considerably to the charm of the organ sound – as does the unequal temperament, giving an overwhelming air of calmness to the pure chords. Andrea Marcon is a master of his art, and he displays huge musical intelligence and insight in his interpretations. His sensitive use of touch works particularly well on this organ. If you wanted to buy just one CD to represent the

Italian organ and its musical influence, this would be a good choice.

Andrew Benson-Wilson

Die Deutsche Schalmey; or, La naissance du hautbois baroque Les Corsaires du Roy, Claire Lefilliâtre S 55' 35"

Ricercar RIC 233

Music by Anders, J. Krieger, Pez, Pezel, Praetorius, Rosenmüller & Steffani

The music and booklet notes give us a guided tour of the *deutsche schalmey* – intermediate between the shawm and baroque oboe. We hear suites by Praetorius (on the standard shawm line-up) and Pezel (on *deutsche schalmey* and bassoon), followed by songs with that accompaniment by Krieger, Steffani and Anders. The soprano has a clear and agile voice which holds the attention well. The group seems more at home with the later repertoire, which has more fluidity than the consort music performances. The disc finishes with a passacaglia by Pez on the baroque oboe to close the brackets around the *schalmey*. This is excellently played with a smooth and luminous sound, and it is interesting to hear the instrumental design gradually moving the tone away from a fundamental reediness as the disc progresses. The slight edge still remaining in the *schalmey* is very convincing in the instrumental/vocal pieces which form the core of the repertoire. One small quibble is that the bassoon occasionally forces the pace in spates of over enthusiasm, which is uncomfortable.

Stephen Cassidy

Villancicos y Danzas Criollas de la Iberia Antigua al Nuevo Mundo, 1550-1750 La Capella Reial de Catalunya, Hesperion XXI, Jordi Savall 77' 03

Alia Vox AV 9834

Music by Arañes, Bocanegra, Cererols, Fernandes, Flecha, P. Guerrero, Hidalgo, Madre de Deus, Padilla, Velasco, Zéspedes & anon

Another invigorating selection of Hispanic American repertoire. The 'tour' begins in Spain (though with pieces published in Rome and Prague) and ends with Cererols' familiar *Serafin*, sandwiching contributions from Mexico, Peru etc. The track that really struck me was the slow, mesmeric *Hanacpachay cussivuinin* (the language is Quechua from Peru), published in 1631. Most of the items, however, are rather lighter, and performed with appropriate panache and awareness of their rhythmical base. I have not always been enthusiastic about Jordi Savall when he moves away from gamba repertoire, but this is certainly a success, and I don't even have my usual reservations about his wife's singing (try track 7). The booklet has some interesting illustrations – I'd

much rather have had a few more facsimiles and pictures than reproductions of other Savall CDs: a list of them would have taken far less space and have given the essential information about them more legibly. Unless you are already sated with this repertoire (there have been several good CDs over the last few years), do buy this.

CB

Those wishing to hunt out Hispanic-American music should try to find a library with Inter-American Music Review vol. VI & VII (1985 nos 1 & 2), a substantial anthology of 55 pieces. Do any readers know any more accessible collections?

LATE BAROQUE

Aubert *Concertos à 4 violons* Les Cyclopes (Florian Deuter, vln solo, Bibiane Lapointe & Thierry Maeder dirs) 61' 30"

Pierre Verany PV703101

Op. 17/1, 4, 5, 6; op. 26/2-4

Having for long cherished Leclair's violin concertos, I enjoyed these curiously Italianate French pieces. There are seven works on the disc, taken from two published sets. They vary from one movement to five, and there is no clear formal regularity; there are two called *gavotte gracioso*, a carillon (which Aubert may have played at the Concert Spirituel, where he was something of a regular star), and the one-movement concerto is a *Ciaccona*. While the bright sound of the CD captures much of the excitement of the fast movements, and the delicate ornamentation of the slower ones, there are a few very slight technical slips – the music can be extremely taxing in places. A welcome addition to the catalogue. BC

Bach *Cantatas Vol. 14* Soloists, The Amsterdam Baroque Orchestra & Choir, Ton Koopman 205' 31"

Challange CC72214

Cantatas 6, 26, 42, 68, 74, 103, 123, 125-6, 178; Sinfonia in D BWV 1045

Koopman's cantata cycle gradually inches towards completion. With this release he concludes Bach's second annual cycle (1724-5) of Leipzig church cantatas. It includes several rich and imaginative pieces, such as the Easter cantata BWV 6 that evokes the C-minor choruses from the end of the Passions; or BWV 103, with its gruesome depiction of earthly sickness in need of a heavenly physician. Many of the pieces are vividly scored, as with the flutes and oboes d'amore in the Epiphany cantata BWV 123, or the trio of oboes that symbolise the eventide gathering in BWV 42. Unlike Suzuki or Herreweghe, however, Koopman does not indulge in sheer sonority, instead preferring to maintain pace and onward momentum. Thus the

first movement of BWV 125, with its use of the *Nunc Dimittis*, becomes less a twilight farewell and more a shapely siciliano. The soloists include Klaus Mertens, who effortlessly articulates difficult melismas in BWV 74; somewhat less assured is Jörg Dürmeller in the tortuous tenor aria in the same cantata. As is Koopman's habit, the choruses are recorded more distantly than the arias, creating a somewhat contrived division, given that all the movements were probably originally sung by soloists. On balance, though, this is a valuable release that offers many insights into Bach's Leipzig output. Stephen Rose

