

# Early Music

## REVIEW

Number 34

October 1997

ISSN 1355-3437

Price £1.50

Editor: Clifford Bartlett  
Associate editor: Brian Clark  
Administration: Elaine Bartlett  
Reviewers:

Peter Branscombe  
Rosemary Druce  
Ian Graham-Jones  
Simon McVeigh  
Noel O'Regan  
Marie Ritter  
Brian Robins  
D. James Ross

- 2 Books & Music
- 8 Handbook to Monteverdi  
Vespers *Clifford Bartlett*
- 9 Books & Music *continued*
- 10 Music in London  
*Shane Fletcher*
- 11 ♪ Grandi Ave maris stella
- 12 Sainte Columbe  
*Jonathan Dunsford*
- 14 CD Reviews
- 20 Obituary: Robert Spencer  
*Peter Holman*

Early Music Review is published on the first of each month except January and August by King's Music, Redcroft, Banks End, Wyton, Huntingdon, Cambs PE17 2AA  
tel +44 (0)1480 52076 fax +44 (0)1480 450821  
e-mail cbkings@ibm.net

### Subscription rates

UK: £10.00 Europe: £13.00  
Rest of World:

£20.00 (airmail), £13.00 (surface)  
Cheques payable to King's Music  
except French francs (FFR115) and  
\$US (\$30.00 airmail, \$20.00 surface)  
payable to C. A. J. Bartlett

Visa, Mastercard, Eurocard accepted

Dr A. J. Godzieba, a teacher of theology and philosophy, wrote, after some general compliments, the following in the letter he sent to place a subscription for *EMR*.

I enjoyed... your comments about Capriccio Stravagante. I too had read some of the buzz on the net about Sempé's performances, and I appreciated your insight that his performance style 'insults the audience'. I know only his recorded performances, but they (as well as their accompanying notes) give off an in-your-face, hipper-than-thou pretentiousness which is wearying and which ultimately has the effect of staving off any informed evaluation: 'we're already at the top of our game, so all your dissent is ill-conceived from the start.'

However, despite my comments on Sempé's new Byrd disc, I am not quite as convinced as I was. Admittedly, behaviour like the Boston soprano's demand for applause before the instruments had finished was just ill-mannered (and the fact that her closing gesture fitted her performance is a sign that the performance took the wrong tone). But I happened to hear another performance of one of the cantatas in that programme in a small-scale concert in Cambridge recently and I missed some of the boldness, vigour and commitment of Capriccio Stravagante. The Private Music could, indeed, be called a very English group, even though the soprano, Hedvig Aberg, was in fact Swedish. Musically, it was fine, except that the violin was out of tune – perhaps put off by the cello being tuned a tone low – and less assertive than her colleagues. But the neat and decorous cello playing by Abby Wall, fine though it was, made me long for a bit of Jay Bernfeld's vigour (I was disconcerted to see down bows when I expected pushes) and the singer needed a touch of the passion that Guillemette Laurens revelled in.

So there needs to be compromise, perhaps a mid-Manche style with some extravagance but without going over the top. Are such compromises inevitably boring? Silas Standage, the group's harpsichordist, is off for further study in Brussels. Perhaps that is safer than Paris.

CB

## Books and Music

### Clifford Bartlett

#### FROM INSIDE

Bernard D. Sherman *Inside Early Music: Conversations with Performers* New York: Oxford University Press, 1997. xi + 414pp, £25.00. ISBN 0 19 509708 4

Interviews with the famous names of the early-music world are common enough but are rarely conducted at the intellectual level shown here. I happened to take on holiday as as light-hearted reading Taruskin's notorious collected essays *Text and Act* (also published by OUP New York but not sent for review). That infuriated me chiefly because of the monotonous repetition of his big idea: that what is characteristic of authentic performance is not a recreation of the past but an essential characteristic of a post-Stravinskian 20th century aesthetic. That explains something, but not everything, and it gets in the way of his genuinely perceptive criticism. (I like someone who begins his review of the Ninth with the timpanist.) Had Sherman's interviews been available, Taruskin would have had more with which to engage.

Sherman interviewed 23 leading performers, mostly conductors or directors of ensembles, who show a wide range of attitudes ranging from lack of interest in the recreation of early performance practice to belief in its fundamental importance. It is a task he approaches with enormous intelligence; his questions lead somewhere and produce insight into what the musicians are trying to do, both philosophically and practically. He links, compares and contrasts (without making a meal of it), and points towards further reading and listening. Sometimes he goes further, as in his fascinating *Postscript on Medieval Music, Plainchant, and "Otherness"* (pp. 88-95). One potential contributor tells me that he was happy with the interview but not with the write-up of it. They read convincingly to me, though one should not expect a single conversation to cover the full complexity of any individual's beliefs. Rather than searching for commendatory words of my own, I will repeat those of Taruskin quoted on the jacket: 'I can't imagine a better book of its kind... Readers will profit greatly and they are addressed considerably and without condescension.'

#### COLLECTED CROCKER

Richard L. Crocker *Studies in Medieval Music Theory and the Early Sequence Variorum* [Ashgate], 1997. [xvi + 334pp], £49.50. ISBN 0 86078 643 9

This is a collection of articles by one of our most distinguished medievalist. It goes back further into the recent past than the similar volume devoted to David Fallows in that it omits Crocker's more recent preoccupation with

chant, exemplified in a variety of articles and the new *New Oxford History of Music* vol. 2. It is perhaps Hamlet without the Prince to have his articles on the Sequence without the book. Six of the 18 articles are reprinted from the *Journal of the American Musicological Society*, that quantity being in itself an acknowledgment of Crocker's distinction as a scholar. One might argue that most people who would find this volume of interest should have access to JAMS, but the longest article, a 54-page stylistic study of the sequence published in a memorial volume to Leo Schrade, is far less accessible and is perhaps the article here which is most usefully reprinted. The shortest, from *Music & Letters* 1987, is an encomium and skilful summary of John Stevens' *Words and Music in the Middle Ages*. Crocker adds a short introduction, describing how the articles fit into his life's work, but not commenting on how well they have worn; perhaps the series would be more useful if introductions could be contributed by sympathetic but not uncritical younger scholars. The original pagination is preserved, so that this can be used as a substitute for the original for bibliographic purposes; but the page size is often smaller, making reading harder work. Other volumes in the series are devoted to the renaissance expert D. P. Walker and Christopher Page (which I haven't seen).

#### LUTE-SONG ANTECEDENTS

The English Lute-Song before Dowland... edited and transcribed by Christopher Goodwin. The Lute Society, 1996-97

1. *Songs from the Dallis Manuscript c. 1583*. 45pp, £12.00 (£8.00 for Lute Society members) ISBN 0 905655 01 X
2. *Songs from Additional Manuscript 4900 and other early sources*. 50pp ISBN 0 905655 07 9

These unpretentiously-produced booklets (A4 pages in comb bindings) bring together the miscellaneous songs with lute from the decades before the outburst of lute-song publication begun by Dowland in 1597 (have I missed the 400th anniversary celebrations?) British Library Add. MS 4900 in fact dates from the first decade of the 17th century, but the songs there appear to have been copied from an earlier collection. The introductions make the point that there is very little material here that might have been genuinely conceived for voice and lute; but it was evidently a common medium of performance and it is useful to have the repertoire so readily available, along with thorough annotations. Some of the music may qualify for the term 'drab' used by literary critics for verse of the early Elizabethan period, but there are certainly songs worth performing here, and the mix of English and foreign material is of interest. Long songs are printed on fold-out pages to avoid turns and the size is large enough for singer

and player to share a copy, providing that both either sit or stand. The tablature is not transcribed.

I have, incidentally, several copies of the Lute and the Viola da Gamba Society newsletters and journals put aside awaiting an issue of *EMR* in which there is space to remind readers of them. Both organisations try to support musicological activity in their field and publish the results as journal articles, reports of meetings, and editions of music. When I was involved in the Gamba Society there were continual rumbles from players that effort spent on the more academic side (i.e. the journal *Chelys*) was a waste of the Society's funds. But much of the research leads directly or indirectly to an extension of the repertoire, improvement of editions, or understanding of performance practice. I strongly recommend that players support the relevant society. The Lute Society Newsletter generally includes some music, and articles can be as practical as Lynda Sayce's entertaining piece on *Flying with Lutes*. (Main recommendation: 'Much of the art of getting a lute on board hinges on appearing unencumbered', though that is difficult to achieve with a theorbo, which has to be called a cello – didn't British Rail also require instruments to be renamed?) Both societies offer reductions on their publications to members, and these two volumes are certainly a justification for supporting the society.

#### FRESCOBALDI'S FLOWERS

Frescobaldi *Fiori Musicali... in partitura a 4, utili per sonatori* a cura di Christopher Stembidge. Armelin Musica, 1997. 106pp, £152,000 (35,000 until 31 October).

Subscribers received an advert for this recently, so will have seen the justification for the edition and a sample page (though in reduced size). That page must have been carefully selected to avoid showing one of the oddities of the edition: the use of unstandard beamings. These are not taken from the source but are editorial interpretations following the style of the engraved editions of other works. This seems contrary to the main tendency of the edition, which is to represent the notation of the print as closely as possible. Frescobaldi may have preferred a type-set score on four staves instead of the other option available, engraving two staves, because he wanted the notation to be neutral with regard to phrasing, apart from the clearer presentation of the polyphony. The other quirk of the edition (again not taken from the source) is the flouting of the usual rules for the direction of the stems. My feeling is that anything odd in the manner of notation draws too much attention to itself and is likely to cause the player to over-react. But the principle of providing a version of the work that retains the four-stave lay-out but substitutes modern clefs is likely to be of great benefit to players (harpsichordists as well as organists). They should, of course, get used to the standard C clefs as well, and those who have acquired such skill can play from facsimile. But they, as well as those preferring a two-stave edition, should consult the commentary and critical notes.

#### JENKINS a3

John Jenkins *Consort Music of Three Parts, transcribed and edited by Andrew Ashbee*. (Musica Britannica 70). Stainer & Bell, 1997. xxxi + 166pp, £67.50

This completes the publication of Jenkins' fantasias, those in four, five and six parts already being available in score and parts from Faber Music. The three-part fantasias fall into two groups. 28 are for treble, two basses and organ, which sometimes has independent material (several fantasias begin with organ solos). One in fact is a Pavan; it is a bit pedantic of the MB volume to fail to give it a number in the sequence of fantasias, since the main source and the gamba society index both do so. The other group is for two trebles and bass with no organ part, though that does not necessarily mean that an organ is excluded if you have one at hand. The latter have been quarried for previous editions more than the former, Nathalie Dolmetsch's edition (Bärenreiter *Hortus Music* 149) being the most widespread; my copy is much used. The merits of composer and editor are equally guaranteed by their previous form, and if you want to do more than contemplate the score, parts are also available at £18.50 for each of the two sets. Curiously, however, there is no organ part included with the two-bass set; you either need the complete score or must contact the publisher for copies of individual pieces.

#### VOCAL LOCKE

Matthew Locke *Songs and Dialogues for voice and basso continuo* edited by Mark Levy. Stainer & Bell, 1996. 56pp, £6.75

Several of Locke's songs have become firmly fixed in my mind from accompanying various singers in concerts by Ars Nova in the early 1970s, especially 'Come honest sexton' from *Harmonia Sacra* and Marvell's *A Dialogue between Thirsis and Dorinda*, a love duet leading to soporific consummation in drugged wine. Local musicians have found amusement when performing *A Dialogue between Apollo and Neptune* (on the death of Lord Sandwich in 1672) in his family home, now Hinchbrook School, at the phrase 'the most admired Sandwich'; the use of the name for two bits of bread with something more sustaining in between derives from a later holder of the title. I have fortunately had for many years a copy of Peter Holman's MS collection of Locke's songs; they deserved complete publication and this edition is most welcome. The contrast between that compact MS and the rather spacious layout here is extreme: does there have to be such a distance between the staves? At least you can get away with one copy for a sing-through, though will probably need two or three for performance, depending on your accompaniment. Locke's style is as quirky here as in his other music, but well worth persevering with. There are eight songs and three dialogues here; strangely one Latin song is included but none of the two-voice Latin pieces. One point concerning the realisation: I find that, if both major and minor thirds feel wrong at concluding cadences, unisons/ octaves sound better than fifths.



