

Early Music

REVIEW

Number 7

February 1995

ISSN 1355-3437

Price £1.50

Editor: Clifford Bartlett

Associate editor: Brian Clark

Administration: Elaine Bartlett

Reviewers:

Angela Bell
Andrew Benson-Wilson
Stephen Cassidy
Julia Craig-McFeely
Margaret Cranmer
Stephen Daw
Ian Graham-Jones
Alastair Harper
Selene Mills
Kah-Ming Ng
Robert Oliver
Noel O'Regan
Graham O'Reilly
Simon Ravens
Brian Robins
D. James Ross
Lynda Sayce
Michael Thomas

- 2 Books and music
- 9 Denis Stevens: Where are the
Vespers of Yesteryear II
- 10 Peter MacDonald on
Monteverdi Vespers
- 12 Julia Craig-McFeely
Fairest Trial
- 14 CD reviews
- 23 Brian Clark:
Not-so-early music
- 24 Letters & Comments

Early Music Review is published on the first of each month except August and January. King's Music, Redcroft, Bank's End, Wyton, Huntingdon, England PE17 2AA
tel +44 (0)1480 52076 fax (0)1480 450821

No, you didn't miss the January issue: there wasn't one. We planned just ten issues a year, making a round subscription price of 10 for £1.00 and giving us the chance to have a break at Christmas and in the summer. Not that we had much of a Christmas break: we spent the time on Purcell instead.

This is our first independent issue away from circulation with *Early Music News*. We are grateful to Andrew Pinnock and the Arts Council for thus helping us to get established. Now we are alone, entirely dependent on our subscribers – and we would welcome an advert or two. Any help in persuading your friends and colleagues to subscribe would be appreciated. Also, if you record or publish anything, please make sure that we receive a copy.

There are over 70 CDs reviewed (including as one the 8-disc Froberger set), plus 20 more in the surveys by Julia Craig-McFeely and Brian Clark. The size of the magazine will vary in accordance with the amount of material coming in. There is likely to be less in the next issue, which will give us space to include a page or two of music again.

We are still getting spin-offs from the 1991 Mozart celebrations (see p. 7). Already criticism has been made of the surfeit of Purcell that 1995 is offering. We knew Mozart well enough for 1991 not to have effected any major revaluation of his music. The lesser works were performed more often, but Symphonies 24 & 28 are still generally reckoned to be less interesting than 25 & 29. But for Purcell we don't have that knowledge. Is *Rejoice in the Lord* always his best anthem, *Music for a while* his best song? 1995 should enable us to widen our experience. Book publishers have prepared themselves well, and there are plenty of recordings; but publishers of his music have been less active and there is not likely to be anything to match the bargain Neue Mozart-Ausgabe in miniature score which we had in 1991. It is a sad reflection on England's attitude to music that publication of one of our greatest composers has such low priority. CB

BOOKS AND MUSIC

Clifford Bartlett

MGG2

The first volume of the new MGG appeared at the end of last year, just in time to leave lying around the house to dip into as a relief from Xmas telly. Unlike its original version (and New Grove), it is being issued in two alphabetic series, with biographical entries separate from subject ones. This seems to be a continental practice that is foreign to the Anglo-Saxon tradition and I am puzzled by it. I can see some advantage in separating off certain areas so that those who do not want to buy the whole 20 volumes can economise. As I suggested with New Grove, I suspect that the majority of those interested in the ethnographical material do not want what is otherwise primarily a dictionary of music in the Western tradition, and vice versa. That would be a much more useful segregation.

One problem of any body of knowledge arranged alphabetically is knowing what heading you need, and more imagination is needed in devising access. There is a map of the whole of Africa in the article *Afrika südlich der Sahara*. Checking other countries beginning with A, there are separate entries for *Ägypten* and *Äthiopien* but not for *Algerien* and *Angola* (*Äthiopien* is alphabeticised under *At...*, not as in MGG1 under *Aet...*). It would help for such maps to indicate which names had articles. Similarly, the article on Germany could begin with a map indicating the towns and regions that have separate entries. One of the strengths of MGG2 (as of MGG1) is its approach by locality, and such a cartographic index would be practical. Some systematic way of listing the instrument articles might also be devised.

MGG1 is notable for the quality and quantity of its illustrations (which enhances its value for the non-German user); it is a great pity their quality suffered so much in the paperback reprint. On the sample of one volume, MGG2 is less lavish. Comparing MGG1 & MGG2 on *Aufführungspraxis*, the former has 11 pictures and 3 diagrams, all apposite, the latter none. So libraries should keep MGG1 accessible. MGG2 has no separate plates, but does include some colour illustrations. Quality is good, though many are very small. The general layout of the page is attractive. The old format of two numbered columns per page is preserved. The type is small but clear, and paragraphs have been properly spaced. The most infuriating aspect of the layout of MGG1 was the cramped work-lists. There are none of those here to check, but ominously the bibliographies are still grouped into paragraphs, though typographically they are much improved. The New Grove practice of listing in chronological rather than alphabetical order has been adopted: a pity, even if it shows how up-to-date an article is (I noticed several 1994 references).

Sadly, though I can get quite a lot out of a paragraph of German, I am not a fluent German reader. I suspect that I will benefit more from the biographical than the subject volumes and I haven't tried to read the more substantial articles here. A translation of the some of them (as Faber did with Blume's MGG1 articles on historical periods) would be of interest. I am fascinated at odd bits of information that I have come across. The article on *Avignon*, for instance, tells us that François Seguin gave concerts in 1836 with music by Palestrina, Bach and Handel. (That turns out to be a revision of the article by Lesure in MGG1, though most articles are new.) There are useful entries on individual manuscripts such as the *Apel-Codex* and *Bauyn*. Overall, the new perspective is as valuable as the individual details. After all, MGG1 began in 1949 and was finished, except for its index, in 1976, while many of the entries in New Grove were written by that latter date. It is also excellent that there is not a monopoly. Inevitably, anglophone speakers will turn first to New Grove, Germans to MGG. But alternative views should be accessible and I hope they will be consulted.

A few entries lacked information I expected to find. That on *Benedicamus Domino* did not touch on the importance of the *Benedicamus* substitute in the history of the carol. Under *Anthem*, the country style (see our last issue) is ignored. *Blasorchester* does not distinguish between English brass and military bands, though there is a paragraph headed 'Gustav Holst und die englische Gruppe'.

What are we to call this new encyclopaedia? New Grove made a big mistake in not providing itself with a simple abbreviation (NG isn't distinctive enough; Grove6 would have been convenient and will probably eventually become standard, especially if the next edition is officially called Grove7 – or will we have *Newer Grove* then *Newest Grove*?) The spine does not betray that it is a new edition at all. I hope 'MGG2' catches on. I hope, too, that the volumes are numbered consecutively 1-20 and that the *Personenteil* does not start at 1 again.

I am in two minds about the value of such massive investments in hard copy. I like books as objects to handle, and enjoy browsing (and also having margins in which to jot down corrections and updates). Knowledge is changing so quickly, but computer technology is improving and cheapening so that I fear that the only effective way of producing the next edition will be electronically, and suspect that this edition should have taken that step. Whether the customer receives the information on-line or on frequently-replaced discs, the updating of MGG and Grove must surely soon be a continual process, with sales

of books replaced by subscriptions to data. The more readable, discursive articles should certainly be published (I suspect that I am fairly normal in not wanting to sit and read much continuous prose on screen), so there is plenty of room for hard-copy spin-offs, but probably not for substantial reference volumes such as this. What a shame!

Die Musik in Geschichte und Gegenwart... Zweite, neubearbeitete Ausgabe herausgegeben von Ludwig Finscher. Bärenreiter & Metzler. 20 volumes (Sachteil 1-8; Personenteil 1-12). Various subscription deals on offer: roughly £120 per vol.

IMAGO MUSICAE

In my days of involvement with the International Association of Music Libraries, I gave support to the establishment of the *Répertoire Internationale d'Iconographie Musicale* to the extent of going along to its business meetings. But my interest was no more sophisticated than a desire to see information collected so that musicians could draw conclusions about organological matters from periods when pictures have survived better than instruments or could examine the constituents of musical ensembles. But musical iconography has taken off independently, and the latest volume (VII, nominally 1990) of its journal *Imago Musicae* (now published by Libreria Musicale Italiana and available in the UK from Rosemary Dooley – address on page 8) is more concerned with the meaning of pictures in themselves.

There seem to be two trends in writing about art. One concentrates on the picture as an object in itself, and discourses on the balance of shapes, colours, etc almost as if it were an abstract design and on the technical means (e.g. patterns of brushwork) by which it was created. The other asks 'what does the picture mean?' It is the latter approach which predominates here. The subject of the essays in this volume is Arcadia and the pastoral: survivals from the Greek and Latin classics; medieval, renaissance and baroque interpretations of that (including the injection of Christian symbolism from David as shepherd and Orpheus as type of Christ); the relationship of these to the folk music; and the use made for wealthy customers of images of folk music as part of a desire for the picturesque. The danger is the tendency of the authors to generalise and to assume, rather than argue, that there always is a meaning to a picture if only you look at it hard enough. However, the various essays do very convincingly show a variety of artistic traditions, and knowledge of these is essential if one wants to draw any musical conclusions from the pictures. The fact that there was often a guitar in 17th-century representations of popular music-making must mean that the instrument was common enough when the convention was established, though not necessarily as common as the pictures might imply. I was amused to see that the convention that tambourines are played by women goes back to 1700 BC: the author does not bring it up to date, but in my recollection it is usually played by lady Salvationists.

MEDIEVAL' PLAYS'

I have put *plays* in quotes, though the title of the book in question does not: *Nine medieval Latin plays* translated and edited by Peter Dronke (Cambridge UP; £30.00). The works included mostly have music, which is not included here. There is, of course, a legitimate history of the publication of libretti. But it would be perverse to publish yet another edition of Da Ponte's Mozart operas if there was only an inaccurate mid-19th century edition of the music available; yet that is the situation with some of the items here. This was not the intention of the book: we are told that the musicologist who was expected to edit the music withdrew at a late stage of the project. That would not be a disaster if a projected companion volume were planned, since the combination of three elements set out as verse, translation and music would have presented problems of format; but no such volume is listed in the series *Cambridge Medieval Classics*, of which this is the first title. Another limitation of the edition links with the account by Thomas Binkley (see the review of the reissue of his *Carmina Burana* record on page 14) of the refusal of the Munich library to let him see the MS (at a time when there was no facsimile available). Dronke complains that he could not get a microfilm of one source of the *Ludus de Antichristo*. But he doesn't say that he was not allowed to look at it in the Austrian abbey that owns it: are scholars now too busy to travel?

But grouses over: this is a most useful volume. It contains the Limoges *Sponsus*, the Freising *Officium stellae*, the Hildesheim *Tres filiae & Tres clerici*, *Verses pascales de tres Maries & Versus de pelegriano* from Vic, the Beauvais *Play of Daniel*, Hildegard's *Ludus Virtutum* and the first *Carmina Burana* Passion Play. All of the texts except Hildegard's (perhaps the feminists have a point) were included in Karl Young's monumental *The Drama of the Medieval Church*. Sixty years on it is possible to produce better editions, and an editor can no longer assume that everyone interested in the subject has fluency in Latin. Moreover, Young's evolutionary arrangement is misleading. I'm surprised that Dronke quotes no criticism of this earlier than Hardison (1965); the first paragraph of my undergraduate essay (1960 or 1961) which I find tucked into my copy of Young mentions the major weaknesses, and I'm sure I wasn't being particularly original.

The Play of Daniel

complete transcription with music
Latin & English texts

edited by W. L. Smolden,
revised by David Wulstan
£2.00

Plainsong and Mediæval Music Society
available from King's Music

A significant source for translations of medieval Latin is the record sleeve and the Hildegard translation originated as such (though has been revised). In view of the greater impact of sound compared with print, it would have been helpful for the edition to have listed and commented on the recordings. The main part of the introduction to each play is devoted to a paraphrase with emphasis on its dramatic qualities. This may ascribe too much sophistication to the medieval writers and audience, but it is healthier than assuming they were dramatically naive. There is concise information about the place, date and sources of each play. The verse forms are analysed. The refusal to put the verse into too regular an accentual straightjacket has implications for music performance, and may discourage the excess tum-ti-turns that some editions have imposed on it, influenced in part by the supposed accentuation of Latin, in part by the dubious application of Notre-Dame rhythmic modes to monophony. The translations are readable but sufficiently literal to help those with a smattering of Latin. They are supposedly in prose, but I liked this couplet of accidental (?) verse:

*We know, in truth, that heaven's gate
Is barred to those who fornicate.*

and later in the same page (67) three of the four lines of a stanza rhyme.

All interested in the subject will need this, and the inclusion of translations should open up an area previously impenetrable to non-Latinists. As an undergraduate, I would certainly have wanted to buy it; but can students afford £30?

WHO WROTE WHAT

The Summer 1994 issue of *The Journal of Musicology* (XII/3) contains a series of articles as a 65th birthday tribute to James Haar. The opening paragraph of one by David Fallows interests me particularly. Musicologists are fond of discussing whether piece A is by composer X or Y. Generally, such discussions only take place if there are conflicting attributions or if there is a gross clash between the style of the piece and that of the composer. But I have always been curious about the statistics: how many pieces securely attributed in one source (which would therefore be accepted as authentic if there were no other sources) have conflicting attributions in equally reliable sources? If one can work out a rough percentage, one can have some idea of the number of unique ascriptions that are likely to be wrong. Fallows begins his paper 'Dunstable, Bedyngham and *O rosa bella*' with the information that of the French songs from c. 1415 to 1480, 29% of those in more than one source have conflicts of ascription. (In fact, if we allow for some multiple identical ascriptions being from sources deriving from each other, the percentage might well be higher.) Therefore, it is possible that we should assume at least that degree of error in the ascriptions in unique sources. The article is interesting too because, although its conclusion (that Bedyngham, not Dunstable, was the composer) has generally been accepted, the argument and

documentation was given orally in Chicago in 1973 but is only now published. Josquin is particularly vulnerable to diminution of his output by the questioning of attributions, and another work convincingly to bite the dust is the six-voice *Ma bouche rit* thanks to Lawrence Bernstein's inquisition. Margaret Bent provides useful information on Aaron's interpretation of accidentals in various passages he quotes, mostly from Petrucci publications. Other articles too are of considerable interest and it is an issue that is well worth buying (\$9.00 + post from University of California Press, Berkeley, CA 94720).

GERMAN RENAISSANCE

Music in the German Renaissance: Sources, Styles, and Contexts edited by John Kmetz (Cambridge UP; £45.00) contains 14 essays, mostly on detailed matters. (The punctuation of the title follows the book: am I right in detecting a tendency for the increased use of a comma before 'and'? If so, why?) Perhaps the most interesting article is one by Jessie Ann Owens on an isolated sheet containing a motet by Isaac in parts in his own hand which seems to have been his composing copy and suggests very strongly that the work was composed without any sketch in score. We are learning the virtues of singing from parts: perhaps the next stage is to do counterpoint exercises thus. Another manuscript study by the volume's editor almost looks over the shoulder of the thirteen-year-old Basilius Amerbach as he receives musical instructions from Christoph Piperinus in 1546-7. The reconstruction of individuals' libraries occupies several essays; it is also the subject of one in the *Journal of Musicology* issue mentioned above. The general reader might find the essays on the Tenor Lied by Martin Staehelin and on Lied and Madrigal by Ludwig Finsher of interest, as well as Robert Lindell's discussion of music and patronage at the court of Rudolf II, which was more than is generally believed. Keith Polk surveys the role of German instrumentalists elsewhere in Europe from 1450-1510. Martin Just's article on simple chant-based polyphony seems to miss several points. I'm no expert, so won't go into details, but I am very suspicious of his remarks on performance.

PURCELL – life

The number of books on Purcell due in the next few months already outnumber those of the last half-century. There has certainly in the past been a strange dearth of them, so this is no bad thing, provided that they are competent and interesting. In our last issue, I praised Robert King in comparison with a 'disastrous attempt by a professional author'. At the time, I was not aware of *Henry Purcell* by Maureen Duffy (Fourth Estate; £17.99). Duffy is a professional author, so readers may well have assumed that I was alluding to her. In fact, I was merely trying to avoid naming Margaret Campbell, whose *Henry Purcell: Glory of his Age* was such a disappointment. Maureen Duffy is a novelist with a particular interest in London and its history. One of the strengths of her book is a deeper awareness of

the historical background than comes from those whose main interest is music. I hadn't for instance, realised that publication of *Harmonia Sacra* had politico-religious implications. Duffy is also good at linking the many people who appear in the narrative. This is a technique which can be overdone, but with so little hard biographical evidence, it helps to bring some idea of Purcell's place in his society. The names of Purcell's relatives occur frequently throughout the book; it would have been fairer on the reader to have been a little more explicit that she is taking her own line on Henry's ancestry, and a family tree would have made it easier to place the various references to other Purcells that abound through the book.