Bach *Per cembalo solo* Richard Egarr hpscd

Harmonia Mundi HMU 907329

BWV 903-4, 906, 965, 971-3,

If the balance of appreciative public opinion for Bach keyboard performance has swung from harpsichord to piano in recent years, the blame must lie at least partly on the shortage of fine harpsichordists. More than ever, it is evident that this challenging instrument demands not only superlative musicianship and technique but also with an awareness of the counter-intuitive aspects of the instrument that should never descend into calculation. Richard Egarr is precisely the sort of player who is needed today and this new Bach disc of concertos and fantasias (including the Chromatic Fantasia and Fugue) plays directly into his strongest suite: fast, virtuosic playing with a tremendous degree of nuanced articulation and rhetorical pacing. He is perhaps less inspired in the more formal, 'finished' pieces (such as the Italian Concerto or the Fantasia and Fugue in A minor), but the Fantasia in C minor (formal, but – fortunately – also virtuosic) is outstanding, as is his completion of the fugue (complete with closing BACH motif).

John Butt

Bach *Organ works* Gillian Weir (2 organs by Lawrence Phelps) 155' 22" (2 CDs)

Priory PRCD 753 AB

Clavier Übung III + BWV 552, 590, 645-50, 679, 767, 802-5 +

On the evidence of these two CDs, Dame Gillian Weir has lost none of that tireless energy and enthusiasm that characterised her youthful burst into the organ world, via the St Albans competition and the first night of the Proms – both while still a student. Her playing is authoritative, stylish and sophisticated, with a strong sense of melodic flow that propels the music onwards, albeit occasionally at rather scary speeds. She works in long phrases, with a cohesive and consistent touch, avoiding the emphasis on the detail and articulation of individual notes

that some players cultivate. This homage to the organ building skills of her late husband, Lawrence Phelps, uses two of his American organs from the early 1970's. In hindsight, this was not a good period for organ building, although Phelps seems to have avoided the neo-baroque spikiness that characterised many instruments of the period and these two instruments are worth listening too. Although not building in a historical style, he was informed and influenced by historic instruments, and it is interesting to compare his eclectic essays in the North German style (Deer Park) and the French baroque style (St Luke's). The programme is well spaced over the two CDs, with the greater *Clavierübung* chorales and the enveloping Prelude and Fugue on one disk, and the smaller chorale settings and duets on the other, alongside the Canonic Variations and the Schübler Chorales. *Andrew Benson-Wilson*

Bach *Das Wohltemperierte Clavier, Teil II*
Ottavio Dantone *hpscd* 146' 04"
Arts 47657-2 (2 CDs)
(issued 2001)

Ottavio Dantone comes from Ravenna, where this recording was apparently made in 2001. For a comparatively little-known performer, to make your second CD a complete recording of Book 2 of the 48 is hardly short in ambition. But it works: this is a fluent and, in most ways, splendidly musical account of these outstanding compositions. The reading is deliberate, with the rhythms (e.g. in the F-major Prelude) calculated in a way that I still tend to associate with the piano rather than harpsichord or clavichord; but in some ways the overall result seems even more impressive. The instrument (by Fadini after Blanchet, Paris 1733) represents a style, contemporary with the time when Bach started assembling Book 2, that should be heard more often in Bach – indeed, at the hands of this resourceful performer. *Stephen Daw*

Bach *Harpsichord Concertos Vol. 1 (BWV 1052-4)* Lars Ulrik Mortensen *hpscd*, dir, Concerto Copenhagen 55' 57"
cpo 999 989-2

As the booklet notes triumphantly assert, 'CoCo' (as it is called) has 'ascended to the heavyweight class' of period-instrument ensembles, the only Nordic one at this level. The instrumental playing on these Bach concertos has all the competence and verve that would be expected at international level. Lars Ulrik Mortensen is both harpsichord soloist and director and provides efficient, effortless performances throughout. The faster move-

ments tend to be digitally pile-driven in such a way that I begin to crave the instrumental ritornelli and accompaniments as oases of nuance. The E Major concerto (possibly the one of the set that is least often heard) is more diverse in texture and phrasing than the perpetually motivated D Minor and D Major concertos and thus perhaps provides the most gracious listening experience of the disc.

John Butt

Fiorenza *Concerti per Flauto, Two Trio Sonatas*. Festa Rustica, Giorgio Matteoli *rec, vlc, cond* 65' 26"
Gaudeamus CD GAU 331

Last year I reviewed a disc of Fiorenza and Barbella by Christoph Timpe and the Accademia per musica and was full of praise for both the music and the recording. Unfortunately, I cannot get quite as excited about this CD. Neither the music (four concertos for recorder with two or three violins and continuo, and a couple of trio sonatas for strings – all in minor keys) nor the performances are quite up to the grade. I have never heard of Festa Rustica, but it is certainly the first group I have encountered where the director plays solo recorder and cello! Perhaps it would have worked better as a listening experience if the trios had been placed between the concertos. Interesting repertoire maybe, but not of the high technical standard I associate with Gaudeamus. *BC*

Handel – Vivaldi *Amor, hai vinto* Robert Expert *ct*, Ensemble Arianna, Marie-Paule Nounou *kbd, dir* 55' 26"
Arion ARN 68635

Handel *Empio dirò* (G. Cesare), *Stille amare* (Tolomeo); op. 6/7; Vivaldi *Amor hai vinto*, *Cessate omai cessate*, Sinfonia to Dario (RV 719)