## LEVERIDGE

Richard Leveridge *Complete Songs (with the music in Macbeth)* Introduction by Olive Baldwin and Thelma Wilson. (*Music for London Entertainment 1660-1800, Series A, Volume 6*) Stainer & Bell, 1997. £120.00. ISBN 0 85249 841 1

Leveridge's reputation survived chiefly through his *Song in Praise of Old English Roast Beef*; cattle were fed properly then. By far his best-known work, however, circulated under the name of Matthew Locke. The music for *Macbeth* was written by Leveridge for a production on 21 November 1702 and astonishingly stayed in use until 1875; the correct attribution was not established till the 1960s. Leveridge's fame was chiefly as a bass singer. He began his theatrical career in 1695 (in time to have sung for Purcell) and retired in 1751. This substantial volume contains 167 songs in facsimile, along with the first edition (c.1770) of *Macbeth*. Apart from its musical interest, it forms a nice sample of English song-publication through the first half of the 18th century. The editors have done an extraordinarily thorough job in tracking down the sources and annotating them, as well as contributing a fine introduction. I gather that there is some doubt concerning the future of the series; it is perhaps difficult to commend this as music of outstanding quality, but it is of considerable value in focussing on a singer/actor/composer whose name crops up so often in the theatrical history of the period. Perhaps one day the song-sheets will be available in reproduction on whatever succeeds CD, but that will be of little use without indexing (or very sophisticated character recognition); until then, volumes like this are still needed.

## SYLVAN GEMINIANI

Francesco Saverio Geminiani *The Inchaned Forrest* a cura di/edited by Enrico Cateri. Libreria Musicale Italiana, 1996. x + 71pp, 1996. ISBN 88 7096 142 7

We have had a facsimile of the parts of this work in the King's Music catalogue for a decade and have two versions of a score, a thorough one by Peter Walls which shows the differences between solo and ripieno partbooks when they are meant to be in unison, and a more compressed and practical one by Blaise Compton. These can now be replaced by this new edition which, though based on the original printed edition, interprets its inconsistencies in the light of the autograph MS (Royal College of Music MS 822). Ripieno and solo violins are both placed on the same staves, which saves space. It is nice that Geminiani's *cresc* & *dim* signs are preserved, but the staccato dashes are too insubstantial. Bar-lines unhelpfully extend unbroken through the score instead of corresponding with the brackets at the beginning of the system, which themselves are not always right. In poor light, the stems of the notes become almost invisible, while shiny white paper can reflect light disconcertingly. I hope future volumes in the series will bear this in mind. Whether or not performers wish to use the orchestral parts produced to accompany this edition or our

facsimiles, this score is essential for anyone who wishes to perform the work, and we will keep copies in stock. The price is likely to be about £12.00.

## RECREATIONAL LECLAIR

Jean-Marie Leclair *Ouvertures et Sonates en Trio Pour Deux Violins avec la Basse Continüe Oeuvre XIII* edited by Richard Gwilt. RG Editions, 2 vols (RG 106 & 107), £14.60 & £12.00

Leclair recycled more than two-thirds of this collection from earlier works, the three sonatas from op. 2 no. 8 (with the gamba part put up an octave for the second violin), op. 1/12 and op. 2/12; two movements of the last of the three *Ouvertures* begin the opera *Scylla et Glaucus*, with the fugue notated in halved note-values and, as the composer wrote, 'arranged in a manner which makes it easier to listen to'. The original edition alternates *Sonates* and *Ouvertures*, but Richard Gwilt sensibly puts the *Sonates* in vol. 1 and the *Ouvertures* in vol. 2. Interest in Leclair's music seems to be growing; much is available in facsimile (including this set from Performers' Facsimiles – PF83 @ £25.00), and this is a welcome addition to the body of modern editions. Each set provides a score and four parts (the continuo is printed with and without figures); there is no keyboard realisation, but those wishing to write out what they play can order a bass part with a blank stave.

## EDITION MOLINARI

Zelenka's *Hipocondrie* a7 (2 oboes, bassoon and strings) has long been available in facsimile and in modern score (*Musica Antiqua Bohemica* 61) but parts are more elusive. In terms of legibility, MAB is bolder than Molinari's new edition. I haven't seen the facsimile, but it seems from the MAB commentary that its separate bassoon stave is editorial, while the Molinari edition preserves what I assume is the autograph layout with bassoon cued in and out of the continuo part. I can't comment on any differences in details, but it is odd the MAB score brackets the sharp before the vln/ob 1 F in the penultimate bar while the Molinari doesn't. This is a fine French overture and the existence of parts should facilitate performance (ISMN M-50062-030-3; score DM22.00, parts DM2.50 each).

With the Amadeus series in progress, I am surprised that anyone is issuing Telemann trio sonatas, but Molinari have produced two of them. TWV 42:g1 (ISMN M-50062-011-2; DM16.00) is for oboe, violin & bc and has a particularly memorable first movement; the other two are short but effective. TWV 42:c3 (ISMN M-50062-054-9; DM25.00) is for *dessus de viole* (the alternative of violin is presumably editorial), oboe and continuo. The rare combination is an attraction, though I hope treble viol players who generally just play the consort repertoire don't inflict it on the public or their friends. There are five movements.

Another unusual scoring is F. A. Hoffmeister's Quartet No. 35 in Eb for oboe, two violas and cello (ISMN M-50062-057-0);



the number does not, sadly, imply another 34 quartets for the same combination. Much of the writing looks quite easy, especially for viola 2, though there is a little catch for the less-skilled player at movement 3 bars 13-15, and viola 1 has a variation of demisemiquavers in the finale. The music seems quite easy-going from the listener's viewpoint; if you are playing the Mozart oboe quartet, get your violinist to take up the viola (it's good for his soul) and try this.

#### EARLY CANTATAS

*The World of the Bach Cantatas* Edited by Christoph Wolff with a foreword by Ton Koopman. [1.] *Johann Sebastian Bach's Early Sacred Cantatas* Norton, 1997. xi + 226pp, £25.00. ISBN 0 393 04106 9

This is the first of three volumes related to the Koopman/Erato recording of the complete cantatas and covers the pre-Leipzig sacred works; a second volume will cover the secular cantatas and a third the Leipzig sacred cantatas. It was certainly a good idea to provide additional material to supplement the essays printed with the CDs, and this book can stand by itself as a useful guide even for those who don't have the recordings: it does not even refer the reader to the individual CDs. The book has appeared already in Dutch and German, and some of the stolidity in the writing may perhaps be blamed on the anonymous translators. One wonders too whether the plentiful illustrations have been reprocessed from the original edition, since they are not so clearly reproduced as one would like. They seem to have been prepared for a smaller page-area, so the interesting reproductions from Bach's MSS are less legible than they might have been. It is odd that pages from complete sources are captioned 'fragments'. The contributors are authoritative, though some chapters feel a little short-winded. It may be a better book to dip into than read through, since it is tedious that several chapters take one through the same biographical information. Readers will benefit from the emphasis on the forms and theology of the texts. It might have been interesting if the list of sources on p. 213 had stated what (if anything) each cantata was called. Koopman's organ discs have *Praeludia* rather than *Preludes and Fugues*; perhaps we should abandon the mostly-secular *Cantata* for church pieces.

I jotted down a few points for comment.

p. vii. This is not the first set of books to deal exclusively with Bach's cantatas: Whittaker's two volumes still have their uses for the English reader, especially those who need translations which show what each word means.

p. 37. What sort of French horns were available in the 17th century and what did small zithers play?

p. 52. We have guilders, groschen and florins: how do they relate?

p. 84. I would have thought that the pitch at which the instruments played in relationship to the organ was nothing to do with the status of the latter but a matter of local custom and the pitch at which wind instruments were available.

p.90. The permutation fugue is said here to have been

Bach's own invention but on p. 95 to have developed in Hamburg around 1680.

Christoph Wolff's chapter on 'Choir and Instruments' (I would have thought that 'Choir and Orchestra' or 'Voices and Instruments' would have matched better) tactfully avoids the thorny question of multiple voices.

p.145. One could turn on its head the idea of progress from mean-tone temperament and say that Werckmeister and others began the process of the decline in awareness of tuning which is so obvious in modern main-stream performance.

p. 164. Schein did not live in the late 15th and early 16th century.

p. 166. Walter's *Geystliche gesangk Buchleyn* was published in 1524, despite the misprint on the facsimile.

p. 187. The score of Cantata 106 does NOT indicate that the recorders play at the same pitch as the strings: they are notated in F, the strings in Eb (see facsimile on p. 187).

p.211. I am suspicious of the idea that Bach corrected mistakes in parts that were used and that what survives may have been reserve material. The concept of having writing implements at a rehearsal is a modern one, and faulty parts are so normal that players must have been capable of remembering corrections (as, indeed, they remembered so many other aspects of performance that later musicians have required to be notated). What is the point of keeping uncorrected parts anyway? It is no doubt because of Koopman's belief that the number of surviving parts is not important that such information, significant to other performers, is not given in the list of sources.

But I don't want to leave a negative impression. Most of us who perform, study or listen to Bach's cantatas will learn much here and I look forward to the sequels. I would put this below the *Cambridge Companion to Bach* (see EMR 32 p. 4) in priority as a claim on the pocket, but it usefully supplements that book's brief treatment of the cantata.

#### ANNA MAGDALENA BACH 1725

J. S. Bach et al. *The Anna Magdalena Bach Book of 1725* Edited and annotated by Richard Jones. The Associated Board..., 1997. 40pp, £4.25. ISBN 1 85472 951 9

This is a selection from the second of the two books of mostly keyboard music which Bach compiled for his second wife, beginning rather than ending in 1725. 26 of the 42 pieces are included, the chief omissions being the vocal items and the early versions of BWV 812, 813, 827 & 830. The C major Prelude from Book I is here, and players can practise coming to grips with ornamentation in the 'Goldberg' *Aria*. As in previous editions from the ABRSM and Richard Jones, there are helpful performance suggestions as well as a critical commentary. The musical text is clear, with only the addition of fingering to show its pedagogical nature. I've expressed my doubts of this procedure before. I wish that occasionally alternative fingerings were shown, just to make it more obvious that choices were available or that space were taken (there is a whole blank page available)

to discuss how modern fingering may have differed from Bach's: whether, indeed, Bach's was uncharacteristic of his time. That is perhaps material for a whole book. But the implications of the fingering here are more legato than I would favour and it is not clear whether what is being offered is modern or 'authentic'. Otherwise, a highly commendable edition, enabling players to set Bach's music in the context of pieces which he thought useful for students.

#### C. P. E.'s LETTERS

*The Letters of C. P. E. Bach* Translated and Edited by Stephen L. Clark. Clarendon Press, Oxford, 1997. xlii + 308pp, £48.00. ISBN 0 19 816238 3

I remember being very disappointed when Faber published the first volume of Stravinsky's letters: he only seemed to be interested in money. Most of the 338 letters surviving from C. P. E. Bach (all except four from the period 1765-1788) have a similar topic, allied closely to the postal services, two topics which feature strongly in my own business concerns, so I can't complain. This is, with very few exceptions, not a volume which will help the reader understand Bach's personality or his music. There are, of course, two famous letters to Forkel about his father; and it is nice to see that CPE thought J. Christoph's *Es erhub sich* was a masterpiece; it astonished everyone when JS performed it in Leipzig. But these are exceptional. What one really learns most is about the relationship between Bach and his publisher, since most of the letters are to Breitkopf. I was interested to see that one of the transactions most fully documented was two sets of trios which we issue in facsimile. Expected sales were quite high, with 1050 copies printed, 350 with the keyboard right hand in the violin clef (G2), 700 in the soprano (C1), which was still the normal keyboard clef. Most players will be glad that we followed what was then the minority taste.

The translations read well, though the annotations are a bit pedantic. Information evident from immediately preceding letters is unnecessarily footnoted while a reference to Burney on p. 119 'Would that Dr Burney had read the foreword' (of a book by Forkel) is unexplained. I was interested in the remarks about an alto on p.19: Bach asks if he has a falsetto, which implies the possibility that he might not. 'May God bless us all' seems a strange translation of 'Deus benedicat!' (p. 53). There is a good 16-page introduction (the prelims are so long because there is a superfluous list of letters). It is a book that is certainly of interest, but I wonder whether a complete edition of the letters in translation is a luxury; proper scholars will need to have the German and the material is not really significant enough for non-specialists to want to read every letter.