Duffy gives in her Prologue enough information about herself to show her as an enthusiastic amateur musician. There are benefits in this; she manages to express enthusiasm for his music in a more natural way than Robert King that may well encourage the general reader to explore the music in greater depth. But there are also disadvantages. Her knowledge of other music of the period and of the period just before Purcell seems slight, and for comparisons she slips back to Monteverdi and Dowland; Purcell certainly knew some music by the former, but the comparison is too vague to be helpful. A certain number of odd statements could have been avoided had the book been read before publication by someone with greater musical expertise. How do four people divide up an eight-voice canon and sing it (p. 5)? Orlando Gibbons was hardly an Elizabethan composer (p. 10): he was only 20 when James came to the throne. There is not necessarily any relationship between the increased appearance of an ornamentation sign in the notation and the frequency of its use in performance (p. 133), and the remark quoted on the same page that all notes marked with an asterisk 'are to be sung as demi-quavers' is purely of typographic significance. The caption to the last plate 'Sackbut, being replaced during the period by the trumpet' is odd. Why surprise at Purcell's inclusion of an organ into his music (p. 166)? While we are not thoroughly conversant with the conventions prevailing at the time, there is little evidence that Purcell showed any originality in this respect. She still believes that there were alterations to *The Fairy Queen* requiring a considerable amount of work by the composer in 1693. She does, however, take on board the idea that *Dido and Aeneas* was not written for the Chelsea girls' school (about which she gives more information than other Purcell books). She also provides information relevant to the controversy over Queen Mary's funeral music; although assuming that the Purcell's earlier Funeral Sentences were probably sung, she has earlier in the book pointed out that there had not been a State funeral for a monarch since the death of James I. Bruce Wood's suggestion that Morley's music was used is therefore reasonable, not because it was traditional but because there was no tradition, so precedent was sought from the last occasion 70 years previously.

It is not easy to make a clear choice between Duffy and King. The latter reads more fluently, especially in the

opening chapters, but Duffy presents a more rounded picture and has come up with some unfamiliar information. Thames and Hudson have produced a far more attractive book and the quality of its illustrations sways the balance towards King. Neither author can really bring Purcell the man to life, since the information is far too scant. It would be interesting to read a historical novel about him, but I suspect that his life was primarily in his music and we can only know the man through that.

PURCELL – works

Peter Holman's *Henry Purcell* (Oxford UP; £30.00 hb, £9.95 pb) is in the series *Oxford Studies of Composers*; this would once have implied that Purcell was a player from the second eleven, but the series is now upgraded and this is fatter than earlier examples with 250 pages. The great merits of the book derive from the fact that the author knows the music well both as scholar and as performer and similarly knows the music by Purcell's predecessors and contemporaries. He is thus able to relate Purcell's music to the conventions and genres of the time in a way that is more subtle and precise than most other discussions of it. He can discriminate between the good and less good, both within Purcell's oeuvre and between that and the output of his contemporaries, yet does not under-rate the less good. It is not an easy book to read; a lot of music is covered in a short space. But it is as clear as its subject allows and perseverance is rewarding. It provides context and evaluation: two vital elements which so many books on music fudge. This may safely be bought now without fear that any of the forthcoming Purcell books will make it redundant.

1539 WEDDING

Musiche fatta nella nozze dello... Cosimo de Medici e... Leonora da Tolieto (1539) is a fascinating publication, giving not only the music performed at various parts of the wedding festivities but quite precise details of instrumentation for what would otherwise appear to be unaccompanied madrigals, plus one motet. Andrew C. Minor and Bonner Mitchell produced a fine edition (University of Missouri Press, 1968), though its small landscape format was impractical for performance). I copied parts for David Munrow to use at a summer school in 1970 and can testify from that experience that the music is ideal for the everyone-bring-his-crumhorn sort of early-music course and the simplicity of *Bacco, bacco e u o e* resulted in it being known by heart and sung by various groups wandering round the grounds of Dartington Hall. (I also, incidentally, have a copy with ornamentation added by Michael Morrow.) I don't think the quality of the music is as high as the 1589 *Intermedi* (the only other comparable publication) – Corteccia, the main 1539 composer, was no Marenzio; but it is still enjoyable.

There is a facsimile available from Alamire, but a practical edition has long been required, and this has now been

produced by Martin Grayson and George and Rosemary Bate; the imprint is Alfredston Music and it is available from Jacks, Pipes and Hammers, Bridge View, Garrigill, Alston, Cumbria, CA9 3DO (0434 381583). The complete package of score and parts costs £29.00, the score alone is £12.00 (ALF1), and there are five sets of parts, arranged by numbers of voices rather than in the order of the score; these include C-clef alternatives and are underlaid, so can be used by singers as well as players. Strangely, the 6-voice set includes a score, the others don't. A tablature lute part will appear later. The parts are clearly legible, though high-speed organisation of ad hoc groups would be facilitated by printing the part names in big letters at the top of the page. There are limitations in the computer programme used. It is odd that there is no treble clef with an 8 below it, so a clumsy makeshift is used. The underlay is in too insubstantial a typeface, though looks better in the parts than the score. Bar-lines would be less obtrusive if they broke between each stave. It is very confusing to use the modern convention of a semibreve = a bar's rest for music in unreduced note values with long bars; I had that problem with the first version of the programme I use, but surely current systems can handle breve rests?

This is a most useful edition. There is a concise introduction setting the music into its original context, and the texts are translated. Original clefs and ranges are given for each piece, plus a suggested metronome mark. The original instrumental specifications should have been quoted: players are likely to be interested in the precise nomenclature. The music does, however, work well in a variety of scorings, and the editors are to be congratulated on their enterprise.

CONTINO MOTETS

Contino (no, not a misprint for the eponymous inventor of the figured bass, who, as all schoolboys know, was Cifra) is a name I must have come across, both in connection with the Santa Barbara rite at Mantua and as a teacher of Marenzio. But I have no image of him or his music in my mind so was interested to receive his first book of five-voice motets (or *Modulationes* as the 1560 publication was called). These are transcribed by Richard Scherr, the expert on the incompetence of the Papal singers (see last November's *Early Music*) as vol. 25 of Garland's *Sixteenth Century Motet* series. The virtues and weakness of the series are now well-known. The music is moderately interesting; it perhaps would be worth programming a motet or two in a Palestrina concert to show the style of unremitting polyphony that he was reacting against. While there may be a certain amount of expressiveness in the melismata on important words, the general effect of a large number of incomprehensibly overlapping texts makes the Tridentine desire for reform understandable. Contino was in fact in charge of the choir in attendance for part of the Council, so one wonders whether his music had a specific effect on the assembled dignitaries.

THE VIOL DISCOVERED

Jean-Louis Charbonnier's *Découverte de la Viole de Gambe* (Zurfluh/UMP; £16.50) is, among tutors available for the elementary viol-player (e. g. by Francis Baines, August Wenzinger, Alison Crum) the one most suitable for a child, resembling tutors for 'normal' instruments whilst remaining perfectly appropriate for the viol. It is for the treble, and introduces the instrument with step-by-step 'discoveries', progressing from the open strings to simple music, staying within the range bounded by the #f of the top string. Its virtue lies not only in the material itself (intelligent ordering of progress and good exercises) but in its appearance. The hand-written text and music (calligraphy by Nathalie Le Gaouyat) with decorative flourishes based on French music engraving of the 17th-18th centuries, is very attractive, and is supplemented by mostly delightful drawings of fanciful and amusing viol-playing predicaments by Anne-Marie Sonneveld. Charbonnier (tutor to the Stars) assumes that a teacher will oversee the pupil's work and provides well-chosen exercises, suitable popular tunes (*Frère Jacques*, *Au clair de la lune*, *Ah vous dirai-je Maman*) and treble/bass arrangements of 16th-century chansons and dances. My points of disagreement are minor: I would not introduce slurs at this level, and would prefer fingering to be 1 2 3 rather than 1 2/3 4 – after all, beginner violinists can do it from the start. Charbonnier, as in his other tutors, manages totally to exclude English music, though this should not deter an English student, nor should the brief French text. The price might cause more hesitation (42p per page), but the book is fun to look at and very practical, imparting enthusiasm with flair.

Robert Oliver

TELEMANN

A few weeks ago Brian Clark (violin), Andrea Oliver (flute and oboe), Robert Oliver (gamba) and myself (hpscd) assembled to give a practical test to the latest in the ongoing series of Telemann trio-sonatas that Amadeus has been producing. Sadly, after the first few, we were tempted to a change of style and tried some Couperin instead. The leap in the quality of musical invention was immediately apparent, though Telemann did later redeem himself when we tried a Paris quartet or two. So none of the newly-published works get a four-star accolade. They are appealing in themselves, but do not represent Telemann at his best, and are maybe better used for limbering up or relaxation rather than serious study. They are, however, gratifying and agreeable to play. [For 2 violins, some with wind alternatives, & bc: no. 7 in g, BP 476; 21 in G, BP 2461; 22 in g, BP 2319; 58 in A, BP 2341; 68 in D, BP 2583. For flute, gamba (with alternative editorial parts for viola) & bc: 54 in g, BP 786; 77 in c, BP 2506. Prices are around £8.00 from Schott.]

Two further items from the same composer and publisher are the 12 *Fantasien* for unaccompanied violin (BP 365; £7.95) and a Concerto in D for horn, 2 violins & bc (BP

2402; £13.80). I am puzzled why the source of the violin fantasias should be an edition of 1926 rather than the Berlin MS, so the Bärenreiter edition is probably a safer recommendation (I haven't been able to check it against the MS: the photocopy I had when writing the notes for Maya Homburger's excellent recording isn't on the right shelf.) The Concerto is a chamber, not an orchestral work, a useful addition to the limited chamber repertoire for the horn; a virtuoso player is needed if a natural horn is used.

HANDEL INSTRUMENTAL

Just as recording companies all want to have an authentic set of the Brandenburgs, so publishers feel obliged to have their own versions of such standard repertoire as the Handel recorder sonatas. The new one from Amadeus is by that skilful pasticheur Winfried Michel, though here only keyboard realisation is required. This is done more elaborately than usual; I'm torn between suggesting that it will be useful for the keyboard player who cannot read the bass alone and the alternative, that to react with it and decide whether it is helpful under any particular set of circumstances you must already be an experienced player. The prospective purchaser has an immediate problem, in that there is no list of contents and the works are given neither the old opus or the new HWV numbers. There is not even a running number in the edition itself. The six works included are: in g (HWV 360, op. 1/2), F ((HWV 369, op. 1/11), a (HWV 362, op. 1/4), C (HWV 365, op. 1/7), Bb (HWV 377, 'Fitzwilliam' 1) and d (HWV 367a, op. 1/9 transposed). The English introduction has a curious comment that the basses were conceived *at* rather than *for* the keyboard; an unfigured bass part (presumably for cello) is, however, provided. I think I will stick with the Faber edition I have used for many years, which has a little more music for less money, though this is perfectly satisfactory. (Amadeus/ Schott; BP 360; £13.75)

Koopman's op. 7 has reached No. 5 (Breitkopf PB 5215; DM26.00 for score, with all parts being available for sale OB 5215). It is a work I remember with affection as the first piece of Handel that I ever studied. I'm sure Beethoven must have known the *Andante*; I can never hear 'Seid umschlungen Millionen!' without being reminded of it, but others don't hear the connection. The fact that the final Gavotte is only from later sources and could be considered optional might have been made more explicit, but otherwise this is a fine edition.

An unequivocal link between Handel and Beethoven is the Overture to *Solomon*; Breitkopf has published Beethoven's arrangement of the Fugue for string quartet (KM 2268; DM18 for score & parts). The introduction by Willy Hess provides an interesting list of polyphonic pieces copied by Beethoven but is vague on the date of this arrangement: surely the paper and/or handwriting can be dated more precisely than 1798-1817? I suspect that its interest is more academic than practical and the fact that it exists is what really matters; but this is a good, playable edition.

RECORDER BIBLIOGRAPHY

The Recorder: a guide to writings about the instrument for players and researchers by Richard Griscom and David Lasocki (Garland; \$70.00) is a valuable compendium of information. It is thorough and well arranged, and its summaries are themselves useful sources of information, making it worth browsing through even if you have no intention of chasing up every reference it contains. It is up to date: I was surprised to find my name in the index for a contribution to a book that is not even advertised yet. The range of books and articles included is wide, though the authors have avoided material that is likely to be inaccessible. There is probably not much of value in the more unusual languages yet, but one could argue that as East European musicology develops, summaries of articles in Czech and Polish would be more useful than those of articles one can easily consult. A particularly valuable and unexpected feature is the inclusion of early treatises and tutors, with a description of their contents as well as modern studies and editions of them. One naturally expects the ultimate in professional competence in anything with Lasocki's name on it, and the user will not be disappointed.

TOSI/AGRICOLA

Tosi's *Opinioni de' cantori antichi e moderni 1723* is a valuable source for Italian vocal practice of his time, or a little before (since his tastes were old-fashioned). The English version by Galliard was reissued a few years ago by Stainer and Bell. In Germany it was translated by Johann Friedrich Agricola in 1757, 'adding notes and comments which have caused the translation to be regarded as a landmark in the teaching of singing' (to quote New Grove). A facsimile was published in Leipzig in 1966, and this has been reissued, along with commentary by Kurt Wichmann, by Breitkopf und Härtel (£22.85). This is a basic work which should stay in print, and the new version is neater and better produced than I remember the 1966 one being.

MOZART

Two excellent new Mozart books are derivatives of the 1991 celebrations. Christoph Wolff's *Mozart's Requiem* (Clarendon Press, Oxford; £27.50) is translated from a German publication of that year and is excellent value for a musicological hardback. It contains a chapter on the history of the work, another on the music itself, an assemblage of the early documents (in English only, since the originals can be seen in the German edition) and an edition (based on NMA but corrected) of what was left by Mozart, to which is added the bare bones of Süssmayr's completion. Wolff is more willing than Maender to believe that Süssmayr's setting of the words (though not the orchestration) may preserve something Mozartian. Wolff's study of Süssmayr's work on the horn concertos shows how he seized any surviving Mozartian material and makes it likely that he would have used any scraps available. His description of Süssmayr's *Requiem* as showing 'intermittent flares of

brilliant musical ideas, imperfectly integrated because the composer lacked the technique to master them' explains the technical incompetences so thoroughly surveyed by Maunder yet allows for the feeling that the music is better than one would expect from unaided Sussmayr.

Wolff writes interestingly on the tradition which Mozart seems self-consciously to have been using. I know Handel's *Funeral Anthem* well, but it existed in a different compartment of my mind and I had never thought of it in the same context as the opening of the *Requiem*; but once Wolff points it out, the relationship is obvious. The idea of Mozart deliberately referring back to an earlier funeral piece, with its built-in chorale reference, is fascinating; I wonder whether the introduction of the *tonus peregrinus* was an attempt at universality by using both catholic and protestant material? (It would have been intriguing if Mozart had later in the work alluded to the music which Handel parodied from the *Ecce quomodo moritur justus* by an earlier inhabitant of Vienna, Handel/Gallus.) The Handel and Mozart would make a good pairing for a concert or CD (do players get doubling fees for playing baroque and classical in the same concerts?)

On Mozart edited by James M. Morris (Cambridge U. P. £35.00, pb £10.95) contains a dozen contributions, mostly lectures given at the Woodrow Wilson Centre in Washington in 1991 by a variety of experts, not all musical. They are accessible to the general reader, though there has been a certain amount of beefing up with the addition of footnotes, etc, which presumably explains the delay in publication. Two later papers are added, an introduction by Denis Donoghue on how various philosophers and writers have approached Mozart and a fascinating account by Wolff entitled 'The challenge of blank paper' on how Mozart got on with the job of composing. The volume as a whole is valuable in representing how we see Mozart in 1990s; rather boring for its self-conscious correction of the older image of Mozart, making one even more certain that, if the old Mozart was created in the image that was then attractive, so the new view is equally likely to be ephemeral. Am I alone in having avoided *Amadeus* so not needing the false image it gives of Mozart to be so often corrected? Nevertheless, even if writers in 2056 may be less obsessed by how much Mozart earned, it is interesting to think that Mozart would have been among the top 5% of wage-earners had he been alive in the USA in 1989: not quite a Lloyd Weber (though the calculations do not allow for the royalty payments Mozart would have received were he a successful composer in 1989), but probably better off than most full-time composers. This is a comparatively painless way of catching up on how Mozart scholars are thinking (there are also contributions from psychologists on child prodigies and geniuses), with minimal jargon. *Topos* is explained, but not the now-ubiquitous *closure*. I am also puzzled by the title *Mozart as a working stiff*. My fairly recent Webster gives the same meaning as English English, but I can't make sense of 'Mozart as a working corpse'. A slang glossary is needed.

THE CLAVICHORD

De Clavicordio is a substantial, A4 publication of 287pp and 24 plates available for the reasonable sum of Lire 40,000 including post from Istituto per i Beni Musicali in Piemonte, Via Ottavio Revel 15, I-10121 TORINO (TO), Italy. It contains the proceedings of a conference on the clavichord held at Magnano in September 1993: congratulations on such rapid publication. Funding for the publication came in part from Barclays: I must show it as a precedent to my bank manager! Congratulations too to what seems to be a very small town for hosting an event of this nature. All papers are in English, with Italian summaries. They cover a wide variety of topics, mostly organological rather than interpretative (though at the conference itself, the performances would have redressed the balance). There are far too many of them for specific comments, though one general point did occur to me. Perhaps the next conference might like to draw up a standard specification and checklist for describing extant instruments: comparison might have been easier if, for instance, Tagliavini and Steiner had been able to set out their data in comparable form. It seems that the phase of the moon at the felling of the wood is significant (p. 106), or was that a joke? Exchange of information is important, so the efficient publication of this conference is a model to others. While there is much to be said for the swapping of data on e-mail networks (I was interested to hear from David Rubio at a Christmas party that violin research has become much more open since makers started exchanging information thus), cheap publication enables others to benefit from the event, and even those present will prefer a permanent publication to transient notes and a bundle of handouts. I enjoyed one phrase. 'Charles Burney, the portable English critic', though don't know what it means. Christopher Hogwood's point about playing songs on the clavichord (p.188) would be strengthened had he emphasised that they were printed on two staves so, apart from the words, did not look very different from keyboard music. Sadly, the concluding comedy, *The True History of the Birth of the Clavichord*, set in the Abbey of St Dolmetsch in 1385AD, does not amuse in sober print.

This is an appropriate point for drawing attention to the British Clavichord Society: details are available from Sheila Barnes, 3 East Castle Road, Edinburgh EH10 5AP, tel 0131 229 8018.