This is rather a mixed bag: there is much to commend, such as the virtuoso playing, nowhere more satisfying than in a beautiful one-to-a-part (in fact, less than one-to-a-part, since there are no ripieno players at all!) of one of Handel's Op. 6 concertos, and some of Expert's singing is enjoyable (he's rather better in Vivaldi than in Handel); sometimes, though, the drama is too much for the music and the portrayal of anger from Giulio Cesare is at the expense of the notes. Doubtless this is something one would be forgive more easily in the theatre, where the action would distract one. Ensemble Arianna is certainly a group to look out for. *BC*

Mascitti *6 Sonate da camera, Op. II* Fabrizio Cipriani *vlm*, Antonio Fantinuoli *vlc*
Cantus C9610 60' 55"

We first reviewed this in *EMR* 40 (May 1998), when BC found it 'a most worth-

while recording of an attractive set of sonatas', though was a little disappointed that the cellist didn't use the opportunity of his sole possession of the continuo line to expand his contribution. *CB*

Telemann *Overtures, Sonatas, Concertos, 1*. Musica Alta Ripa 65' 49"
Dabringhaus & Grimm MDG 309 1189-2
Concertos TWV 51:C1, G9; Overture 55:fls; Quadro 43:g4; Sonata F3:F4

It always astounds me that Musica Alta Ripa are not much better known: without exception, their recordings are both technically superb (as much the Dabringhaus und Grimm technological input as the performances) and stylistically exemplary. Having recorded most of Bach's instrumental music, they here move on to Telemann, and give spirited and beautiful one-to-a-part performances of two sonatas, two concertos and an overture-suite, which was previously the domain of chamber orchestras, but works perfectly thus. Having enjoyed the fine Collegium Musicum 90 Telemann series on Chandos, I fear I may now have to consider having both sets on my shelves. How spoiled I will be for choice! *BC*

Vivaldi *Complete Bassoon Concertos, 1*. Tamas Benkócs *bsn*, Nicolaus Esterházy Sinfonia, Béla Drahos 61' 32"
Naxos 8.555937 £
RV 471, 476, 480, 493, 498, 503

This is the first disc in a project to include all of Vivaldi's concertos for bassoon. For anyone who thinks they might all be the same, let me assure you that they are not: there are several wonderful movements on this CD, not least of all in my favourite concerto of the 37, RV 498 in A minor. There are also some what can only be described as buffo moments, where humour must have been on the composer's mind. These might be modern instrument performances, but they certainly the lightness of touch (for the most part) that this repertoire needs. I look forward to hearing more of the series. *BC*

We were hoping to produce the editions for the bassoon concerto series, but the library at Turin & Naxos could not agree on a fee for permission – a pity, since they would then have been available at a reasonable price for any bassoonist to play. *CB*

Vivaldi in Arcadia: *Concertos and Arias* La Serenissima, Adrian Chandler *dir*, Mhairi Lawson *S* 79' 32"
Avie AV0031
RV 95, 520, 551, 553, 564, 575, 709

I thoroughly enjoyed this disc. The pastoral theme is reflected in the choice of repertoire and influences some of the playing

(most notably in the three-violin version of *La Pastorella*, RV 95). The disc includes two of Vivaldi's most luscious concertos – those for pairs of violins and cellos – and music by other composers (which are none to obvious on the cover), namely Gemini-ano Giacomelli and the better-known Hasse. In fact, the 'arias' of the disc's subtitle is slightly misleading since only one is by the Red Priest. Given the fantastic virtuosic singing of Mhairi Lawson, though, this is hardly important: strange, however, that more of Vivaldi's own arias were not thought worth including. BC

Vivaldi *Vesperi per l'Assunzione di Maria Vergine* Gemma Bertagnoli, Roberta Invernizzi, Anna Simboli, Sara Mingardo, Gianluca Ferrarini, Matteo Bellotto SSS ATB, Antonio de Secondi vln, Concerto Italiani, Rinaldo Alessandrini dir 153' 05 Opus III OPS 30383 (2 CDs in box) (Tesori del Piemonte 18, Vivaldi Edition, Musica Sacra 4)

This is the first recording of Vivaldi's church music that I am aware of that tries to put it into a proper religious context, here a Vespers service for the Assumption. As usual in Alessandrini recordings, there are two sets of booklet notes; the first a musicological account of the background and the repertoire, the second by the director, if not justifying then certainly explaining his approach to the project. Eyes may be raised at two particular elements of the recording: the orchestration of three psalms to match the other concerted choral pieces, and the adaptation of plainsong into ariettas. Since, in the former case, two of the pieces are for solo voice, might it not have made sense simply to accompany each with one of the orchestras? And, having stated clearly, in the latter case, 'it has not in fact been possible to locate anything similar in the Venetian repertoire', why impose a practice that existed elsewhere? And why do neither of the notes mention the provenance of the hymn? Is it, too, an adaptation of chant? These things might not necessarily be important were this not part of what purports to be a complete edition of Vivaldi's output. What is beyond any doubt at all is the breathtaking standard of the performances, both vocal and instrumental: the vocal soloists make light work of Vivaldi's most demanding writing. The second disc is dominated by the magnificent Sara Mingardo, but – for once – she is not in a class of her own! I won't be surprised if this set wins several awards. BC

£ = bargain price ££ = mid-price
All other discs full price, as far as we know

Vivaldi *La Senna Festeggiante* Delphine Collot *La Vertu*, Katalin Károlyi *La Seine*, Stephen MacLeod bar, Le Parlement de Musique, Martin Gester 84' 23" (2 CDs) Accord 476 054-2 ££