#### ARRANGEMENTS

Why is so much music dished up (to use Grainger's term) for different instruments than those for which it was written? Are six Bach Suites for unaccompanied cello not

enough? How many cellists feel that they have mastered them to such an extent that they want more? If you do, a version of the violin solo BWV1006 transposed down to G, rather than the expected A, has been made by Lothar Niefind, with a few performing suggestions (for modern cello) and a bit of ornamentation added (Simrock EE5238; £6.00 from Richard Schauer). I'm even more amazed at the sixth Brandenburg Concerto by the same arranger and publisher for five cellos (EE5235; £11.30 for five parts, with a photocopied score available separately). Bach was happy to adapt music from one combination to another (as, indeed, with BWV 1006); but the instrumentation for pairs of violas and gambas is so unusual that there seems little point in playing the work in any other form, except perhaps as a joke at the end of a summer school. If this is used for such occasions, players should take care to restore Bach's own bowing, with no slurs till the last four notes of bar 3.

There is no problem in principle with recorders playing flute music, even though in Bach's concerted works the tone quality of the recorder had a clear but limited function. So a recorder version of BWV 1034, transposed up the conventional minor third from e to g minor is unexceptionable (Universal Recorder Edition UE 30 382; £7.50). The transposition does make it difficult to keep the keyboard realisation low, as the last bar of the first page shows; does the top part have to be two octaves and a third above the bass?

The dances in Purcell's *King Arthur* are fair game for a recorder quartet version – for a start, they are in four parts – even though it is not a characteristic sound for the time and place. The set looks quite useful, but the price of £13.20 for two scores is beyond what the British recorder world will find acceptable (Pan 715 from R. Schauer). I was interested to see a complete edition of the seven Attaignant-Gervaise-Du Tertre dance-books advertised on the back. I haven't seen them, but doubt whether they are competitive with London Pro Musica in editorial quality or price (Pan 721-7).

Baroque solo sonatas arranged with guitar accompaniment only work with modern guitar, so they sound no more authentic than versions with piano; but it is nice that editors like Rudolf Buttman, who has prepared a version of Vivaldi's op. 2/11 & 12 for violin and guitar (Breitkopf 8664; DM16.00), take care to check the source, write a decent introduction and fill a blank page with a facsimile. In fact, since there is a cello part, the edition can be used without guitar, though the user isn't told that.

There are contemporary versions of Mozart's operas for various wind ensembles. The *Divertimento „Die Zauberflöte“* (Breitkopf KM 2273; DM27.00) for three basset-horns (or 2 clarinets & bassoon or 3 clarinets) is a modern version produced collectively by the Trio di Clarone, who have recorded it. There is a score (notated in C), with three parts that can be read in F on basset horns or B♭ on clarinets; there is also a bassoon part transposed to replace the third clarinet. Five popular items are included. In view of the

paucity of genuine Mozart for this very Mozartian ensemble, these arrangements should prove useful for playing and for entertaining for audiences.

While sceptical of Bach for recorders, I am far more convinced by PRB's *The Art of Fugue transcribed for Viol Consorts* by Lucy Bardo (VC026; score & parts \$40.00 or score \$17.00, parts \$28.00). It is now generally accepted that the work was written for keyboard (the open score being in the tradition Bach knew from Frescobaldi – he owned a copy of *Fiori musicali*). But a viol consort is an excellent medium for abstract counterpoint, and this gives players a plausible group of pieces from a period later than that to which they can normally go, and a chance to play music that fits their instruments by a composer who otherwise only wrote very difficult music for solo gamba – not that *The Art of Fugue* is easy even if you only have one part to play. Tovey's completion is used.

*Brahms for Viols?* The punctuation is part of the title, which continues *Organ Chorale Preludes* (on the cover, or *Twelve Chorale Preludes* on the title page) *Arranged for Viol Consorts* (VC032; \$32.00 for score and parts). The perpetrator is Mr PRB himself, Peter Ballinger, who evidently loves the op. 122 chorales but finds that most modern (or century-old) organs make them sound confused. Between three and six viols are required. The idea is intriguing. Ballinger speculates what might have happened if Brahms and Arnold Dolmetsch had met: this is an ingenious answer. Players will need to interpret the unfamiliar long slurs. *Es ist ein Ros' entsprungen* on TrTTB viols will be useful at Christmas.

#### SEYDELMANN

Franz Seydelmann *Solo Keyboard Works* Edited by Bernard Brauchli. Harwood Academic Publishers, 1996. ix + 102 pp. hb £40.00 ISBN 90 5702 060 2; pb £18.00 ISBN 90 5702 061 0  
 Franz Seydelmann *Six Sonatas for Two Persons at one Keyboard* Edited by Bernard Brauchli. Harwood Academic Publishers, 1996. viii + [138] pp. hb £48.00 ISBN 90 5702 062 9; pb £19.00 ISBN 90 5702 063 7

I must confess that I was not familiar with the music of Seydelmann (1748-1806) who worked at Dresden and is described in New Grove as 'an introspective man of little energy' who may have been fond of drink. His four-hand sonatas were published by Breitkopf in 1781, the title page including an engraving which may be a square piano or a clavichord. Since both volumes are promoted by the International Centre for Clavichord Studies (of which the editor and Christopher Hogwood are directors), the editor no doubt feels that these works are suitable for that instrument, though there is nothing particularly idiomatic in their technique as far as I can see. Neither his set of six solo sonatas nor an additional Sonata in g minor (surviving in Dresden MSS whose numbers are not stated) were published, but a set of variations was issued in an 8-page edition in Dresden in 1783. Being for Cembalo rather than Clavier, the editor assumes they are for solo harpsichord.

## B.V. MUZIEKHANDEL SAUL B. GROEN

*Saw it in Early Music Review?*

- We have a large stock of early music
- We understand the requirements of the early musician
- We can send music, books and CDs quickly worldwide



Saul B. Groen, tel +31 20 6762240  
 Ferd. Bolstraat 8, fax +31 20 6711223  
 1072 LJ Amsterdam, e-mail:-  
 The Netherlands groencd@worldonline.nl

The solo pieces look to me more interesting than the duets, but perhaps that is because I haven't been able to try out the latter. These are the first issues in a series *Music Archive Productions*, which is seemingly to be extensive, since eight different sub-series are listed. These volumes are both in the landscape format associated with piano duets; the duet volume gives the same number to each of the opposite pages and conveniently makes the lines of each part match. The series introduction states: 'where necessary a sonic realisation of the music, using the latest computer technology, will accompany the edition', which will make evaluation easier for reviewers. The double pricing is sensible, making the unbound versions cheap enough to encourage the interested performer. But as with the Geminiani above, glossy paper is not a good idea and the weight may prove awkward on the flimsy music stands of clavichords.

\*\*\*\*\*

I have tried to work through the pile of books and editions waiting for review, and have almost caught up. A long review on a new book on Monteverdi's *Vespers* has been made into a separate article, and I have filled up a column there with reviews of some miscellaneous editions. So all there is waiting at the moment is *The Collected Works of Supply Belcher* (Garland), *Symphonies* by Leopold Hofmann from Artaria and Mary Sue Morrow on *German Music Criticism in the Late Eighteenth Century* (Cambridge UP), plus a pile of *Performers' Facsimiles*. No doubt more will arrive before the November issue is due.



## HANDBOOK TO MONTEVERDI VESPERS

Clifford Bartlett

John Whenham *Monteverdi Vespers (1610)* (Cambridge Music Handbooks). Cambridge UP, 1997. viii + 140pp. hb: £25.00. ISBN 0 521 45377 1. pb: £8.95. ISBN 0 521 45979 6

I would guess that more people have sung Monteverdi's *Vespers* than any other work of the 17th century. Yet there is virtually nothing in print that the curious performer, let alone students struggling with it as a set work, can readily acquire to increase their understanding of a work which is extremely unlike anything else they normally encounter. Whether Jeffrey Kurzman's forthcoming book from Oxford UP will be a rival remains to be seen, but that isn't due until sometime after his edition, which is expected next year. Whenham is a good person to write this, since he is an expert on the composer and period but has not been embroiled in the vespers controversies, and in fact manages to write a book that keeps them as far out of the way as possible, touching on them lightly but effectively.

There is considerable emphasis on the liturgy. Whenham tends to the belief that the motets are not so much antiphon substitutes as additional pieces sung between complete performances of psalms with antiphons fore and aft (as on the Pickett recording). The problem with this is that for virtually no Marian feast is there any sensible relationship between antiphons and psalms, and it does seem very odd that, despite the impeccable modal behaviour of the psalm settings, Monteverdi would be happy for the clash between psalm and antiphon. (It is a pity that there is no reference to my *Liturgical Guide*, which includes the chant of the major Marian feasts together with text and translation of sections of the *Directorium*.) It is often very difficult to decide how to pitch antiphons in relationship to the psalms as set: what matters more, relating the reciting notes or the finals? On sheerly practical grounds, I suspect that, although the antiphons might have been said or spoken to preserve liturgical propriety, they were not perceived in relationship to the concerted performance of the psalms; so for a concert performance they may be ignored. In fact, the original 'congregation' may well have treated a service with such elaborate music like a concert, or maybe, depending on which, if any, of the surmises concerning the origin of the work (if it is a work) may be favoured, as an act of homage to the Gonzagas – to God's earthly representative rather than to God himself.

The psalms are discussed chiefly through the formal arrangement of how the tones are set out for each verse. This is interesting in a limited way, but mostly seems a bit obvious. There is a neat explanation of the logic of the skip down a tone for the *Gloria* of *Dixit Dominus*, though I'm not sure if I really believe it. Each psalm is taken individually,

with little comment on the surprisingly different ways Monteverdi avoided having five similar settings. Other psalms do not have their bones showing as clearly as *Dixit Dominus*; *Nisi Dominus* seems simple, but there the verses overlap. This too has a magical fall in pitch for the *Gloria*; the *Glorias* are always interesting in the *Vespers*, and I wonder whether there is a link with the trinitarian *Duo Seraphim*: perhaps a deliberate counterbalance to what was liturgically a Marian occasion.

A curiosity of the book is the devotion of pp 105-120 to the text and translation of the work plus the music of the psalm-tones and an indication of the voice singing it in each verse. Surely anyone using the book will have a recording with the words (if they have my edition they will have them there), and it's not too difficult to spot the psalm tone and which voice is singing it without being told. Whenham prints *Dixit Dominus* but *Laudate pueri dominum*, following the inconsistent capitalisation of 1610; is that really important in a book that does not refer to the significant musical variants that might disturb someone listening to the music with the wrong score? The punctuation of *Nigra sum* and *Pulchra es* is odd and *Audi coelum* isn't set out as verse (one could argue that it isn't in verse, but if so the word *stanza* on p. 54 is misleading). Typographically, it is odd that the reader is frequently referred to numbered pages in this section but there are no numbers on the pages.

A few detailed points. On p. 11, surely the term 'void semibreve' is absurdly pedantic? Although not printed till recently, G. Gabrieli's 'Sonata con voci' *Dulcis Jesu* is perhaps relevant to a discussion of the Sonata (p. 56); the two works both have complex instrumental writing with vocal ostinato, even though they treat the idea very differently. With regard to the uninflected chant for *Domine ad adiuvandum* (p. 61), I have in my head (though can't find in print) the idea that it was sung to a monotone on lesser feasts; if that is true, then might the setting have been made for an occasion when for political reasons an elaborate Vespers was celebrated on a liturgically unimportant day?

Had I been writing the book, I would have started from the delights and problems in performance and worked outwards from there. This more formal approach is of great interest, though there is nothing to give any hint of why singers love the *Vespers* so much. Perhaps it is because Monteverdi's handling of Latin words is so characterful that one could enjoy singing them even without knowing what they mean and still feel some musical understanding, and there are passages that continue almost to take my breathe away, despite taking part in a fair number of performances (alas, playing rather than singing, except for the memorable

★★★★★★★★★★



Several East-European Christmas pastoral masses have achieved at least a modest popularity over the years; perhaps the *Missa Pastoritia ex D* by Marcin Józef Zebrowski will join them (No. 80 in PWM's *Early Polish Music* series; £31.30 from A. Kalmus). It was written c. 1763-65 and remained in use for at least fifty years. It is not in any way a primitive, rustic work; the editor has detected no folk melodies, though popular styles are incorporated. It is scored for SATB, 2 violins, 2 trumpets, timps & continuo; only one of each part survives and the occasional *solo* mark need not indicate contrast with a *tutti*, though there is no difficulty in allocating all except the obviously solo sections to a chorus. It is a work that it would be worth trying as a Christmas novelty, though it is not clear whether performance material is available.