Rosemary Dooley has pointed out that I quoted the members' price for the RMA Research Chronicle last month: the price for non-members is £22.50; they are available from her at Crag House, Witherslack, Grange-over-Sands, Cumbria LA11 6RW (tel 05395 52286; fax 05395 52103). Rosemary is also the UK agent for the Libreria Musicale Italiana.

WHERE ARE THE VESPERS OF YESTERYEAR II

Denis Stevens

Thank you, Clifford, for the splendid quote in your Vespers review (*EMR*, November 1994): 'At the price of £7.95, none of the existing editions can compete.' And so say all of us. We don't need a new title for this article-review, because I am simply reusing an earlier title of mine (*Musical Quarterly* XLVII, 1961, 315-330). Faced with the appalling prospect of *Jaws 2* and *Rambo 3* I see no reason why we can't continue discussing a top-ten hit ad infinitum. The year 1961 saw my first edition of eight works from the Vespers (published by Novello), and of its first two performances in Westminster Abbey under my direction. Prior to that I had heard only the versions by Leo Schrade, Walter Goehr and G. F. Ghedini. The Ghedini (Magnificat only) was done at the Edinburgh Festival of 1950 by the Orchestra and Chorus of La Scala Milan. Ending my review (*Music Survey*, III, 1950, 123) I wrote: 'It is to be hoped most sincerely that the Italians will one day learn to interpret their musical heritage in the right way.' Little did I know that 15 years later I would conduct virtually the same forces in Milan – using, I may say, under faint pressure, Walter Goehr's edition.

Thereby hang several tales. I had worked with Goehr on *Orfeo* in 1952 when I was in charge of Early Music for the BBC Third Programme. He showed remarkable insight, both in accepting the edition I had prepared and in realizing that the closing acts needed help from an arranger-conductor, which he most certainly was. But his version of the Vespers was Mahlerian. Now did you know that both Busoni and Mahler were in Vienna in 1885? The Italian was working on the manuscript of *Ulisse* in the Vienna State Library, while Mahler, conducting the chorus in Italian repertoire at the Carlstheater, began to take an interest in early Italian music through conversations with Busoni.

There was, and still is, a complete set of the 1610 publication in the Gesellschaft der Musikfreunde. My teacher, Egon Wellesz, studied in Vienna at a slightly later date, but knew of Mahler's interest although he never actually saw the score. This came to light shortly after Mahler's death, having been rescued from a summer-house at the Klagenfurt end of the Lake of Portschach. Since it was not an original work by Mahler, his widow Alma took little notice of it, lending it to one of his friends. Goehr, too, studied in Vienna, where he came to know the owner of the Mahler version, at which he took a long and careful look. Hence the Goehr version, which certainly bears a Mahlerian imprint.

Let's sum up so far. Mahler-Goehr was based on the original edition in Vienna. Ghedini's was based on Malipiero. So was Redlich's version (Universal Edition, first performed in Zürich in 1935, published 1949). I wrote a

review of the edition (*Music Survey*, II, 1949, 106-7) in which I pulled my punches, since Redlich was hovering round the editorial board. A few years later I received a letter from Dr. H. C. Robbins Landon, informing me that he and a colleague had checked the Redlich version against the original in Vienna and together they had discovered several thousand errors. I still have the letter, but wild musicologists would not drag it out of me.

The Schrade edition was also Malipiero, but with a mild Teutonic face-lift. I produced it for the BBC in the early 1950s (Anthony Lewis conducting) and, in due course, it became another egg in the Lyre-Bird nest. It was rather uneventful apart from the Sonata, which we used to call the *Sonata sopra Sancta Margareta*, because Mabel Ritchie had to sing the whole thing *a piena voce* over the welter of an enormous orchestra. It was, however, top-sided like all other performances then or now, since no-one has tumbled to the fact that Monteverdi, in his youth, was a viola player. He would therefore have been unlikely to suppress his own instrument. Of course, as any true connoisseur knows, he suppressed violas in his publications, knowing full well that they would be supplied in performance. Note the 'three-part' sections of his ballets, which (notwithstanding the notation) were always played in five parts to conform with the French ballet tradition.

Pisendel once asked Vivaldi why he didn't figure his basses. 'Questi sono per li coglioni' came the answer. 'They're for ... the idiots.' Monteverdi, had he not been so polite, would have said the same thing about people who leave out his viola parts, as for instance in the Sonata.

And now we turn to Clifford. 'Taking a cue from Peter Holman, Stevens decides...' No, Clifford! I took no cue from anyone other than Monteverdi himself, whom I know rather well through having translated and edited all of his letters and through knowing and performing his music for the past 50 years. Editing the ballet *Movete al mio bel son* for Faber Music in 1967 (dedicated, incidentally, to Egon Wellesz), I made use of a five-part dance from Book 7 as the centre piece. In *Early Music* XIV, 1986, 358-366, I pointed out that the ballet *De la bellezza* should also have a full five-part string compliment. I had 'decided' on a comparable quintet for the Sonata long before Holman's article appeared in 1993 and, indeed, the music was with Novello's engravers by 1990. I did actually write to him, asking permission to quote from his article, but, since he had the courtesy not to reply, I quoted him anyway.

I am certain now that the only true key to a genuine Monteverdi spirit in performance and recording comes

from a careful study of his letters. In this connection, I am pleased to say that my revised and augmented version of the 1980 Faber edition is due this spring from the Clarendon Press. Nothing more than the Letters provides such penetrating insight into Monteverdi's assessment of voices, his feeling for instrumental colour and his highly personal views about performance. A distinguished English colleague of mine at Columbia, the late Dr. W. T. H. Jackson of the Department of Germanistics and Comparative Literature, gave me a copy of his remarkable book on the *Tristan* of Gottfried von Strassburg (*The Anatomy of Love*, New York, 1971). On the flyleaf, he wrote: 'Amice, si in hoc libro res litterarias quaeris, invenies musicas, si musicas, litterarias. Harmonia corona operis est, harmonia regina caelorum.' And so with Monteverdi. If you seek his life and letters, you find his music; if music, you find the letters.

The other Vespers? There are many, of course: one might even say too many. All rely on Malipiero, and they take over his misprints. Who was Malipiero? I can tell you: an Italian composer who put his name to the Letters in 1930, although they were actually 'transcribed' (if that is the

word) by two old ladies whose knowledge of palaeography was more or less negligible. Malipiero also put his name to the collected edition of Monteverdi's music, but on the same principle: the entire work was done by American students and Italian composers looking desperately for employment. I knew personally three of these people and there are many more.

If Malipiero is a fiction, those who follow him are asking for trouble. Monteverdi dealt exclusively with professional musicians, not with fresh-voiced young amateurs straight out of a Camford college chapel. The travesties of Monteverdi that are now not merely permitted but even raved about have no relationship whatever to the choral-orchestral sound of his day. It doesn't matter how many CDs, cassettes, films or broadcasts these latter-day prophets have made. They are all false: and one day, they will be shown to be false. It doesn't matter, dear Clifford, which arpeggio the organist plays, or whether the chorus sings *Santa* or *Sancta*. What matters is the spirit of the music and that has now been drowned in the dropsy of the early music business. *Crescit indulgens sibi dirus hydrops*.

Peter MacDonald on Monteverdi Vespers

Having read the informed and extensive review of Denis Stevens' recent edition of Monteverdi's Vespers (EMR, November 1994), I would be grateful for the opportunity to comment on a few points raised therein.

Anyone who knows Venice will also know what the Virgin meant to that City from earliest times and, while during the 17th century, as we know, St Mark's was able to follow its own particular liturgy, the theology and traditions of the early Aramaic interpretation of the *Katabasis*, the Chalcedonian formula and the eventual introduction and codification for the Church by Origen, could not be ignored; the theology of the Divine Offices (even those so-called extra-liturgical) had the foregoing authority. And here we come to two textual matters and in particular *Nigra sum*. The text is a text from the *Song of Songs* (as the Vulgate has it: *The Song of Solomon* is that of the Authorized Version). In his review, Clifford Bartlett refers to part of a phrase as 'pretty girl'. Now, the Hebrew text is not in doubt; the phrase is plural, and denotes those to whom in the *Song of Shulammit* is speaking. The Vulgate is therefore correct. The part-books may be influenced by the standard allegorical interpretation which takes the maiden as a type of Church. If so, then the translation 'girl' is singularly crass: 'daughter of Jerusalem' implies the authentic citizen and inheritor of the heavenly Jerusalem, superseding the Jewish heirs of the earthly city. But the rendering can in no way be derived from the original, and may be an ignorant copyist's mistake or 'improvement'. The 'black', in the allegorical interpretation, can be referred to the Gentile character of the Church. Of course,

the allegorical interpretation goes just as easily with the correct reading: 'daughter of Jerusalem' then = the Jews who despise the Gentile Christian. Denis Stevens rightly keeps the plural (as does the Russian Church: *Ya smogla, ho kraceeva, o docheree Yerusaleema ... minya ee preeval v cvayoo cpalnyu*). In Clifford Bartlett's fine edition, further on in the same motet, he leaves out 'me' in the 'introduxit me', although he gives a footnote. This omission can only be a mistake. There is no separate word in Hebrew for 'me' as the object of the verb; there is simply a suffix added to the part of the verb. It may just have been overlooked. Stevens, knowing his Italianate-Latin, elides the vowels: 'introduxit me in cubiculum'. Further, in grammar we have what is known as Topicalisation. This is a device in which the first element stressed (the subject or the object) is uttered first: it is then followed by the normal sentence, in which the topicalised item is usually represented by a pronoun if it is the object. Here the 'me' is an example of the anteposition of the object, allowing the sentence to begin with the 'topic'. We saw this above in the Russian 'minya ee preeval' and it is present in the German and French Bibles of the time: '... und hat mich in sein Gemacht geführt': 'et m'a amenée avec lui'. By the elision of the vowels, Denis Stevens has preserved the integrity of the vulgate text and symbolism of the Love between Christ and the Church which was the reason for the inclusion in the liturgy for Marian feasts of texts from the *Kethubhim* (there is a similar text from Proverbs introduced for the Immaculate Conception of the B. V. M.); hence the rather long preamble on this important matter. The background to the liturgical tra-

dition would have been known to Monteverdi, who was also highly regarded as a valuable consultant by the Chapter of Milan Cathedral. At Anfrित्रite, once its famous clash with the papacy had ended (1606-7) and Paolo Sarpi was dead (1623), a closed ruling class would make it clear that this was not a place for intellectual non-conformity. (The mistakes in the part-books are either a *hapax legomenon* [sorry – we haven't sorted out Greek type yet] in the Monteverdi corpus or a case of *dormitat Homerus*.)

As to the matter of forces employed, I cannot wholly endorse the suggestions for the scoring of the bass line. The trouble with frequent changes of instruments (organ, harp, harpsichord, chitarrone) is that it produces a restlessness which is inappropriate. Stevens allows his trombones to play in the Gloria Patri. There is evidence for this in Germany and from Bologna. The maestro di cappella at San Petronio, Girolama Giacobbi, writes in the preface to his 1609 collection of Psalms: 'as the numbers of singers and players abound, the judicious Chapel Master may, in his own way, augment the said psalms by adding other choirs, both high and low, in accordance, however, with the quality of the place and the quantity of the singers and instrumentalists'.

As to the matter of antiphon, all a choirmaster would have to do would be to chose from the great number of the Marian antiphons to match the tones in which the Psalms and Magnificat were set. Stevens appears to know this.

Coming to the matter of continuo, Clifford Bartlett mentions 'messy' bars and unidiomatic arpeggios. Many of Stevens' 'arpeggios' are spread over too many bars for them to be called such. They are better defined as a line comprising the intervals of a third, fifth and octave and thus integrated into the structure of the accompaniment.

The reviewer touches on the thorny issue of mensuration. Let us not go down that path. By Monteverdi's time, the mensuration system was basically dying on the continent.

Paul Doe has demonstrated that even if precise ratios should be applied at this point on the continent, there is no evidence that the tactus was kept rigidly consistent throughout Renaissance compositions. In England, many works of the time used two principal mensurations, *tempus perfectum* and *tempus imperfectum diminutio*. Recent theories confirm that diminution may have meant not a halving of note values but rather a reduction by a third less: a literal 'diminishing'. Denis Stevens shows quite clearly the passages of sesquialtera and hemiola. If we are not careful, we shall find ourselves playing a cabalistic game of looking for symbolism in the sonata cantus firmus entrances. Remember the numerological interpretations and overall dimensions of Obrecht's *Missa Sub tuum praesidium* offered by van Crevel which led nowhere! He found the sum of the tactus in the five movements the number 888 which defeated his object as the number of the Virgin is 7.

To return to Monteverdi. We have had the deliberations of Schrade, Bonta, Redlich, Goehr, Osthoff, Jürgens and many others, leaving us rather like Monteverdi's singers - a little further down in spirit; 'nel palco'.

Denis Stevens' edition is both scholarly and practical, borne out of a consummate knowledge of Monteverdi, concomitant with matters of the period and its ethos. As Denis Arnold once noted, there must be a compromise between scholastic exactitude and performing expediency. (Stevens prints the translation at the bottom of the page rather than have the singer forever turning back and forth.) Having given the first performances of Vivaldi in St Petersburg in 1989 (then Leningrad) with the Glinka Cappella, this year it is planned to give the first performance of the Vespers by the above choir, the Conservatoire and the Philharmonic Society of which I am their guest conductor. I need a score without reams of paper devoted to commentary and indexes, that some editors often employ nowadays. In fact, one almost expects to learn that the editors themselves have also hacked down the trees for the paper to print it on.

I'm not sure that Peter and I actually come close enough to each other to agree or disagree, in that his interesting discursus does not seem to me to have any bearing on establishing what Monteverdi actually wrote.

My translation 'pretty girl' was intended merely to show the grammar: the translation in my edition is, of course, much more formal. As an editor I hesitate to print words we think a composer should have set if what appears in the source makes sense. Correcting from the vulgate can lead one astray, as the Trahe me [no comma] post te example in our December issue showed (p. 15). Most texts set by catholic composers are likely to come from the liturgy rather than directly from the bible. The way to investigate further whether the 1610 edition is plausible is by checking through the liturgical books in use in Mantua – Venice is hardly relevant – in the decades around 1600. (The non-specific books I have seen, both early and modern, have

filiae.) The 1610 edition is on the whole accurate with regard to its words. The tenor partbook has filia three times, so is clearly not a misprint, and Monteverdi's setting makes more sense with those words than the 'correct' ones. There is a parallel in Victoria's 6-voice setting of the text, which has filia in the edition I have checked (1576); Pedrell prints that but Angles changes it to filiae without comment.

As for the me, it doesn't affect the meaning at all. Whether expressed or not, there is no doubt who, actually or symbolically, is being enticed into the bedroom. Exactly how the Hebrew might be translated could have been a topic of conversation between Monteverdi and his Jewish colleague Salamone Rossi but has no bearing on what an editor prints or a singer sings. There is no great difficulty in eliding the vowels, but the t m collocation of introduxit me is slightly awkward to sing so it is better not to add the extra word unless necessary. CB [See also p. 24]

FAIREST TRIAL

Julia Craig-McFeely reviews two Purcell collections

Even before Purcell Year got under way, Julia Craig-McFeely had a mountain of CDs to hear, and she didn't even like his music...

I have to admit being something of a philistine where Purcell is concerned. As a choral singer, I find his vocal lines singularly frustrating, since they always seem to go somewhere I'm not expecting (a legacy of singing far too much Renaissance and late Romantic music with nothing in between) and I have to confess to experiencing boredom performing the Funeral Services, despite some superb moments. It is probably the fact that Purcell produces these spectacular moments surrounded by relatively drab, uneventful wallpaper that I find unsatisfactory. Having heard the anguish of the (supposedly) unfinished *Hear my prayer, O Lord*, I am invariably disappointed by pieces like *My heart is inditing*. (Thinking about what happens at the end of *Lord, how long wilt Thou be angry*, though – almost as chromatic as *Hear my prayer* – I suspect the absence of its end is no great loss.) You can imagine, therefore, how I felt at the thought of reviewing no less than 14 CDs of Purcell over Christmas. I found myself faced with two boxed sets: *A Purcell Companion* (Harmonia Mundi re-issues) and the *Gardiner Purcell Collection* (re-issues again, Erato this time), produced to ride the Purcell tercentenary bandwagon.

You can see that I started out rather worse than sceptical, not only about the music, but also about the performers: early 'early music' recordings are usually to be avoided and many of the Harmonia Mundi CDs fell into this category (Deller et al.) while I had gone off Gardiner and the Monteverdi Choir after the unpleasant experience of their Monteverdi and Gesualdo madrigals and motets.

The Gardiner Collection seemed a good place to start; eight CDs, heavily inclined toward the dramatic music. In fact, I was surprised not to find *Dido and Aeneas* in a collection that did include *Timon of Athens*, *Dioclesian*, *The Tempest*, *King Arthur* and *The Indian Queen*. The remaining two CDs are 'Music for Queen Mary' (*Come, ye sons of Art* and the funeral music) and the 1692 *Ode to St Cecilia*. Obviously this would make or break me as far as Purcell was concerned and I sat down with them over the Christmas break and tried to forget about a large bowl of brandy butter lurking within dangerously easy reach.

To my immense surprise, the brandy butter remained untouched for far longer than I had expected. I was most immediately impressed by the amazing consistency of sound and quality throughout these recordings, which span just over a decade (1977-1988). Gardiner clearly 'got it right' in 1977, both in choice of soloists and in the sound he found for his players, and he stuck with that vital recipe in

the ensuing years. Apart from a mild irritation at the cummings-esque lack of capital letters on the covers, I found nothing substantial that I disliked about this collection and, on the contrary, found the music far more absorbing than I had ever done before. I'm not worried by the absence of a *Dido* since, if you have any Purcell on your shelves at all, it's likely to be that. There is nothing new here and it is far more retrospective than the Harmonia Mundi set; but judging by recent Monteverdi Choir recordings, that may be an advantage. (Or am I unfairly extrapolating from the bad taste left by a single recording?)