This excellent period instrument performance of Vivaldi's serenata features three very fine singers, accompanied by a small orchestra, which is reduced within the arias to single strings, and continuo consisting of theorbo and harpsichord. This interpretation of *piano* and *forte* as a distinction between tutti and soli works very well – somehow single players are more effective than groups playing quietly. Although each of the vocalists deserves the highest praise, Katalin Károlyi is outstanding. It's something of a pity that the discs were not filled out with more from this team – they definitely have something to say about Vivaldi. BC

Baroque Oboe Concertos Marcel Ponselee, Il Gardellino 50' 10" Accent ACC 22156
Bach Sinfonias BWV 12, 21 & 156; Handel in g BWV 287; Marcello in d; Telemann TWV 61: 61

Quantz wisely observed that the true music lover preferred to be moved rather than astonished, but oboist Marcel Ponselee manages to do both in these cornerstones of Baroque oboe literature. Moving is the way in which Ponselee and his one-on-a-part band shape not only each phrase, but each note, and in a totally natural and uncontrived way. Tempi and articulations are nicely adjusted to the resonant acoustic of the Église St. Apollinaire of Bolland, Belgium, and never seem extreme. The astonishment arises, therefore, not from flashy tempi (though we get one, at least, when Telemann calls for *Molto allegro* in his Concerto in E minor), but from the sheer musicality of the endeavour. Ponselee, playing his own copy of a Stanesby Jr. instrument, commands a self-effacing technical fluency that makes the music, rather than the playing, paramount. The program separates well-known concerti with three Bach sinfonias, which gives a well-rounded program. Even though at less than 50 minutes, it may seem short, as the Pythons might say 'couldn't eat another bite'. Oh, but there is an after-dinner mint (wafer thin!) in the form of Astor Piazzolla's *Oblivion* which proved quite satisfying. Jim Rich

The documentation isn't perfect: the Handel concerto does survive in an early source (published by Bärenreiter as a flute concerto) and the listing wrongly refers to the Marcello as from op. 1. Jim Rich runs the Jefferson Baroque Orchestra in Oregon (though is having difficulty with local authority finances). He visited us in December. CB

CLASSICAL

C. P. E. Bach *Sonatas for Keyboard and Violin* Adrian Butterfield vln, Laurence Cummings kbd 70' 24" Atma ACD 2 2313
H. 502, 513, 514, 535

Here are three unfamiliar (to me, at least) duet sonatas for violin and obligato harpsichord, and a set of variations originally for solo keyboard, to which Bach later added an accompanying violin part. The earliest of the sonatas dates from 1731 – it's a remarkable work for a 17-year old. The other two were written more than thirty years later, and are substantial pieces, mostly in the composer's mature, serious, 'north German' manner although the first movement of H. 513 is a little more galant. The playing is first-rate, intelligent and expressive, and both Butterfield and Cummings obviously have a thorough knowledge and understanding of period style.

The Arioso variations are particularly interesting since they afford a rare opportunity to hear the clavichord in concerted music. A Hamburg newspaper reviewer of Bach's 1777 keyboard trios said that he had heard the composer playing them on his Friederici clavichord accompanied by 'a muted violin and a discreetly played violoncello': the surprisingly good balance on this recording confirms that a suitable clavichord, here a copy of a J. H. Silbermann, is perfectly capable of holding its own in chamber music of this kind. How about a recording of the trios played that way? Richard Maunder

Gebel *Christmas Oratorio and New Year's Oratorio* Monika Mauch, Kai Wessel, Nico von der Meel, Peter Kooij SATB, Cantus Thuringia, Capella Thuringia, Bernhard Klapprott 69' 26" cpo 999 993-2

Georg Gebel the Younger (1709-1753) wrote these tuneful oratorios in 1748 for the musical establishment of Prince Schwarzb-urg at Rudolstadt. They are both multi-movement works of short duration, with felicitous sequences of recitatives, arias (or duets) and chorales, flanked by larger-scale choruses. The small, period-instrument forces are alert and musically, and the well-balanced soloists include in Kai Wessel a male alto of real skill and charm. Sung texts and translations are included, along with lengthy, interesting but crabby unidiomatic notes. The recording is fresh and lively. Peter Branscombe

Haydn String Quartets op 64, nos 1, 3 & 6 *Quatuor Mosaïques* 60' 19" Naïve Astrée E 8886

Once or twice in recent years I have felt the *Mosaïques* to be exaggerating the natural characteristics of their gut-stringed instruments, to the extent that – especially in Mozart – they were endangering the validity of their cause. I'm happy to report that this new issue decisively stills my doubts: the playing is fresh, idiomatic and firmly focused, with Haydn's blend of profundity, wit and tenderness nicely caught. With the earlier CD of the other three quartets, opus 64 is now complete in highly recommendable period-instrument recordings. The booklet wrongly labels the first two movements of the Bb work as *Adagio* and *Menuetto (Allegretto)* rather than *Vivace assai* and *Adagio*. The familiar Astrée card slipcase contains otherwise useful three-language notes, and the recording is clear and well balanced, with the often complex contrapuntal writing making its due impact. Delightful. *Peter Branscombe*

Mozart in Turkey: Die Entführung aus dem Serail Paul Groves Belmonte, Yelda Kodalli Kostanze, Désirée Rancatore Blonde, Lynton Atkinson Pedrillo, Peter Rose Osmin, Oliver Tobias Pasha Selim, Scottish CO & Choir, Charles Mackerras 88'
Opus Arte OA 0891 D DVD