## MUSIC IN LONDON

Shane Fletcher

Last month's *EMR* covered the first half of London's Promenade Concerts but before the end of the season early music featured in three more. Time was when two of these three would not have featured here since they were not performed by strictly early-music groups. The BBC Singers gave a late night concert conducted by Stephen Cleobury on Friday August 15th. Their delivery in Handel's Chandos Anthem, *Let god Arise*, was as clear as many groups more usually associated with early music; the accompaniment of the Brandenburg Consort helped. Elsewhere, however, this was a deeply disappointing concert. Anyone hearing Purcell's *My heart is inditing* for the first time would have had no idea what a masterpiece – albeit a subtle one – this is. Utterly relentless from start to finish, Cleobury's account seemed to have no understanding of the music, its relationship to the text and the natural breathing and relaxation points in it. It was not recognisable as the performance of someone whose work with his own choir shows all these characteristics. Was it simply that he is used to shaping an interpretation over a longer period of time than the rehearsal schedule of the BBC singers permitted? Much the same was true of Byrd's extraordinary motet *Domine, quis habiabit*, though this a much harder piece to bring off, especially in the spaces of the Albert Hall.

The same could not be said of the Gabrieli Consort and Players' first half of the Prom on Friday September 5th. There was style here a-plenty. While Paul McCreesh is perhaps best known for his Venetian extravaganzas, his smaller-scale performances, with him directing from the cello, are often gems of graceful ease. Not far into the concert their music was all but drowned by the noise of helicopters covering the moving of the coffin of Diana, Princess of Wales from St. James's to Kensington Palace. Not something one should complain about perhaps, but it was a pity, since from what I could tell from my seat, Carys Lane's account of the *Lamento della ninfa* was an outpouring of grief, albeit on a different theme, suiting the occasion. Like the lamenting nymph many of the audience had doubtless been nearly 'trampling flowers underfoot in grief and distress'.

The concert on the Monday immediately after the Princess's death was more chillingly apposite. Handel's *Jephtha* tells of the needless sacrifice of a much loved young woman and Charles Mackerras dedicated the performance to the memory of the Princess of Wales. The score is a late Handel masterpiece, contemplative rather than action-packed. Anyone privileged to have seen the Peter Sellars' production of *Theodora* at Glyndebourne, especially this summer's revival with Jean Rigby in the all-important role of Irene, will have a new benchmark of standards in late

Handel. (Joan Rodgers, Jephtha's daughter, Iphis, had been Glyndebourne's *Theodora*.) At times, it seemed as if this account would not match up well. Anthony Rolfe Johnson, in the title role did not start on form. The trickier moments of the earlier arias seemed to be defeating him. But poise and confidence suddenly returned (in the reprise of 'Open thy marble jaws') and from then on he gave a glowing account of a father's anguish; 'Waft her, angels, through the skies', once something of a lollipop frequently extracted from the work (no fewer than 17 times in Promenade concerts since 1903) was as tender and rich as the moment – both within the work and in the world at large – demanded. The star among the soloists was Felicity Palmer as Storge, Jephtha's wife. This part is so close to the comically wronged matrons that she plays so well that she might have had a hard task in maintaining the seriousness of the part. That she did so with such dignity and powerful expression is a credit to her talent. The work was accompanied by the Scottish Chamber Orchestra, not a group that one immediately associates with early music. Yet their style showed a firm grasp of baroque string technique and some of the wind players used 'authentic' instruments, so that the overall effect to the casual listener would have been of a baroque orchestra.

Much of the mood of the piece depends on the chorus and the New Company had been urged to put delivery of text at the top of their agenda. Unanimous and with plenty of dynamic contrast, their virtuosity was never merely for an impressive effect, but always to enhance the work. Credit for this must go to Charles Mackerras, one of the pioneers in historically-aware performance. Though occasionally he seemed to rush unnecessarily (the late Handel oratorios are not for those who want the story to get a move on), the effect he produced was thoughtful and demonstrated the intellectual rigour of an oratorio whose text is based on contemporary writers such as Pope as well as the original Biblical story. Mackerras did not shrink from the work's most extraordinary moment when the chorus insist that despite that all is doom and gloom, 'Yet on this maxim still obey: Whatever is, is right.' This must have been as hard to take at the work's original performances with Handel, his health and eyesight failing, present in the audience as it was in the immediate aftermath of the death of the Princess of Wales. Yet Mackerras was absolutely right to allow the chorus and orchestra to deliver this with insistent certitude, for it lies at the heart of this complex work.

\*\*\*\*\*

*It is ironic that, having pointed out an error in a duration given for a CD last month, we also made a mistake. Keith Briggs noticed that the duration given for Koopman's 4-disc Buxtehude Cantata set would give nearly 112 minutes per disc. The total should read 235' 03".*



## A. Grandi – Ave maris stella

Violin I (C1)

Violin II

Continuo

7 [4th time to Amen]

Soprano (C1 clef)

Su - mens il - - - - lud A - - ve Ga - bri - el -  
 Mon - stra te es - - - - se Ma - trem Su - mat per  
 Vi - tam pre - - - - sta pu - ram I - ter pa

23

- - - - lis o - re Fun - da nos in pa - - - - ce mu -  
 - - - - te pre - ces Qui pro no - bis na - - - - tus tu -  
 - - - - ra tu - tum Ut vi - den - tes Je - - - - sum sem -

31

-tans E - ve no - men. A - - - - men.  
 -lit es - se tu - us.  
 -per col - le - te - mur.

Si replica due volte tutto è una volta la Sinfonia nel fine.

## SAINTE COLOMBE

Jonathan Dunford

D'AUTRECOURT – DANDRICOURT

As the editor for the Société Française de Musicologie's new edition of the *Concerts à deux violes esgales* by Sainte Colombe, as well as three forthcoming editions of his music for solo viol, and as the author of the article for the next edition of *Grove* on this composer, I thought I'd like to share the results of my researches of the last few years.

During the period when the film *Tous les matins du monde* was on everybody's mind, Pierre Guillot, a Parisian musicologist and professor at the Sorbonne, published an article in *Le Monde*<sup>1</sup> claiming that he had found Sainte Colombe's identity: his name was Augustin D'Autrecourt, and he lived in Lyon in the 1650s.

Shortly afterwards I was asked to revise Paul Hooreman's 1973 edition of the *Concerts à deux violes* by Sainte Colombe. I needed to revise the introduction, and took up on the Lyon trail. Indeed there was such a person living in Lyon in the 1650s, but subsequent research indicated many suspicious things. Pierre Guillot apparently used secondary sources: books of hospital archival material printed in the 19th century and available in any local archive in France. He was mistaken about D'Autrecourt's payments (he was paid exactly the same as all other musicians at the Hospice de la Charité in Lyon), mistaken about his name (not his fault, the hospital archivist in the 17th century made the mistake), and not knowing the viol's history made the mistake of not knowing that Sainte Colombe had studied the viol with Nicolas Hotman (who died in 1663), according to Sainte Colombe's student Jean Rousseau.

To make a long story short, Augustin D'Autrecourt was really Augustin Dandricourt and was a choir director living in Lyon in the 1670s. He used the pseudonym 'Sainte-Colombe' or 'Sainte Culombe'. As a large and important catholic family named Sainte-Colombe lived in the region and were benefactors for the Hospice de la Charité where Dandricourt worked, we can assume tentatively there was some connection. His duties were to teach composition, form a choir and teach the best students the viol. Bacilly (in Paris) mentions and gives the text for a *Sarabande de M. de Sainte Colombe* in the 1660s, when Dandricourt was still in Lyon. (Bénigne de Bacilly edited *airs de cour* in seven sets for Ballard published between 1661 and 1668 under the title *Recueil des plus beaux vers mis en chant*.) So where does this leave us for the Parisian viol player named Sainte Colombe?

JEAN DE SAINTE COLOMBE

I had ordered a film of the Panmure viol manuscript some years before, as I had edited the original version of the *Folies* by Marais, and had been absorbed by P. Cadell's 1984 article on the Count's collection.<sup>2</sup> Looking through the 'Insinuations de Chatelet' at the French National Archives (a valuable 19th-century index of catalogues of notary acts from Paris in the 17th century), I was intrigued by a certain Françoise de Sainte-Colombe living on the Rue de Betizy in Paris, married in 1669; one of the witnesses, Nicolas Caron, was an organist. I ordered a copy of this marriage contract, and was troubled by the signature of Françoise de Sainte Colombe's father Jean, believing I had already encountered this hand.

I checked the Panmure manuscript pieces that were (according to the owner in the 17th century) 'lessons for the viol by Mr Saint Culom'. The titles seemed to be of the same hand. Being no expert in paleography, I took the pieces and the signature to be examined by Catherine Massip, head of the Bibliothèque Nationale's music division and an expert in 17th-century paleography. She confirmed my discovery. I then sent all of these documents on to a handwriting expert at the French law courts and he reconfirmed the same conclusion.

Jean de Sainte Colombe lived near the Louvre in the 1650s and 1660s. As I have mentioned, he lived on the Rue de Betizy, which intersects the Rue de la Monnaie and the Rue Bertin Poirée, two of the early addresses of the young Marin Marais. The houses on the Rue de Betizy (which is now the Rue de Rivoli) in the late 1650s had large courtyards, like so many Parisian houses do today, with ample space for a hut for practising purposes. Also, the Rue Saint Germain l'Auxerrois is one street away. This was DuBuisson's street; I discovered that his full name was Jean Lacquement-dict Dubuisson.

After many years of looking through the French Archives, I have only found Jean de Sainte Colombe referred to as 'bourgeois de Paris' and not a musician. And after years of examining all notary acts from the mid-17th century, Jean de Sainte-Colombe and his daughters are the only Sainte-Colombe family I have found living in Paris at this time. He was certainly the only Sainte-Colombe living in the right neighbourhood, with two daughters Brigide and Françoise. His friend Nicolas Caron was organist at St. Thomas de Louvre and the Eglise St. Opportune. Jean de Sainte Colombe was N. Caron's witness when he married in 1658. Why should a simple 'bourgeois de Paris' have such a musical friend?

<sup>1</sup> Guillot, P., *Le Monde*, 18 January 1992, pages 1 & 13; see also *Le Monde*, 5 January 1996, page 19.

<sup>2</sup> Cadell, P., 'La musique française classique dans la collection des comtes de Panmure', *Recherches sur la musique française classique* XXII, 5-58, (1984).

## THE DAUGHTERS AND (ILLEGITIMATE?) SONS

Françoise married Jean Varin, a mathematics teacher for the king, and was appointed as a teacher in Belfort. Brigide de Sainte Colombe married Louis Le Bé, a secretary for 'marquis de Segnelay, stationed in Versailles'. The Le Bé family, printers of both books and music, were closely associated with the famous Ballard family. We also find close ties to a family of publishers named 'Allain' (note the *Concert à deux violes* called *L'allain*). Chateau d'Aquin de Lyon, in his book *Le siècle littéraire sous Louis XV* affirms to have known one of Sainte-Colombe's sons who was not a musician.

In the Durham Cathedral library under the shelf number A27 one finds amongst about 300 pages of solo bass viol music, six wonderful suites for solo bass viol by 'Mr de Sainte Colombe le fils'.<sup>3</sup> Strange to say, in the same library one finds a theological dissertation in Latin by Henri Auger de Sainte-Colombe, who according to this document was from the Bearn region in France.

From an article by Ian Woodfield<sup>4</sup> we know that the viol-playing Sainte-Colombe son lived in 1707 in Edinburgh, and Durham is on the road to Edinburgh. We know also that according to the London newspaper *The Daily Courant* that a 'concert benefice for Mr Sainte Colombe' was held at the Hickford Room in London in 1713.

The minister Henri Auger de Sainte Colombe was in all of the same places at the same time as the viol-playing son. We did find Henri Auger's birth record. Born near Pau in France the 1st of June 1680 to monsieur le baron Jean de Sainte Colome and Marie de Landorte, therefore not the viol player (Paris-based) son. Importantly though, these Sainte-Colombes from Pau were protestants, unlike the catholic Sainte-Colombe's based in Lyon.

Picking up on the protestant trail, we found in the Paris protestant archives in the 'répertoire Hague', a Parisian Sainte Colombe (no first name) mentioned in 1700 as being 'fort suspect de religion'. The mystery continues...

## THE MUSIC

Since the Hooreman publication we have an edition of the 67 *Concerts à deux violes esgales*. Since P. Cadell signalled the solo pieces we have acquired 106 pieces for solo viol and a little suite for two, dispersed in the two Scottish MSS (thanks to F. P. Goy for this discovery). Then two years ago a new manuscript was brought to light in the municipal library in Tournus (Burgundy).<sup>5</sup> This manuscript, copied by the same scribe as the *Concerts à deux violes esgales*, has about 144 pieces for solo bass viol. About seventy are concordant with the Scottish manuscripts and about 40 are concordant between the solo pieces and the *Concerts à deux violes*.