Despite having been pleasantly surprised by Gardiner, I still felt trepidation about the Harmonia Mundi collection and I have to admit to committing the ultimate sacrilege of playing some of these CDs in the car on one of those inevitable long journeys to visit relatives – thank goodness I did. I surprised myself by not even realising that the traffic jam around Newbury lasted a whole hour, so absorbed was I in William Christie's *Dido and Aeneas*. The other recordings in this collection are *King Arthur*, the inevitable Funeral Sentences (with a *Te Deum* thrown in), organ Works, Chamber Music and an Alfred Deller anthology of songs predictably entitled 'Music for a while'. These range in date from 1978 up to 1993 and live up to the collection's title of 'A Purcell Companion' very well. *King Arthur* is a pretty silly piece with the words as well as the music; without the narrative (as in the Gardiner version), it is even sillier and it suffers little more from being reduced to excerpts as is the case here. I already noted my 'absorption' in *Dido*, some of which was due to some quite extraordinary pronunciation that surfaced. 'Come away, fellow sailors' was so funny that I had to pull off the road as I couldn't see through the tears of laughter streaming down my face. Poor Michel Laplénie attempted a 'Zomerzet' accent and the whole thing came out rather like a French version of the English policeman from 'Allo, 'allo. Guillemette Laurens as Dido came up with some very suspect words, though generally she coped well, although I found some of it extremely LOUD and Dido's lament seemed far too robust for someone about to die. However, I suspect my absorption was because of the undoubted freshness of the performance and the fact that it was filled with these odd moments kept me entertained and involved far more than a pristine English performance would have done. It sounds jingoistic but I have the feeling that the English actually do perform Purcell better than anyone else, despite that fact that this and the Funeral Sentences are both good recordings and well worth listening to again.

I must also comment particularly on the spectacular Butt recording of the organ works in this collection, performed

on early, if not English instruments, which completely blew me away. I had to sit down and listen to several of the tracks again, there was so much going on and the organ sounds were so exciting. John Butt's dexterity is completely amazing, particularly when you consider how difficult most early instruments are to play. If you can't afford the whole set, this one is an absolute must.

This was the first time that I had really listened to Alfred Deller's legendary voice and I found it far easier on the ear than most modern counter-tenors. Though I possibly enjoyed the CD of songs less than the others, this was mostly because I found the music less satisfying rather than because of any lack in the performers. I find it more difficult to listen to a series of brief unrelated songs, no matter how beautifully crafted or sensitively sung, than something continuous.

Throughout the chamber music disc, I found myself expecting a voice to join in and it made me realise how naked Purcell's chamber music can sound. Having said that, this recording was infinitely preferable to an agonisingly tedious three-volume set of Purcell's sonatas by another group that has contributed very largely to my disaffection with him.

I dare say I should make some razor-sharp comment in summary but I have to admit to feeling a little blunt after so many hours of Henry Purcell. I definitely feel quite different about his music than I did when I set out on this marathon. The Gardiner Collection is good for the dramatic music and gives you complete recordings of things you might not already own. Its purpose (and what it achieves) is quite different from the Harmonia Mundi set, which is far more of a 'companion' and will probably appeal to a wider audience than the Gardiner. I don't know how the two sets are relatively priced: Erato appear to have spared no cost, with new colour pictures on all the boxes, while the Harmonia Mundi set looks cheaper with its basic black and white covers repeated for each CD. If I had to choose between the two, I would pick the Harmonia Mundi because it offers such a pleasing variety of music and interpretation, ensuring that you never tire of its content. After a while, the Gardiner began to sound a bit monotonous, in spite of the fresh and committed sound that he gets from his performers, so is less of a companion and more of a collection. You could listen to the Purcell Companion from start to finish and never tire of it, while the Gardiner set can only really be heard in smaller doses. It depends on what you're looking for.

Gardiner Purcell Collection Erato

The Indian Queen 4509-96551-2 62' 36" 1979

King Arthur 4509 96552-2 (2CD) 90' 00" 1983

Music for Queen Mary 4509-96553-2 44' 06" 1976

Come ye Sons of Art, Funeral Music

Hail! bright Cecilia 4509-965542 53' 02" 1982

The Tempest 4509-96555-2 57' 29" 1979

[NB the notes by Peter Holman, whose edition is used, admit that this is not by Purcell]

Timon of Athens, Dioclesian 4509-96556-2 (2CD) 112' 00" 1987

A Purcell Companion Harmonia Mundi

Dido and Aeneas (Christie) HMX 2901528 53' 45" 1985

Funeral Sentences (Herreweghe) HMX 2901529 67' 43" 1993

Z 10, 15, 17, 27, 30, 37, 49, 50, 58c, Te Deum Z 232)

Chamber Music (London Baroque) HMX 2901530 63' 51" 1989

Z 336, 730, 731, 748-752, 770-772, 796, 801, 807

King Arthur excerpts (Deller Consort) HMX 2901531 59' 46" 1979

Music for a while (Deller) HMX 2901532 55' 18" 1978/9

Z 193, 379a, 400, 406, 574/17, 578/9, 581, 583/2, 585/1,

627/App 2, 628/38, 629/39b & 40, 630/17h

Organ Works (Butt) HMX 2901533 64' 59" 1993

Z 645, 716-720, T678, T680, T687, T698, D221,

[+ Voluntaries by Blow & Locke]



KING'S MUSIC

Redcroft, Banks End, Wyton

Huntingdon, PE17 2AA

tel: +44 (0)1480 52076 fax +44 (0)1480 451739

newly published

PURCELL

Dido and Aeneas

Score: £6.00 Vln I, II, vla, each £5.00

Instrumental bass: £5.00

This is primarily based on the Tenbury/ Bodleian MS and the 1689 libretto, with fewer concessions to modern notational practice than other editions (e.g. original mensuration and key signatures are preserved and superfluous accidentals are retained). Like our editions of *Dioclesian*, *The Fairy Queen* and *The Indian Queen* (which also avoid unnecessary modernisation) it is freshly typeset and the score is accompanied with carefully laid-out orchestral parts. The bass part has most of the solo vocal lines cued in, so is usable by theorbo/guitar as well as bass violin (or cello, and even double bass if you are adopting a later performance style). We have not produced separate full and vocal scores – there is no need for the latter in music so lightly scored. We have retained the price of our previous version.

Update: our new *King Arthur* is due in the summer (specifically, in time for the Boston Festival in June). Meanwhile, we have a set of scissors-and-paste parts available.

We listed all our Purcell editions in an advert in the December issue: if you need a separate copy of that list, please write, phone or fax.

RECORD REVIEWS

CHANT

Plain-Chant Parisien XVII^e & XVIII^e siècles
Ensemble Organum, Les Pages de la
Chapelle, Marcel Pérès dir, organ 72' 26"
Harmonia Mundi HMC 901480

Another fascinating chant record from Ensemble Organum. This CD contains a mass for Christmas Day as it might have been sung in Notre Dame, Paris, after a revision of the liturgy around 1680. The ordinary is sung to a chant setting by Camppra. Other chant is from the contemporary Parisian use and Pérès provides convincing organ improvisations where appropriate. The sound of chant with a baroque accent is intriguing and this seems to me one of Pérès's most successful experiments. CB

MIEVEAL

Carmina Burana The Benediktbeuren MS, c. 1300
Studio der frühen Musik, Thomas Binkley 99' 50" (rec 1964)
Teldec *Das Alte Werk* 4509-95521-2 2 CDs

This is a key document in the revival of medieval music. These mostly-Latin songs are, to me at least, less remote than those of the troubadours and trouvères and the vast popularity of the Orff setting has helped draw attention to them. Binkley's imaginative attempt to create a style for the performance has had enormous influence; his notes in the substantial booklet (with full texts and translations) refer both to mindless imitation and to a pseudo-historical performance style based on this recording which creates a new music. Despite my suspicions of instrumental elaboration of medieval monophony, it is rather the emphatic rhythms that I find oppressive: Latinists are now more flexible in their approach to Latin stress. But this pioneering achievement has a conviction of its own which entirely justifies reissue 30 years later. I hope the Munich librarian who refused to let Binkley see the manuscript was subsequently ashamed of himself. CB

Codex Faenza Ensemble Organum, Marcel Pérès 70' 27"
Harmonia Mundi HMA 1901 354 (rec 1990)

The Faenza Codex is the earliest substantial collection of keyboard music (if it really is for keyboard). Pérès plays here 10 items on a specially-constructed clavictherium. This makes an interesting sound somewhat like a cimbalon and presents the lavishly-embellished music convincingly. The CD begins with 9 of the vocal originals of items in the MS (7 of which overlap with items played). They are placed consecutively, avoiding the schematic, didactic but more convenient placing of vocal and instrumental version in succession. So I suspect that listeners will find themselves hopping from

track to track. Occasionally, the singers incorporate ornamentation from the Faenza versions. The English a capella heresy has infiltrated here, but not the absolute clarity of intonation (especially in the three-voice pieces) which is essential to make it fully credible. CB

Music of Charles University 2. Czech Music of the 14th and 15th Centuries Ars Cameralis, Lukás Matousek 61' 49"

Studio Matous MK 0005-2231
Includes 6 motets by Petrus Wilhelmi de Grudencz and 30 anon items

This is a frustrating CD. 36 pieces lasting an average of 1¼ minutes, however well sung and played, are difficult to digest with no detailed information or texts. The music and recording deserve the full documentation that *Das Alte Werk* would have provided; perhaps a separate edition of music and commentary could be issued. This is, however, an extremely appealing disc, and if you don't mind not knowing what the words mean, where the music comes from and what it was for, you will enjoy it. CB

RENAISSANCE

Byrd Keyboard Works Patrick Ayrton

Globe GLO 5123 69' 14"

The Bells, The Carman's Whistle, Clarifica me pater I, II, III, Fancy, Fantasia, Pavan 8, Pavana Lachrymae & Galiarda, Rowland, Sellinger's Round, Ut re mi fa sol la, Walsingham

Patrick Ayrton plays a well-chosen selection on copies of harpsichords by J. Couchet (1679) & G. B. Giusti (1681) and a beautiful 1531 organ in the church of Kreward, Groningen. The overall impression is of a thoughtful and imaginative player. The articulation of the pieces based on songs is more legato and cantabile than the rest, and leaves one humming them – a sign of good communication. The Carman whistles happily, with highly-articulated playing on a flute stopped diapason. The more often I listen to the CD, the more I appreciate the depth of Ayrton's interpretation and the clearer Byrd's intentions become. Is there some relationship between the photograph of alfresco harpsichord-playing and the openness of English music? Michael Thomas

Gesualdo Responses for Good Friday
Ensemble A Sei Voci 37' 52"
Erato 4509-97411-2 (rec 1982)

A disappointing recording. Music for six solo male voices needs absolute precision in pitch to prevent it sounding muddy, and music whose tonal progressions are so unpredictable needs utterly unambiguous chords. The ensemble lacks that spot-on intonation which is essential to make any performance of Gesualdo effective, despite some impressive singing from the two haute-contras. This reissue does not do the ensemble a favour. Although only half-length for a CD (a relief to the reviewer but

poor-value for the purchaser, even at mid-price) the music is still too much to take in a sitting; this is an obvious case where items published consecutively need to be spaced out, either in their liturgical context or by some other means. CB

Gibbons Consort and keyboard music, songs and anthems Rose Consort of Viols, Red Byrd, Tessa Bonner, Timothy Roberts
Naxos 8.550603 68' 24"

Fantasia 1 a2, Fantasia 3 & 5 a6, Fantasia 1 with the Great Double Bass, Go from my window a6, Galliard a3, In nomine a4, Pavan & Galliard a6; Allmaine in G, Lincoln's Inn Mask, The Lord of Salisbury his Pavan & Galliard, A Mask *The fairest nymph*, Preludium in G; Dainty fine bird, Fair is the rose, I weigh not Fortune's frown (i-iv), The silver swan; Behold thou hast made my days, Glorious and powerful God

An even better £5-worth than the Naxos Byrd CD by the same performers. Centered on music for the viol, this provides a good survey of Gibbons' output as a whole (though I would have welcomed a full anthem, both to represent that aspect of the composer and to let us hear a little more of Red Byrd). There is a nice mixture of the well-known and unfamiliar. Those new to the repertoire might try first *Behold thou hast made* (whose tenor soloist should have been named) and the pair of Fantasies A6; no. 3 has the most arresting opening of any viol music. The playing and singing are entirely convincing, apart from *Glorious and powerful God* being a bit rushed. CB

Josquin Sydney Chamber Chorus, Nicholas Routley 58' 10" Tall Poppies TP054
Missa *Pange lingua*; Absalon fili mi, Ave Christe, Illibata Dei, Inviolata integra et casta es a12

Nick Routley is Senior Lecturer in Music at Sydney University (my Alma Mater), whose motto is *Sidere mens eadem mutato*. This sort of paternalism grates nowadays on us colonials, but seems initially appropriate for this semi-amateur group from 'the displaced constellation' as they attack *Illibata Dei* with Oxbridge-like soaring trebles leading a generally well-balanced and homogenous sound. But after a while problems in both rhythm and tuning become increasingly apparent. Because the placing (hence the length) of the short notes after dots is haphazard, very few chords in the polyphony are truly together; and while the music more or less maintains pitch, it is not often really in tune, because no-one seems to have decided exactly how big the thirds and fifths are meant to be. Passion and commitment take them a long way, though, especially in *Illibata Dei* and *Ave Christe*. A bit less in the precipitate *Osanna* of the Mass would have been welcome. One wonders about the inclusion in a record devoted to Josquin of so many pieces probably written by someone else (*Ave Christe* by Bauldewyn and *Absalon fili mi* by La Rue). The 12-part *Inviolata*, which is also a doubtful attribution, is a difficult challenge for 24 amateur singers. It must also be noted that, despite their claim to 'authentic

performing techniques', almost every piece is transposed into an unsuitable mixed-choir key. For all that, most enjoyable, especially from a distance, and with one of the prettiest covers I've seen for a long time.

Graham O'Reilly

Lassus *Deutsche Lieder und Instrumentalstücke* Mona Spägle, Bernhard Landauer, Wilfried Jochens, Thomas Herberich SATB Lautten Compagnie 55' 09" Capriccio 10 538

The contents list, with items in Italian and French as well as German, seems not to match the title, but only the German songs are performed with voices. *Matona mia cara* (which should sound German) loses its comic point without the words. The singers are fine, though there is some rigidity in places – maybe not so much their fault as the fact that Lassus was writing in a language he only learnt quite late in life. But it is the instrumental sounds that make this a memorable disc, with some fine lute-ensemble playing in particular. CB

Palestrina *Missa pro defunctis* Chanticleer Teldec *Das Alte Werk* 4509-94561-2 65' 36" Also includes *Gaude Barbara* a5, *Gaude gloriosa* a5, *O bone Jesu* a6, *Pange lingua* a4, *Salve Regina* a5; motets from the *Song of Songs* *Trahe me*, *Nigra sum*, *Surge propera*, *Quam pulchra es*, *Veni dilecte mi*

Something of a mixed bag! Palestrina's four late Requiem movements are by far the best thing here and work well in Chanticleer's unsophisticated performing style. There are reasonable performances of some of the motets, but overall they are blandly sung and there is no sense that the singers have any idea what they are singing about. There is the somewhat naive enthusiasm of a well-tuned amateur choir with everything sounding the same and tempo particularly inflexible. This recording, as opposed to that by Michel Laplenie's group discussed in the following review, is a strong argument against group singing of this music (though there are only 12 singers here); it makes one long for more subtle solo singing, particularly in the five more intimate *Song of Songs* settings. Apart from the Requiem, I cannot really recommend it. Noel O'Regan

Palestrina *Musiques pour Saint-Jean* Ensemble Sagittarius, Ensemble La Fenice, Michel Laplenie 61' 45" Accord 203662 *Missa Ecce ego Johannes* with offertory *Justus ut palma*; *Magnificat* VI toni a 4 (no. 34); *Exsultet coelum laudibus*, *Haec dies* a4, a8, *Hic est discipulus ille*, *Valde honorandus est*; *Ricercare* IV, VI

This CD is a spin-off from the French contribution to the EBU's Palestrina quatercentenary celebrations and was produced by Alain de Chambure who, with the BBC's Graham Dixon, was the driving force behind those celebrations; Chambure has done much to further Palestrina research and performance in France. This is an important recording which presents music that is mostly hitherto unrecorded with authentic performing forces and a freshness and joy in the singing which makes it a real pleasure to listen to. Like so many other interesting French recordings, it is sponsored by

France Telecom and represents (with Françoise Lasserre's *Akademia* ensemble) a new French contribution to late 16th-century vocal performance which could become very exciting. Based around the *Missa Ecce ego Johannes*, the CD includes a somewhat arbitrary mixture of other pieces related to the two St Johns. The mass is sung by a choir of 12 men and five boys (as in Palestrina's *Cappella Giulia*) with discreet organ support and only solo voices for reduced-voice sections. This seems to me to be authentic for mass-ordinaries and certainly convinces here. Motets, etc. are performed one to a part (including solo boys) and there are two of Palestrina's rarely-heard *ricercars* on the organ. Tuning is occasionally less than perfect, and the boys are a bit hesitant in the mass, but overall this impressed me very much. Noel O'Regan

Ward *Psalms and Anthems* The Consort of Musicke 78' 46" Musica Oscura 070982 (rec 1988)
Ward *Madrigals and Fantasias* The Consort of Musicke 51' 54" Musica Oscura 070981 (rec 1984)

The disc of *Psalms and Anthems* starts most promisingly with the darkest sonorities of bass and great bass viols recaptured by the low voices in Ward's setting of Psalm 103. However, by the end of three or four tracks, even the lovely playing of the Consort of Musicke cannot alleviate the insistence of G minor and a general sameness of style. Psalm 68 is notable for the rich bottom Ds of the basses, but on the whole the singing is unremarkable – as may be thought fitting for this devout music. Among Ward's most typical devices is the pairing of voices in interlocking canon. The effect of his madrigalian style serves the words well, but can become otiose. The great array of 11 viol players listed in the booklet is due to the fact that one track was recorded in 1984, when the Consort of Musicke had an almost entirely different personnel.