This is a fascinating and delightful DVD. We see and hear much of Mozart's score, impeccably performed by the SCO under Sir Charles Mackerras (complete with the requisite appoggiaturas). The cast is good, if not outstanding. Elijah Moshinsky's production, set in the Topkapi Palace in Istanbul (rather than in the Pasha's country house), is imaginative and deeply satisfying; his comments to camera and in rehearsal are illuminating, his insights often original and seldom cranky. The camera-work is sensitive and beautiful, even if some of the switches from 18th-century palace scenes to the present-day Bosphorus may strike one as questionable. Oliver Tobias's Pasha is a superb and moving assumption, and the cast act as well as sing with style and conviction (none more so than Yelda Kodalli, who in the finale touchingly mimes her gratitude and too-late-found affection for the Pasha).

After some less than happy experiences with the medium I find it doubly pleasing to be able to praise a DVD unreservedly (the gallant SCO may have been disappointed to have to record the score in Dundee's Caird Hall, rather than in Turkey, but the sessions did also give rise to a Telarc CD recording, issued in 2000). There is much to enjoy in this DVD, and I shall often return to it. *Peter Branscombe*

Zimmermann String Quartets op. 3/1-3
Musica Aeterna Soloists 67' 44"
Naxos 8.553952 £

Anton Zimmermann (1741-1781) spent most of his short career as a violinist and Kapellmeister at Bratislava. He deserves, on this evidence, to be named in the same breath as Romanus Hoffstetter (composer of the 'opus 3' set) as an eager follower of the young Haydn's quartet style. These, the first three of a set of six published at Lyons in the mid 1770s, are attractive major-key works in a leisurely five-movement form, with minuettos in second and fourth place; whereas the core of nos 1 and 2 is an *Adagio*, no. 3 opens with its slow movement. These period-instruments performances were recorded as long ago as 1994. So pleasing are they (even if the leader's enthusiasm is occasionally in danger of carrying him away) that we must hope that Musica Aeterna have by now recorded the other half of the set. A folder offers a brief note, and the recording is forward and decisive.

Peter Branscombe

Arias de zarzuela barroca María Bayo S, Les talens lyriques, Christophe Rousset
Naïve B 8885 70' 18"
Music by Boccherini, Hita, Martín y Soler, Nebra

This disc, I fear, only ended up on my desk on account of my living in Spain: I have no first-hand knowledge of the zarzuela – I only know the form takes its name from the Madrid palace where the first such works were performed – and had only heard of two of the composers listed (one of them not even Spanish!) before listening to the disc. Given that the artistes are Les talens lyriques and María Bayo, though, there was never any doubt that the disc would be enjoyable. Both Bayo and Christoph Rousset have a record of roaming off the beaten path and returning with genuine treasures: if the purpose of such music was to entertain and delight, then these performances show that it must have succeeded. There is no pretence of sophistication or erudition: the music is somewhat formulaic. Yet, for all that, it is effortlessly simple, slightly predictable and definitely entertaining. Bayo sings well, decorates with authority and pulls off some impressive coloratura. The orchestra under Rousset is similarly impressive: just listen to the marvellous wind playing and superb strings in the overture to Boccherini's *Clementina* (Track 9) if you need to be convinced. I hope my imminent return to Scotland won't mean I get records of bagpipes instead! *BC*

So that's why Brian has changed his mind and is house-hunting in England instead. Now that John Butt is professor of music at Glasgow, perhaps we should send him any bagpipe recordings that come our way as a change from Bach. *CB*

Music for Lord Abingdon The Hanoverian Ensemble (John Solum, Richard Wyton fls, Monica Gerard vla, Arthur Fiacco vlc)
MSR Classics MS 1099 61' 42"
Abel op. 16/4; JC Bach op. 19/3, Trio in C; Grétry Flute Duets in C & G; Haydn Trios Hob IV:1-4;

Willoughby Bertie, 4th Earl of Abingdon (1740-99), amateur flautist and composer, radical politician, racehorse owner and sometime jailbird, is best known to musical history as the major sponsor of the Bach-Abel concerts in the 1770s; but he was also a friend and patron of other composers such as Grétry and Haydn. It was therefore an excellent idea to record a programme of music associated with the Earl (indeed, most of it was commissioned by him), and some delightful pieces are included, especially the Haydn 'London' trios and J. C. Bach's beautiful quartet for two flutes, viola and cello. The only dud is the rather perfunctory trio in C attributed to Bach, which Warburton's catalogue dismisses as 'impossible to accept as an authentic work'.

The performances are of the straightforward, no-nonsense variety, which on the whole suits the music well although a little more subtlety would have been welcome now and again, and the flutes' intonation is occasionally slightly suspect (this is, of course, an inherent fault of the 'classical' one-key flute, and one can see why extra keys were soon added by the more enterprising London makers). Enjoyable and well worth buying, all the same. *Richard Maunder*

BC has recently edited under his Prima la Musica imprint sonatas for two flutes and continuo by Oliver y Astorga written for the same patron.