F. P. Goy has recently discovered that the Tournus manuscript was part of about eleven books of music. He

discovered another book of viol music, copies of Caix d'Hervelois copied by the same hand that used blank pages in the Sainte-Colombe manuscript. This person probably was a monk who studied in Paris in the end of the 17th century and took the books back to Tournus. Alfred Cortot, the pianist, who was the original owner of the *Concerts à deux violes* (now at the Bibliothèque Nationale in Paris) spent a large part of his life in Tournus!

The two solo books in the Scottish National Library are probably autographs. We find many measures crossed out, not reappearing elsewhere in the manuscript. They really look like a composer's notebook. However, F. P. Goy thinks that the handwriting is NOT Sainte Colombe's; so the question is perhaps still open.

## RECORDINGS

I'm now preparing my 6th solo CD for Ades, the suites by Sainte-Colombe le fils. While sight-reading through the suites in g minor and e minor, I noticed that the *Allemande in g* has another name: 'Prelude pour M. Vaucquelin' (in a truncated version), and the Prelude in e is also in a shortened version named 'Fantaisie in e'. The claimed author of these strange truncated versions in *Tous les matins du monde* is Jordi Savall [tracks 3 & 11 on the soundtrack CD]. The latter is actually named 'Anonyme XVII siècle - J. Savall' – he couldn't say the music was by Sainte-Colombe's son, as there are girls in the film. Some of this is explained on the notes to my recent recordings:

Ades 204 912 *Sainte Colombe for solo viol*

Ades 206 042 *Sainte Colombe le fils*

Ades 205 612 *DuBuisson Suites pour viole seule.*

<sup>3</sup> Urquhart, M., 'Prebendary Phillip Falle (1656-1742) and the Durham Bass viol Manuscript A.27', *Chelys*, 5 (1974-75), 7-20

<sup>4</sup> Woodfield, Ian, 'The Younger Sainte-Colombe in Edinburgh', *Chelys*, 14 (1985), 43-44.

<sup>5</sup> Goy, F. P., 'Jean de Sainte-Colombe et le manuscrit de Tournus dans l'histoire de la musique pour viole seule en France', *Société des Arts et des Sciences de Tournus, Centre international d'Etudes Romanes*, Tome XCIV, Année 1995, 61-76

\*\*\*\*\*

Saul Groen has just sent us four catalogues of music up to 1815, with separate A5 booklets for keyboard, violin, viola/cello/double bass and viola da gamba. The violin one starts with an impressive page-and-a-half for the unaccompanied instrument. There is always the problem with dealers' catalogues in that naming the publishers would be useful in giving the user a clue as to what an item listed is like and whether it is worth buying, but also gives him a chance to get it from somewhere else. So don't blame Mr Groen if he doesn't say whether an enticing facsimile is SPES, Fuzeau, Performers' Facsimile, King's Music or something else. See his advert on p. 7 for address etc.

\*\*\*\*\*

I was amused by this reply from an American academic when I questioned the value of discussing *Acis and Galatea* in terms of the homo-erotic and gender-shifting:

*When tenure's the drive, what mortal fears jargon.*

(Steve Hammer)



## RECORD REVIEWS

## MEDIEVAL

**Magister Leoninus Sacred Music from 12th-century Paris** Red Byrd (John Potter Richard Wistreich), Cappella Amsterdam Hyperion CDA66944 71' 05"

Anonymous IV (the writer, not the group) is very careful how he uses the word 'best' in his account of Leonin and Perotin, but it is easy to get the false impression that he thought the latter was generally better, and that has stuck. He calls Leonin the best creator of organum, and this CD makes that completely credible (though we have to take on trust that the surviving Parisian organa are in fact by him). There is no later three- or four-part stuff here to blur the picture, just chant and two-voice organum. It's worth buying to hear John Potter in such eloquent form (and I wouldn't want to undervalue Richard Wistreich either) even if the music isn't to your taste; if it is, don't hesitate. If anything deserves to oust Hyperion's best-selling medieval lady, it's this; it may help that you don't have to worry too much about the words. CB

**Machaut Ay mil Lais et virelais** Emmanuel Bonnardot voice & fiddles 55' 01  
Opus 111 OPS 30-171  
Lai 1, 16; Virelai 3, 4, 5, 8, 9, 11, 13, 16, 18, 26, 31,

This is a one-man performance; that doesn't mean that the whole disc is unaccompanied, since Bonnardot plays a variety of string instruments: indeed, he favours playing without singing rather than the opposite. Two lengthy lais are performed in a relaxed manner, surrounded by shorter songs with attractive melodies, making this a fine introduction to monophonic Machaut. The voice is warm, lacking the hard edge that characterises some medieval singing; I wish Bonnardot had the confidence to let us hear it alone. I'm not sure whether a recommendation is helpful, since you need to find out whether you can take nearly an hour of the same voice; so if you can sample it before buying, it is worth doing so. CB

**Music of the Fourteenth Century vols 3 & 4 I am music: Works by Francesco Landini** The Ensemble of the Fourteenth Century, dir John Griffiths & John Stinson Move MD 3093 77' 08"

**Mass for the Feast of the Annunciation** Les Six, dir John Stinson & Hartley Newnham Move MD 3094 64' 34"

In July 1987 I attended at lecture at the annual Medieval and Renaissance conference by John Stinson, co-director of these groups, about his scheme to set up a centre for study of 14th-century music, which included a project to record it. He subsequently sent a recording for review in *Early Music News*; I was full of enthusiasm for the idea and praised the singers' ability to get round the notes convincingly, but wrote 'the problem

is intonation' (EMN 1/88 p.11). There is a distinct improvement here, but I suspect that I have also become more critical and it is still a problem. The title song of the Landini disc, *Musica son*, sounds messy. Admittedly the music is difficult. But the precise tuning of every single passing note, let alone the more lasting chords, that we have come to expect from medieval polyphonic song is missing. (As in 1988, one need only mention Gothic Voices to show that it can be done.) It is a pity that is the opening track; the disc improves, and the less complicated, two-part songs are most enjoyable. It is marvellous to have 20 of Landini's 154 songs on one disc: why have they been so neglected? The Mass presents fewer problems, though I wonder at the relevance of 11th-century neums for chant sung in the early 15th century. The ordinary (by Gherardello, Bartholus, Lorenzo & Don Paolo) is the only cycle to survive from 14th-century Italy; a motet by the theorist Marchettus of Padua is also included, though it dates from a century earlier. One way in which this differs from most liturgical reconstructions is the inclusion of a sermon. Stinson's booklet notes (in English only) are of extreme interest, linking the strands that make up the Mass assembled here. This is certainly an interesting series, but the singing isn't quite convincing enough to entice. CB

*I'm not normally a net surfer, but accidentally came across the project's informative database, which lists 3198 works in 427 MSS.*

## 15th CENTURY

**Dufay The Virgin & The Temple: Chants & Motets** Pomerium, Alexander Blachly 60' 06"  
Archiv 447 773-2  
Motets *Alma redemptoris mater II*, *Ecclesie militantis*, *Laetabundus*, *Nuper rosarum flores*; Chant *Recollectio festorum Beate Marie Virginis (1st Vespers)*

By an odd coincidence, this links with the same 1987 conference as that mentioned in the previous review. Hearing some singing coming from the bar, I joined in what I thought was the first performance of the Dufay chant. But according to Blachly's notes, Barbara Haggh identified it in Cambrai chant books in 1985, so it may have already been revived in several other unliturgical places. The documentation for Dufay providing the chant in 1457-8 is clear enough, even if the surviving chant is, of course, unascribed. This CD contains the music for first Vespers, complete with the psalms. It could be useful for teaching modes, since, as is common with rhymed offices, the antiphons proceed through them in order. The Magnificat is sung expansively to the *Sexti toni* polyphonic setting. The opening item is the motet that can now be reinstated as linked to the proportions of Florence cathedral (both cathedral and motet use the same Biblical dimensions); in that and especially *Ecclesie militantis* a

harder edge to the sound might have been more effective than loudness. Dufay fans will have bought this already (the delay in reviewing it is not entirely our fault); others should follow, unless you find swathes of chant tedious. CB

## 16th CENTURY

**Byrd Virginals & Consorts** Skip Sempé, Capriccio Stravagante 73' 19"  
Auvidis Astrée E 8611

Kbd: MB nos. 14, 17, 20, 21, 25, 32, 36, 60, 94; Consort: Fantasia a6, Pavan & Galliard a6, Browning, Pavan a5, Praeludium & Ground, My Lord of Oxford's Masque; anon *Mille regrets* (Susato, 1551) & *Belle qui tiens ma vie* (Arbeau, 1589)

The first track will put most listeners off, certainly any who love the g minor Fantasy a6; some bass notes are horribly emphasised, there is a superfluous lute continuo, a gaggle of recorders join in at *Greensleeves*, the Galliard is played too fast for the short notes to be coherent, the coda is exaggeratedly slow. I don't assume that it *must* be for viols (I once programmed it for cornetts & sackbuts), but am puzzled at Sempé's 'anything goes' orchestration (surely an inappropriate word for the period). On the other hand, his harpsichord playing is much more restrained, musical and enjoyable. In principle it is nice to have the variety, and the other instrumental pieces are a little better; but I wish Sempé would be content with just being a good harpsichordist or else could avoid a change of personality when directing other performers and writing programme notes. CB

**Palestrina Missa Brevis, Missa Lauda Sion** Pro Cantione Antiqua, Mark Brown Carlton Classics 30366 00742 ££ 65' 46"  
Also includes *Sicut cervus & Super flumina Babylonis*  
**Palestrina Missa Papae Marcelli, Stabat Mater** Pro Cantione Antiqua, Mark Brown Carlton Classics 30366 00702 ££ 58' 32"

I'm afraid I tend to be more an admirer of Pro Cantione Antiqua and their tremendous work for early sacred music than a lover of their sound. With one or two adult male voices per part, this must be a close recreation of the sound of much singing in the Sistine Chapel and other Roman churches – yet I find the sound wearing after a while. Too much vibrato, especially in the inner parts, clouds the chording. Tempi are very slow, more four-in-a-bar than two, and there is a tendency to surge and wallow in every dissonance, which for me is too self-indulgent. These masses are treated as classics rather than young music: they represent a later stage of their performance by the papal choir (a legitimate tradition) rather than sounding as new music of the 16th century. But there is a tremendous commitment, some incredibly long lines, and when occasionally they do let their hair down a bit, the effect can be electrifying. The *Missa brevis* comes off best here, as well as some move-

ments of the *Missa Lauda Sion*, and this disc also includes some beautiful things in two classic motets, *Super flumina* and *Sicut cervus*: still self-indulgent, but maybe these pieces can take it. As a counter-balance to all the choral Palestrina around, these two reissues are certainly a useful purchase. Noel O'Regan

**Music with her Silver Sound: Englische Consort-Music** Knut Schoch T, Peter Croton lute, Ensemble Galliarda Basel 57' 43"  
Acanthus 94005

Music by Bennet, Bleyer, Brade, Campion, Coprario, Dowland, Holborne, Patrick, Phillips, Praetorius, W. Mundy, Tye, R. White & anon.