The second disc is more pleasing and Ward's talent and originality are better displayed. Two fine 6-part laments on the death in 1612 of the Prince of Wales are followed by five madrigals on more usual subjects and then by seven viol fantasias, all recorded in 1984. The viols sing their words and changing moods quite as eloquently as the singers and with fewer irritating mannerisms. These recordings should bring Ward's music to the attention of more performers, both professional and amateur. Selene Mills

Canzonetta: 16c canzoni & instrumental dances The King's Noyse, David Douglass *dir*, Paul O'Dette *lute* 78' 37" Harmonia Mundi HMU 907127

I have thoroughly enjoyed the live performances of *The King's Noyse* which I have heard at the last two Boston Festivals and this disc confirms the excellent impression they have made. They are a renaissance-style violin band with a free approach to written music that gets them nearer to the semi-improvised manner of performance

that much of this music requires. Indeed, one track with divisions on *Anchor che co'l partire* is listed as being by Douglass himself. The repertoire runs from Willaert to Banchieri, with lute solos from Chilesotti's edition of a lost Italian manuscript. Highly recommended. CB

Il Cortegiano: Italian Renaissance Music Giuseppe Zambon *c/tenor*, Catherine Daron flute, Gail-Ann Schroeder *b.viol.*, Andrea Damiani, Jean-Luc Impe *lutes* 50' 27" Arcobaleno AAOC 93682

Appropriate enough for a group which takes its name from Castiglione's seminal book, this collection is devoted to instrumental and vocal music from the early decades of the 16th century. The vocal items, mostly frottole and including one by Castiglione's much-admired Marchetto Cara, are sung quite pleasingly but without any great personality. The efficient 'backing group' also contributes a number of pieces, mostly dances, but there are a couple of more substantial pieces by Francesco da Milano and Ortiz. Presentation is poor: the notes are amateurish, there are no texts and no identification of the works by Milano and Ortiz. Those interested in the repertoire would do better to search out Circa 1500's Chandos disc, which covers similar ground (several items are common to both) in performances that communicate much more than these rather pallid offerings. Brian Robins

Dolcissima et Amorosa: Early Italian renaissance lute music Paul O'Dette 67' 21" Harmonia Mundi HMU 907043 Francesco da Milano, Pietro Paolo Borrono, Marco da l'Aquila, Alberto da Ripa

Stunning music, superbly played and beautifully recorded, and furnished with an informative booklet in 3 languages. That's all you need to know: just go and buy it. Lynda Sayce

Une Fête chez Rabelais: Chansons et pièces instrumentales de la première moitié du XVI^e siècle. Ensemble Clément Janequin, Dominique Visse 58' 33" Harmonia Mundi HMC 901453 Music by Certon, Clemens, Compère, Coste, De Bussy, Fresneau, Gombert, Guiard, Hesdin, Josquin, la Rue, le Petit, Pipelare, Sermisy, Vermon Primus, Willaert

Great fun: 26 mostly-jolly, often bawdy chansons and dances performed with immense verve. There is also subtlety and beauty – try Gombert's marvellous 6-voice reworking of *Mille regrets*. The booklet does its best to explain the words, but abandons the translation for the more complex items. The Ensemble is now so experienced at this repertoire that its mastery sounds effortless. But I wonder whether the contrast between the refined and the coarse sound is too extreme; after all, Guiard's pub is full of musicians. CB

Musica Imperialis: Musical Homages to the House of Habsburg Wiener Motettenchor, Ensemble Musica Antiqua Wien, Bernhard

Klebel 42' 25"

Christophorus **CHE 0058-2** (rec. 1979)

J. de Brouck *Laeta dies*; C. Feste *Quis dabit oculis*; Flecha *Dal superbo furor*; A. Gabrieli *Felici d'Adrio*; Isaac *Imperii proceres*; Lassus *Heroum soboles*; Monte *Augusti Erneste*; Padovano *Ricercar*; Portinaro *Ove sacre sorelle*; Vaet *Currite felices*, *Si qua fides*; Zanotti *O di progenitori*

I remember very vividly being taken out to lunch in Bologna in 1972 by the Gabrieli scholar Egon Kenton and being criticised for accepting the assumption that the genre 'political motet' really existed. Albert Dunning's *Die Staatsmotette* had been published in 1972; I hadn't read it, but there was an Archiv record of some characteristic examples. This CD strengthens my belief that there was a particular style of music written for ceremonial occasions: formal, a little stiff, not too subtle. The problem with these performances is that those adjectives come too readily to mind. Individually, they are acceptable: if you want an item to illustrate a lecture, your audience won't cringe, and there is some interesting, unrecorded repertoire. But I found the programme as a whole, despite its brevity, rather tiring. **CB**

EARLY BAROQUE

Charpentier *Messe pour le Samedi de Pâques, Requiem Mass* Knabenchor Hannover, Heinz Hennig 51' 55"

Calig **CAL 50 874**

With movements from F. Couperin organ masses played by Ton Koopman

The first of the two masses is interspersed with movements from Couperin's two organ masses (four from each). There is nothing wrong with this in theory: in practice, however, it is slightly disconcerting to move from the fine tuning of the Hanover Boys Choir to the French organ's temperament. The ear can adjust many different tunings (I recently attended a concert of music played on the 21-stringed Zheng with pentatonic tuning quite different from Western 'notes' and found my ears adjusting remarkably quickly). Perhaps the source of the problem here is the fact that the continuo organ is tuned differently from the solo one. The singing of the choir is fine, though one might have welcomed more attention to slightly smaller phrases: Hennig seems to think in terms of sweeping expanses of space, while I would have preferred more direction in the individual lines. Koopman's organ sections are everything you would expect. **BC**

Fröberger *The Complete Keyboard Works*

Richard Egarr *hpscd, organ*

Globe **GLO 6022 - 6025** (4 double-disc sets)

Fröberger is a major composer whose importance is still under-rated by most listeners. An 8-disc complete edition is probably only going to sell to the converted, which is a pity; but I hope that the mere existence of this thorough survey of his output will help draw wider attention to the music. Richard Egarr has done his homework well and made a thorough study of the sources, going far beyond the three major auto-

graph collections in Vienna (which are probably still available cheaply from Garland for \$50 the set). The order on the discs follows the sources. Two harpsichords are used, one a copy of a Ruckers of 1638 (2 manuals with two 8' and one 4' registers), the other of a Giusti of 1681 (one manual 8' and 4' with short octave). The organ is that at St Martin's Church, Cuijk, a fine instrument in itself. But the recording of it worries me: in a church, the ears adjust to the varying distances and positions of the pipes, but listening at home I found that the quieter stops sounded peculiarly distant and that the notes did not register with the precision the performance demanded. Nor am I convinced by the way Egarr tends to play the organ with all the rubato of his harpsichord style. This can sound quite refreshing in works whose interest is primarily vertical, but in the contrapuntal pieces the rhythmic vagaries often seem to be applied irrespective of the logic of the parts. Some pieces (e.g. the opening Toccata of CD1) sound a bit messy, and there are jolts when full chords that are characteristic on the harpsichord let forth a disproportionate volume on the organ. I wonder whether the mixture of private and public styles is disconcerting for private listening, and that these performances produce a compromise in the way a public instrument (the church organ) is played in a private way. I am much happier with the harpsichord playing, which is eloquent and subtle (though the lift before final chords becomes an annoying mannerism when heard so often). This is a bold project which deserves to succeed, and my criticism is not intended to discourage purchase. I hope it sells well enough for the proposed sequel of works of doubtful authenticity. **CB**

Fröberger *Stylus phantasticus* Shirley Matthews *hpscd* 73' 16"

Gasparo **GSCD-299**

Suites 2, 6, 13, 17, 19, 29; Toccatas 2, 19, Lamentation (Ferdinand III); Tombeau fait à Paris 1652

Shirley Matthews has a natural feeling and understanding for Fröberger's distinctive, highly expressive style, from the slow laments to the gigue, though the latter could have a more legato penultimate beat. The young Ferdinand IV climbs to heaven up a C major scale (*scala* = ladder): suddenly all is light as we step into the Courante. Perhaps the repeat spoils the effect. Again, M. Blanrocher falls down stairs, a downward scale. To die once thus is a tragedy, to do so twice is sheer carelessness. This is a completely convincing performance. The excellent notes are by Fröberger's editor, Howard Schott. **Michael Thomas**

Lully & Philidor London Oboe Band, Marie-Ange Petit *percussion* Paul Goodwin *director* 58' 33"

Harmonia Mundi **HMU 907122**

A.D. Philidor *Le Mariage de la Grosse Cathos*

Lully: excerpts from *Le Bourgeois Gentilhomme*, *les Noces de Village*, *Cadmus et Hermione*

Paul Goodwin's direction ensures stylish, accomplished and often exquisite playing on this, the Band's first CD. Three treble

oboes, two altos and one tenor, with three bassoons are joined by percussion and, in the burlesque *Fat Kate's Wedding*, by what sounds like dozens of enthusiastic saucepan-bangers. The notes explain the oboe band's history at the court of Louis XIV, and the repertoire includes Philidor and arrangements of two ballets and a tragedy by Lully. It is a most enjoyable disc, despite the limited keys, brevity of the pieces (45 of them), constant tone and generally jocund mood. The ear is caught by some very beautifully-controlled and articulated playing, and if you tire of the short and simple tunes, there are two superb chaconnes. It is a lot of fun, and bears repeated hearings. **Robert Oliver**

Matteis Ayres *for the Violin, vol. II* The Arcadian Academy, Nicholas McGegan 70' 20
Harmonia Mundi **HM 907108**

From the outset, it is clear why the playing of Matteis made such an impression on his contemporaries: the music is bright and direct, the harmonies simple but skilfully built around compelling progressions. The Arcadian Academy are ideal for this kind of music and their continuo group of keyboard, string bass and plucked continuo provides a sound basis for the fiddlers to attack the melodic lines. As the notes rightly point out, the trio arrangements are the more straightforward pieces, yet that, in a way, makes them more attractive too. The solo pieces include some movements for unaccompanied violin which allow Blumenstock and Weiss to savour what is an unusual experience in 17th-century music; the Fantasia from the A minor suite (Book 2) is beautifully played by Elizabeth Blumenstock. Anyone unfamiliar with this repertoire should start their initiation here! **BC**

Purcell *The Complete Anthems and Services* 10. The King's Consort, Robert King

Hyperion **CDA66707** 60' 58"

Contents: Z. 7, 21, 22, 45, 63, 69, 188, 214, 230

Purcell *The Complete Anthems and Services* 11. The King's Consort, Robert King

Hyperion **CDA66716** 65' 00"

Contents: Z. 1, 13, 25, 41, 62, 48, 184, 193, 230

'Achieved is the glorious work', as was said a century after Purcell, and the Lord might indeed behold it and be pleased. Robert King, his singers, players and Hyperion have laboured for rather longer than six days and nights, but have completed their third Purcell series in a remarkably short time. I was rather less enthusiastic than other critics for their song CDs, finding that the concentration on one aspect of Purcell's work diminished rather than enhanced my enjoyment of it. But there is much more variety in the anthem set. Not only is there such a wide range of ensemble, style and expression among the works themselves, but the church pieces are varied by the inclusion of the sacred songs and solos (to use Moody and Sankey's apposite title). I'm not entirely convinced by the use of choirboys in these domestic works; no doubt boys did sometimes sing them, but they are not primarily ecclesiastical. The anthems sometimes sound a bit too devout, with a hint of

Victorian decorum rather than Restoration vigour. But anyone seriously interested in Purcell's music who can afford 11 CDs should not hesitate to acquire these and will realise that there is far more to Purcell's sacred output than is commonly sung. CB

Purcell Dioclesian (excluding Masque) Catherine Pierard, James Bowman, John Mark Ainsley, Mark Padmore, Michael George SATTB, Collegium Musicum 90, Richard Hickox 54' 21"
Chandos Chaconne CHAN 0568

Here is the rest of the music for *Dioclesian* promised by the editor for 'speedy release' in September last year when the *Masque* was reviewed. As a whole, my impressions are more favourable than those Stephen Daw expressed about the earlier issue, although I agree with him that the chorus sounds more Handelian than Purcellian. But there is much here to enjoy, especially from the male soloists; John Mark Ainsley (who gets the lion's share of the solo work) is particularly effective, and his 'What shall I do' is a highlight of the record. In comparison, John Eliot Gardiner's set, despite similarities of tempi, has more incisive rhythms which often make Hickox sound a little sluggish and in general I find Gardiner's version the more idiomatic. Brian Robins
The *Masque* is on CHAN 0558

Purcell Hark how the wild musicians sing: the Symphony Songs Red Byrd, The Parley of Instruments, Peter Holman 71' 00"
Hyperion CDA66750
Z 506, 508, 510, 541-4, 547, Pavans 748-751

This is an unfamiliar repertoire: most of the items are new to me (though I played *How pleasant is this flowery plain* with The Parley's predecessor from Bärenreiter's *Hortus Musicus* series 25 years ago) and the genre itself only recently received a name. Since Peter Holman christened it, it is appropriate that he direct its first cohesive presentation. The genre is well described in the notes (and also in the director's recent book, reviewed on p. 5). The performances are appealing, with Red Byrd again providing singing of distinction, and the interspersed Pavans are a welcome bonus. CB

Sances Motetti e cantate a voce solo Maria-Cristina Kiehr, Concerto Soave 63' 21"
L'empreinte digitale ED 13038

A compelling introduction to a little-known composer, with a selection of works for solo voice published in the 1630s. As the first couple of phrases on track 1 make clear, he had considerable imagination and individuality, and the singing does him justice. There are enterprising accompaniments on harp, archlute, theorbo, guitar, gamba, cello, organ and harpsichord (the photos show only three of the team of five). I find the red on black printing on the back of the cover virtually illegible and some might condemn the front (a teen-age girl with a sword at her bare breast) as pornographic. But if it helps sell a fine record, I won't complain. CB

Schütz Weihnachtshistorie etc* Heinrich-Schütz-Ensemble & Monteverdi Orchester München, Wolfgang Kelber (63' 45")
Calig CXAL50941

* *Mein Sohn warum hast du* (SWV 401), *Es ging ein Sämann aus* (SWV 408), *Ich hebe meine Augen* (SWV 399), *Jauchzet dem Herren* (SWV 493)

It's a pity this did not arrive in time for our December issue: recommending a *Christmas Story* (the translator seems unaware of the normal English title and calls it *Oratorio*) in January is hardly timely. This is, however, a CD well worth having, not just for that, but for the marvellous pieces from *Symphoniae Sacrae III*. Mary in *Mein Sohn* is a bit wobbly, but otherwise the performances are entirely convincing, though I wonder about the alternation between pairs of violins, cornetts and recorders on the parts for 'Violinum oder derogleichen'; effective though the sound is at any moment, cumulatively the changes seem fussy and I wonder whether that is what Schütz meant. But I wouldn't want to miss the cornett-playing here. CB

Austrian Baroque Music before the Time of Mozart La Follia Salzburg 48' 38"

VTL Classique VTCLAS001

S. Bernardi *Sonata III, IV, VI*; Biber *Mensa sonora III*; Caldara *Sinfonia 4 'Morte e sepultura di Christo'*; Fux *Concentus musico-instrumentalis VI*; Schmelzer *Fechtschule, Lament on Death of Ferdinand III*

The two pieces by Schmelzer on this disc are perhaps his most widely known. The *Fechtschule*, with its graphic representation of the duel and its aftermath, is an ideal introduction to his style. The *Lament*, with its tolling of bells, is also programmatic. The three pieces by Bernardi are brief but effective. Biber's *Mensa Sonora* consists of suites of dances: *Pars III* has a lovely *ciaccona*. Caldara's *Sinfonia* is taken from one of his sepulchros, a Viennese tradition in which an oratorio was performed before a model of the Crucifixion scene. Fux's *Concentus-Musico-Instrumentalis* is one of the outstanding publications of the time, perhaps laying down the overture suite for the many composers who followed. The six players of La Follia Salzburg clearly enjoy this music: the sword-fight is extremely dramatic; the sinister *Todtenglock* is quite moving; the Bernardi sparkles. But 49 minutes is poor value, especially when there are hundreds of works by Schmelzer and Biber waiting to be recorded. BC

Music at the Habsburg Court Concentus Musicus, Nikolaus Harnoncourt 96' 26"

Teldec *Das Alte Werk* 4509-95989-2 (2 CDs)

Fux *Sonata a4, Rondeau a7, Serenada a8* (rec. 1969) Schmelzer *Sonata Natalitia a 3 Chori; Sonata I, II, IV* (1662) & other sonatas (rec. 1970)

These are classic recordings, examples of the pioneering work of Nikolaus Harnoncourt which convinced us that the use of early instruments was not just an antiquarian foible but a way of bringing dead music to life. Despite the 'progress' of the last quarter-century, these are still the best recordings of instrumental music by Fux and Schmelzer (I haven't heard the disc reviewed above), and their mid-price reissue is most welcome. CB

The Art of English and Italian Song Alfred Deller *c/tenor*, Desmond Dupré *lute, gamba*, George Malcolm *hpscd* 51' 03"
Vanguard Classics 08 5074 71