VARIOUS

Bach – Bull – Byrd – Gibbons – Hassler – Pachelbel – Ritter – Stroggers Gustav Leonhardt *claviorganum, hpscd* 70' 15"
Alpha 042

This is the second recording I've heard in recent months to feature a claviorganum. Whereas Claudio Brizi (reviewed last October) delighted in frequent changes between organ and harpsichord within a piece, Leonhardt prefers to couple the two manuals, so the pluck of the harpsichord is enfolded by the warmer sound of the bourdon. Leonhardt's programme has the ostensible theme of 'the Italian legacy', but in fact is an eclectic and attractive selection extending from the English virginalists to the late German Baroque. He includes some rarities, such as a tombeau by Christian Ritter on the death of Charles XI of Sweden, alongside more familiar pieces by Pachelbel and Bach.

Leonhardt's playing is reflective, yet in the virginal pieces he also gives the figuration a buoyancy that few other players can achieve. Throughout there is careful rhythmic placing and melodic phrasing, so that even the unaccompanied opening subject of a fantasia has direction and shape. The CD case is adorned with a 1648 picture of the interior of the Bavo Kerk in Haarlem, elucidated by an essay in the booklet. Although the picture is unrelated to the programme, it is most apt for the player, and not just because it is Dutch; the austere magnificence of the church interior and the artist's clarity of perspective all find an equivalent in Leonhardt's magisterial playing. *Stephen Rose*

Dark Harpsichord Music Colin Booth
Soundboard SBCD 203 62' 18"

Music by Andriessen, 3 Couperins, 2 Bachs, D'Anglebert, Mattheson + blackbird & song-thrush

As his contributions to *EMR* have made clear, Colin Booth is a clear and deep thinker about music as well as a much respected player and craftsman. Here all his talents combine to produce an original programme played with unfailing, if understated, taste and skill on an instrument of his own construction. The programme developed from a late evening recital at Dartington and is a creative use of a medium which is all too often simply reduced to either document (*The Complete...*) or showcase (X plays Y). The music is continuous, with improvised, modulatory links where necessary and maintains a mood of sober reflection which is ruffled only by the more flamboyant passages in JSB's violin Chaconne (a superb transcription). As CB mentioned in *EMR* 96, the disc opens and closes with birdsong as did, quite naturally, the Dartington performance. Personally I enjoyed the mood setting qualities of this at the beginning though found that at the end intrusive, lovely though it is when heard on its own. But that does not prevent my giving this issue the strongest of recommendations - it could become cult listening. *David Hansell*

The Convict Harpsichordist Elizabeth Anderson 60' 39" + 18' video on the life of John Grant
Move MD 3242

Music by Bach, Mozart, Paradies, Scarlatti, Soler & Ron Nagorcka

The music can be heard innocently as a harpsichord recital, a welcome mix of Bach, Handel, Scarlatti, Soler and Mozart, and a pleasing change from the usual single-composer discs. It ends with a bit of a shock, though not a nasty one: a

piece for harpsichord and didjeridu with sounds from the Australian bush - why didn't I send this to our didjeridu-playing (or at least -owning) reviewer? The work's theme of relationship with the land and its indigenous people does not link with the main theme of the disc.

The programme was first performed in 2001 at the City of London Festival at the Old Bailey (apparently the only musical event ever staged there), the site of the trial of John Grant in 1803. He was convicted for shooting the guardian of a lady he fancied and sentenced to death, but had enough friends to be transported to Australia instead. He took his harpsichord with him, the instrument becoming the earliest example known on the continent. (Was it the last as well: surely square pianos were easier to export?) The booklet is full of information about Grant, evidently an awkward fellow, but important because many of his letters and journals have survived in a single collection. They do not say exactly what music he took with him, but, apart from Nagorcka's piece, all the music here was published in London between 1791 and 1803: new music might have been fashionable, but there was also a strong interest in music of the past, whether as survival or revival. This is a fascinating disc. *CB*

When Augustus reigned: Christmas Music from the Byzantine Tradition Capella Romana. Alexander Lingas dir 50' 31"
Gagliano Recordings GR 502-CD

I requested this on the assumption that it was a recording of Byzantine music. A couple of tracks are, but it is mostly music for the modern American Greek Orthodox church by Michael Adamis, Frank Desby, Peter Michaelides, John Vergen and Tikey Zes. A couple of early chants are also included. The choir is based in the American north-west, though the conductor lives in Kidlington and has his *EMR* sent to Princeton. I'm not sure what to make of it: I imagine that the music works better in context. Michaelides's Three Christmas Hymns seem to me the items most likely to be taken up by non-orthodox choirs. The booklet is in English and Greek: I'm intrigued that John Vergen isn't transliterated, while Frank Dansby comes out as Photios Despotopoulos. *CB*

The choir is visiting The Byzantine Festival in London (organised by Guy Protheroe, an old friend for whom I played harpsichord in Dido and Aeneas a couple of months ago) on 13 March: see diary

Sonderlich auff Violen: Musiques des XVIIe et XVIIIe siècles pour les violes de gambe Ricercar Consort, Philippe Pierlot dir 144' (2 CDs) (rec 1992-2000)

Ricercar RIC 231

Music by CPE Bach, Funck, Hentschel, J. Graun, A. Kühnel, Nikolai, Posch, Scheidt, Schaffrath, Schenk

An important recording this, bringing together as it does a representative selection of a repertoire mostly unfamiliar, but well worth the attention of viol players, serious students and general listeners. Facsimile editions of Kühnel, Schenk and C.P.E. Bach have been around for more than a decade now, but music of Schaffrath and Graun has only recently come to the attention of scholars and players. This two-disc set, evidently a compilation, also includes music completely new to me by Buchner, Hentzschel and Funck, as well as the above-mentioned composers plus Nicolai (for 3 bass viols) and Scheidt (from *Ludi Musici*). The playing is brilliant throughout, and the music is all enjoyable, some is outstanding. The great D Major sonata of C.P.E. Bach (described in the booklet as in G Major - a minor typo in an excellent summary of the repertoire by Piet Stryckers, who also plays in some of the pieces) receives a powerful performance from Pierlot, whose playing I greatly enjoy and admire. Many will be delighted to discover Schaffrath - a superb galante duo for two bass viols, so far as I know, unpublished, although I have recently played it. The Graun trio in C Major is a delight - obbligato bass viol and harpsichord, with continuo bass viol and harpsichord, and the two harpsichords sounding out of different speakers. Highly recommended.