Having been brought up with one of the early '60s recordings of The English Consort of Viols performing some of the same music on a vinyl disc with this same title, I was disconcerted to find a CD of English consort music performed by recorders, tenor and lute. The ensemble plays neatly and it is good that some of the consort songs include the great and double bass recorders, which give a better balance with the voice, though I found the intonation of the playing slightly disturbing at times. Some of the pieces were taken at unusually fast tempi: both Tye's *The Crye* and Holborne's *The Fairie Round* were dashed off with such panache as to miss their point. Knut Schoch has a pleasant vocal quality for the music and produces a balanced sound, though the consort songs with recorders do not always sound right. At first I thought he was attempting 17th-century pronunciation, but no – just some teutonic oddities. I cannot whole-heartedly recommend this to any but the hardened recorder enthusiast. Ian Graham-Jones

## 17th CENTURY

**Dumont Les litanies de la Vierge** Ensemble Dumont, Peter Bennett 66' 23"  
Linn CKD 067

This is only the third CD I know of dedicated to the music of Dumont, one of the leading composers of the early French baroque and among the first composers in that country to make extensive use of basso continuo. It is the first time I have heard the ensemble named after him and I must say that I enjoyed most of the performances. My only real reservation is the tone of one of the sopranos, which (to me) is slightly overpowering in ensembles and rather lacking in focus in solos. Dumont's beautiful melodies and rich harmonies are neatly embellished by singers and players alike and I look forward to hearing more from this talented group, perhaps slightly expanded to give us more of the *grands motets* than are available, or maybe in a secular programme? BC

**Falconieri Canzone, Sinfonie, Fantasia, Capricci, Brandi, Correnti, Gagliarde, Alemane, Volte, Naples, 1650** La Luna 70' 17"  
Wildboar WLBR9605

Rosemary Druce (in 1995) and BC this year were both enormously impressed by La Luna at the Boston Festival; having now

heard them, I know why. Falconieri is hardly the leading composer of his generation, and I wasn't initially very excited by the editions I had for review this month (see p. 11). But these musicians bring it to life and have the imagination to make it sound rich and exciting. Try it. CB

**Gibbons Anthems and Instrumental Works** Jeffrey Thomas T, Berkeley Festival Consort of Viols, UC Berkeley Chamber Chorus, John Butt *dir* & organ 57' 15"  
Centaur CRC 2308

A popular anthology, with most of the favourites, commendable with the proviso that the choir is rather large; even if the total numbers of the Chapel Royal may correspond roughly, they are unlikely ever to have sung verse anthems with viols all together. But the relationship of soloists and choir works, without the vast disparity in style one can get when a famous soloist is brought in for *This is the record of John*; here we have a tenor who is not from a different world and who can blend with viols. The viol pieces include the marvellous *In nomine as* with its quotation from *What is our life*. The keyboard playing is interesting. The popular (then as now) fantasy-exercise in G is given exaggerated two-bar phrases; I'm sure John Butt (now back in England) knows what he is doing, but I don't. CB

**Landi La morte d'Orfeo** Johanna Koslowsky S, Myra Kroese A, David Cordier, Michael Chance *cTcT*, John Elwes, Wilfrid Jochens, Nico van der Meel *TTT*, Harry van der Kamp, Lieven Deroo *BB*, Vocal Ensemble Currende, Tragicomedia, Stephen Stubbs *dir* Accent ACC 8746/47 118' 39" 2 CDs

It's over ten years since I pored over the printed score of this opera at the British Library and I'm delighted to have a first-class performance of it on CD. It's a fairly minimalist affair: two cornetti and a pair of violins, continuo of two plucked strings (or three, if Andrew Lawrence-King is harping and not sat at an organ), a couple of bowed strings and harpsichord. As with Luigi Rossi's telling of the familiar Orpheus tale (the storyline is rather different here), it was the ensemble writing that grabbed my attention, be it luscious duets, stunning soprano trios or madrigalesque choruses (often in antiphony). While the continuo playing is faultless and the solo singing of a very high standard, the extended passages of recitative cum arioso rarely feel as if they're going anywhere (I hope that's not too ridiculous a comment – I'm sure, as usual, that seeing what was happening would have helped enormously.) The booklet contains only the Italian libretto. BC

**Monteverdi Il combattimento...** Les Arts Florissants, William Christie 18' 12" &  
Harmonia Mundi La Solothèque HMS 926015

This is from the first batch of Harmonia Mundi's new series of discs containing single works, as mentioned in our editorial last month. The work is an obvious choice: a key work in music history, though one

which is not always appealing to listeners who are unable to react to Tasso's verse. Sadly, no English translation is provided, which immediately limits its use. It is a fine performance; my only worry is the weight of instrumental bass, even though Monteverdi asks for a 'contrabasso da Gamba, che continuerà con il Clavicembano'. CB

**Monteverdi Vespro per la Salute 1650** Akademia, La Fenice, Françoise Lasserre *dir* 101' 98" 2 CDs  
Pierre Verany PV797031/32

Another Monteverdi Vespers compilation, this time from the 1650 *Salmi* and various anthologies. The Magnificat by Cavalli is also from that collection and the instrumental canzonas and sonatas are by Venetian contemporaries. These are generally convincing performances of what is perhaps not always Monteverdi's most inspired or easiest music. Much of it is really for an ensemble of soloists and maybe too much use is made of the full choir. One or two of the soloists are, unfortunately, not quite up to the virtuosic demands of the figuration, and generally the voices are outshone by the wonderful wind playing of La Fenice, just as happened at the recent Glasgow Early Music Festival 1610 Vespers with the same instrumental group. Especially interesting here is an *Ave maris stella* by Gioanpietro del Buono which has canons in the wind instruments over the cantus firmus and, best of all, the little-known but sumptuous Monteverdi setting of the Litany of Loreto. Worth getting for that alone, but also for much other fine singing and playing. Noel O'Regan

**Schütz Kleine geistliche Konzerte. vol. I** New York Baroque, Eric Milnes 56' 28"  
Pro Gloria Musicae PGM 109  
SWV 282-3, 285, 289, 297, 303, 306, 308-9, 315, 317, 328, 324-6, 335

This is Vol. 1 of the recording, not of Schütz's publication; his two collections are arranged more sensibly for finding a piece for the combination you want but with less variety for consecutive listening. I haven't been entirely enthusiastic about some of the offerings from PGM, but enjoyed this one. When singing with slow intensity, the voices tended to spread too much for my taste, but otherwise the pool of seven singers provides suitable voices and idiomatic performances for each Concerto. Is it a sign of the times that the biography of the director is vague about where he has performed but lists all the radio stations on which he has been interviewed. CB  
A recent free sampler from PGM (PGM 903; 72' 13") has 20 extracts from their catalogue, including six tracks from a live St John Passion

**Torelli Sinfonie e concerti op. 5** Insieme strumentale di Roma, Giorgio Sasso 57' 22"  
Stradivarius STR 33461

Here is a name we read a lot without having much direct access to his music. Well and truly overshadowed by those of his rhyming Roman contemporary, Torelli's sonatas and concerti recorded here should begin to redress that imbalance. If they are



not quite as expansive, they are worth playing and hearing and were surely known by Stradella and Handel. The string playing is quite accomplished, while the continuo remains in the background for the concerti and gets more involved in the sinfonias. It's the first time I've heard this ensemble but I look forward to hearing more. **BC**

**Festal Mass at the Imperial Court of Vienna (1648)** Yorkshire Bach Choir, Yorkshire Baroque Soloists, Baroque Brass of London, Peter Seymour 62' 44"

Carlton Classics 30367 02182 ££

C. Strauss *Missa Veni sponsa Christi* with music by A. Bertali, G. Fantini, G. Priuli, A. Rausch

I was initially very excited at the prospect of this 1989 recording. I'm extremely interested in the Viennese church repertoire and looked forward to hearing music from the period immediately before Bertali's and Schmelzer's vocal output. The programme itself is fine: sonatas by Bertali and Fantini, motets by Rauch and Priuli, and an entire mass by Christoph Strauss. But I found the variety of sounds quite distracting and, in particular, the shrill high soprano parts disturbing. The motets are perhaps the most successful pieces, though Bertali's two short sonatas are stylishly played. **BC**

**Thou knowest, Lord, the secrets of our hearts: Funeral Music from 16th and 17th Century England** Choir of Christ's College, Cambridge, Michael Bawtree org, Annabel McLauchlan vlc, David Rowland dir 67' 18" Meridian CDE 84363

Burial Services by Croft, Morley, Purcell, Tomkins; Gibbons *I am the resurrection*; Greene *Lord let me know mine end*; Locke *I know that my redeemer lives*; Purcell *O dive custos*; Tomkins *When David heard*; Weelkes *Death hath deprived me*

This somewhat sombre collection features fine choral singing and some rarely-heard masterpieces. We have the splendidly-familiar early setting by Purcell of the Funeral Sentences and a predictable lovely set of burial sentences by Tomkins. These and other impressive large-scale settings, such as Weelkes' deeply moving tribute to Morley, are interspersed with music for solo voices and continuo, including Purcell's touching lament for Locke. Also impressive are Croft's Burial Sentences incorporating Purcell's later, chordal 'Thou knowest Lord', though here without flatt trumpets. [Possibly written to be sung with Morley's setting, Croft incorporated it in his. **CB**] The singing of the choir and soloists, though not entirely without blemish, is of a high standard, expressive and sonorous, and after several listenings, rather than thinking with Purcell 'What hope remains for us?' I found myself 'half in love with easeful death' and wishing they had recorded the rest of Morley's Burial Service. **D. James Ross**

## LATE BAROQUE

**Bach Family Motets** Choir of Trinity College, Cambridge, Richard Marlow 75' 31" BMG 75605 51306 2

Johann *Sei nun wieder, Unser Leben ist ein Schatten*; J. Christoph *Der Mensch vom Weibe geboren, Ich*

*lasse dich nicht, Lieber Herre Hott*; J. Michael *Fürchtet euch nicht, Halt was du hast, Nun hab' ich überwunden, Sei lieber Tag*; J. Ludwig *Das ist meine Freude, Es danken dir, Unsere Trübsal*; J. S. Jauchzet dem Herren BWV Anh.160; J. C. F. Wachet auf

Marvellous music and generally good performances, though a little old-fashioned; the edges are softer than we now expect, whether from early-music ensembles or from choruses used to 20th-century music, and the speeds are quite relaxed. The impression is of a choir larger than the music needs; 28 singers are listed. If that doesn't bother you, this is well worth buying, not just for the music but for performances that have a strong style, even if it feels more 1960s than 1990s (without going into the question of which suits music covering more than half of the 17th & 18th centuries). **CB**

**Handel Organ Concertos, Concerti Grossi, Water Music** Amsterdam Baroque Orchestra, Ton Koopman 309' 18" (5 discs)

Erato 9630-17761-2 rec 1986-93 ££

Contents: Organ Concertos op. 4, 7, Nos. 13-16; Concerti Grossi op. 6/1, 2, 4, 6; Water Music

Lively, bright-eyed playing and an agreeable sense of intimacy have long ensured a top billing for Koopman's 1986 recording of the organ concertos. It's good to see them back, as it is the fine performances of the Concerti Grossi. The *Water Music* (1993) merits less of a welcome, more an outboard motor excursion than stately progress by royal barge. The mannerisms that have marred some of Koopman's later work are much in evidence here, too. A four out of five rating.

**Brian Robins**

**Leclair Sonates en trio op. 4** London Baroque Harmonia Mundi HMS 901617 67' 13"

There are already two outstanding recordings of this set: the Purcell Quartet on Chandos and Musica Alta Ripa on Dabringhaus und Grimm. Try as I might to give London Baroque a fair hearing, I'm afraid this just doesn't get anywhere near the others: the violin parts sound difficult (which, of course, they are) and the keyboard is too readily overwhelmed by the cello. (Interestingly, the rivals opt for gamba.) Such minor flaws as there are on the technical front will not put off devotees of this group but, with hand on heart, I cannot recommend this disc as the best available. **BC**

**Mondonville Pièces de clavecin avec voix ou violon, op. 5** William Christie, Judith Nelson, Stanley Ritchie 52' 52"

Harmonia Mundi Musique d'abord HMA 1901045 £ rec 1980

William Christie's new release of Mondonville's *grands motets* [reviewed next month] will get a better press than this re-issue. The pieces are a bit of an enigma: harpsichord pieces with accompaniment for voice and/or violin (but with doubt over the extent the latter should double the former). Since these are scarcely compelling accounts of absolutely marvellous music, is this simply an attempt to cash in on Mondonville's brief (?) time in the limelight. **BC**

**Vivaldi/Chédeville Les Saisons amusantes** Palladian Ensemble with Nigel Eaton *hurdy-gurdy*, Richard Egarr *hpscd*, Jean-Pierre Rasle *musette* 60' 09" Linn CKD 070

In their latest offering, a somewhat idiosyncratic version of Vivaldi's classic *Four Seasons*, the Palladian Ensemble stray from their usual path, presenting us with a revival of the French bagpipe and hurdy-gurdy cult of the eighteenth century. Its greatest exponent, Nicholas Chédeville, achieved limited fame as a musette virtuoso and composer (often passing his own work off as that of Vivaldi), hence the extraordinary mixture of sounds and effects presented here. Vivaldi's work is hardly recognisable in places and totally reorganised in others – different enough at least to tempt back the otherwise 'over-seasoned' listener. The balance is not always successful with this unorthodox grouping of instruments, but there is some expressive recorder playing by Pamela Thorby; certainly an intriguing buy. **Marie Ritter**  
Release date: 13 Oct.