This is a sampler to the series, at budget price but with the disadvantage of no information on the music. Its contents do not overlap with any of the other discs in the *Edition Alfred Deller* CDs reviewed last month, and comprise an anthology of 20 songs covering the whole range of the 17th century from Dowland to Alessandro Scarlatti sung inimitably, though what is enjoyed as artistic expression in individual songs becomes mannered if too many songs are heard in succession. CB

An Italian Ground Maurice Steeger *recorder*, Naoki Kitaya *kbd*, Brian Feehan *theorbo*, Lorenz Duftschild *gamba* 64' 62"
Claves CD 50-9407

Carr *An Italian Ground, Cima Sonata in d Fontana Sonata 6, Hume A soldier's resolution, Locke Suite 3 in D, Piccinini Toccata 6, Rognoni Vestiva i colli, Vivaldi op. 13/4, + anon grounds*

The first impression here is of a pleasant live ambience, immediate but not too close. The second is of how well the performers play together, of real people playing music they enjoy. The recorder playing is (what a relief!) not extravagantly virtuosic: Maurice Steeger's phrasing and use of vibrato are very stylish and his tuning is excellent; yes, he does dazzle in the few fast florid passages, but never just for effect. It can be difficult to make these long sectional sonatas (Fontana, Cima, etc) sound coherent, but this group is utterly convincing. The change of style and mood, I felt, was too abrupt between the delightfully executed Locke suite and the Vivaldi sonata. Changes of texture, as provided elsewhere by theorbo and gamba solos, would have been welcome here. Having charmed us so far, Steeger's Vivaldi proved the weak point, lacking sparkle with indistinct tone and articulation, passage-work underplayed and disconcertingly overblown sforzandi disturbing the flow. Luckily the following Sammartini sonata is a gem and beautifully played. Carr's *Italian ground* provides a magical ending. All in all, a stunning disc. Angela Bell

LATE BAROQUE

Albinoni Pimpinone Elena Zilio *Vespetta*, Domenico Trimarchi *Pimpinone*, I Solisti Veneti, Claudio Scimone (rec 1980)

B. Marcello Sonatas op 2/7, 10, 12 Angelo Persichelli *flute*, Mariolina De Robertis *hpscd*, Jodie Bevers *vlc* (rec 1979)
Fonitcetra CDC 40 71' 37"

Pimpinone is one of the few *intermezzi* to be available in a good edition (by Michael Talbot from A-R editions, which the listener will need to get if he needs a translation – the notes do not supply one). The performance has a good feel for the stage and will be enjoyed by all save those who demand early instruments at all costs (though it is better if you forget Telemann's version). I must confess that I cannot find the 'almost didactic rationalism' which the note-writer

finds in Marcello's flute sonatas. They are recorded very much as pieces for flute with accompaniment but quite nicely played, apart from the interminable cadences. CB

d'Astorga E pur Cesare ha vinto, Stabat mater Silvia Mapelli, Sonia Zaramella, Hidefumi Narita, Paolo Battaglia SATB, Concentus Musicae Antiquae, Milano Sinfonietta, Daniele Ferrari 71' 38" Nuova Era 7198

I became interested in d'Astorga's *Stabat mater* when, about 30 years ago, I acquired an old Novello vocal score and recognised the opening bars as 'These pleasures, Melancholy, give' from Handel's *L'Allegro*; he probably heard d'Astorga's work when it was new in Rome around 1708. It became incredibly popular in England later in the century it was performed in 15 consecutive seasons of the Antient Concerts, and was still known in England and Germany through the 19th century; but this century it has been ignored. A shame, since it is well worth reviving. Sadly, this live recording is unconvincing; the general effect is of a provincial choral society performance of the 1960s. The listener would have been better served if the conductor had spent less time consulting 20 MSS and more experiencing decent performance of this sort of music. The best soloist is the soprano Silvia Mapelli, and the CD begins with her singing a lengthy solo cantata with orchestra. This is in all respects more stylishly performed and makes the CD worth acquiring. CB

Music by the Bach Dynasty Debrecen Kodály Choir, Salamon Kamp 74' 02" Hungaroton HCD 31549

J. Bach *Sei nun wieder zufrieden*; J. Michael Bach *Halt was du hast, Unser Leben ist ein Schatten*; J. Christoph Bach *Der Gerechte ob er gleich, Lieber Herr Gott*; J. Ludwig Bach *Das ist meine Freude*; Telemann/J. S. Bach *Jauchzet dem Herrn* (BWV Anh.160); Kuhnau/J. S. Bach *Der Gerechte kommt*; J. S. Bach *Der Geist hilft*; J. C. F. Bach *Wachet auf*

Noticing that the list of instruments included an English Horn and that there were nearly 50 singers in the choir photo, I assumed that I was in for a tedious hour and a quarter of old-fashioned performances. But no: the very first bars of *Unser Leben ist ein Schatten* grabbed my attention: 'unser Leben' had a gentle, perhaps just slightly self-indulgent tone, but any choir that can throw off their Schattens so perfectly deserves respect. The singing is, in fact, extremely stylish (as is the small instrumental contribution to the disc); everything is well-shaped in a way that illuminates the music, with few mannerisms. The music is first-rate, even though there is only one unequivocal work by JSB. Choirs could take ideas for repertoire from here (most of the music is available from Carus). This nicely complements one of my favourite sets, the Musica Antiqua Köln collection of Bach family cantatas; it is not to be missed. CB

Bach Cantatas 8, 26, 43, 61, 85, 130, 182 Chorale Heinrich Schütz (Heilbronn), Südwestdeutscher Kammerorchester, Orchestre de Chambre de Pforzheim, Fritz Werner Erato 4509-97407-2 2 discs, 147' 22"

Fritz Werner's recordings of Bach cantatas were taped in the 1950s and 1960s and these are digitally enhanced revamps of performances which I long cherished in vinyl pressings that were shallow and hence vulnerable; now it is highly agreeable to be able to listen to them without surface grumbles and sudden slips. The recitatives sound very odd today, as do some of the emphases on the bass line (as in the final chorus on disc 1), the occasionally over-slow arias (BWV 26/2) and the desperately sincere sounds of the chorus (partly desperate because Bach sits high at these pitches, but also evidence of an attitude that is perhaps closer to Bach's religious veneration than many of ours). So another useful documentation of a kind of performance practice that we find it easy to condemn, but ought to consider more deeply; but not the whole story in terms of modern interpretation, either for listeners or for those preparing to perform Bach. Stephen Daw

Bach Complete Organ Works vol. 1 Marie-Clair Alain (Schnitger/Ahrend organ at Martinkerk, Groningen) 64' 57" Erato 4509-96718-2 (rec 1985) Preludes & Fugues in e, b; Chorales BWV 653, 654, 658, 662-4

'To record Bach's complete works for organ on historic instruments has always been a dream for me'. So writes Marie-Clair Alain in the introduction to vol.1 of the 14-CD series – her third complete Bach. If the first disc is anything to go by, this will be a series to remember. An immediate impression is of a sensitive recording engineer: the mixing is not so close as to reveal all the guts and clatter that affect to many organ recordings, and yet not so far as to cloud the clarity of Alain's playing – the acoustic bloom adds much to the sound of this magnificent organ. Two major Preludes and Fugues and choral preludes from the '18' Leipzig collection are played with artistic conviction and consummate musicianship. Her sensitive and musical articulation is particularly evident in *An Wasserflüssen Babylon*, and the use of 8' pedal tone is well judged. The only slight concern is that some of the registrations chosen on this northern German organ are not quite perfect for Bach: the mixture-rich *pleno* for both Preludes and Fugues and the 'gap' registrations of 8' + 2' or 8' + 2 2/3, for example. Buy this CD, and if the rest of the series are up to this standard, buy the lot. Andrew Benson-Wilson

Bach Sacred Songs and Arias from Schmelli's Gesangbuch Georg Jelden Baritone, Hainz Schnauffer Organ 82' 27" 2-CDs Christophorus CHE 0060-2 (rec. 1974)

I must confess that, much as I enjoy hymns, the idea of an unadulterated CD of them offers no attraction. So I approached this collection of 69 melodies with some suspicion. Schemelli's collection was intended for private devotion rather than church use, so they are appropriately sung here by a single voice. Georg Jelden sings pleasantly, without overstraying the bounds of what is appropriate. He has an attractive voice;

Robert Oliver tells me that he heard him evangelising as a tenor sometime before this was recorded yet even reclassified as a baritone his top notes sound uncomfortable. But I don't think I could take even Emma Kirkby in so many short songs. It is a pity that they are all reduced to one or two verses. The best-known example, *O Jesulein süß*, is typical in having 6 stanzas, only two of which are recorded. Fewer songs sung complete, with contrasting music between items, would have made for more attractive listening. This is really only for those who feel they need this particular corner of Bach's oeuvre complete. CB

Bach Die Kunst der Fuge Tini Mathot, Ton Koopman *hpscds* 75' 22" Erato 4509-96387-2

As far as I know, this recording has no direct precedent in that both performers are involved in playing in ensemble most of the time on two instruments. Nobody could dispute this as a viable option (much that Leonhardt has written even effectively supports it) and the result also justifies the idea. The recordings were made by the husband-and-wife team on copies of instruments by Couchet and Ruckers by Willem Kroesbergen of Utrecht. The Koopmans play with a controlled expressive flexibility which I find particularly appealing in this work; any idea that, thematically or structurally, it is particularly distinct from, say, the almost contemporary fugues of WTC II weakens when we hear so many direct motivic reminiscences from that collection treated in this way. Those pieces (all four *Canons* and *Contrapunctus VIII*) which Ton Koopman takes solo on the Ruckers copy are played slightly more freely still; so far *Contrapunctus VIII* is my favourite number. It is all lovely, though, and complete on one disc, with the bonus of Christoph Wolff's notes adding to the value to the package (although his wording is just a little clumsy). Stephen Daw

Clérambault Cantates Noémi Rime, Jean-Paul Fouchécourt, Nicolas Rivenq STB, Les Arts Florissants, William Christie 68' 05" Harmonia Mundi HMA 1901 329 (rec 1990) *La Muse de l'opéra, La Mort d'Hercule, Orphée, Pyrame et Tisbé*

Louis-Nicholas Clérambault's reputation still rests largely on his keyboard music. But he was considered a master of the cantata (he published five collections) and is important as a pioneer of the *Réunion des goûts* – the mélange of Italian and French characteristics. So this CD is welcome. The most extraordinary piece is *La Muse de l'Opéra*, a sampler of contemporary operatic devices with no pretence at a plot. *Orphée* has a famous Invocation to Pluto ('Monarque redouté') for voice and instruments without continuo, *Pyrame et Tisbé* an exceptional Plainte ('Quoi? Tisbé tu n'es plus?') and *La Mort d'Hercule* a fine tendre Air ('Ah! que tes traits sont redoutables'). The performers are best in the suave French-style pieces, Christie as usual somewhat underplaying the more bravura Italian aspects. Fouchécourt is a fine plaintive *Pyrame*, with excep-

tional diction. Noémi Rime's vowels are less careful and occasionally high coloratura passages catch her out, but the voice has a lovely warm middle register. Rivenq's stage presence shows in his more externally dramatic approach. The continuo phrasing could be more imaginative here and there; Marc Hantai's flute playing is exceptional. It is a pity that a less neutral tuning and 18th-century pronunciation were not chosen. In general, the performances are slightly 'vert' – carefulness for the needs of a recording outweighs the assurance that some preliminary concerts would no doubt have added. *Graham O'Reilly*

Couperin *Second livre de pièces de clavecin; L'Art de toucher le clavecin* Olivier Baumont Erato 4509-96364-2 (3 discs) 2 hr 58'

In his *Art de toucher le clavecin* Couperin states: 'J'aime beaucoup mieux ce que me touche, que ce que me surprend'. Olivier Baumont is evidently inspired by this and gives a performance which is elegant and poised with clear articulation and phrasing throughout. Couperin himself indicates the grouping by the length of the bass notes which follow the harmonic basis but also give the key to the phrasing. Baumont brings out all the detail and contrasts, giving full weight to the slurred upbeats, suspensions and syncopations. The 8th Ordre is particularly outstanding. Perhaps the clarity of the phrasing is helped by the clear, if slightly dry, tone of the harpsichord.

Michael Thomas

Couperin *Deuxième livre de pièces de clavecin; L'Art de toucher le clavecin* Christophe Rousset 3 hr 2' Harmonia Mundi HMC 901447.49 (3 discs)

Christophe Rousset gives a powerful, fast performance which is very impressive at first hearing, particularly in the big descriptive pieces. But he is less flexible in the poetic, expressive pieces. Le Roux suggests singing pieces before playing them, but he often plays too fast for that. The last suite is particularly hurried, with the phrases not separated enough. In *La coribante* the tempo increases so that when the semiquavers come one cannot hear the shape and climax of the phrase, only a flood of notes. Sometimes important notes are not held under the fingers to give a singing effect. The Couchet-Taskin harpsichord has a lovely rich tone but sounds as if it has historical damping which, at high speed, doesn't help the clarity of the phrasing. *Michael Thomas*

Couperin *Trois Leçons de Ténèbres, Deux Motets* (Audite omnes; Pour le jour de Pâques) Nadine Sautereau, Janine Collard, dir Laurence Boulay **Charpentier *Le Reniement de Saint-Pierre*** N Robin, J. Chamonin, A. Maurant, P.-M. Richez, J.-J. Lesueur, dir Philippe Caillard Erato 4509-97409-2 72' 26 (rec 1954, 1969)

Both these recordings broke fresh ground originally, and it is of more than historical interest to have them in a generally well-handled transfer to CD. The singers apply

techniques of projection that demonstrate mannerisms of European tastes of the 50 years or so after World War I rather than any other historical age, the continuo organist for Couperin's heavenly Lamentations hardly lets any air into his realisations, and the harpsichordist in Couperin's beautiful oratorio on the Denial of St Peter doubles the choir and fails to distinguish between one kind or style or movement and another. But we all knew far less in the 50s and 60s than we do today, and priorities were essentially complex but different. So all the more valuable to have the period's performances documented in good examples like these, even if it is to more recent recordings that the beginner (or even the specialist) should first refer. *Stephen Daw*

Fasch *High Mass* Juliane Claus, Martina Rüping, Elisabeth Baumgarten, Nils Giesecke, Johannes Künzel, Jörn Sakuth, SSATBB, Universitätschor Halle, Akademisches Orchester, Jens Lorenz 53' 11" Tonstudio CD 826/2

The manuscript of this work is preserved in the Bodleian Library, along with two further movements for similar forces. Both masses were probably first heard at the Court Chapel in Dresden, where much of Fasch's church music was performed, albeit adapted by the Kapellmeister Heinichen. This was clearly written for some special occasion: the elaborate scoring would have required the full forces of the Dresden musical establishment. Pitch is often a problem with Fasch's church music: he writes extremely high soprano and tenor parts. The present recording opts to perform the mass down a third, which gives the singers an easier time but rather robs the music of the sparkle that D trumpets naturally bring. For a student recording this is quite an achievement: there is much fine playing and singing; the soloists are stylish and much of the material is elegant and harmonically rich. Perhaps some of the period instrument groups will take up this sadly neglected repertoire: see the Zelenka review below to see what can be done! *BC*

Le Roux *Pièces de Clavessin* Iakovos Pappas, Pascal Baylac *hpscds* 77' 55" Arkadia CDAK 127.1

This is a strongly rhythmic interpretation of the Suites. The original Paris edition of 1705 had 6 pieces selected for two harpsichords and suggests that a second part could be added for any of the suites in a similar way. Three of them are performed thus. They have an enormous swing, often with large rolled chords or other ornaments on the first beat so that sometimes the melody is not quite strong enough for such a background. Sometimes, too, the two harpsichords have a texture too related, as when they move in parallel thirds. The beautiful Sarabande in G minor, of which we get seven of the 12 couplets, anticipates the variations of Handel and Rameau. This is a record that grows on me the more I listen to it. *Michael Thomas*

D. Scarlatti *Essential Scarlatti* Colin Booth Olympia OCD 251 73' 37" Contents: K. 30, 46, 87, 119, 132-3, 208, 213, 215, 259-260, 278, 380, 429, 517, 544-5

Thomas Rosengrave described hearing Domenico Scarlatti playing the harpsichord as 'like a thousand devils on the keys'. But besides the well-known virtuoso sonatas there are many beautiful lyrical ones and Colin Booth excels in both. He holds the notes that sing under his fingers and, as he points out in the booklet, the length of the notes has to be carefully thought out. This he has done and this is part of the reason for his expressive playing, which gives full reign to the sense of drama of the music. The harpsichord he made himself sings beautifully in the top octave and has 3x8' like the one found recently in Switzerland. He himself says Scarlatti is instrument-tolerant, but surely the melodic beauty of the instrument helps make this record so successful. Perhaps the sensitivity to the mood of the music has been passed down through Colin Tilney from Mrs Mary Potts, who played (though not so much Scarlatti) in this poetic way. *Michael Thomas*

D. Scarlatti *12 Sonatas Vol. 1* Miyuki Takahashi 54' 01" Sound Creation Studio, Speyer [no number] K. 9, 10, 27, 30, 47, 61, 62, 104, 107, 209, 212, 337.