Robert Oliver

Mustique de Chasse Deutsche Naturhorn-solisten

Dabringhaus & Grimm MDG 605 1188-2

A truly exuberant exposition of the natural horn ensemble, from the French hunting tradition of St Hubert to a 20th century mass by Hofer. These large ensemble pieces sandwich 6 delicate quartets by Anton Richter. The hunting pieces are played with the full open-hearted approach of the famous traditional French ensembles (cf *Les Veneurs de la Meuse*, reviewed in *EMR* some while ago), but without the very wide vibrato - one small concession to listeners of a delicate constitution. However, we do get the massive tone, ripping entries, and unmodified 7th harmonics of the unhandled horn. The result is a thrilling ride. The virtuoso players can also tail the sound away to a virtual whisper. The Richter pieces are played with perfection on hand horns. The Hofer Mass is again on a larger scale, and has the moving addition of 3 alphorns for the Gloria. As a piece, there is a 'surprise' shift of chord, which happens just too often for it to be

so. I must commend the recording engineers – who seldom get a mention in *EMR*: The sound is tremendous: a huge dynamic range and sense of space is rendered, with just a hint of the outdoors Thoroughly recommended. *Stephen Cassidy*

Spring any day now: music of 18th-century Scotland and elsewhere David Greenberg *vlr*, David McGuinness *kbd*, Concerto Caledonia
Marquis 77471 81325 2 9

The term eclectic seems too narrow to embrace the huge range of this CD in which early, traditional, and jazz music and associated instruments not only rub shoulders with each other but blend together. Concerto Caledonia has customarily explored the 18th/19th-century Scottish musical heritage, and in a number of tracks here, tunes recorded by William McGibbon, William Christie, Alexander MacGlashan, Nathaniel Gow, Robert Bremner and Robert Mackintosh are given the uniquely inspired Concerto Caledonia treatment. But it is not as simple as that. While period instruments are used, they are not used exclusively for the 'early' material, nor is this material guaranteed 'authentic' treatment. Thus it is that baroque instruments are heard in Zappa and an electric piano pops up in *Lustie May* (16th-cent Scots). While readers may find this and David McGuinness's rather anecdotal programme notes a trifle disorientating, there is no denying the splendidly energetic approach to the music from 18th-century Scotland and indeed that from elsewhere and elsewhere. And then there are moments of genuine genius such as the emergence of tunes from, as McGuinness calls it, a preparatory *doina* (Scots players would of course have had their own 18th-century equivalent of this traditional Hungarian genre), and the morphing of the psalm tune *Martyrs* into 'O Lustie May' is both witty and profound. Perhaps early music performance has reached the stage where hidebound authenticity has become a restriction on creativity (we recall recent cross-over albums from the Scottish Lutar, Rob MacKillop), but I confess to some discomfort at the blurring of the lines. At any rate, things should be more clearly delineated on eagerly anticipated Concerto Caledonia recordings on Delphian and Linn, although it is to be hoped this is not at the expense of the crackling energy! *D. James Ross*

Tshwaranang (Unite) The Buskaid Soweto String Ensemble 60' 30"
Universal HIPCD 1002 (126)

I've mentioned Buskaid several times before: it's the youth orchestra that the

baroque viola-player Rosemary Nalden runs in South Africa. The ensemble is notable for the wide range of music that it performs and the easy way its members can produce the right sounds and styles for Biber, Mozart and Elgar. Their latest disc isn't really relevant to us, being what the players themselves can make of their own traditions, mostly wedding songs. 'None of this music has been written down', says the introductory note. African music is linked with western classical and popular (but not pop) styles. Listening right through is a bit like an hour of encores, so don't try too many tracks unless you are in the mood. Apart from enjoying the music, this is worth hearing because of the way it is intensely rhythmical without being dominated by drumming: many medieval groups could learn from their subtlety (and perhaps having Nick Parker as producer helps, as does the Snape hall as a recording venue). One doesn't expect all the players of a string orchestra to be able to sing: these can – listen, for instance, to the in-tune thirds on track 6. The delightful booklet notes for each piece are written by a different player. I usually only mention cover designs and group pictures when they look wrong, so I will praise the striking front of the box. All proceeds from the sale of the disc go to Buskaid. *CB*

Some readers will get an advert for the disc with this issue, but there were not enough available for our complete circulation. Further information from jo.churchill@buskaid.co.uk or sonja@buskaid.org.za

BELATED CHRISTMAS

Christmas with the Tallis Scholars
Gimell CDGIM 202 ££

My apologies for not drawing the attention of our present-buying readers to this before Christmas. It had arrived in good time and I had enjoyed listening to it, but in the rush of getting the December issue out, it was ignored. The content is not your normal Christmas-stocking stuff: the second disc has the Sarum *Missa in galli-cantu* (readers may remember discussion of when that took place), some other seasonal chants, and Tallis's *Missa Puer natus est nobis*. Excellent performances, to be snapped up if you don't have them already. The first disc has English 15th- and 16th-century carols, familiar German carols set by H & M Praetorius, and motets by Josquin, Verdelot, Clemens non Papa and Victoria. These are more like what one expects from The Tallis Scholars. It's not my favourite style; but if your tastes differ, you can get an interesting anthology performed by excellent singers at a good price. *CB*

Lindum Records

Premier suppliers of Early Music Recordings

provide recordings
favourably reviewed in
recent issues of Early Music
Review and other journals.

supply any other record you
want subject to availability.

maintain our catalogue and
a list of new releases of
Early Music CDs on our
web site.