**Divoti affetti: Early Music at the Court at Dresden** Tamara Matthews S, Jennifer Lane mS, Timothy Burris lute, New York Baroque, Eric Milnes dir 70' 12"

Pro Gloria Musicae PGM 106

Fux *Felice io me (Orfeo ed Euridice)*; Heinichen *Io vorrei saper (Flavio Crispo)*, *La bella fiamma di Tirsi*; Ristori *Canto divoti affetti*

Like Vienna, Dresden holds a particular attraction for me, because Fasch appears to have studied there with Heinichen and Pisendel and certainly his Latin church music was performed in the Catholic Chapel. The overall feeling of the pieces here is doom and gloom and almost as prominent a role is given to lutenist Timothy Burris as is afforded the two singers. There is also a fair amount of pizzicato from the other string players of New York Baroque (presumably in the interests of balance.) PGM are to be congratulated as usual on their continued exploration of new repertoire and I warmly commend this to anyone interested in 18th century vocal music. **BC**

New readers need to know that **BC** is an expert on the music of Fasch: see *EMR* 31, pp. 11 & 23.

## CLASSICAL

**John Antes String trios Johann Friedrich Peter String Quintets** American Moravian Chamber Ensemble 62' 28" New World Records 80507-2

**David Moritz Michael The Water Journey; Parthia 1 & 2 Pacific** Classical Winds 61' 50" New World Records 80490-2

The Moravian Church in America is perhaps better-known for its choral tradition, but instrumental music played an important role in their rich musical life, as the informative notes to these discs make clear. Their surviving libraries include vast amounts of music by European composers, and local composers also contributed to a repertoire



destined for performance by amateur musicians. The Pennsylvanian John Antes had a surprisingly colourful life, especially during his years as a missionary in Egypt, where he was tortured by representatives of the Ottoman Empire; he also corresponded with Benjamin Franklin in Paris. During this period he wrote a set of quartets for an English nobleman in India, and these three trios for two violins and cello, which he dedicated to the Swedish ambassador in Constantinople. But this remarkable biography is scarcely reflected in the music itself, the earliest known chamber music by an American. They are pleasant, well-crafted trios, with some affecting *minore* passages, but not likely to set the Nile on fire.

Peter had a less colourful career as music director in Salem, North Carolina, and other Moravian centres, and these six quintets of 1789 are his only instrumental works. Curiously they seem to exploit less textural variety than Antes' trios, and for the most part they remain innocuous examples of a somewhat more mature classical style. The final two have moments of richer sonority but a certain structural unease is not redeemed by some rather alarming tempo changes in these performances.

Michael's *Water Journey* is accompanied by a charming anecdote of a boat journey down a Pennsylvanian river ('the composer, poet-like, caused the music to convey the idea of fear and terror'), though such drama is hard to recognise in this naively outdoor *Harmoniemusik*. The simplicity is occasionally touching, but I find it difficult to reconcile the succession of short marches, minuets and final chorale with a claim for superiority to contemporaneous European wind music. The two Partitas unusually feature a trumpet in the first and a flute in the second.

Simon McVeigh

C. P. E. Bach *Berlin Symphonies* H 649, 650, 653, 654, 656 (Wq 174, 175, 178, 179, 181) Kammerorchester 'Carl Philipp Emanuel Bach', Hartmut Haenchen dir 53' 02"

Berlin Classics 0010962BC ££

C. P. E. Bach *Magnificat* Venceslava Hrubá-Freiberger S, Barbara Bornemann A, Peter Schreier T, Olaf Bär SATBar, *Symphonies in G*, H 648 & 655 (Wq 173 & 180) Kammerorchester 'Carl Philipp Emanuel Bach', Hartmut Haenchen dir 63' 42"

Berlin Classics BC1011-2 ££

These two recordings date from 1985 and 1988 respectively, the latter being a live recording of a concert celebrating the 200th anniversary of the composer's death. The symphonies, in a sense, play themselves: there is no need for dramatic interpretations since the music is, of itself, eventful enough. The *Magnificat* is a strong piece but the arias were hardly intended as showpieces for singers of the calibre we have here, so their efforts are sometimes overbearing. The choral singing is not the best either, the sopranos tending to be rather shrill. BC

F A Hoffmeister *Six Trios for two flutes and cello*, op. 31 Bent Larsen, Henrik Svitzer fls, Niels Ullner vlc 66' 29"

CLASSCD119

Hoffmeister's main contribution to musical history was his publishing house, which produced sets by Mozart and Beethoven and later became the renowned C. F. Peters. The six works on this CD (played on modern instruments) are mostly in three charming movements (No. 5 has only two) lasting between 38 seconds (a final *Allegro*) and almost seven minutes. The brief notes comment on what fun they are to play and I am sure they would make wonderful background music for a picnic on a sunny Sunday afternoon, or an excellent diversion if kept in by the rain. I have to confess that I have come to quite enjoy these bubbly performances. BC

Mozart *Symphonies No. 35 Haffner & 36 Linz transcribed for fortepiano, flute, violin and cello* by J. N. Hummel Kark Kroll fp and The Parlor Philharmonic 59' 53"

Boston Skyline BSD144

As something of an enthusiast for chamber reductions of classical symphonic music, a domestic tradition much to be recommended for amateur music-making today, I put on this disc with high expectations. I'm not sure whether it was Hummel or the performances that caused my disappointment, but the disc turns out to be much more early 19th-century in spirit than Mozartean. Dominated by the piano, as such arrangements usually are, the thick left-hand sonority all too easily becomes heavy-handed, and the rhythmic energy relentless to the point of monotony. As a student of Mozart, albeit one firmly placed in the nineteenth century, Hummel would surely have approached his master's music with more grace and style.

Simon McVeigh

Mozart *Wind Serenade in Bb*, K361 Wind Soloists of the Orchestra of the Age of Enlightenment, Anthony Halstead 48' 10"

BBC Music Magazine Oct. 1977, vol. VI no. 2

A fine performance which is certainly an incentive to spend £3.75 whether or not you enjoy the magazine.

G. B. Sammartini *Quintetti e Quartetti* Ensemble Agl'ia 67' 47"

Stradivarius STR 33426

Concertini a4 in Bb, Eb & G (c.1763-7), Quintets (1773) nos. 2 & 3

I've never heard any of this music or any performances by this young ensemble, basically the Quartetto Agl'ia with a third violin for the quintets. I am thoroughly impressed by both. The booklet notes (a masterpiece of Italian waffle, for the most part) talk about the pieces standing at the threshold of the classical period but, on hearing them, I feel that Sammartini has already crossed it and is exploring new ideas; the viola, for example, is often given a solo role. My record of the month – until I heard the Schumann (see p.17). BC

£ = budget price    ££ = mid-price  
The rest: full price (as far as we know)

All discs can be ordered from Lindum Records

## 19th CENTURY

### Beethoven Symphonies

Two period-instrument sets of the 1980s have recently been re-issued during the summer. Hogwood's recordings come as a bargain five-disc set (*L'Oiseau Lyre* 452 551-20C5: 365"), with the overtures *Coriolan* and *Egmont* as bonus. Norrington's come as five separate mid-price discs coupled 1, 3 & *Prometheus* overture (VM 5 61374-2), 2 & 8 (...75-2), 4 & 7 (...76-2), 5 & 6 (...77-2) & 9 (...78-2), with a total of 349'. Norrington is a marvellous conductor of live performances and I was totally convinced by the *Ninth* at his *Beethoven Experience* (and not, I think, just because I had some involvement with the event). But I have played the CD made the following week only once: something disappeared in the studio, and similarly with the *Symphonie fantastique*, reissued as VM 5 61379 2, which was recorded after the *Berlioz Experience*. Hogwood seems more at home in the studio. Perhaps his relationship with his producers Peter Wadland and Chris Sayers was more effective than Norrington's with David Murray (though David's recordings of Simon Rattle are effective enough); or perhaps Norrington, with his years touring opera, is more of a showman and needs an audience. So despite the model of hero and villain that Taruskin implied in his reviews (cf p.2), choice between these sets is by no means obvious. CB

### Donizetti Chamber music

Vol. 1: *Music for violin and piano* 60' 20"

Vol. 2: *Music for one or two instruments with piano or harp* 60' 16"

Vol. 3: *Music for chamber ensemble* 79' 18"

Arts 47217-2, 47218-2 & 47219-2 £

This is an enterprising venture from a budget label. Most of this music is unknown to those who categorise Donizetti as an opera composer (though I remember being captivated by a concerto for cor anglais by him). It's true, maybe, that this is not the composer at his most profound and most of it does sound like rejected operatic material, but there are some nice pieces spread over the three discs and anyone looking for new repertoire should investigate. Not on early instruments, but never mind. BC

Schubert *Symphonies* 5 (D 485) & 8 (D 759); *Rosamunde Entr'acte & Ballet* (D 499/4 & 9) Das neue Orchester, Christoph Spering 61' 20"

Opus 111 OPS 30-192

It is very interesting to hear familiar Schubert works played on period instruments and directed by a musician who has clearly thought the implications through. Das neue Orchester, forty strong, is a deft, musicianly body, intelligently directed, as anyone will recall who has listened to last year's recording of *Die Verschworenen*. Here the programme-building at first sight might appear odd, but it works very well: the final number from *Rosamunde* is followed by the 'Unfinished' Symphony, then the third *Entr'Acte*, and finally the Fifth Symphony. In each case the balance, naturally favouring the winds,

though with crisp, incisive strings too, challenges the listener to re-think the music. The B-minor Symphony emerges free from typical big-orchestra associations, and though some hearers may prefer a more marked differentiation in tempo between the movements, I for one am delighted at Sperring's approach. Textures are airy, tempi urgent yet unrushed, and the result should give pleasure and win admiration for a long time to come.

Peter Branscombe

**Schumann Cello Concerto, Symphony No. 4**  
Christophe Coin, Orchestre des Champs  
Élysées, Philippe Herreweghe 56' 06"  
Harmonia Mundi HMC 901598

The only other CD of Schumann in my collection is by the same conductor and the same orchestra: last year's release of the second symphony, coupled with Andreas Staier's revelatory performance of the piano concerto. The concerto + symphony pairing works well again. Where in live performances I've heard the concerto (on modern instruments) the cello has had to struggle, particularly on the lower strings, Christophe Coin is always clearly audible, partly because the proportions of his supporting crew are much smaller than the modern concert hall 'demands' (I imagine it's a long time since anyone did serious acoustical studies to find out if huge string sections actually do make more efficient use of space) and partly because, as is usual with this most individual of artists, one is frequently caught unawares by subtly different phrasing. The symphony, too, is rather underplayed for the most part: the texture is crystal clear. Listen out for the bassoons in thirds, the beautiful viola lines and the intertwining of woodwinds: the horns can sound just a little rustic, but I'm sure that's what Herreweghe wants and it certainly colours this performance in a way quite unlike 'such and such a conductor's' version – I'm sure Schumann would be as delighted with this as he was with the premiere of his revision. Quite clearly the outstanding disc of the month. BC

**Recorder Bravura: Transcriptions for recorder and piano in the Grand Romantic Style** Piers Adams, Howard Beach 67' 42"

Upbeat Classics URCD129

Music by Chopin, Damare, Finzi, Gossec, Granados, Popp, Hunyadi, Massenet, Paradis, Rachmaninov, Sarasate, Schubert, Vitali, Wessely

One of my most vivid musical experiences was of a central European café ensemble at a restaurant somewhere outside Bratislava whose repertoire included pieces from the 'gipsy' style, so I can understand the relief from the baroque of a Bruges competition that the sound of a Hungarian gipsy band may have brought Piers Adams and his desire to adapt the repertoire for his own instrument. It takes a few moments to get used to hearing a recorder playing music that is so associated with the violin and any CD of what one feels to be encore pieces needs to be listened to in small doses. There is a slight feeling that the players are self-consciously reviving a style that older listeners and players still know as a living tradition – it's safer to play Telemann. The

only track that doesn't work comes from a very different tradition, Finzi's poignant *Come away Death*, which needs a singer and words. Otherwise, this is an entertaining disc, brilliantly played, which will provide delight and amusement not only to recorder fans.