This record is delightfully cleanly played with an exact and accurate technique with eloquence and charm. It contains sonatas of extreme beauty such as the D minor K. 9, the Cat's Fugue and the A major, K. 209. Some others, such as K. 212 and K. 104, are a little too fast and technical and lost the sustaining melody. It is difficult to say whether the music should just be revolving colours or should be echoes, sometimes major against minor, and be more contrasted in speed and tension. This record gives a good accurate musical rendering but perhaps lacks the sense of drama and lyricism of Colin Booth's recording. *Michael Thomas*

Vivaldi *Opera Arias and Sinfonias* Emma Kirkby, The Brandenburg Consort, Roy Goodman 74' 58" Hyperion CDA66745 *Griselda* Sinfonia, Ombra vane, Agitata da due venti; *Ottone in villa* Sinfonia, Gelosia tu già rendi, L'ombra l'aure e ancora il rio; *L'Atenide* Ferma Teodosio; *Tamerlano/Il Bajazet* Sinfonia; *L'incoronazione di Dario* Non mi lusinga; *Catone in Utica* Se mai senti, Se in campo armato

The copious notes give an excellent background to Vivaldi's huge operatic output and helpful plot summaries. Emma Kirkby sings excitingly throughout, marred only by the occasional (and uncharacteristic) forced top note. The disc is not spoilt though; indeed, never before have I heard a solo recording of hers where she so convincingly portrays different moods and characters. Take, for example, the extended 'Ferma, Teodosio' from *L'Atenide*, with the heroine's cries of desperation and the sustained lament of her acceptance of her fate. Contrast the fiery word painting of 'Agitata due venti' as the heroine compares her heart to a storm-tossed ship with the follow-

ing 'Non ti lusinghi la crudeltade', a heart-rending plea for mercy. Here oboe joins voice in a gorgeous, moving duet. The Brandenburg Consort provides excellent support, especially in the aria 'L'ombre, l'aure e ancora il rio' with its charming violin and oboe solos, recorder duet and soprano echo (Liliana Mazzari) adding extra colour. The arias are joined by three Sinfonias, making an enjoyable recital. Judging by this refreshing selection, the corpus of Vivaldi's dramatic output might reward anyone interested in performing (and recording) it. *Angela Bell*

Vivaldi Concertos for violin I Solisti Veneti, Claudio Scimone 71' 23"

Erato 4509-97415-2 (rec 1979, 1983)
RV 199 *Il sospetto*, 208 *Grosso Mogul*, 234 *L'Inquietudine*, 270 *Il riposo*, 271 *L'amoroso*, 363 *Il cornetto da posta*, 553 (4 vln in Bb)

There are six solo concertos here, plus the rarely-heard concerto for four violins in B flat. Two violinists (Piero Tosi and Maco Fornaciari) share the solos. Their playing, and that of the band, is on the whole bright and dynamic. The first movement of the *Grosso Mogul*, with its extended cadenzas, is an exceptional illustration of how close some modern ensembles have come to their period-instrument colleagues. But the slow movements invite a return to the vibrato-ridden sound of a decade or so ago. Still, this is relatively unknown repertoire and will be welcomed by Vivaldi fans. *BC*

Weiss Sonata 17 Kurt Schneeweiss guitar
Koch Schwann 3-1412-2 49' 18"

This renders me speechless. Schneeweiss's arrangement 'endeavours not so much to produce an authentic version as possible, but rather to adapt Weiss's intentions to the aesthetics of the classical concert guitar' (to quote the notes). The resultant gallimaufrey of technical tricks owes more to Villa-Lobos than to Weiss, who gets trampled underfoot and wiped off the guitarist's shoe somewhere in the middle of the Prelude. Ardent guitar fans may like Schneeweiss's composition but will take exception to the unpolished performance. *Lynda Sayce*

Zelenka Missa Sanctissimae Trinitatis Anna Hlavenková, Magdalena Kožená, Richard Sporka, Stanislav Predota, Michael Pospíšil SATTB, Musica Florea, Marek Stryncl
Studio Matous MK0017-2 231 55' 41"

This is the second Dresden mass setting reviewed in this issue (see Fasch above). This time, instead of the full forces of two choirs and two orchestras, we have 13 singers and a band of 18 players with period instruments. With a few names familiar from Pavel Křikar's *Musica Antiqua Praha*, *Musica Florea*, directed by Marek Stryncl, is a new Czech group specialising in 17th- and 18th-century repertoire. The mass consists of 19 contrasting movements: there are three extended solo arias, a duet for Tenor and Bass with oboe and chalumeau accompaniment and a trio for Soprano, Alto and Tenor. Choruses include homophonic

declamation and typical Zelenka fugues with chromatic counter-subjects and cross-rhythms. On the whole, this is an excellent performance: there are rough edges, particularly in the tuning of the two flutes. The ensemble singing is first-rate, the solo singing delightful with some imaginative cadenzas. I look forward to hearing more from this group: more Zelenka or perhaps some of the Brixis' masses? *BC*

Baroque Trumpet Concertos Håkan Hardenberger, 1 Musici 53' 55"

Philips 442 131-2
Albinoni: *op. 7/3 (arr)*, Baldassare *Sonata in F (arr)*, Corelli *Sonata in D*, Franceschini *Sonata in D*, A. Marcello *Concerto in d (arr)*, Torelli *Sonata in D*, Vivaldi *Concerto in C RV 537 Viviani Sonata I*

This sort of mixed baroque trumpet programme was fine in the 1960s before we were used to the sound of the baroque instrument. But with our aural image of the music that was appropriate for the trumpet and could be played on it, works like the Albinoni (originally for oboe) which require the trumpet to play a whole range of notes Albinoni could never have imagined possible, combined with the avoidance of characteristic trumpet figuration, makes this feel completely wrong. A pity, because the genuine solo and two-trumpet pieces have commendable panache and 1 Musici show signs of learning from the sounds of unmodernised strings. *CB*

Laudate pueri: Cantatas Peter Schreier tenor, Ludwig Güttler tpt & dir, Virtuosi Saxoniae Berlin Classics BC 1077-2 55' 42" (rec 1987)
Ariosti *O quam suavis*; Fux *Plaudite sonat tuba*; Heinichen *Lamentatio I*; A. Scarlatti *Su le sponde del Tebro*; Zelenka *Laudate pueri*

Congratulations to tenor and trumpeter for assembling this enterprising anthology. It is a modern-instrument performance with nice string-playing, but the brilliant modern trumpet style has a facility that sometimes makes the music feel superficial. Peter Schreier sings with clarity and accuracy, if at times a little blandly. But if the repertoire appeals, this is worth buying: only the Scarlatti is at all well known.. *CB*

Concert au goût italien: Chamber Music, Paris 1740 Musica Alta Ripa 49' 17"

MDG 309 0503-2
Boismortier *Sonata for rec, 2 vlns, bc op. 34/1 Corrette Cello Sonata op. 20/2, 'L'allure'; Leclair Overture in A op. 13/5; Mondonville Sonata op. 3/4; Naudot Concerto in G op. 17/5*

It is a relief to find a potpourri recording in the age of the supposedly archival single-composer collections. This contains an *assortiment* of chamber concerti and sonatas by a crew of French Italophiles manifestly more interested in *le goût italien* than in *les goûts réunis*. One would have thought any date from 1700 to the 1720s to be more significant than 1740, with all French composers then falling over themselves to write in the Italian style against the *milieu* of the ongoing *querelle*. The performances are variable in quality; the best is Guido Larisch playing Corrette's op. 20/2 cello sonata.

Kah-Ming Ng

L'Orgue Baroque Nigel Allcoat 68' 15"

Herald HAVPCD171

Boyvin *Suite du 5 ton*; M. Corrette *Magnificat du 3 & 4 ton*; Croft *Voluntary in a for double organ*; Dandrieu *Offertoire pour le jour de Pâques*; de Grigny *Point d'Orgue*; Handel *Fugue in a*; Purcell *Verse in C*; Roman *Sinfonia da chiesa*; Stanley *Voluntary in C op. 5/1*; Walond *Voluntary in G op. 1/5*

The large new four-manual French classical organ in Saint-Antoine l'Abbaye (Aubertin, 1992) is a magnificent instrument in a very favourable acoustic and has been well recorded by David Wright. The sound is just right for the pieces by De Grigny, Dandrieu, Boyvin and Corrette, as is the modified fifth-comma meantone tuning based on Schlick (1511) and Rameau (1726). The choice of contrasting French and English pieces of similar dates makes for an effective and instructive programme. The playing is nicely-articulated, sensitive and clearly heartfelt. Registrations make good use of the organ's resources and are generally historically accurate, although a naughty 16' pedal Bourdon makes its way into some of the French movements and the use of no less than five 8' stops together for a Handel fugue brings out a Brahmsian quality I had never found in it before. The 1689 suite by Boyvin is particularly effective, and it is good to hear the gutsy sonority of a 16' Grand Jeu de Tierce in the duo. Well recommended. *Andrew Benson-Wilson*

Pastorales: French Court and Peasant Music from 1650 to 1750 Folies Bergères 68' 22"

Ensemble Music Label EML 013

Music by Boismortier, Chédeville, Corrette, Daquin, La Borde, Lalande, Marais, Naudot, Scellery

The longing of the privileged for the 'simple life' expresses itself in baroque France in a most attractive way in the Noëls, where peasant music and instruments were wedded with the more formal practices of the court circle. This CD gives examples of the repertoire from that time that has lived on in traditional noëls. Musette and hurdy-gurdy, in unlikely but rewarding liaison with oboe, violin, bass viol, recorder and harpsichord, produce enjoyable music and beautiful sounds. The songs range from the elegant and courtly through the raunchy (Corrette drinking songs, in which the men join in the chorus) to the intense and passionate. Sara Stowe sings them with wit and commitment and an unerring sense of style. The instrumentalists are all good: Jean-Pierre Rasle plays musette and cornamuse, Matthew Spring the hurdy-gurdy, guitar and theorbo, Emilia Benjamin violin and bass viol. Her perfectly-tuned playing of the former in songs by de la Borde is exquisitely phrased, but she takes Marais' very difficult *Cloches ou Carillon* reflectively rather than following the composer's marking gay. I would have enjoyed some Couperin: Sara Stowe shows herself a very adequate harpsichordist and his Musettes would have made a good companion to the genuine article. But it's churlish to ask for more: what could they have omitted? Not the Naudot – exquisitely played on violin, oboe and hurdy-gurdy, nor the LaLande, with all instruments suc-

cessfully united, drones as well, and certainly not the songs, in which the performers cross the boundaries, as the music demands, to deliver the music with vibrancy, vigour and flair.
Robert Oliver

CLASSICAL

C. P. E. Bach Trio sonatas H. 576, 577, 582, 584, 590 London Baroque 62' 10"
Harmonia Mundi HMC 901511

The trio sonatas are just like Bach's exciting symphonies, but without the ripieno effect and the tricky intonation that besets multiple strings. This CD has a selection of some of his best *trii*, baroque-style trio sonatas of 1747-56. London Baroque's virtuosic and expressive ensemble playing conjures up the quirkiness and characteristic boldness, originality, novelty and humour that endear Bach's music to us. From light-weight galanteries to tear-jerking *Empfindsamkeit*, there is enough passion for all *Kenner und Liebhaber*.
Kah-Ming Ng

Beethoven Sonatas for Piano & Cello op. 5
Christophe Coin, Patrick Cohen 59' 07"
Harmonia Mundi HMA 1901179 (rec 1985)

These sonatas were inspired by Beethoven's visit to the Berlin court where the director of the court orchestra was the French cellist Jean-Pierre Duport. Aware of the cello's superior cantabile and sustaining powers, Beethoven avoided slow movements which would place the piano at a disadvantage; and by giving the cello melodic and thematic material he moved away from the notion that the cello should reinforce the bass line. The playing on this disc is lyrical and expressive, and the recording balances the instruments perfectly. Oddly, there is no mention of the specific instruments used, though other discs by these performers have given them.
Margaret Cranmer

Carulli Opere per chitarra e fortepiano - VIII
Leopoldo Saracino, Massimo Palumbo
Nuova Era Ancient Music 7196 58' 41"
Contents: op. 61, 161, 168, 207/1, Fantaisie sur... Fiorella musique de Auber (in A).

Carulli is well known to legions of amateur guitarists through his volumes of technical studies. These larger-scale works have immediate, abundant charm and little depth, but they are interesting because of the unusual pairing. The 19th-century instruments balance much better than their modern counterparts and the recording reproduces this realistically. Saracino and Palumbo play with technical assurance, fine ensemble and subtle musicality; alas, the tuning is dreadful. The instruments are not in tune with themselves or with each other, a really unfortunate flaw in an otherwise attractive recording.
Lynda Sayce

Haydn 12 Piano Sonatas Rosmarie Wright
forte piano 71' 28" + 71' 19"
Arembe ASRWCD24

This two-disc set performed on a 1799 Broadwood is particularly good value at a

little over £15.00. These are spirited performances in which the player explores the wide-ranging emotions in her selection. Excellent control and careful phrasing are matched by some riveting playing pointing the many dramatic moments and sudden harmonic surprises in these sonatas. There may perhaps be some overpedalling, particularly in the earlier sonatas, but this does not detract from some outstanding performances. Some of the very best of this corpus are here, including all five sonatas in minor keys. It was a pity, however, that none of the late sonatas are included (the latest being the G major No. 54 of 1782), as it would have been good to have had an overview of Haydn's keyboard sonatas in the one set. My only disappointment is with the scanty and uninformative notes that accompany these excellent performances.
Ian Graham-Jones

Haydn Piano Trios vol. 4, nos. 38-40 (Hob XV:24-26) Patrick Cohen forte piano, Erich Höbarth vln, Christoph Coin vlc 47' 15"
Harmonia Mundi HMC90 1514

These brilliant trios dedicated to the amateur fortepianist Rebecca Schroeter were composed just before Haydn left London in 1795. Presumably he had a higher opinion of amateur pianists than of string players because the violin parts are easier and the cello just doubles the bass. The set includes Haydn's most popular trio, with the Gypsy Rondo, which contrasts admirably with the profound F# minor trio. The ensemble playing here is impeccable, with the instruments blending well. Perhaps the recording places the Guarnerius violin a little too forward of the Walter fortepiano for the best effect.
Margaret Cranmer

Haydn Symphonies 22-25 The Hanover Band, Roy Goodman 74' 46"
Hyperion CDA665236

These four symphonies from Haydn's Eisenstadt years are like *Tafelmusik* for the nobility, unlike the *Sturm und Drang* stuff of the following Esterháza period. One suspects that the young *Vice-Capel-Meister* did not dare to overstep his mark as long as the *Oberkapellmeister* Werner was nominally still in charge. There is little to challenge the listeners, and one can sense that the Hanover Band were struggling to maintain enthusiasm, despite their stylish and polished endeavours.
Kah-Ming Ng

Haydn Theresienmesse; Salve Regina in g
Prague Chamber Choir, Virtuosi di Praga, Johannes Moesus (56' 16")
Discover DDCD 920216

[Haydn's] best works... have not lost one bit of their freshness.' It is as well that the note-writer tells us this, since the Prague Chamber Choir mostly makes a sound that is solid and unexciting, with little sense of forward movement even in the fugues, though the occasional sotto voce passages shine through with a wonderful, round, warm tone. The recorded definition of choir and orchestra is obscure. The soloists

are too serious and their dark vowels and pronounced vibrato may not appeal to everyone. Soprano Valerie Girard alone finds an occasional lightness of touch. The orchestral playing is excellent, especially when the texture is light enough for individual lines to hold their own. The *Salve Regina* provides a welcome change of colour with an organ now added to the string orchestra and, indeed, the choir does not make such heavy weather here.
Angela Bell

Mozart Horn Concertos K. 371, 412, 417, 447, 495, 514. Anthony Halstead, Academy of Ancient Music, Christopher Hogwood
L'Oiseau Lyre 443 216-2 59' 51"

The editorial complexities in Mozart's horn concertos are enormous, with fragments still emerging: the reconstruction of the fragmentary Rondo K. 371 includes 60 bars not included in the NMA score published as recently as 1987. This and other editorial work has been done convincingly by John Humphries, who also goes back to Mozart's draft for the Rondo of K. 412; Sussmayr's version (K. 514) is also included here. The notes do not mention Wolff's nice idea that the *Lamentatione* theme occurs in his version because he had at hand a sketch of Mozart with an early idea for the *Requiem* as well as the Rondo that he rejected that chant in favour of the *tonus peregrinus*; Sussmayr did, however, make very effective use of it. One used to think of the horn as the most difficult of period instruments; it is almost a defect of Anthony Halstead's playing that it sounds so easy, with the stopped notes integrating so smoothly into the melodic line. The recording of the orchestra avoids the fad of highlighting it so that every semiquaver sounds as a polished entity. So this is a slightly subdued recording; some will want a version more brash, but I am happy with this.
CB

Mozart Litaniae Lauretanae K. 109, etc
Arnold Schoenberg Chor, Concentus musicus Wien, Nikolaus Harnoncourt. 76' 49"
Teldec Das Alte Werk 4509-9617-2
Alma Dei creatoris K. 277, Benedictus sit Deus K. 117, Ergo interest K. 143, Inter natos mulierum K. 72, Litaniae Lauretanae K. 109, Regina coeli K. 108, Sancta Maria mater Dei, K. 273, Sub tuum praesidium K. 198, Tantum ergo K. 197, Te Deum K. 141, Venite populi K. 260,

There are eleven works on this CD, not many of them regularly performed. In that respect, therefore, it is most welcome. Two of them feature on the Emma Kirkby/AAM disc of 1985 and it must be said the present disc does not match those performances. Although some people consider Kirkby's voice too pure for this repertoire, I felt that Charlotte Margiono's voice was just too big and was surprised to find that Barbara Bonney failed to impress as much as she has done in operatic roles from Drottningholm. The choral singing and instrumental playing is better than other recent Harnoncourt releases (Vivaldi's *Gloria*, for example).
BC

Also recently issued on the same label are four other discs of Mozart church music directed by Nikolaus Harnoncourt.