Please contact us if you
would prefer these as hard
copy.

One call, fax or email to
**Aldhundegate
House
Beaumont Fee
Lincoln
LN1 1HB
U.K.**

Tel +44 (0)1522 527530

Fax+44 (0)870 0511 958

Email:
info@lindumrecords.co.uk

Web page:
www.lindumrecords.co.uk

LETTER

Dear Clifford

Although not strictly part of *EMR's* remit, you or your readers may be interested in an edition that I have just completed of the two symphonies of Alice Mary Smith (1839-1884), which is now published by A-R Editions, USA. (vol. 38 of the *Nineteenth and Early Twentieth Century* series).

Alice Mary Smith was the first woman in Britain to have composed a symphony, in 1863. This received a trial performance by The Musical Society of London in that year. Her second symphony was written for the Alexandra Palace competition of 1876, but was never submitted, and is the only one of her major works that was never performed. The symphonies show a sure grasp of structure and orchestration, and show some deft writing, and stand up well against the symphonies of other British composers in the mid nineteenth century.

Significantly, she was the only woman composer to have written a considerable number of major orchestral and choral works, as opposed to the traditional drawing-room songs and piano pieces expected of women composers at that time – about thirty major works, as well as a considerable number of part-songs and miniatures.

It would be good to get these recorded, or at the least performed, so if anyone is interested in promoting these, do please get in touch.

Ian Graham Jones

BENDA

I was far too impetuous when I came across the two Benda keyboard sonata volumes that I mentioned in the last issue (p. 5). I was unnecessarily embarrassed at not having reviewed them when they appeared. A couple of weeks later, I was looking for something else and came across another pair of them. These were signed and dated, so I was quickly able to check *EMR's* and find them reviewed in issue 39 (April 1998). Meanwhile, Christopher Hogwood has confirmed that they are out of print, so the publicity is frustrating – though I do have a couple of spare copies. Perhaps I should send them to Russia.

GOD REST YOU MERRY, AGAIN

The pages on *God rest you merry, gentlemen* in the last issue were put together at the last minute since there were problems of layout with what had been intended. Had I thought, I would have remembered the recording of Samuel Wesley's *The Christmas Carol Varied as a Rondo for the Piano-Forte* on a Psalmody CD. This was published around 1815, and is interesting for the way the title singles it out as the Christmas carol. Its pre-Victorian status is confirmed by it being parodied in 1820 as 'a political Christmas Carol' by William Hone (who published a book on folk customs three years later).

OBITUARIES

HAROLD COPEMAN

Harold died at the end of last November. He is known to the world-wide early-music community for his book *Singing in Latin*, which he published himself in 1990 along with *The Pocket 'Singing in Latin'*. These publications were well-timed. Authentic pronunciation (allied to minimal vibrato) was perhaps the singers' equivalent to authentic instruments. In his retirement, Harold (a keen singer but no expert on linguistics) studied a vast amount of historical literature, asked many questions, found a fair number of answers, and stimulated others to follow him.

I first met Harold in 1963, and through the 1960s we performed in the Sacred Music-Drama Society's Christmas and Easter performances, sometimes in duet.* He was, I believe, a senior Civil Servant at the Treasury and had a acquaintance with my Cambridge director of studies, John Stevens, going back to their youth. I visited his house in Wimbledon several times to participate in madrigal and motet singing and kept in touch with him after he moved to Oxford. When John Stevens became Chairman of the Plainsong and Medieval Society, Harold and myself were among the old acquaintances drawn into the organisation. More recently, we met regularly at the Beauchamp Summer School. I thought of him very much like one of those Victorian gentleman who pursued a hobby to such an extent that his expertise was consulted as if it was his profession – rare in these days of specialisation and formal qualification. He had a determination, and I particularly remember him at one Utrecht Festival when he was even more assiduous than me at attending a long day devoted to a complete medieval plainsong Office. CB

* I was reminded again of these productions by the January programme in the TV series *The Sky at Night*, which featured amateur astronomer Donald Franke; he played Herod in some of these performances in the 1960s. The programme itself sketched out the interrelationship of mathematics, music and astronomy, and pointed to the importance of music as showing the early Greek philosophers that, from the fact that they obeyed demonstrable mathematical laws, other natural phenomena also had material explanations.

RON MARDEN

Another subscriber who died towards the end of last year was Ron Marden. I first met him as a theorbo player at a Monteverdi Vespers in Beccles church. It was supposed to be primarily a course, but a few posters had been put up. When we stepped outside to have a break before the run-through, we saw a long queue at the door. I played with him on several other occasions, though he lived somewhere westwards, so our paths didn't often cross. Then he moved to Kolding in Denmark and settled down with a delightful Danish lady. We called to see them once without warning, and were made very welcome. I know nothing about his background, except I believe that the nautical impression given by his beard had some justification. CB