CB

## KEYBOARD

**Beside Themselves: Music for Two Harpsichords**  
Phoebe Craig, Katherine Westine 70' 47"  
KATastroPHE 8312001

J. S. Bach *Concerto in C (BWV 1060)*; W. F. Bach *Concerto in F (F10)*; Couperin *Musées de Choisi et de Taverni (Ordre XV)*; Gershwin *Three Preludes*; Joplin *Steptime Rag*; Soler *Concerto 1*

The curious and irreverent may go for the Gershwin and Joplin, but the former is too inherently pianistic and the *Steptime Rag* is badly chosen – the rests in the theme might work with a live audience but not on disc. But there is enough other music of interest in this anthology to justify acquiring the disc, and the playing (on pairs of French and Italian instruments by John Phillips) is stylish. The cover picture gives the wrong impression: it is, mostly, not a jokey disc. CB

**Bizarre or Baroque** Elizabeth Anderson *hpscd*, Kylie Davies *d.bass*, Danny Fischer *drums*  
Move MD 3179 69' 46"

This has a few popular harpsichord pieces, but is otherwise a mixture of modern music for the instrument (Ligeti's *Hungarian Rock* the only item by a big-name composer, is easily the best) and 'novelty items', some of which would make good encores but which mostly fall a bit flat on disc, especially since one needs to adjust the bass from one track to the next. The ragtime here is better than on the KATastroPHE disc. *Eleanor Rigby* with bass rhythm and minimal melody is a travesty: it's the tune that matters; and there's nothing haunting about *Scarborough Fair*. Albéniz transfers as well to the harpsichord as to the guitar. The harpsichord tone is tediously percussive. There are some good ideas, but not enough self-criticism in the compilation.

CB/EB

## VERITAS PORTRAITS

all numbers prefixed 7243 Mid-price.

**René Jacobs 5 61397 2 5** (rec 1977-88)

Bach *Cantata 170*, arias from 161, 177 & *Magnificat*; Handel arias from *Admeto* 73' 12"

**Scott Ross 5 61398 2 4** (rec 1989)

Frescobaldi excerpts 70' 49"

**Jordi Savall 5 61399 2 3** (rec 1983)

Schein *Banchetto musicale* (excerpts) 51' 50"

**Gustav Leonhardt 5 61400 2 8** (rec 1984-93)

Bach BWV 808, 825, 1061; CPE Bach H664 (Wq 183/2); Purcell *Love's goddess sure* 75' 16"

**Anner Bylsma 5 61401 2 7** (rec 1988)

CPE Bach *Cello Concertos Wq170-172* 70' 09"

**Fretwork 5 61402 2 6** (rec 1988-91; this compilation 1992) Byrd, Dowland, Gibbons, Lawes 63' 54"

You might expect from a series labelled 'Portraits' that each disc would contain a representative sample of an artist's or group's work; but that isn't always the case here. There are some real bargains here though no texts or translations are provided for vocal music, something I always find very annoying.

If you like your altos rich, dark and chocolaty, then the René Jacobs selection is the kind of record to listen to curled up on a settee with a box of Black Magic and a large sloe gin. The highlight is the group of arias from Handel's *Admeto*, full voiced virtuosity with dazzling speeds and plenty of theatricality recorded in 1978 with Il Complesso Barocco and Alan Curtis. You may, however, find the *Et misericordia* and *Esurientes* from Bach's *Magnificat* recorded with La Petite Bande/Sigiswald Kuijken in 1989 rather on the ponderous side. But a disc to relish.

Also extremely good is the Scott Ross CD of Frescobaldi harpsichord music; hardly a portrait, except perhaps of Frescobaldi, but beautifully recorded to display the instrument's full range of colours in an extremely sonorous meantone tuning.

'A significant part of Hesperion XX's repertoire is devoted to music of the Mediterranean countries' says the notes to the Jordi Savall CD. So what do we get as a representative picture of his group's work? Yes, you've guessed, a rather short CD devoted to Johann Hermann Schein. Most of it is stylishly played with lightly-dancing rhythms, and if you enjoy early 17th-century German music you will find it good fun.

Gustav Leonhardt's portrait includes Bach harpsichord solos, a double harpsichord concerto with Bob van Asperen and the OAE with C. P. E. Bach and Purcell. Without doubt the best thing on the disc is the C. P. E. Bach Symphony; the OAE is superb. This is not quite the case with *Love's goddess sure was blind*; I much prefer The Sixteen's recording with tenors in place of Leonhardt's counter-tenors. The OAE simply does not seem to have mastered Purcell's style and the result is at times over-articulated and rhythmically a little flabby rhythm. Also a greater weight in the bass line would be welcome: it's not that I longed for double-basses, but were cellos were used instead of bass violins? [I think I may share some of the guilt for the recorders in *Sweetness of nature*; our edition hadn't yet suppressed them. CB] I have absolutely no reservations about the Concerto for 2 harpsichords accompanied by Melante Amsterdam, which is exuberantly played with immense zest and energy.

Leonhardt and the OAE appear again on Anner Bylsma's disc of C. P. E. Bach cello concertos. It is again hardly a rounded portrait, but definitely one for the collection. Elegant, refined, beautifully phrased, these are works and performances which grow on you the more you listen to them.

The Fretwork disc (an earlier compilation reissued) spans selections from Byrd to Lawes. They are joined in three pieces by Michael Chance – Byrd's *Come to me grief for ever*, and *Ye sacred muses* and Dowland's *Lasso vita mia*. If you are looking for a representative selection of viol consort music, then buy this one. Rosemary Druce

# Lindum Records

suppliers of Early Music Records

You have read the reviews in Early Music Review?

You wish to buy a record?

**We will:**

supply records favourably reviewed in recent issues of Early Music Review.  
gradually increase the stock list to include other quality records.  
supply any other record you may wish subject to availability.

**Send SAE for current stock list**

**One call, fax or email to  
Aldhundegate House  
Beaumont Fee  
Lincoln LN1 1HB  
U.K.**

**Tel/Fax 01522 527530**

Email: peter@aldhund.demon.co.uk

Welcome to



A HOME PAGE  
FOR THE  
CLASSICAL MUSIC  
PROFESSIONAL

(Artists, Agents, Instrument Makers, Merchants, Recording Companies and Music-lovers)

<http://www.brainlink.com/~starmus/Unison/unison.html>

- Design – World Wide Web publicity from about £120.00 (US\$200.00)
- Hosting (Storage) and Maintenance – from about £120.00 (US\$200.00) per year\*
- Language Translation of web documents – from about £110.00 (US\$175.00)
- Special Announcements – short pages from about £55.00 (US\$90.00)
- Links from Unison to other W3 locations – free or for nominal charge

\*Annual or monthly payment by Credit Card: Access/Eurocard/Mastercard & Visa

## Features and Benefits

- Accessibility – 24-hr from any computer connected to the World Wide Web
- Affordability – compare to other W3 design services and printed advertising
- Efficiency – we do the work so you can make more music
- Simplicity – no investment in hardware or software necessary
- Visibility – boost the power of your publicity on a shared web site

For full details request our brochure, available in English or French

Europe: Fax/Voice Mail (up to 60 seconds)  
[UK - London] +44 (0) 171-681 1376  
[France - Paris] +33 (0) 1.53.01.31.07

Fax: [USA] +1 (812) 336-7236  
Phone: [USA] +1 (812) 336-1810 / (812) 335-1121

Note: We do not provide access to the Internet – contact a local Internet Service Provider (ISP) for e-mail and W3 access

Star Community Services Inc., 3702 Tamaron Drive, Bloomington, IN 47408-2819, U.S.A.  
E-mail: starmus@brainlink.com WWW: <http://www.brainlink.com/~starmus/index.html>

## CEDRIC LEE

As I approach my 65th birthday, I can look back on over 20 years of music-making influenced by the rediscovery of 'early music'. What strikes me about this period of my life is the number of musicians with whom I have had contact, however brief, who have enriched my experience through teaching and coaching, master-classes, summer schools and conducting. I feel a great debt of gratitude to them for the instruction, inspiration and encouragement that they have given me, often with great generosity. These have included:

Alan Lumsden	Lewis Jones
Alison Crum	Martin Crimp
Andrew van der Beek	Mary Beverly
Anthony Milledge	Michael Procter
Barbara Alden	Monica Huggett
Bernard Thomas	Nicholas Parle
Bruno Turner	Nigel North
Clare Redfarn	Paul Goodwin
Clifford Bartlett	Paul Hamburger
David Pugsley	Paul Nicholson
Deborah Miles-Johnson	Peter Beaven
Edward Wickham	Peter Gellhorn
Ghislaine Morgan	Peter Holman
Glenda Simpson	Phillip Thorby
Hildburg Williams	Poppy Holden
Howard Davis	Richard Boothby
Ivor Bolton	Richard Wistreich
Jane Francis	Simon Hill
John Southcott	Tess Miller
John Milsom	Theresa Caudle
John Rutter	Timothy Roberts
John Toll	Virginia Black
Judith Nelson	Walter Reiter

I am grateful also to the many others who have been responsible for organising workshops, courses and concerts, and all those friends with whom I have played and sung.

(This is intended not as an exercise in name dropping, but as a tribute to the remarkable way in which, in this country, professional musicians make themselves accessible to musical enthusiasts.)

## Advance Notice

### CEDRIC LEE BIRTHDAY CONCERT

*French cantatas and readings*

with

CLARE NORBURN PATIENCE TOMLINSON  
ILANA CRAVITZ RACHEL LATHAM  
MARTIN PERKINS TATTY THEO

**SATURDAY 10 JANUARY 1998  
ST JOHN THE DIVINE RICHMOND**

*Details to be announced later*



## ROBERT SPENCER

1932-1997

Peter Holman

1997 will be remembered by the English early-music community as the year it lost a number of its senior figures: Anthony Baines, Michael Thomas, Joseph Saxby, Carl Dolmetsch, Ruth Dyson, and now Robert Spencer. He lost his courageous struggle with cancer on 8 August, just three months after his 65th birthday. There have been several good thumb-nail biographies in the newspaper obituaries, which allows me to contribute a more personal appreciation here.

My wife Tricia met Bob and Jilly before I did: she had lute lessons with Bob while still at school and took me over to meet them at their house at Woodford Green in, I think, 1970. Over the years the Spencers and their household never seemed to change, except that the library was constantly growing; there seemed to be something new and exciting to see at every visit. Bob built up his extraordinary collection of manuscripts and prints of lute music and song with a winning combination of thorough scholarship, perseverance and charm, and it eventually rivalled those in the major public research libraries. He was remarkably generous in allowing fellow scholars and performers access to it. One of the most memorable experiences of my life was to sit with him for several evenings while he read through the newly-discovered Board Manuscript on the lute and we both tried to identify the contents. As he played music by Dowland and his contemporaries (some of it in Dowland's hand) that had in some cases not been heard for three and a half centuries, the sense of communication with the past was almost tangible.

In fact, Bob was a remarkably generous person in several respects. Although it pained him when others fell below his high scholarly or musical standards, he always tried to see the best in people, and often spent a great deal of time and effort helping beginners in lute-playing or research. Not

surprisingly, he was a first-rate teacher, particularly coaching singers in lute-songs or Purcell, and was adored by his students.

Although he was not a trained musicologist (he started as a librarian) and was always modest about his scholarly credentials, he broke new ground researching the lives of English lutenists, and set new standards for the study of English 16th- and 17th-century manuscripts and prints – as the introductions he wrote to the Boethius Press facsimile series of lute manuscripts reveal. He was always willing to put his expertise at the service of others. I must have phoned him hundreds of times in the last few years with scholarly problems, and if he could not supply a solution immediately, one usually came by return of post in his beautiful handwriting. Even when he was seriously ill he did not lose his enthusiasm for research, his delight in good music well performed – or his love of life.

There is a strong feeling among those who knew Bob and worked with him that he deserves a permanent memorial, and it is hoped that the means will be found to make his collection permanently available in this country to scholars. Meanwhile, two tributes have been planned: a memorial service (see details below) and lecture *John Dowland: The Man and the Myth*. For the last year I have been working on a book on Dowland and his collection *Lachrimae* and originally planned to use the annual Margot Leigh Milner Lecture to mark the 400th anniversary of the publication of Dowland's *First Booke of Songes or Ayres*. But it now seems appropriate to dedicate it to Bob's memory, since he contributed an enormous amount to the book, including several pieces of new information about Dowland's life and the publishing history of the works. I hope that musical illustrations will be provided by Bob's past students. All are welcome to both events.

Saturday 15 November, 2.30 p.m.  
Swedenborg Hall  
20 Bloomsbury Way, London WC1  
(near Holborn tube station)

Following the NEMA AGM  
Peter Holman will give  
the Annual Margot Leigh Milner Lecture  
*John Dowland: The Man and the Myth*  
in memory of Robert Spencer

Monday 24 November, 12.00 midday  
St. Bartholomew the Great  
West Smithfield, London EC1  
(near Barbican tube station)

### MEMORIAL SERVICE for ROBERT SPENCER

Music by his friends and colleagues  
All who knew him or admired his work are invited