Mozart String Quintets K. 515, 516 Ensemble 415 68' 51"
 Harmonia Mundi HMC 901512

Two of Mozart's most profound chamber works are given performances that are immaculate in detail on classical instruments by Ensemble 415. I found the C major Quintet (played with the *Andante* before the *Minuet*, the current order of the autograph, not of the first edition) a little lacklustre, though the G minor has more warmth. Perhaps the bulges in tone on the *fp* markings and the overdone endings of phrases, which often get lost in the texture, may sound somewhat excessive for some tastes; nevertheless, these are fine performances. The use of classical instruments stretches the demands on both instrument and performer, and Ensemble 415's perfection makes it sound all too easy. The Salomon's versions (paired with different Quintets) invite interesting comparisons.

Ian Graham-Jones

Viotti Flute Quartets op. 22 Claudio Ferrarini, Quartetto di Salisburgo 61' 27"
 Stradivarius Str 33338

An acid test of the musical worth of such a collection as this is whether the reviewer's attention is captured in listening to the whole CD in one sitting. Although written in 1803, the three three-movement flute quartets are based on similar models for this combination by J. C. Bach and Abel and are stylistically rooted in the late 18th century. They have the galant grace of J. C. combined with the intensity and rapidly changing thematic ideas of C. P. E., superimposed with the virtuosity of Boccherini. Despite the use of modern techniques and an almost Galway-like vibrato on Ferrarini's wooden flute, these performances are always spirited and convincing. The works are sufficiently contrasted with some memorable movements, so come through the test with flying colours

Ian

Graham-Jones

Grand Duett: music for two organs Luigi Celeghin, István Ella, János Sebestyén on organs at the Misericordia Basilica at Sant' Elpidio a Mare, Italy 64' 20"

Hungaroton HCD 31464

Sonatas by Banchieri, Cherubini, Galuppi, B. Pasquini, Piazzini, Terreni; Beethoven *Adagio in F* WoO 33/1; P. J. Blanco *Concerto 2 in G*, S. Wesley *Grand Duett in Eb*, Zucchini *Concerto in B flat*

Until 1981, the Misericordia Basilica at Sant' Elpidio a Mare had two 1741 organ cases but only one organ. Then the Epistle organ of 1757 (by Nacchini) was joined by a 1758 Callido organ from a nearby church and the small but fascinating repertoire of music for two organs has found a new recording venue. Short dances from 16th-century Hungarian MSS are given lively performances by the three players who share the honours, although most of the CD is taken up with generally less-than-distinguished 18th-century pieces in the pretty but easily wearing gallant style. Beethoven's *Adagio* for mechanical organ is a relief amongst the three-course Italian meal of Terreni, Piazzini

and Zucchini. Registrations are sparkling and bright, with staccato articulation predominating.

Andrew Benson-Wilson

Music of the Federal Era Members of the Federal Society, John Baldon 47' 20"

New World Records 80299-2 (rec. 1978)

Music by Benjamin Carr, Charles Gilfert, Samuel Holyoke, Franz Kotzwar, Victor Pelissier, Philip Phile, Oliver Shaw, Raynor Taylor & anon.

This is an intriguing reissue (cheaply but sensibly packaged in a stiff polythene wrapper but with no skimping on the notes) of music popular in America at around the same time as the English music on the disc reviewed below. As with that, it may be difficult to justify the disc on merit if Mozart and Beethoven are your criteria; but the music is entertaining and companionable. I'm not sure if I would sit and listen to it to the exclusion of other activity, but it is good company in a traffic jam or on a motorway. The orchestra has an appealingly homely sound, but the sopranos are less convincing.

CB

The Romantic Muse: English Music in the Time of Beethoven Invocation (Julia Gooding, Ana-Maria Rincon, Charles Daniels, Rufus Muller, Christopher Purves SSTTB, Frances Kelly harp, Timothy Roberts fortepiano) 77' 07"

Hyperion CDA66740

Attwood *Coronach*, Ellen's Song, The Soldier's Dream; Corfe *Lady Anne Bothwell's Lament*; Haydn *The Spirit's Song*, The Wanderer; J. S. Smith *Blest pair of sirens*; Knyvett *Jessie*; W. Linley *Down in the gloomy vale*; P.-J. Meyer *Duet in d on Scottish Airs*; Pinto *The Distress'd Mother*, *Rondo in Eb*; J.S. Smith *Blest pair of sirens*; Storace *Captivity*; S. Webbe Jr *The Death of the Common Soldier*, *Funeral March in Honour of Beethoven*

This addition to Hyperion's invaluable English Orpheus series presents the kind of programme which might have been heard at one of the social musical gatherings that were so popular in Georgian England. The major part is taken up by songs and glees by native-born composers, although two of Haydn's songs composed to words by Anne Hunter are included. Not surprisingly, they take the palm by a considerable margin, but some of the other songs are not without interest, in particular Pinto's *The Distress'd Mother*, a highly dramatic work in the style of *Erk König*. The interspersed instrumental items are of less interest and include a truly awful *Funeral March in Honour of Beethoven* by the young Samuel Webbe which must have had the great man turning in his newly-dug grave. The performances strike a nice balance between being accomplished without adding a sophistication which would be out of keeping for such unpretentious music. The tone of Timothy Roberts' 1817 Broadwood is particularly attractive. This is less rewarding than Invocation's previous disc devoted to the Linley family, but worth investigating by those interested in the byways of English music.

Brian Robins

MISCELLANEOUS

Wanda Landowska in Performance Vol. 1

Music & Arts CD-821(2) (2 CDs) 128' 24"
 C.P.E. Bach *Concerto in D* (H421); Handel op. 4/6; Mozart K.415, K.482; Poulenc *Concerto champêtre*; (rec. 1943-49)

To listen to these recordings from the 1940s is a humiliating experience. The record has a warning that it is not recommended to people who are interested in high quality sound. But the music is so much more important than the sound and it has been remastered adequately. The C. P. E. Bach concerto is beautifully conducted by Adolf Kaldolky with really expressive string playing. In spite of the dull thud of the harpsichord, which sounds like 'grumble and grunt' under six feet of mud, the performance survives as an intelligible musical experience. The Handel B flat concerto sounds better on the harp. But for colour, invention and surprise, the Poulenc is a remarkable work. The harpsichord sometimes replies to the orchestra, sometimes contradicts it with abrasive sounds. The orchestration really reflects the harmonics of the 16' harpsichord. One can only lament that this work is not performed more often. On the second disc Landowska plays two Mozart concertos. It is absolutely amazing that, after playing such a heavy, insensitive instrument as the old 16' harpsichord, she has such sensitive fingers to give the colour, variety of tone, impeccable runs in a performance that is both virtuosic and poetic. The slow movement of K. 487 is outstanding.

Michael Thomas

For UK distributors, see the directory in the current issue of *Gramophone* (p.182 in the Jan 1995 issue). Companies not listed there:

Hungaroton: Select

Sound Creation Studio, Meisenweg 55, 67346 Speyer, Germany

Studio Matous, Ronkova 8, 180 00 Praha 8, Czech Republic

Tonstudio und Musikverlag GmbH, Alte Markt 26 06108 Halle/Saale, Germany

VTL Vacuum Tube Logic of America Inc, 4774 Murietta St, #9, Chino, CA 91710 USA (909 627 5944; fax ...6988)

The reissue of early English organ music played by Thurston Dart (see Dec. p. 19) is now available direct from MSCD: J. Martin Stafford, 298 Blossomfield Road, Solihull, B91 1TH

Early Music Review

Subscriptions (10 issues per year):-

UK: £10.00 Europe (airmail): £13.00

Rest of world:

(airmail): £20.00 (surface) £13.00

£UK cheques & Eurocheques payable to King's Music

\$US (\$30.00) and French (FFR 115,00)

cheques payable to C. A. J. Bartlett

NOT-SO-EARLY MUSIC: SOME RECENT RECORDINGS

Brian Clark

If we are becoming accustomed to CDs devoted to lesser-known composers of the baroque period through the work of groups such as The Parley of Instruments at home and the Musica Antiquas of Köln and Praha abroad, the same can hardly be said of music of the Rococo, Classical and Early Romantic eras. The cult of the what's-it-centenary as a PR angle for the promotion has seen that change somewhat: Joseph Martin Krause achieved a brief spell in the limelight in 1992, the year after the great Mozart extravaganza. But what have we heard of his music since then? Was it all a candle in the wind? Will Boccherini, three of whose cello concertos have been recorded by Christophe Coin and the Ensemble Baroque de Limoges, along with the *Aria Accademica*, sung by Marta Almajano, on *Astrée* (E 8517, 62'), return to the shadows in 1995? Indeed, will anyone notice, as Purcell-mania sweeps the Early Music scene and beyond? But irrespective of bicentenaries, there has been a marked increase in commercial activity in the recording of period-instrument performances of classical and later music.

The Boccherini disc is full of quality music; nothing of outstanding originality, it must be admitted, but full of energy and bursting at the seams with eminently singable tunes. Christophe Coin's playing, as ever, strikes a keen balance between virtuoso display and great poise and control.

Abel is not an unknown name, but he has fared less well than his colleague J. C. Bach. But his time has now come: cpo has already released three discs of music by Carl Friedrich Abel, with more to follow. The first two (released in 1993) include the six Symphonies Op. 10 played by La Stagione, directed by Michael Schneider (cpo 999 207-2, 61' 24"); the same forces are joined by Karl Kaiser for four of the composer's Op. 6 flute concertos (cpo 999 208-2, 63' 27"); the third disc has chamber music for flutes, gamba and cello (cpo 999 209-2, 61' 08"). The playing on all the discs is first rate: the clarinets are particularly worthy of note in the symphonies; Karl Kaiser's beautiful phrasing and well-constructed cadenzas make the concertos a treat and a must for all students of early flute. The recording balance of the chamber music disc is a little ill-conceived – at times it feels as if the microphone was placed under the lid of the harpsichord. Also, I think it might have been nicer to alternate music with and music without flutes, rather than playing blocks of pieces for one scoring. Curiously, although the notes are written by the Abel expert (and single-handed editor and publisher of his complete works), Walter Knappe, his catalogue numbers are not used to identify the works recorded.

Michael Schneider is also the conductor of a Hasse opera, in which *La Stagione* are joined by sopranos Barbara Schlick and Ann Moyonios and tenor Wilfried Jochens (*Capriccio* 60 043-2, 2 discs, 123' 35"). This *Intermezzo tragico* in two-parts is full of delights; the problem for me was one of concentration – there seemed little dramatic impetus and, while the music was doubtless very clever and a perfect vehicle for the three marvellous singers to show off their technical skills to the full, it seemed rather like a 'That's Music Now 1770' compilation of *Hasse's Greatest Hits*. If that all seems a little disparaging, it is not entirely intended as such: I feel sure that the piece could be very successful on the stage, but it simply did not work for me on disc.

Two *Capriccio* offerings take us to areas even more remote from the standard repertoire. One has symphonies by Gaetano Brunetti, Juan Arriaga, José Pons, Francisco Moreno and José Nonó. These *Sinfonías Españolas* (10 488, 58' 43") date from around the beginning of the 19th century and are clearly influenced by late Haydn. Each of the four has its own voice, perhaps the most powerful (and best-known) being that of the teenaged Arriaga, who died before reaching his 20th birthday. Another disc (10 489; 68' 19") contains three symphonies by Brunetti. These are also from Spain: Brunetti was one year younger than Boccherini, and the pair were probably acquaintances if not friends. There are four movements in each symphony and there is prominent use of a woodwind group within the orchestra, which gives them a quite individual character. Concerto Köln work very successfully without a conductor: their ensemble playing is remarkably precise and they succeed in raising what might be considered trifling, insignificant music to something quite worthy of note.

If the Early Music world was at one stage in danger of losing its cutting edge, as recording schedules seemed full of Bach, Handel and Mozart, let us hope that these are only the first of a new wave of imaginative planning: great though that triumvirate undoubtedly were, they did not live in vacuums – without some reference to the Fasches and Vanhals of their circles, we cannot fully appreciate their true genius.

We hope that most subscribers received an errata sheet with their last issue. The misprints were our fault, but the printer (who came to us as part of the link with *Early Music News*) seemed incapable of reading any instructions and added a variety of mistakes in imposition. Avoiding misprints is a problem: the more time I spend on *Early Music Review* the more I wonder at the skill of Peter Williamson, who printed my writings from 1977 to 1994 in *Early Music News* with such accuracy. I am sure that, as soon as I send this to the printer, mistakes will leap from the page. I caught a nice one in our *Dido* at the very last minute (Scene: the shops). Luckily, our cottage-industry approach to music printing means that mistakes can be instantly corrected. A publisher recently objected to 13 misprints in a rival edition; our scores can be corrected at once, his stayed wrong for nearly 70 years.

LETTERS & COMMENTS

Dear Clifford,

I'm just recovering from two concerts which included various *Histoires sacrées* and a Magnificat by Charpentier and write to agree with David Hansell that (a) it is wonderful music and (b) works well with organ and theorbo only.

I tuned the organ for the concerts in Nantes and deepest Vendée, and found that a 'tweaked' Valotti temperament (with C#s and G#s moved a little lower) worked very satisfactorily, and was one to which strings and theorbo could easily accommodate themselves.

There is a great deal of theory around about organ continuo tuning, not all of which takes into account two basic structural problems: that stopped pipes have, as their first harmonic, an octave and a fifth and that (most) strings are tuned in fifths. I've come to think that therefore Valotti or its later English 'equivalent', Young, work well practically. Indeed, for four performances of Bach's St John Passion last year, I eventually found that Young's temperament suited players and the music far more satisfactorily than any apparently-authentic German system.

These two tunings have two further advantages: (1) at our conventional A=415 low pitch, one can take B flat from a 440 fork, and (ii) in the usually noisy circumstances of rehearsals and the entry of the audience for concerts, one can place the temperaments' pure fifths very precisely by listening to the pipes' harmonics. Tuning the bass pipes is particularly important to keep the continuo string players content, especially since bass tones travel well in the resonant acoustics of the neo-gothic piles of the village and town churches in western France where we do most of our concerts.

I would be interested to hear what other tunings have been used for Charpentier, in whose time, one would think, meantone was the norm for organs, whatever the clavicemblists were up to.

Martin Renshaw

Dear Mr Bartlett,

I liked your remarks on tunes and you might be interested in my reactions. Did tunes exist in 'serious' music of the 16th and 15th centuries? My impression is that popular tunes were only admitted if heavily disguised rhythmically and polyphonically. Who was the first composer who does use tunes that are easily recognised and remembered? Purcell, perhaps. In the 18th and 19th centuries this is more general, although everybody may not have approved. Schubert has been criticised for using a trivial tune as second subject in the Unfinished Symphony. By the end of the 19th century harmonic developments were making this kind of thing less of a normal procedure, and composers like Mahler and Debussy were bringing in popular tunes for non-musical reasons.

No doubt this is an over-simplification and perhaps I am wrong. Whether anybody still sings tunes is another matter. No *Academic Festival Overture* today!

A. D. Bolingbroke

I wasn't actually writing about tunes in 'art' music. Constant Lambert's dictum on the use of folk-tunes applies to any discrete melody in a longer work other than variations, and Vaughan Williams' remarks on Beethoven's problems in finale of the Ninth Symphony are apposite. My thanks to other readers who have commented favourably on my editorial. CB

Dear Clifford,

Congratulations on Early Music Review... Mention in your December issue of Mendelssohn's *Paulus* and of Ludford's *Missa Lapidaverunt Stephanus* reminds me of a conversation I held a few years back with Rafael Frübeck de Burgos in the conductor's room of Birmingham Town Hall during the interval of a memorable televised performance by the City of Birmingham Symphony Orchestra and the CBSO Chorus of *Elijah*, first performed in 1846 in that very building. I observed that it was a pity that all the dramatic highlights of *Elijah* occur during part I. 'Ah!' he said, 'bot mit Paulus eet ees even vorse. Vonce Stephanas hass been lapidated, nuzzing else 'appens!'

Beresford King-Smith

Several readers have written to point out that Harry Gabb (who featured on some of the Deller recordings) was sub-organist at St Paul's and organist of the Chapel Royal. I was puzzled by the mention of Anthony Baines as double bass on the Monteverdi disc; presumably it must have been the inimitable Francis.

I cut off my comments on Peter MacDonald after the major point at the foot of the page. But I cannot let pass the idea that a choir-master would chose a Marian antiphon, surely a false analogy with a protestant attitude to hymns. According to my understanding of the Roman liturgy, the antiphon is fixed; whether the congregation perceives it to relate to a concerted setting of a psalm is another matter. I too dislike fussy alteration of continuo instruments: organ and chitarrone are enough (multiplied if the building is large). The decay of mensuration conventions is a big and complex subject, which I avoided, but I suspect that old habits died hard. See Ellen Harris on *Dido and Aeneas*, for instance, as well as Roger Bowers' article in *Music and Letters*, August 1992. Although I am congenitally sceptical about numerology, there is definitely something suspicious about the way Monteverdi varies each statement of the cantus firmus in the Sonata.

Questions for Denis. Is there really a set of the 1610 publication in Vienna? (It is not listed in Sartori or Stattkus's *Claudio Monteverdi Verzeichnis*.) What evidence is there for the existence of the score mentioned in paragraph 3? In view of the ambiguity of terms related to *viola*, how do we know Monteverdi played the *viola* rather than any other stringed instrument? (The mistakenly-surviving alto-clef part of the 1640 *Magnificat a 8* suggests that exact doubling is not the solution for missing *viola* parts.) I look forward to the revised edition of your invaluable translation of the letters, though fear that they tell each performer what he wants to hear.

Thank you, Denis, for sending a copy of your fascinating article on Beecham and early music; if any reader wants a copy, a pound (£1.50 or \$2.00 for posting abroad) will secure a copy. CB

One of our readers is wondering whether there has been any recent research on the origin of *Liliburlero* and whether there are any reasonably authentic recordings of it. Information welcome.